Applied Ethnomusicology in Institutional Policy and Practice

Edited by Klisala Harrison
EDITOR’S INTRODUCTION
Why Applied Ethnomusicology?
Klisala Harrison

INSTITUTIONS 1: ORGANIZATIONS

Government
Approaching an Epistemic Community of Applied Ethnomusicology in Australia:
Intercultural Research on Australian Aboriginal Song
Sally Treloyn

Migrant Youth Hip-Hoppers in Hamburg, Germany: Negotiating Institutional Politics
and Social Integration
Emily Joy Rothchild

"Being on Both Sides": The Ethnomusicologist between Official Institutions and Musicians
Marie-Christine Parent

Universities, Music Conservatories and Learned Societies

Policy Formation, Ethics Statements and Ethics in Ethnomusicology:
The Need for Increased and Sustained Engagement
Muriel E. Swijghuisen Reigersberg

Industrialized Music Education in China: A Discussion of the “Standard Grade Examinations
in Music” (SGEM) Organized by the Central Conservatory of Music, Beijing
Zhang Boyu

Collaboration and Community-Engaged Practice in Indigenous Tertiary Music Education:
A Case Study and Model from South Australia
Jennifer K. Newsome

Initiatives, Reorientations and Strategic Plans in the Music Department,
University of Fort Hare, South Africa: A Summary and a Visionary Reflection
Bernhard Bleibinger

The Christian Church
Dave Dargie

INSTITUTIONS II: SELF-ORGANIZED INSTITUTIONS

Uploading Matepe: Online Learning, Sustainability and Repatriation in Northeastern Zimbabwe
Jocelyn Moon

List of Contributors

COLLEGIUM
STUDIES ACROSS DISCIPLINES IN THE HUMANITIES AND SOCIAL SCIENCES
Why Applied Ethnomusicology?

Klisala Harrison
University of Helsinki

During a time of increased valuing and rapid growth of ethnomusicology in use, this article considers the naming of current ethnomusicological trends and the discursive location of applied ethnomusicology within those. Applied ethnomusicology has acquired specific and internationally shared meanings and uses within a growing tendency, across the social sciences, arts and humanities, towards the societal usefulness of academic work. It is both distinct from and related to ethnomusicology in the public interest, public ethnomusicology, public sector ethnomusicology and engaged ethnomusicology.

First we have to name what it is that we do. Changes in our praxis should be reflected and indeed generated by changes in the language on our websites and in our mission statements—whether those of our academic societies or of our programs and departments. Course syllabi and concert programs can also include language that both transcends the academy and addresses its changing politics. We have to name our goals and aspirations for the field and to emphasize the relevance of our unique training for a world beyond the academy. And we have continuously to imagine and to articulate this activist awareness to our students, our colleagues, our administrators, our audiences, and to the doubters, whose facile tropes of simplistic condemnation need correction. Beyond, before, and in addition to the pure professorate, with its ideal balance of teaching, research, and governance, we need to imagine and contribute to the options available for our younger colleagues who have chosen the academic field of ethnomusicology as their training ground. As the pure professorate shrinks, we have to confidently assure them that they have made the right choice.

Anne Rasmussen
President, Society for Ethnomusicology

Because I chair an international study group called Applied Ethnomusicology, I have been pondering how many terms there are for ethnomusicological work that has social and cultural impacts. Names like public sector ethnomusicology, public sector ethnomusicology and engaged ethnomusicology.

1 Rasmussen 2016, 4.
ethnomusicology and engaged ethnomusicology are often used in an unclear way. Although the two largest learned societies of ethnomusicologists, the Society for Ethnomusicology (SEM) and International Council for Traditional Music (ICTM), have official sub-networks devoted to “applied ethnomusicology,” the societies as wholes promote contexts where “applied” is not used but emphasize the same trends that “applied ethnomusicology” describes. It is time to explore and question if applied ethnomusicology is the term to go with. Definitions gather together ideas and set limits, but it is important not to gloss over them—doing so contributes to the erasure of intellectual traditions, and increases the likelihood of wasting energy on “reinventing the wheel.”

The article studies how applied ethnomusicology and related terms have been used; how the monikers have been defined vis-à-vis adjacent scholarly fields; and what are their strengths and weaknesses. It argues that what to call new developments in ethnomusicology depends on the perspective that one takes to them, and the contexts in which they operate, in which applied ethnomusicology always has its own specific meaning.

Public + Ethnomusicology

Terms that pair “public” with “ethnomusicology” include ethnomusicology in the public interest, public sector ethnomusicology and public ethnomusicology. In the first issue of the SEM journal *Ethnomusicology* about applied ethnomusicology in 1992, Jeff Todd Titon defined *ethnomusicology in the public interest* as “[ethnomusicological] work whose immediate end is not research and the flow of knowledge inside intellectual communities, but, rather, practical action in the world outside of archives and universities’ while stating that ‘as a way of knowing and doing, fieldwork [which is constitutive of ethnomusicology] at its best is based on a model of friendship between people rather than on a model involving antagonism, surveillance, the observation of physical objects, or the contemplation of abstract ideas.’” Ethnomusicology in the public interest was a term intended to evoke Habermas’ notion of the public sphere.

*Public sector ethnomusicology*, by contrast, has been often interpreted to mean ethnomusicologists who are employed by government, or the public sector. In the USA, this would include employees of the Library of Congress, the Smithsonian Institution, the National Endowment for the Arts or states arts councils, for example. In other interpretations, place of employment is not mentioned specifically; it is

---

3 Rylko-Bauer et al. 2006, 186.
5 J. T. Titon, pers. comm., 6 July 2016.
6 Titon 2015a, 8.
7 Ibid.
vague whether the term refers to work done outside of the academy by someone employed in the public sector, or work done outside of the academy regardless of employer. For instance, an organizer of the 2016 SEM pre-conference “Soundings: Public Sector Ethnomusicology in the 21st Century” described the event as a “discussion that focuses on ethnomusicology outside of the academy … whether that be different types of programs incorporating public-sector work; whether that be exploring the skill sets needed for public-sector work; [or] whether there are specific or model projects that might be highlighted.”

Such initial definitions of public sector ethnomusicology can be criticized as exclusionary and US-centric. Titon writes that sectors of society, outside of academia yet not in the public sector, are excluded:

By definition “public sector ethnomusicology” is unable to include applied ethnomusicology as practiced by those who work in the private sector, in NGOs such as museums, historical societies, foundations, and various non-profit organizations, even when part of their funding comes from government grants; nor does it describe the work of applied ethnomusicologists in corporations and client organizations.

If the term public sector ethnomusicology is used outside of the US, which has many private universities, confusion may result. For example, in Australia or EU nation-states, ethnomusicologists who work inside the academy also work in the public sector when government funds universities and colleges. Yet there is also a “grey zone” of universities and colleges only partly funded by government, for example in Canada. In such cases, the above definitions of public sector ethnomusicology are also inadequate.

The sector and country-exclusive aspects of public sector ethnomusicology originate in the term’s history. Titon notes that

US-development of the term public sector ethnomusicology is mainly a borrowing from the abandoned term public sector folklore. (Folklorists used the term public sector folklore in the 1970s and 1980s but in the 1990s the preferred term became public folklore, which it remains.) Historically, in the US, public sector folklore developed both outside the academy and inside of government institutions.

In the 1970s and 80s, public sector folklorists—who were academically trained—participated in scholarly societies (like the American Folklore Society) and published academic work. Today, US-based ethnomusicologists who promote public sector ethnomusicology are in a similar position. Although they may be employees of public sector institutions, they participate in scholarly societies like the SEM, and publish

8 J. Gray, email message to SEMNotices-L, 16 Nov. 2015.
9 Titon ibid.
academic articles and books. If one is unfamiliar with histories of folklore, “public sector ethnomusicology” could seem also to include academic work by the “pure professoriate” on the public sector, which in practice the field has not. However, evaluations of cultural policies including (but not limited to) those of government have been one of the most common foci of applied ethnomusicological work.

Public ethnomusicology refers to a public, but which one? What is that public lacks definition. It can only be said definitively that it refers to “applications in the public arena,” or, if not applications, ethnomusicology that in some way involves a “public.” This is vague too.

Recently the SEM at the initiative of its Presidents and Executive Board has promoted the terms public sector ethnomusicology and public ethnomusicology. In addition to holding the pre-conference on public ethnomusicology, in 2015 the SEM first awarded the Judith McCulloh Public Sector Award, which “recognize[s] the valuable impact of many types of ethnomusicological work that benefits the broader public and typically engages organizations outside academic institutions.” The awardee each year is: “1) an individual or organization/institution carrying out a major public-sector project that has attained significant recognition; or 2) an individual or organization/institution whose ongoing work contributes significantly to public understandings of ethnomusicology.”

In SEM contexts, public sector folklore and public folklore influenced 1990s developments of what became commonly called applied ethnomusicology. In 1992, Martha Ellen Davis noted that public sector folklore “refers to practical projects in cultural conservation undertaken by folklorists as employees or consultants of government—federal, state, or local—and non-profit cultural-conservation organizations such as historical societies and museums. Such projects are intended to facilitate conservation of aspects of expressive culture (music, dance, crafts, and so forth) by their respective culture bearers in their traditional social settings.” In 1993, the volume Public Folklore made an intellectual case for dropping out “sector.” Editors Robert Baron and Nick Spitzer also promoted “collaborative efforts of tradition bearers and folklorists or other cultural specialists” towards cultural innovations based on folk traditions—particularly folklorists’ purposeful “reframing and extending [of] tradition in collaboration with folk artists, native scholars, and other community members.” In public folklore, folklorists work not only in conservation, but also in and with contemporary social contexts and broadly defined publics, for

11 For example, academic works by the co-organizers of the 2016 SEM pre-conference include Gray 2015 [2001] and Groce 1999.
12 Rasmussen ibid.
13 Titon 2015a, 6.
14 Ibid., 8.
17 Davis 1992, 362.
18 Baron & Spitzer 1992, 1.
example folklife festivals, or initiatives continuing, exhibiting and marketing culture within contexts of urban renewal and gentrification. SEM leadership has used public ethnomusicology and public sector ethnomusicology interchangeably even though the parallel terms in folklore have significantly different meanings.

Applied Ethnomusicology

In 1998, when 38 ethnomusicologists founded the first scholarly network of applied ethnomusicology—what became the Applied Ethnomusicology Section of the Society for Ethnomusicology, USA—“applied ethnomusicology” was a growing field in the US. Yet, Titon recalls, “Until [a founding] meeting, a single name for [applied] activity had not yet risen to the surface; among those in circulation then were ‘applied,’ ‘active,’ ‘action,’ ‘practice,’ ‘public,’ and ‘public sector’”—even though mentions of “applied” work is threaded through the history of ethnomusicology. The SEM group’s founders, Martha Ellen Davis and Doris Dyen, respectively identified with applied ethnomusicology and public folklore; the group was said to represent a safe space where ethnomusicologists employed outside academe could gather and through which applied ethnomusicology could be advocated for as an “alternative” career to an academic one. Various other founding members who worked in universities, though, did not share this view and identified with applied anthropology. One could also observe a sociocultural anthropology orientation widely shared among members, reflecting the historical and continuing focus of the SEM general. As Section leadership changed, the group abandoned the idea that applied ethnomusicology was a constituent within SEM that was opposed to academic ethnomusicology, a view also abandoned by SEM leadership today. Titon writes that “[i]n the new millennium, as applied ethnomusicology has become increasingly popular among graduate students and welcomed inside academic institutions, the Section has become an SEM meeting-place and platform for ethnomusicologists based both inside and outside of academia as long as they are doing applied work.” Recently, the Applied Ethnomusicology Section has taken the broad focus of “ethnomusicology that puts music to use in a variety of contexts, academic and otherwise, including education, cultural policy, conflict resolution, medicine, arts programming, and community music.” The Section meets at a business meeting held at each SEM annual conference.

19 See also Hansen 1999, which describes such “cultural interventions” as based on academic theorizations and contributing to those.
20 Titon 2015a, 27.
21 Ibid.
22 Rasmussen ibid.
By 2007, when a group of 44 ethnomusicologists formed the International Council for Traditional Music’s Study Group on Applied Ethnomusicology, applied ethnomusicology was the main term in use internationally too. Attendees were interested in solving concrete problems via research and practical interventions. Problem-solving is also generally regarded as the task of applied anthropology. The study group defined applied ethnomusicology in 2007 as “the approach guided by principles of social responsibility, which extends the usual academic goal of broadening and deepening knowledge and understanding toward solving concrete problems and toward working both inside and beyond typical academic contexts”—a definition adapted from an applied anthropology textbook. Founding chairperson Svanibor Pettan added (also in 2007; again borrowing from the applied anthropology textbook) the aim that the group “advocates the use of ethnomusicological knowledge in influencing social interaction and course of cultural change.”

By 2008—when the ICTM Study Group on Applied Ethnomusicology started holding its biannual symposia so far on four continents, and specifically focused on solving concrete social problems—ethnomusicology in the USA had developed in diverse directions. US discourses of ethnomusicology substantially influence the field’s global discourses because the USA has the largest number of universities and colleges, as well as ethnomusicologists working within them, of any single country. For example, Titon had proposed in 2003 that applied ethnomusicology focuses on practical problems: “To me, ethnomusicology is the study of people making music. Applied ethnomusicology, then, is the application of that study: beyond mere documentation, beyond interpretation, beyond theory-building, and toward the solution of practical problems in the world outside the academy,” which is likewise congruent with applied anthropology. Also in 2003, other US academics ventured different definitions. Ethnomusicologist Amy Catlin-Jairazbhoy wrote that applied ethnomusicology is “ethnomusicology with a sense of purpose, and the purpose is to engender change, to participate fully as scholars in the world of practitioners, and to collaborate with them in the design and creation of new modes of musical being, using all the intellectual tools available to the otherwise ‘normal’ ethnomusicologist.” Folklorist Lucy Long, who researches food and foodways, emphasized ties of US applied ethnomusicology to public sector folklore and public folklore, which supported applied “academic emphases on individual bearers of tradition, on music as one outlet of expressive tradition within a culture, and on the

28 International Council for Traditional Music ibid.
29 Fenn & Titon 2003, 130.
significance of the situated performance context in constructing meaning.”

Today, a diversity of definitions in the USA continues to be reflected in Internet webpages of the SEM Applied Ethnomusicology Section. Stating “applied ethnomusicology is elusive to define,” the pages post Section-member attempts at definitions.

Certainly there was room for many understandings of the international field of applied ethnomusicology. That was the approach taken by Pettan and Titon when they edited *The Oxford Handbook of Applied Ethnomusicology* (starting in 2009; publication date, 2015). The editors deliberately did not supply their own or in fact any single definition of applied ethnomusicology for the contributors whom they invited to write for the book.

However, Titon’s introduction distilled a new and revised definition of applied ethnomusicology from the sort of work he saw in the field when he edited the handbook and in 2013–2014:

*Applied ethnomusicology* puts ethnomusicological scholarship, knowledge, and understanding to practical use. That is a very broad definition. More specifically, as it has developed in North America and elsewhere, applied ethnomusicology is best regarded a music-centered intervention in a particular community, whose purpose is to benefit that community—for example, a social improvement, a musical benefit, a cultural good, an economic advantage, or a combination of these and other benefits. It is music-centered, but above all the intervention is people-centered, for the understanding that drives it toward reciprocity is based in the collaborative partnerships that arise from ethnomusicological fieldwork. Applied ethnomusicology is guided by ethical principles of social responsibility, human rights, and cultural and musical equity.

An introductory text by Pettan re-asserted the focus on solving concrete problems important to the ICTM Study Group on Applied Ethnomusicology.

Chapter authors seemed to agree that applied ethnomusicology involved making an “intervention” with intention to stimulate a benefit or solve a problem. By 2015, these among other scholars had formed a coherent set of ideas about what applied ethnomusicology was, and what it was not, in international perspective, in English.

32 Long 2003, 98.
33 Society for Ethnomusicology ibid. See Dargie, this volume.
34 Pettan & Titon 2015.
35 Titon 2015a, 4.
36 Pettan 2015.
37 Pettan & Titon ibid.
38 Pettan ibid. (after Harrison & Pettan 2010, 16–17) reviewed what applied ethnomusicology was not:
1. Applied ethnomusicology does not stand in opposition to the academic domain, but should be viewed as its extension and complement.
2. Applied ethnomusicology is not an opposition to the theoretical (philosophical, intellectual) domain, but its extension and complement.
3. Applied ethnomusicology is not an opposition to ethnographic, artistic, and scientific research, but their extension and complement.
This understanding also is consistent with definitions of applied anthropology. For example, the Society for Applied Anthropology currently describes itself as promoting “the investigation of the principles of human behavior and the application of these principles to contemporary issues and problems.” Although applied anthropologists work in a range of settings like academia, business, law, health and government, the unifying factor is “a commitment to making an impact on quality of life in the world.”\(^{39}\) Today, the American Anthropological Association (AAA) strongly emphasizes applied and practicing anthropology, about which it includes a description on its webpages:

Applied or practicing anthropologists are an important part of anthropology. … Applied anthropologists work to solve real world problems by using anthropological methods and ideas. For example, they may work in local communities helping to solve problems related to health, education or the environment. They might also work for museums or national or state parks helping to interpret history. They might work for local, state or federal governments or for non-profit organizations. Others may work for businesses, like retail stores or software and technology companies, to learn more about how people use products or technology in their daily lives.\(^{40}\)

A process-inclusive definition is found in John Van Willigen’s *Applied Anthropology: An Introduction*: “applied anthropology is a complex of related, research-based, instrumental methods which produce change or stability in specific cultural systems through provision of data, initiation of direction action, and/or the formation of policy. This process can take many forms, varying in terms of problem, role of the anthropologist, motivating values, and extent of action involvement.”\(^{41}\) Today, applied anthropology and practicing anthropology are synonymous.

Applied ethnomusicology—influenced as it is by applied anthropology—deals with solving problems and enhancing quality of life. It is research-based in that it puts ethnomusicological knowledge to use, although “instrumental” methods or the “practicing” aspect could also include musical arts-making or -organizing.

### Engaged Ethnomusicology

Applied ethnomusicology has been engaging what today is fashionably called “engagement” for decades.\(^{42}\) Yet it’s difficult to find out exactly what is *engaged ethnomusicology*.

The term “engaged” is engaging. Beyond this, the engaged ethnomusicology literature is confusing. Tina Ramnarine equates engaged ethnomusicology with

---

39 Society for Applied Anthropology n.d.
41 Van Willigen 2002.
42 Dirksen 2012.
applied ethnomusicology, as defined in Seeger 2006, and also “ethnomusicology as advocacy.” In a 2003 article, Gage Averill equated engaged, applied and public ethnomusicology. In 2010, Averill explained that he preferred “engaged” because it faintly echoed “Paris ’68 and the call to an engaged intelligentsia.” He found public ethnomusicology “too allied to a Habermasian notion of the ‘public sphere’”; and “advocacy ethnomusicology … too rooted in political instrumentality.” He threw out “applied” because it “was often framed in the context of alternative career choices to academia, and didn’t yet ring with a broad obligation for ethnomusicologists (whether inside or outside of academic institutions) to share their experiences, training, and understanding widely.” However, it would seem that “engaged” is just as caught up in instrumental rationality, a term developed by Adorno and Habermas, as “applied.” Other ethnomusicologists echoed Averill’s preference and reasoning. Diane Thram adapted Averill’s 2003 use of engaged ethnomusicology for archival contexts, particularly at the International Library of African Music at Rhodes University, South Africa. In 2010, Eric Martin Usner, a graduate student in Averill’s at New York University, advocated for “engaged,” explaining that he reacted against the SEM Section’s aims. The Section’s webpage read at that time that it was devoted to “work that falls outside of typical academic contexts and purposes.”

If one looks beyond the views of the SEM Applied Ethnomusicology Section’s founders and their immediate predecessors, to the Section membership generally and the international field of applied ethnomusicology, it has never been true that applied ethnomusicology refers more to non-academics than academics. Titon writes that “more practitioners of applied ethnomusicology are employed within academia than outside it.” Seeger argues that distinguishing academic from non-academic in applied work is unhelpful. The current, internationally resonant concept of applied ethnomusicology does not make any imaginary distinction between academic ethnomusicology and non-academic applied ethnomusicology, mimicking as it does applied anthropology. Rebecca Dirksen notes that some

43 222–26.
44 Ramnarine 2008, 84–85.
45 Averill 2003.
46 Averill 2010, 8.
47 Ibid.
49 Thram 2014, 312.
50 Usner 2010, 88.
51 Titon 2012.
52 Titon 2015a, 24.
53 Seeger 2015.
54 The AAA definition of applied and practicing anthropology does not distinguish between “academic” and “applied,” as one notices on a careful read.
Ethnomusicologists also “favor ‘engaged ethnomusicology’ for its ability to reflect the researcher’s desire for a deep and sustained engagement with the community. But ... it is incorrect to claim that ethnomusicologists working within academia are not in fact engaged with the groups and individuals who participate in their research.” In Dirksen’s thinking, “engaged” seems redundant when used in connection with ethnomusicology.

Adding to the confusion, the title of the first-ever forum of the SEM and ICTM, held in Ireland in 2015, evoked engaged ethnomusicology whereas its description aligned with public sector ethnomusicology. According to a Call for Papers, “Transforming Ethnomusicological Praxis through Activism and Community Engagement” aimed to feature “some of the finest thinkers and social activists within the global academy of music scholars together with public sector actors/advocates/activists who understand the relevance of sound and movement studies in addressing social, political and environmental issues of urgent importance.” The stated motivation for the Call made the same points that had already been made in the same way in the applied ethnomusicology literature: “while there is now a long history in ethnomusicology of initiatives that have sought to address problems of inequality, conflict and oppression, and a shorter history pertaining to such matters as health and environmental change, the symposium will focus, not on the problems per se, but on the methodologies that could best enable our work to have greater social impact.” The stated focus is surprisingly the same as may be found in the applied ethnomusicology literature focused on method. If the forum did not define anything new, why promote other concepts?

**Comparison of Terms and Uses; Inspiring Ideas beyond Ethnomusicology**

Ethnomusicological writings have theorized “applied ethnomusicology” to a much greater extent than “engaged ethnomusicology” and combinations of “public” with “ethnomusicology.” The latter are yet relatively weak terms to use from a scholarly standpoint. However, ethnomusicologists working in all of these areas are part of large-scale transformations happening in ethnomusicology. Such scholars and practitioners are transforming ethnomusicology.

---

55 Dirksen ibid.
56 “Praxis” here was at odds with the idea of community engagement. Presenters at the conference spoke in academic terms, to an academic audience, and not in the communities supposedly engaged with.
57 Summarized in Harrison 2014, e.g., 22, 30.
58 I.e., the SEM-ICTM forum “Transforming Ethnomusicological Praxis through Activism and Community Engagement.”
If one wishes to work further on theorizing the latter terms, there is the possibility to strengthen ethnomusicological theorization with scholarship from adjacent disciplines. In anthropology, however, labels like “public interest anthropology” or “public anthropology” mostly have been said to “exist more as sets of ideas or frameworks than tested strategies of action.”\(^{61}\) There is one case in which public anthropology is no longer vague, and easy to critique as “indistinguishable” from (other) applied work.\(^{62}\) In 2001, Prof. Rob Borofsky founded the Center for a Public Anthropology. Borofsky’s public outreach projects, and publications including the book *Why a Public Anthropology?*,\(^{63}\) have aimed to foster “accountability standards in which anthropologists are evaluated less by the number of publications produced and more by the degree to which their publications address social problems”; to embrace “transparency—allowing the larger society to understand why to date the field has not lived up to its potential for serving the common good”; and to call for “the revision of anthropology’s ethical code … [so that] instead of focusing on ‘do no harm,’ anthropologists need to embrace a standard of doing demonstrable good.”\(^{64}\) Borofsky’s public anthropology has been critiqued though with the argument that “this image of anthropologists ‘reaching out’ from protected academic positions to a vaguely defined ‘public’ is elitist and out of touch with the working conditions of many anthropologists, especially those junior and untenured.”\(^{65}\)

Public folklore of course is well-developed as a field particularly in the USA; indeed, it has been called “an American invention.”\(^{66}\) Yet public sector folklore and public folklore’s attention to heritage and conservation, while persistently “hot” topics in applied ethnomusicology, has limited potential for ethnomusicology as a whole, as a cross-disciplinary inspiration. Contemporary ethnomusicology more broadly interprets music as and in culture, and people making music—any kind of music, including popular, jazz, art, “traditional” and so on. To some extent, though, public sector folklore and public folklore resonate with the terms that couple “public” with “ethnomusicology”—since they emphasize employees of the public sector and dialogues with “publics” (although publics, in folklore, are defined around “vernacular” expressions, heritage and conservation issues\(^{67}\)).

Engaged anthropology could serve as a point of inspiration for further developments in ethnomusicology. Setha Low and Sally Engle Merry reframe the entire history of anthropology as having “engaged” aspects, writing,

\(^{61}\) Rylko-Bauer et al. ibid., 185.
\(^{62}\) Van Willigen ibid., 8.
\(^{63}\) Borofsky 2011.
\(^{64}\) Center for a Public Anthropology 2011. A somewhat similar example to Borofsky from folklore is the American Folklore Society’s (n.d.) Position Statement on Promotion and Tenure Standards and Review, which seeks to educate university tenure committees on the value of public folklore work.
\(^{65}\) Field & Fox 2007, 6.
\(^{66}\) Baron 2007, xiv.
anthropology has pursued many paths toward public engagement on social issues. These avenues include (1) locating anthropology at the center of the public policy-making process, (2) connecting the academic part of the discipline with the wider world of social problems, (3) bringing anthropological knowledge to the media’s attention, (4) becoming activists concerned with witnessing violence and social change, (5) sharing knowledge production and power with community members, (6) providing empirical approaches to social assessment and ethical practice, and (7) linking anthropological theory and practice to create new solutions.\textsuperscript{68}

The authors consistently discuss “engaged,” but mention “applied” only twice. Anthropologists like Jeanne Simonelli, Jonathan Skinner\textsuperscript{69} and Merrill Singer\textsuperscript{70} critique the reinvention of public anthropology, including as engaged anthropology, for showing how “the hierarchies of academic/applied and the hegemony of academy anthropology marginalize applied/practicing anthropology’s long history of public work.”\textsuperscript{71}

As engaged anthropology has framed applied aims in ways that can easily be relevant to academic research, applied anthropologists have increasingly opposed distinguishing between pure and applied research. Ethnomusicology has joined in on this history at a time when the applied/academic binary has already been rejected in anthropology\textsuperscript{72} as well as folklore and sociology.\textsuperscript{73} What one finally names current trends in ethnomusicology is yet undetermined—although as in anthropology, applied scholarship has the largest and most fully developed literature. It should also be kept in mind that attempts to rename and rebrand applied anthropology—via “public” or “engaged”—have been unsuccessful compared to “applied.” One result of disciplinary-political infighting is that applied and practicing anthropology have attained hegemonic status in how the American Anthropological Association publicly defines anthropology. For example, on the “Advance Your Career” webpages of the AAA, anthropology is defined as including four sub-fields—archaeology, biological anthropology, cultural anthropology and linguistic anthropology—and all of these fields can be “applied” or “practicing.”\textsuperscript{74} The AAA career webpages actively promote not only academic careers, but equally careers in each of the public, private and third sector, offering appropriate online career support for both academic and applied paths.

If anthropology continues to be foundational to ethnomusicology as it is today, it would be a mistake to forget that applied and practicing anthropology have a lot to teach ethnomusicology’s applied, engaged, public or other societally relevant

\textsuperscript{68} Low & Merry 2010, 210.
\textsuperscript{69} Simonelli & Skinner 2013, 558.
\textsuperscript{70} Singer 2000.
\textsuperscript{71} Singer ibid. summarized in Low & Merry ibid.
\textsuperscript{72} MacClancy 2013, 18.
\textsuperscript{73} Dasgupta & Driskell 2007, 4.
\textsuperscript{74} American Anthropological Association: Advancing Knowledge, Solving Human Problems ibid.
formulations. If we are searching for what is now the most commonly used term in anthropology among those discussed, “applied” is it.

Seeger asks since many fields have “applied” disciplines, why use a different word in ethnomusicology?75 There is much that ethnomusicology can still learn from rich histories of applied scholarship in certain other disciplines. Pettan explains,

scientific and scholarly disciplines have their applied domains. To mention just some, there are applied mathematics, applied physics, applied biology, applied geography, applied sociology, applied anthropology, and then … applied musicology … If hydrology, for instance, is the study of water and encompasses “the interrelationship of geologic materials and processes of water” (Fetter 2001: 3), then “applied hydrologists are problem solvers and decision makers. They identify a problem, define the data needs, design a field program for collection of data, propose alternative solutions to the problem, and implement the preferred solutions” (ibid., 11). Applied sociology refers to “any use of the sociological perspective and/or its tools in the understanding of, intervention in, and/or enhancement of human social life” (Price and Steele, 2004), while applied anthropology refers to “any use of anthropological knowledge to influence social interaction, to maintain or change social institutions, or to direct the course of cultural change” (Spradley and McCurdy, 2000: 355).76

“Applied ethnomusicology” can be used if only for the sake of consistency with other disciplines.

Applied ethnomusicology is a powerful covering term around which to continue to organize scholars around a specific set of ethnomusicalogical practices it describes—for instance ethnomusicology in the public interest, public sector ethnomusicology and public ethnomusicology,77 The term “applied ethnomusicology” is also politically necessary because without it, the field can end up being swallowed up in the larger discipline of ethnomusicology and marginalized further than it already has been historically.78 Applied ethnomusicology is intellectually motivated: it is distinct from ethnomusicology being “properly practiced” especially because of its focus on problem-solving. The term is practically necessary so that people doing a similar thing can exchange ideas with one another and develop best practices. Due to a rapid increase in applied ethnomusicalogical work,79 the field is also necessary to support in undergraduate and graduate-level university education.

Yet there are critics. Samuel Araújo in one conference paper said, contrary to the argument given above, that all ethnomusicology is applied ethnomusicology and that the prefix applied is redundant.80 This was also the view of two of five ethnomusicologists who anonymously gave their perspectives to Pettan’s

75 Seeger ibid.
76 Pettan ibid., 34–35.
77 Seeger ibid.; Titon 2015a, 8.
78 Titon ibid.
79 Harrison 2014.
80 Araújo 2015.
introduction to *The Oxford Handbook of Applied Ethnomusicology*.\(^{81}\) Supporting that, the erroneous claim is made that “activism and community engagement [are] fundamentals of everything we do in the discipline” of ethnomusicology, therefore one can choose “not to bracket” applied work.\(^{82}\) This is incorrect because it ignores various areas of ethnomusicology. For instance, it ignores the analytical priorities of music theory-oriented ethnomusicologists like those associated with the group Analytical Approaches to World Music. These scholars are best not described as primarily “activist,” nor would they want to be described as such. Ethnomusicologists doing historical research, for example those associated with the ICTM Study Group on Music Archeology, may not focus on currently existing communities. “Engaged” connotes contemporary contexts, as described above. In the case of music archeology, “community engaged” does not accurately represent the main focus of the work if it is archeological and historical. In contemporary contexts, not all ethnomusicological actions are “activist” or “community engaged.” However, other ethnomusicologists observe a central place of applied work in large-scale shifts in the analytical and methodological orientations of large numbers of ethnomusicologists, not to the exclusion of different ethnomusicologies. Sally Treloyn\(^{83}\) writes of the Australian context, “To some extent the ubiquity of applied approaches … reflects a global shift towards praxis in ethnomusicology (Araújo 2008) and demonstrates the notion that all ethnomusicology entails social impact insofar as it involves engaging with musicians (Cottrell 2011, 229).” As Treloyn goes on to explain, and this article has described, there is much more to applied ethnomusicology than that.

**Ethnomusicology in Use**

Ethnomusicology today, to an increasing and great extent, requires pragmatic engagement with societal issues. This means, for applied scholars, as anthropologist John Van Willigen writes, “the commitment to action is a given; the challenge lies in continuing to find ways of acting more effectively and ethically while linking the specificity of local problem solving to larger sociopolitical contexts.”\(^{84}\) Culture-theoretically-driven ethnomusicologists are shifting disciplinary focus towards “current problems, as they are defined within the context of the larger social order” and away from problems defined solely “within the context of our discipline”\(^{85}\)—an example of which in ethnomusicology is a current interest in affect theory. Even

---

81 Pettan ibid., 48.
82 Diamond 2015, 3.
83 This volume.
84 Van Willigen ibid., 185.
85 Ibid. after Baba 1994, 175.
ethnomusicology’s cultural theory is intended to be put to use by larger social orders.

Coming back to Rasmussen, as ethnomusicological praxis changes, “we have to name what it is that we do.” Ethnomusicology’s shifts in the past two decades have included an increase in: participatory research practices; closeness of dialogue with research participants, who are often called consultants, friends or colleagues (We no longer use the word informants because it is a dialogue); awareness of impact; self-reflexivity of the researcher combined with the questioning of “objectivity”; and attention given to research ethics. Even though we may do all of these things, the result is not “applied” research or applied ethnomusicology, which refers specifically to the use of ethnomusicological scholarship, knowledge and understanding towards an “intervention,” made with intention to stimulate a benefit or solve a problem. The result could be a yet-broader-than-applied category of “engaged” ethnomusicology were we to replace “anthropology” with “ethnomusicology” in Low & Merry’s definition of engaged anthropology.

Applied ethnomusicology is one of the results in an epistemic shift in academic work towards greater practical relevance. That both “engaged” and “applied” have been considered redundant prefixes to “ethnomusicology” is indication of a major epistemic shift in orientation of a significant number of ethnomusicologists towards pragmatism and relevance in society. This is part of a widespread change across the arts, humanities and social sciences. What you call aspects of this shift and how you parcel them out is a matter of perspective, individual positioning and politics. Applied ethnomusicology is part of the increasingly valued and fast-growing area of ethnomusicology in use although not all ethnomusicology in use is applied.

Introduction to the Journal Issue

The articles in this collection take up one research challenge evident from the terminological confusion, which is that applied ethnomusicology worksites are not yet well understood. The articles study applied ethnomusicology in relation to institutions and their practices, which in organizations includes policy.

The volume is the outcome of a multi-year process of the ICTM Study Group on Applied Ethnomusicology, with its 300+ international study group members, during my Chairpersonship since 2011 and founding Chairpersonship beforehand. Papers and discussion groups at symposia in Europe, Asia, Africa and North America as well as ongoing collaborations between members showed that most commonly, ethnomusicologists do applied work, or direct it towards, diverse types of institutions.

86 Rasmussen ibid.
87 Low & Merry ibid.
According to sociologists Michèle Lamont and Mario Luis Small, institutions may be defined “robustly, as formal and informal rules, procedures, routines, and norms (Hall and Taylor 1996), as socially constructed shared cognitive and interpretive schemas (Meyer and Rowan 1991), or more narrowly yet, as formal organizations.”

Institutional economist Geoffrey Hodgson, in his well-known essay “What Are Institutions?” proposes a complementary definition,

Without doing too much violence to the relevant literature, we may define institutions as systems of established and prevalent social rules that structure social interactions. Language, money, law, systems of weights and measures, table manners, and firms (and other organizations) are thus all institutions.

Organizational theorist Stephen R. Barley and sociologist Pamela Tolbert write that institutions are, more simply, “shared rules and typifications that identify categories of social actors and their appropriate activities or relationships.”

Whereas this introduction focused on the question “Why applied ethnomusicology?” vis-à-vis scholarly fields and learned societies, the rest of the volume takes a diversity of institutional perspectives. A first main section considers organizations in three sub-sections respectively on governments; universities and music conservatories as well as learned societies; and the Christian church. The second main section considers the special case of self-organized institutions, which are comparatively informal and spontaneous.

Most of the authors chose to write about organizations. Hodgson writes, “Organizations are special institutions that involve (a) criteria to establish their boundaries, and to distinguish their members from nonmembers, (b) principles of sovereignty concerning who is in charge, and (c) chains of command delineating responsibilities within the organization.” Organizations can occur within the public sector, public sector or third sector. Most of the organizations discussed here are public sector. They include government-funded universities, conservatories and performing arts schools in Australia (in articles by Jennifer Newsome, Sally Treloyn), South Africa (in articles by Bernhard Bleibinger, Dave Dargie), China (Zhang Boyu), the Seychelles (Marie-Christine Parent) and the UK (Muriel Swijghuisen Reigersberg) as well as a Seychelles’ government ministry (Parent). Dave Dargie, though, in writing about the Christian church that solicits donations from individuals, addresses the private sector. Muriel Swijghuisen Reigersberg and Emily Joy Rothchild write about the third sector organizations—those that neither are public or private, but have a range of funding sources. Rothchild considers an organization that is operated by “a recognized foundation, relying on governmental grants.

88 Lamont & Small 2008, 89.
89 Hodgson 2006, 2.
90 Barley & Tolbert 1997, 98.
91 Hodgson ibid., 18.
“other foundations’ grants, and private & corporate donations.”

Swuijghuisen Reigersberg writes about academic societies of ethnomusicology including the SEM, ICTM and the British Forum for Ethnomusicology, which may make use of university resources (public and/or private) but also are funded by individual and corporate members and, at times, grants. Zhang’s example also discusses music exam centres, as well as exam-related publishers and books stores, which have public sector (Chinese government) and private components. These formal organizations all engage policies, either their own or other organizations’.

Jocelyn Moon uniquely focuses on largely informal routines, procedures and norms. She considers how sharing media files on the Internet can help sustain a musical tradition. These examples offer an opening to how the consideration of “institutions” as worksites of applied ethnomusicology can be further developed to include different sorts of “socially constructed shared cognitive and interpretive schemas.” If institutions are “systems of established and embedded social rules that structure social interactions,” these can also exist outside of formalized rules and norms.

Moon’s example can be called a “self-organized institution.” This is a special type of institution that “arise[s] in an undesigned way through structured interactions between agents.” However, as Hodgson reminds us, “even self-organizing institutions require a (rudimentary) language so, with the exception of language itself, the concept of self-organization must be qualified by the acknowledgement of the prior and extrinsic organization of communicative or interpretative rules.” In Moon’s case, rules of posting on the Internet were pre-existing, for example.

Some of the authors who write about organizations take the approach of administrative ethnomusicology. Pettan defines administrative ethnomusicology as a sub-type of applied ethnomusicology referring to “any use of ethnomusicological knowledge for planned change by those who are external to a local cultural group.” For example, Rothchild, based on research at a German hip-hop academy, offers insights on challenges of and best practices for music projects directed at migrant youth, and their integration into national societies and cultures. A critical evaluation, by Zhang, of China’s Standard Grade Examinations in Music addresses the system’s advantages from a learner’s perspective, and disadvantages from business, administrative and learners’ perspectives. Swuijghuisen Reigersberg’s article is an activist intervention into an outdated ethics policy at the SEM and lack of any ethics guidelines at the ICTM; other articles offer other policy recommendations.

94 Lamont & Small ibid.
95 Hodgson ibid., 18.
96 Ibid., 13.
97 Ibid.
Articles by Dave Dargie and Jocelyn Moon offer examples of another sub-area of applied ethnomusicology that Pettan calls “advocate ethnomusicology.” This refers to “any use of ethnomusicological knowledge by the ethnomusicologist to increase the power of self-determination for a particular cultural group.” Dargie and Moon made efforts towards sustaining traditional music practices respectively in South Africa and Zimbabwe. Some of the other authors list themselves as other types of advocates—for example, Rothchild, for migrant youth including in Germany; Newsome, for Aboriginal and Torres Straight Islander people in Australia; Bleibinger, for Xhosa people in South Africa studying music in university; and Reigersberg, for ethnomusicologists negotiating ethics clearances. Newsome sees advocate ethnomusicology as relevant to her case of Indigenous education.

In addition, several articles may be described as applied ethnomusicology research. For instance, Treloyn documents an “epistemic community” of Aboriginal Australian song research, and government policies that encourage much Australian research to be “applied.” Parent offers a critical and thoughtful reflection on methodological and ethical problematics of collaborating with government towards applied aims, in non-democratic countries. Applied work in institutions that are ideologically driven brings benefits, challenges, but also risks.

Based on these articles, and the symposia of the ICTM Study Group on Applied Ethnomusicology associated with them, it can be claimed that applied ethnomusicology means the use of ethnomusicological scholarship, knowledge and understanding towards an “intervention,” made with intention to stimulate a benefit or solve a problem within one or more institutions. Such interventions occur in organizations classifiable as public, private or third sector, but also within informal rules, procedures and norms. All of the article authors in this volume intervene or analyze interventions in institutions including their policies or practices.

Acknowledgements

Thank you to Jeff Todd Titon and Pirkko Moisala for their insightful comments on this article. The Academy of Finland funded its writing, as well as my general editing and copy-editing of all articles in Applied Ethnomusicology in Institutional Policy and Practice. Thank you to the Helsinki Collegium for Advanced Studies and COLLeGIUM journal staff for managing the volume’s peer review process, and arranging language checking of articles by non-Native-English-language authors.

This collection is an outcome of the ongoing collaborations among members of the ICTM Study Group on Applied Ethnomusicology via its international symposia particularly in Cyprus (2012), South Africa (2014) and Canada (2016, appliedethnomusicology.ca).

99 Pettan ibid., after Spradley & McCurdy ibid.
100 Harrison 2012.
References


Institutions I
ORGANIZATIONS

Government
Approaching an Epistemic Community of Applied Ethnomusicology in Australia: Intercultural Research on Australian Aboriginal Song

Sally Treloyn
The University of Melbourne, Australia

This paper uses Klisala Harrison’s concept of an epistemic community as a methodology, in order to understand applied ethnomusicological research on Australian Aboriginal song. It will investigate the ways in which the goals and methods of applied research are informed by institutional recommendations that emanate from an Indigenous rights agenda and Australia’s colonialist past and present, and will consider how applied ethnomusicology has been supported by recent regulatory and funding environments. Framing repatriation and intercultural collaboration as sites of critical discourse, an epistemic community of applied ethnomusicology in Australia is theorized as a site of convergent, pluralistic practices that respond to: social and political determinants of music endangerment; and, aims and principles prescribed by institutional documents that set out priorities for and govern the ethical conduct and design of academic research.

Introduction

In 2006 Stephen Wild asked, does ethnomusicology have “a distinctive voice in the antipodes?” observing that while American ethnomusicology “has been dominated by an anthropological approach that has militated against the analysis of musical sound … Australian ethnomusicology has been dominated by a musicological approach which has fostered the analysis of musical sound.” A description of ethnomusicology in Australia, some ten years later (in 2016), particularly ethnomusicological research on Australian Aboriginal song traditions (the subject of Wild’s research throughout his career), might read differently:

1 Harrison 2012.
2 Wild 2006.
3 Ibid., 351.
almost all ethnomusicological projects in Australia, while examining various musical traditions, also seek to produce knowledge about and promote change in approaches to music sustainability, archives and repatriation, education, cross-cultural understanding and/or other issues that affect the day-to-day lives of local and global communities. Adopting the account of applied ethnomusicology offered by the International Council for Traditional Music’s Study Group for Applied Ethnomusicology—as “the approach guided by principles of social responsibility, which extends the usual academic goal of broadening and deepening knowledge and understanding toward solving concrete problems and toward working both inside and beyond typical academic contexts”—it seems that applied approaches to ethnomusicology are almost ubiquitous in research on Aboriginal song traditions in Australia.

To some extent, the uptake of applied approaches to ethnomusicology in Australia reflects a global shift of praxis in ethnomusicology and demonstrates the notion that all ethnomusicology entails social impact insofar as it involves engaging with musicians. Indeed, looking beyond research on Aboriginal song traditions, applied approaches to ethnomusicology in Australia are common. Ethnomusicology is applied to music education and children’s musical cultures, to archives and archiving, to recording and media industries, to cultural heritage and resource management, and beyond. This paper adopts Klisala Harrison’s concept of an epistemic community as a methodology, to understand the applied nature of contemporary and historical intercultural research on Australian Aboriginal song. The Australian epistemic community of applied ethnomusicology is approached as a site of convergent, pluralistic practices that respond to: social and political determinants of music endangerment; and, aims and principles prescribed by institutional documents that set out priorities for and govern the ethical conduct and design of academic research. Writing as a non-Indigenous Australian ethnomusicologist, I suggest that historical and contemporary policy and institutions in Australia have fostered and even necessitate applied approaches to ethnomusicology and Aboriginal song in the neo-colonial settler state. In this paper I suggest that these necessitating factors position ethnomusicologists who work interculturally and collaboratively with Aboriginal members of cultural heritage communities as an epistemic community. Insofar as Australia and research in Australia operate from shadows of historic and systemic violence, I consider ways in which this epistemic

5 Araújo 2008.
6 Cottrell 2011, 229.
7 Harrison ibid.
8 The term “Aboriginal Australian” is used in this article to refer to the First Peoples of the continent that is today known as Australia. The term “Indigenous” is used when referring to Australian Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander people(s). “Non-Indigenous” refers to Australian people(s) who are neither Aboriginal nor Torres Strait Islander.
9 Bird Rose 1986.
community of applied ethnomusicology in Australia is distinctively marked by critical discourse on collaboration, impact and intercultural relationships. Following on from Harrison, through an examination of diverse manifestations of the application of these relational histories and institutions in ethnomusicological research, the article seeks to articulate a pluralistic, emerging, epistemic community of applied ethnomusicology engaging with Aboriginal song in Australia.

**Preservation, Tangible Benefit, Self-determination and Applied Ethnomusicology in Australia**

Beginning with Trevor Jones in the 1950s and continuing with the prolific output of Catherine Ellis, Alice Moyle and Jill Stubington (1960s–80s), ethnomusicology in Australia has long been preoccupied with recording Aboriginal song and, to some extent, its notation and analysis.10 The Australian Institute for Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Studies (AIATSIS), established in 196411 and governed by the Australian Institute of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Studies Act 1989,12 is today the primary repository of these recordings and associated documentation. Whereas the birth of ethnomusicological research in Australia in the 1950s subscribed to both anthropological (Richard Waterman) and musicological (Alice Moyle) schools,13 both of which continue today, the ethnomusicological recording of musical events in Aboriginal Australia has been set against of a backdrop of “preservation”;14 to create a record of intangible, oral musical practices that are at risk of endangerment.

The problem of music endangerment in Australia was triggered by invasion and colonial expansion by the British Empire, founded on the wrongfully applied international law of Terra Nullius (“a land belonging to no people”). Following the arrival of the British—who claimed the east and central portions of the continent in 1770 and the western portion, from 1827—Acts were introduced to control the lives of Indigenous peoples, impacting use of and access to land and food sources as well as employment, citizenship and basic human rights. Colonial expansion had a devastating impact on language and song practices, and the social worlds that they support. Chester Street, a linguist at the Centre for Aboriginal Studies in Music (CASM) in the 1980s, explained:

Confronted by force, ignorance and arrogant contempt, by the sheer weight of white numbers, by new authorities replacing the old …, the music and its embodied authority,

---

11 Originally the Australian Institute for Aboriginal Studies (AIAS).
13 Toner 2007, 86.
power and cohesion were wounded, often to death. ... Aboriginal people were dispersed from the places where songs ought to be sung, often by direct prohibition of performances or by the death of too many of the song owners. The songs could no longer be passed on. As an initiated Flinders Ranges man said in the 1960s:

We see everybody going to the pack boys and even girls—they just do what they like. The old people that went through the rules, they know better. White fellas interfered in our rules, stopping us from doing our corroborees. No songs—no rules.15

A Statement on Indigenous Music and Dance prepared in 2002 by delegates of the inaugural Symposium on Indigenous Music and Dance convened by Yolŋu leader, musician and educator M. Yunupiŋu (dec.), Indigenous academic Marcia Langton and Australian ethnomusicologist Allan Marett, at the Garma Festival of Traditional Culture at Gunyanjara in Arnhem Land notes:

Once found all across Australia, these traditions now only survive in a few regions, and it is estimated that ninety-eight percent of musical traditions have already been lost. Many senior composers and performers have passed away leaving limited or no record of their knowledge. Modern lifestyles and the ongoing devastating impact of colonization are affecting the dissemination of cultural knowledge between generations.16

To address this impact, a preservation approach to Aboriginal song traditions continues today and is advocated for in the Statement on Indigenous Music and Dance. This document is a manifesto of aims and directives taken up by the National Recording Project for Indigenous Performance in Australia, an initiative that was conceived at the 2002 symposium, and founded in 2005. The Statement on Indigenous Music and Dance affirms that “[t]he preservation of performance traditions is … one of the highest priorities for Indigenous people” and calls on researchers and institutions to orient their research agendas to the task of recording and preserving records of song: “the recording and repatriation of songs [should] … be supported by universities and other institutions”; “well documented recordings of Indigenous song [should] be published in order to educate the broader Australian public and international audiences about Aboriginal performance traditions” (ibid.).

The Statement on Indigenous Music and Dance is an institution in intercultural ethnomusicological research in Australia, insofar as its directives are widely subscribed to, discussed in the literature,17 and cited in funding applications. It has informed subsequent institutional documents, including the Statement on Indigenous Performance issued by the Australia and New Zealand Regional Committee of the International Council for Traditional Music (ANZ-ICTM), which states that “[t]he preservation of Indigenous Australian performance traditions

through recording and documenting is … vital for their survival.” The ANZ-ICTM Statement on Indigenous Performance also recommended that the National Recording Project for Indigenous Performance in Australia should be “supported and expanded in any way possible” on the basis that “[u]rgent action is required to ensure the preservation of those living practices that remain, for the benefit of all Australians, and for cultural diversity worldwide.”

The strength of these statements has contributed to numerous successful bids for funding put forth by ethnomusicologists and community members for the purpose of researching Australian Aboriginal song and for pursuing associated issues of preservation and repatriation.

Irrespective of whether ethnomusicologists respond to a “preservation” agenda or not, in designing and conducting research they must abide by standards for research prescribed by the National Statement on Ethical Conduct in Human Research 2007. This document regulates the conduct of research with humans in Australia, providing guidelines to researchers and to university ethical review boards. The National Statement suggests that researchers and research organizations that conduct research with Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander peoples also refer to the Guidelines for Ethical Research in Aboriginal and Indigenous Studies (GERAIS) produced by AIATSIS. GERAIS prescribes fourteen principles to apply in the conception, execution and consolidation of research. Several relate to themes and issues of direct interest to ethnomusicologists, such as diversity (Principle 1), intangible cultural heritage (Principle 3), traditional knowledge and traditional cultural expressions (Principle 4), and Indigenous, knowledge, practices and innovations (Principle 5).

More pertinent to the question of applied ethnomusicology in Australia is that all fourteen principles prescribed by GERAIS are underpinned by recognition of the rights of Indigenous peoples to cultural practices and knowledges, and—citing Article 3 of the United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples—to the rights of Indigenous peoples to determine how they will be researched and to participate in that research. Furthermore, all principles emphasize that tangible benefit, determined in consultation with participants, must result for Aboriginal contributors to the research.

---

18 ANZ-ICTM 2011.
19 The three bodies that developed the National Statement (the National Health and Medical Research Council, the Australian Research Council and the Australian Vice-Chancellors’ Committee) require that this statement “must be used to inform the design, ethical review and conduct of human research that is funded by, or takes place under the[ir] auspices” (NHMRC, ARC & AVCC 2007 [2015], 4).
20 AIATSIS 2012 [2002].
22 See AIATS ibid., 2.
As ethnomusicologist Muriel Swijghuisen Reigersberg has noted, the *GERAIS* principles can be read to foreground the requirement of positive impact—on the peoples and communities with which we work—as a prerequisite of project design, conduct and outcomes. Ways in which all ethnomusicological research can be viewed as applied have long been a subject of academic discussion, challenging notions that applied work does not involve knowledge production, and that pure research does not involve social impact. In Australia, however, all ethnomusicological research on Aboriginal song must be explicitly applied in nature, at least as far as *GERAIS* is applied and concerned. Jennifer Newsome from the Centre for Aboriginal Studies in Music (which played a key role in supporting Indigenous participation in the academy via the work of Catherine Ellis in the 1980s) has explained, “[a]pplied research … [is] an effective response to the call for self-determination and self-representation by Indigenous peoples in research.”

A further factor that supports applied research in Australia is the set of Strategic Research Priorities prescribed by the Australian government based on five identified societal challenges: living in a changing environment, promoting population health and wellbeing, managing our food and water assets, securing Australia’s place in a changing world, and, lifting productivity and economic growth. While it is not compulsory to do so, insofar as the large majority of research in Australia is funded under Australian government schemes, a grant applicant usually targets at least one of these challenges when seeking to secure competitive research funding. As Harrison has noted, “resultant ethnomusicological work is frequently ‘applied’ in that sense” in Australia and in similar systems elsewhere. The success of Australian ethnomusicologists in securing major research funding, guided by tangible benefit for and self-determination of Indigenous cultural heritage communities, suggest that this “applied” funding environment and context-specific, socio-cultural and political research policies have promoted the growth of applied approaches to ethnomusicology in Australia. The extent to which rights-based research guidelines and funding interplay to foster applied ethnomusicologies elsewhere in the world, either in contrast to or in synch with the Australian situation, would be a worthwhile topic of future research.

In the following two sections of this paper, ways in which principles of tangible benefit and self-determination have informed an Australian epistemic community of applied ethnomusicology, fostering critical discourses around repatriation and collaboration, will be considered.

---

23 Swijghuisen Reigersberg 2012.
26 Australian Government 2015.
27 Harrison ibid., 512.
Repatriation and Intercultural Collaboration

The “preservation” approach to ethnomusicology, characterized by recording and documentation, may be viewed as a form of “salvage ethnomusicology” reminiscent for many of colonial acquisition. As Australian historian Martin Thomas has suggested, “[w]ith some justification, the gathering of recordings can be associated with a broader history of cultural appropriation by colonial powers. Westerners have been making likenesses of the people they colonize since Columbus took mirrors to the Americas.”\(^{28}\) Such an approach is inextricably and problematically tied to the colonial roots of the Australian nation state. Treloyn and Ngarinyin/Nyigina cultural consultant Rona Googninda Charles,\(^{29}\) for example, explore the complex entanglement of current intercultural endeavors to preserve the Junba dance-song tradition in the Kimberley region of northwest Australia by recording, documenting, and archiving, with historical intercultural research that involved the stealing of human remains. Insofar as salvage ethnomusicology is premised on a deficit view of Indigenous cultural practices, it is also linked to State and Territory Aboriginal Protection Acts that supported policies that separated children from their parents, people of mixed heritage from those determined “full blood,” and people from their hereditary country, all predicated on a view that the Indigenous race would “die out”.

While using the term “preservation,” the *Statement on Indigenous Music and Dance* shifts attention towards the importance of using research to support the management of records of Indigenous musical traditions by the Indigenous stakeholders of those traditions and for purposes that Indigenous stakeholders determine. Exemplifying a global shift in discourse around intangible heritage sustainability,\(^{30}\) notions of vitality and cultural innovation are now seen as vital to preservation. The *Statement on Indigenous Music and Dance* identifies repatriation and dissemination of archival recordings as key to this, recommending:

That the recording and repatriation of songs to local Knowledge Centres be supported by universities and other institutions to assist Indigenous communities to integrate their cultural knowledge into a broad range of community activities such as education, bilingual and health programs; and that the maintenance of performance and ceremony be encouraged by their incorporation into community governance. …

That the establishment of local Knowledge Centres with digital storage and retrieval systems be supported as a basis for the repatriation of sound and visual records to communities. Such records play an important role in the maintenance and protection of tradition. Research should be conducted into the most culturally appropriate ways of storing and retrieving knowledge from computers. It is acknowledged that different

\(^{28}\) Thomas 2007, 118.

\(^{29}\) Treloyn & Charles 2014.

\(^{30}\) See Grant 2015.
communities may ultimately adopt different storage and delivery systems, and that there should be regular meetings to explore the success or failure of different strategies.31

The approach to recording and repatriation recommended in the *Statement on Indigenous Music and Dance* indicates a clear and distinct move towards self-determined management of past and present ethnomusical recordings by cultural heritage communities and for self-determined benefit. Self-determination—a trope of the Australian Indigenous rights movement that emerged in the late 1960s as a response to the dominant colonial assimilationist policies32—permeates both the *Statement* and GERAIS, which cites Article 3 of the Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples33 in noting that researchers must “[u]nderstand the meaning of self-determination in relation to Indigenous peoples and their rights to maintain, control, protect and develop their cultural heritage, including their traditional knowledge, traditional cultural expressions and intellectual property.”34 Accordingly, repatriation, guided by community management, has become almost ubiquitous in research on Aboriginal song in Australia.35

As well, by requiring that Indigenous peoples have input into determining what is studied and how, self-determination is embedded in the principle that stresses the importance of rights to participation. Principle 10 of GERAIS states that “Indigenous people have the right to full participation appropriate to their skills and experiences in research projects and processes.”36 Informing the application of self-determination to ethnomusicology, the *Statement* enshrines leadership by Indigenous stakeholders as the cornerstone of all preservation- and repatriation-orientated projects:

The production of both the recordings and documentation should be based on broad consultation with learned senior men and women who would control access to sacred knowledge in song texts. … This … will be conducted under Indigenous control with an advisory board of senior men and women from a broad range of communities guiding its priorities and strategies.37

A priority of enabling Indigenous participation and direction of research is a distinctive characteristic of contemporary applied ethnomusical research in Australia, moving participants beyond “informant” status to claim intellectual ownership of not just research content, but also process and method. This shift

32 See Kowal 2008.
34 AIATSIS ibid., 2.
35 See Treloyn & Emberly 2013.
36 AIATSIS ibid.
has been a long-standing priority of the Centre for Aboriginal Studies in Music and is increasingly embedded in project design.

Collaborative research and the movement of recordings, transmitted from hard drives to community repositories or private collections, via cables, Bluetooth, storage cards or shared online data repositories, can yield tangible benefits for communities. Interim results of a project that has been driven by the collaborative efforts of Treloyn, Indigenous leaders associated with the Mowanum Art and Culture Centre, Dolord Mindi Media (previously known as Barnjamedia) coordinator and manager Katie Breckon, and Rona Googninda Charles, exemplifies some of these benefits. In the course of the Junba Project (which was initiated as part of a three-year project supported by the Australian Research Council), elder teacher and singer Matthew Dembal Martin has described how the process of discovering, listening to and retrieving copies of recordings from personal and institutional archives for repatriation to the Mowanjum Community, has supported his learning and memory of songs and his task of teaching songs to younger generations:

TRELOYN: So, [is there] anything you want to say about why it's important to bring those old recordings back from Canberra, and how you have been using those old recordings for yourself, to teach kids?
MARTIN: Yeah, well the main thing is learning [teaching] kids—our next generation coming up—before they [the songs and dances] die away, you know …
TRELOYN: How do you teach the kids to dance with the old recordings?
MARTIN: Well, that's the recording, you go by the words: the meaning, you know. The meaning of the songs and what it's about: Country or … the spirit, [or] birds. Just follow that. … Follow the spirit. [The] spirit [will] always be there. … It's sort of bringing in to it, you know. Old old songs, old old people what been passed away, like you bringing the spirit back to you. So you … can carry on … [as] the teacher for them, for the next generation.
TRELOYN: It's like the spirits are helping you do the teaching.
MARTIN: Yeah, its like the old spirit comes back. You can't see it but you can feel it. … Singing… Dancing it brings memories back to [me], from the old time. … When young people dance, it brings back the memories of old people. They [the old people that have passed] are teaching them. Its just like … they’re happy to dance and you see the young kids running around. They are willing to dance. The spirit comes back to them, … to their spirit you know. … It sort of draws them in.

The process of collaborative repatriation in the Junba Project has also rested upon involvement of young people in managing digital collections of records of Junba, and in generating video documentary pieces about the tradition and the revival of Junba dances using these records. Preliminary application of

38 Newsome ibid.
ethnomusicologist Catherine Grant’s Music Vitality Endangerment Framework\textsuperscript{42} to the Junba performed at the annual Mowanjum Festival since 2010 has indicated an increase in musical and linguistic diversity that corresponds to the first five years of the Junba Project.\textsuperscript{43} Also evident, but more difficult to measure, are benefits to physical, social and emotional wellbeing of individuals and the community.\textsuperscript{44} Reports from ethnomusicologists conducting research elsewhere in Australia suggest that similar uses of repatriation processes and repatriated recordings also yield benefits for teaching and learning,\textsuperscript{45} music vitality and creative innovation,\textsuperscript{46} and social connectedness and well-being.\textsuperscript{47} Arguably, collaborative repatriation—moreso than recording—has become the primary research intervention that is used to address the problem of music endangerment in Australia, as ethnomusicologists recognize that processes and products of repatriation support self-determined processes of revitalization and reclamation.

**Critical Discourses of Repatriation and Collaboration**

As Harrison has noted, “theorization of approaches to applied ethnomusicology … becomes possible as we examine analytical frames of applied ethnomusicology in themselves and in terms of issues of social, cultural, and political power.”\textsuperscript{48} As the field begins to view repatriation as a new field of “critical discourse,”\textsuperscript{49} not just as a bi-product of research or as simply something that researchers do to “give back,” such an examination of the analytical frames of applied ethnomusicology is possible. We see this, in Australia at least, in repatriation and collaboration emerging as key research methods and topics, underpinned by rights-based principles.

Repatriation is a process that has the potential to render a range of benefits for cultural heritage communities, examples of which have been provided. Repatriation and the study of repatriation also makes a significant contribution to new approaches to the assessment of music endangerment that take into account social creative innovation, change as a factor in continuity, opportunity to practice music, and social attitudes about the health of traditions. However, as musicologist and ethnomusicologist Stephen Cottrell warned in his consideration of the impact of ethnomusicology:

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{42} Grant 2014.
\item \textsuperscript{43} Treloyn & Charles ibid.
\item \textsuperscript{44} Ibid.
\item \textsuperscript{45} See Campbell 2012 regarding the repatriation of song recordings to the Tiwi Islands.
\item \textsuperscript{46} See Campbell ibid., 2014, and Marett & Barwick 2003.
\item \textsuperscript{47} See Toner 2003, in reference to Arnhem Land.
\item \textsuperscript{48} Harrison ibid., 525–526.
\item \textsuperscript{49} Nannyonga-Tamusuza & Weintraub 2012.
\end{itemize}
[N]ot everything in the garden is rosy. If, in facing one direction, we confidently assert the positive outcomes of at least some of our activities, then this serves only to mask our Janus-like concerns with the underlying implications of some of those assertions.\textsuperscript{50}

Having established how applied ethnomusicology in Australia has developed according to principles of tangible benefit and self-determination, are we tacitly claiming that our practice carries less risk of perpetuating colonial power imbalances and repetitions than earlier acquisitive approaches? Do we claim that we have found our way to a distinctly Australian “decolonizing” ethnomusicological practice via attention to rights-based institutional guidelines and applied ethnomusicology that might even be applicable to other settler states, such as Canada, or, closer to home, New Zealand or Papua New Guinea? Do we risk falling into the “liberal tendency to minimalise or disavow difference”\textsuperscript{51} when we claim consensus and alignment between our research questions, methods and outcomes, and the priorities of Indigenous collaborators? Before we can answer these questions we must treat repatriation and collaboration as analytical frames, and, following Harrison, attend to issues of social, cultural, and political power in which they are entangled.

In Australia, there is a particularly uncomfortable proximity between, on the one hand, the history of intercultural research on Aboriginal song, and, on the other hand, the policies and interventions that have indisputably had a devastating impact on Indigenous peoples and the very linguistic and musical traditions that are the subject of study. At risk of over-simplification, insofar as the applied ethnomusicology described in this article responds to situations of music endangerment, it owes its very existence to the devastation caused by intercultural intervention in Aboriginal oral traditions.

Moreover, while collaborative research aims to support self-determination and equitable representation of Indigenous perspectives, and to support the rights of Indigenous peoples to determine how their cultural knowledges and practices are researched and represented, such a task is challenging. Achieving Indigenous self-determination and equitable representation of Indigenous perspectives in ethnomusicological research is complicated by factors ranging from difference between performers’ and Western ethnomusicologists’ ways of analyzing music, to inequities in access to education and resources, and is compounded by a lack of literature on the challenges and processes of intercultural research collaboration in Australia. As Somerville observes, “[t]here are many examples of ethnomusicological research in the contact zone of Indigenous and non-Indigenous collaboration but there is little discussion of how collaborative research processes

\textsuperscript{50} Cottrell 2011, 231.

\textsuperscript{51} Manathunga 2009, 168.
work in practice.”

We are yet to untangle our practice from the social, cultural, and political inequities and implications of colonialism.

Looking specifically at research centered on repatriation, the fact that the same records that may render benefits for communities of origin may also have a detrimental effect on musical vitality requires conscientious attention. Steven Knopoff describes the potential of recordings to “distort performance practice—by reinforcing notions of ‘fixed’ authoritative versions of songs over the traditionally oral, extemporal, and fluid approaches to performance.” Stephen Wild has similarly observed:

It can be seen that the fixing of interpretations by researching and archiving can …, by acceptance of an archival record as authoritative, interpose a factor in community adjustments which the researcher and the archivist did not intend and bear a responsibility for introducing.

In so doing, legacy records have the potential to freeze the fluidity of musical form, limiting the extent to which they can be used to adapt to changing environments (social, linguistic or technological). When legacy records are used in tools for teaching and learning, they possibly supplant face-to-face intergenerational transmission. In such cases, the potential for freezing—or for an undermining of the agency of some contemporary cultural heritage stakeholders—increases. Thus, as I have previously noted, repatriation is not an unambiguous good.

New media types, new technologies and new content management systems that are developed to help disseminate recordings, compound such risks. Supported by institutions and local organizations, including AIATSIS, ethnomusicologists, linguists, and others in Australia have participated in cross-sector, trans-disciplinary projects in efforts to make collections of data accessible to local stakeholders via ad-hoc (e.g., iTunes libraries) and specially-designed digital content management systems (such as Ara Iritija). With expansion of telecommunications and Internet systems across the Australian continent and open-source solutions (such as Mukurtu CMS), increasing numbers of communities are adopting these technologies. However, while designed to support access, content management systems give rise to a range of issues around access and the intellectual property of Indigenous cultural heritage. In “Opening Archives: Respectful Repatriation,” digital cultural heritage researcher Kimberly Christen Withey discusses the process of making the Mukurtu Wumpurrarni-kari Archive available to community members at the Nyinkka Nyunyu Art and Culture Centre in Tennant Creek, Northern Territory:

52 Somerville 2014, 17.
53 Knopoff 2004, see also Campbell 2014.
55 Treloyn & Emberly 2013.
While digital technologies allow for materials to be repatriated quickly, circulated widely, and annotated endlessly, these same technologies pose challenges to indigenous communities who wish to maintain traditional cultural protocols for the viewing, circulation, and reproduction of these newly animated and annotated cultural materials.\footnote{56}

Michael Christie, a specialist in Indigenous knowledge systems, education and new technologies, considers the ramifications of misfits between Indigenous knowledge systems and the platforms into which they are organized, warning:

Databases are not innocent objects. They carry within them particular culturally and historically contingent assumptions about the nature of the world, and the nature of knowledge; what it is, and how it can be preserved and renewed.\footnote{57}

With regard to technologies of repatriation, there is an emerging body of research that takes a critical look at database design, metadata and curation to support cultural innovation. There is also a groundswell of critical discourse about collaboration. Katelyn Barney’s 2014 volume Collaborative Ethnomusicology: New Approaches to Music Research between Indigenous and non-Indigenous Australians positions intercultural collaboration as its primary topic of research. This edited volume presents examples of intercultural collaborations that treat the “contact zone”\footnote{58} as a productive postcolonial “discomfort zone,”\footnote{59} where attention to difference (rather than homogenization) allows for hybridity and new knowledge.\footnote{60} Payi Linda Ford, Linda Barwick and Allan Marett\footnote{61} enact this postcolonial approach by finding ways to restructure research processes, including relationships between communities and researchers across generations, with Indigenous knowledge frameworks. It is also embraced in a growing body of scholarship by Australian ethnomusicologists that explicitly seeks to form collaborative relationships that recognize rather than erase the violence of past and present intercultural histories in Australia.\footnote{62}

The increase in presentations by Indigenous performers and researchers in the annual Symposium on Indigenous Music and Dance convened by the National Recording Project for Indigenous Performance in Australia and the growing number of publications on Indigenous song traditions written with or by Indigenous researchers also open paths for critical dialogue. Finally, increasing Indigenous leadership of research about song signals a new era of self-representation and

\footnotesize{\begin{itemize}
\item[56] Christen 2012, 192.
\item[57] Christie 2004.
\item[58] Pratt 2007 (1992).
\item[59] Somerville & Perkins 2003.
\item[60] Barney 2014, Treloyn & Charles 2014.
\item[61] 2014.
\end{itemize}}
critical voice in the ethnomusicological landscape: senior Indigenous scholars such as Payi Linda Ford and Steven Wanta Jampijinpa Pawu-Kurlpurlurnu Patrick, and a new generations of scholars (Clint Bracknell, in particular) are championing research into Indigenous song epistemologies, Indigenous research methodologies, records of cultural heritage in museums, and the digital circulation of records. The development of new Indigenous teaching and research spaces, such as the Wilin Centre for Indigenous Arts and Cultural Development at The University of Melbourne, further support the emergence of critical discourses in research about Indigenous song, arts practices more broadly and arts-based research.

**Conclusion**

This article has considered an epistemic community of applied ethnomusicology that addresses agendas of music endangerment, repatriation and collaboration. It has explored the ways in which applied research goals and methods are informed by Australia’s colonialist past and present, and by institutional recommendations for tangible benefit and self-determination that emanate from the recognition of Indigenous rights. The article has also critically analyzed repatriation and collaboration as frames of applied ethnomusicology in terms of particular social, cultural and political conditions of the neo-colonial settler state. Policies impacting Aboriginal peoples, Aboriginal song traditions and research on these song traditions have been entangled for as long as they have coexisted in Australia (from 1770 onwards). Intercultural research today operates on, and attempts to push away from, a colonialist stage, as actions (repatriation) and tools (recordings and digital content management systems) that support the vitality of traditions must be balanced against the risk of inadvertently harming them. Similarly, attempts to embed a decolonized intercultural collaboration in research and the achievements of those working in the “discomfort zone,” must be balanced against the risk of colonial entanglements, systemic social inequity, and a tendency to assume shared goals and consensus in collaborative work. The result is a need for continuing critical analysis and critical discourse.

As we begin to theorize applied ethnomusicology in Australia and beyond, and particularly repatriation and collaboration, as critical discourses that produce knowledge, it is necessary, as Harrison notes, that we “examine analytical frames of applied ethnomusicology in themselves and in terms of issues of social, cultural, and political power.”

63 Such a task is particularly required of the emergent epistemic community of applied ethnomusicology in Australia for reasons of social justice and human rights. Critical examination of intercultural research is also needed to equip ethnomusicologists and cultural heritage communities, in Australia and elsewhere, with frameworks, language and tools that will enable them to be “guided
by principles of social responsibility”—the core priority of the epistemic community of applied ethnomusicology in Australia and beyond.

References


Migrant Youth Hip-Hoppers in Hamburg, Germany: Negotiating Institutional Politics and Social Integration

Emily Joy Rothchild
University of Pennsylvania, USA

The Hamburg HipHop Academy is a city-supported institution, which uses hip-hop to socially integrate youths with migration backgrounds into the German nation-state. To progress upwards in the Academy’s hierarchical structure, youths build relationships with power-holders and peers, prove mastery of organizational norms, and conform their performance styles to the institution’s expectations. The Academy’s top-level Ensemble members act as cultural ambassadors for Germany through international exchanges. This article reveals how migrant hip-hoppers navigate the organizational politics of a German institution to become part of a “community of practice.” Effective self-advocates master the organization’s political structure through a process of micro-political integration. They learn a “shared repertoire” of actions, but these norms can inhibit youths’ opportunities to progress equally within the system and to express themselves fully. In order for a government-sponsored institution to help migrant youths integrate, all youths must be able to contribute to organizational and artistic decision-making processes.

Introduction to Hamburg, Germany, in 2016

The year 2015 was one of unprecedented change for Germany. 1.1 million asylum-seekers entered the country looking for refuge.¹ A welcoming culture emerged: urbanites flooded train stations to meet new arrivals and clothing donations overwhelmed local charities. 22,299 new asylum-seekers took refuge in Hamburg, Germany’s second most populated city (1.8 million).² Despite decades of uncertainty surrounding the social integration of immigrant populations, Germans presented a new face to the world. Integration, however, does not come without

---

¹ Pandey 2016.
² Flüchtlinge: Daten zur Zuwanderung 2016.
challenges. In fact, the country is still working to integrate 2nd and 3rd-generation migrant descendants, i.e., children or grandchildren of immigrants who arrived either as guest-workers in the 1950s to 1970s or as political or economic refugees in the 1980s–1990s. Prior to the refugee influx, Germany tallied four million “ethnic Muslims.” Unfortunately, alongside Germany’s welcoming culture, Islamophobia has resurfaced with protesters expressing fear of Muslims “taking over” the nation-state.

Amidst this socio-political climate, social integration projects are a practical solution to engage migrant youths and help them belong to the local community and by extension to Germany. According to the United Nations, social integration constitutes “a dynamic and principled process where all members participate in dialogue to achieve and maintain peaceful social relations.” Thus, for social integration to work, members of the host society and newcomers need to interact with another. The Hamburg HipHop Academy is one such integration project founded in 2007 in the eastern city district Billstedt. Through artistic expressions of hip-hop, the institution seeks to socially integrate participating youths (13–25 years old)—80% of whom have migration histories. The approximately 550 participants’ stories are as diverse as their ethnic backgrounds, whether Turkish, Vietnamese, Persian, Kurdish, Macedonian, Russian, Ghanaian or German.

As a participant observer from 2010–2014, I attended Academy Tanztheater-produktionen (dance theater productions), battles (dance-offs) and camps. I led interviews with classmates, Academy trainers and administrators, underground hip-hoppers, integration workers and schoolteachers in order to understand their views on the Academy’s efficacy as a social integration project. I also enrolled in a Level 1 NewStyle dance course in an immigrant-dense district of eastern Hamburg. There, I experienced firsthand the social integration into German society that is possible through hip-hop.

Applied ethnomusicologists can contribute greatly to social integration work. I strive to be an “advocate” anthropologist of music—one who uses her resources and output “to increase the power of self-determination for a particular culture group.” In this article, I aim to offer ideal solutions for integration that can best help migrant youths while at the same time, recognizing the human element of any institution, and the time and financial resource constraints of non-profit organizations. Applied ethnomusicologists are in a unique position to work towards social integration because music can act as an entry point for mutual communication among diverse

---

4 Kathleen Van Buren (2010, 219) reminds applied ethnomusicologists that every community faces myriad problems and that we should not lose sight of that fact. In this paper, I focus on the Academy’s social integration aims, however there is another basic result of the organization’s popular dance classes: physical exercise.
5 Kanzlerin besucht Sprachkurs und HipHop-Academy 2010.
groups of people. After establishing a key commonality and developing trust, applied ethnomusicologists then can delve more deeply into social or political issues.

Herein, I examine how migrant youths navigate the structures and politics of a government-funded institution. Their testimonies show how relationships to power players and peers affect social bonds in and feelings of belonging to a “community of practice.” A social learning theory of educational theorist Etienne Wenger, “community of practice” explains that in order to feel belonging in a community, one must “mutually engage” in a “joint enterprise” and take on common practices known as a “shared repertoire.” In this article, I reveal how politically savvy students master the Hamburg HipHop Academy’s political structure and norms, become successful self-advocates within the institution, and form their own community of practice. Through this process of social integration at the micro-level—what I term “micro-political integration,” they learn a “shared repertoire.” However, these norms of practice, particularly gendered ones, can inhibit chances for youths to progress equally within the system and express themselves fully. For all youths to feel as if they belong to the Academy community, it is essential that they can contribute their opinions to organizational and artistic decision-making processes. This is the ideal scenario. The challenge is—how do we best listen to less dominant voices? With this issue in mind, my article offers suggestions for future integration work via performing arts.

Meet the Hamburg HipHop Academy

Located near the train station in Billstedt, an eastern Hamburg district with more than half of its population having a migration background, the Kulturpalast cultural center houses the Academy’s offices and rehearsal spaces. The Academy also operates courses in schools and youth centers often in economically disadvantaged neighborhoods throughout Hamburg. In a city where private sports club fees are expensive and in-school sport teams and extra-curricular activities are limited, the Academy gives Level 1 students a place to learn new skills, build muscle strength and memory, and become physically and emotionally healthier youths.

In cooperation with the Kulturpalast, Turkish-German b-boy (breakdancer) Metin and “ethnic German” b-boy/graffiti artist Christian conceptualized the Academy as a project to benefit Billstedt youths by teaching them socially positive behavior through breakdancing, DJing, NewStyle dancing, graffiti art, beatboxing, rapping,

---

8 For literature on music, inter-cultural understanding and (double-sided) social integration efforts, see Hemetek 2010, Pettan 2010 and Skyllstad 2015.
10 Hamburger Stadtteil-Profile 2013, 41; Regionalergebnisse 2011.
producing (beatmaking, record producing) and singing courses.⁵¹ Metin shared the Academy aims to use hip-hop to “unite people over all borders so that they can create something new together.”⁵² According to the Academy, by “transcending cultural differences,” Academy participants then can “exemplify effective and sustainable integration.”⁵³ Supporting and promoting a cohort of professionally trained artists called the Ensemble who tour internationally and perform Tanztheaterproduktionen (dance theatre productions), and transforming hip-hop into high culture or Hochkultur are primary concerns. Hip-hop as high culture materializes best in the Ensemble’s contemporary/modern Tanztheaterproduktionen. Participating in these shows, however, is contingent on a participant integrating into the Academy itself.

Cultural Policy Bridges

The City of Hamburg’s agency of culture or Kulturbehörde provides a large portion of the Academy’s operating monies. The Academy structures its offerings in part to match the Kulturbehörde’s guidelines for the cultural exchange division, which funds intercultural and international exchanges. The intercultural funding guidelines specifically favor projects that bridge diverse groups of people through intercultural exchanges and have a cross-border effect or “grenzüberschreitende Wirkung,” which could mean blending “mainstream” or “subculture” or “traditional” or “modern” performance genres.⁵⁴ The Academy fulfills these aims both through the Ensemble’s Tanztheaterproduktionen, which have mixed mainstream and subculture and/or traditional and modern genres (e.g., Baroque music and hip-hop), and through artistic intercultural and international exchanges at home and abroad.

These exchange efforts ideally produce bridging social capital, which produce greater trust among people with different social backgrounds, in this case via interethnic and inter-socioeconomic relationships and social networks.⁵⁵ Bridging social capital often forms following the creation of bonding social capital: social networks among people with similar ethnic, religious or socioeconomic backgrounds. Both forms of social capital engender collective benefits of trustworthiness and mutual reciprocity, and thereby can contribute to social integration within society.⁵⁶ Bridging social capital, though, is especially important because it means that diverse types of people are engaging with one another—whether they’re performers of

---

⁵¹ Home 2013; Metin 2013. All German-source quotes have been translated into English.
⁵² Metin 2013.
⁵³ Fördern 2014.
⁵⁶ Putnam 2000, 19, 22.
different nationalities during an intercultural exchange or audience members and youths at a Tanztheaterproduktion. Essentially, if ethnic Germans and migrants bridge with one another and develop trust, they are more likely to accept each others’ differences and live together peacefully.\textsuperscript{17}

Additionally, German politicians benefit from the Academy’s work and seek opportunities to highlight Academy youths’ talents and any of the project’s integration successes. Angela Merkel visited the Academy in 2010; Hamburg mayor Olaf Scholz travelled to Marseilles in 2013 to regale the Academy’s international exchange with Marseille’s Di6danse Crew.\textsuperscript{18} Cultural studies specialists Toby Miller and George Yudice write of a tendency among governments to not only “discipline” constituents but also “to \textit{showcase} and \textit{market} the citizen.”\textsuperscript{19} In other words, by supporting projects that train migrant youths to be performers, the government in return receives examples of disciplined, integrated youths whom they can send abroad as cultural ambassadors.

\begin{center}
\textbf{Joining an Academy Community of Practice: A Process of Micro-political Integration}
\end{center}

Academy students begin the process of joining a community of practice—one I link to micro-political integration—from day one.\textsuperscript{20} Still, micro-political integration into the Academy happens through long-term engagement. Students first build relationships with one another, and learn social norms, practices and values. Next they connect with trainers and administrators, and master the organizational structure and power hierarchy. Academy participants then fit into an organizational mold and have learned accepted social behaviors that can benefit their “macro-political” integration into German society.\textsuperscript{21}

Academy beginners start in Level 1. Approximately five hundred students (or approximately 91\% of Academy participants) participate at this level at about 35 youth centers and schools throughout Hamburg. Students can just “show up” at any time during the cycle of the course. The roughly 9\% remaining students participate in Levels 2, 3 or the Ensemble. Almost all courses beyond Level 1 take place at the Kulturpalast.\textsuperscript{22} If a trainer notices a student is dedicated and talented, he might recommend the student try out for Level 2. About 50 students participate in Level 2 courses that focus on increased professionalization. Students who have mastered Level 2 can continue on to Level 3, sometimes known as the Master

\begin{flushleft}
\textsuperscript{17} Rothchild 2016. \\
\textsuperscript{18} Bürgermeister zeigt sich beeindruckt von der Academy 2013. \\
\textsuperscript{19} Miller and Yudice 2002, 27. \\
\textsuperscript{20} Wenger 1998, 72–78. \\
\textsuperscript{21} Ibid., 173–174. \\
\textsuperscript{22} HipHop Academy Hamburg: Lokal – Global 2013.
\end{flushleft}
Class. In addition, as of 2014, talented students from Level 2 NewStyle merged with the former Level 3/Master Class to form an intensive show group or *Intensiv/Showgruppe*. The group participates in international exchanges like the one to Marseilles.\(^\text{23}\)

The pinnacle of one’s “career” at the Academy is the Ensemble. The Ensemble consists of approximately twelve youths (age 18+). Their talents include NewStyle dancing, bboying, graffiti art, beatboxing and rap. Students are paid to participate in Tanztheaterproduktionen, which play in Hamburg and tour Germany and abroad. For students desiring a professional career in performance, participating in the Ensemble is an incredible opportunity for publicity and advanced training. From an organizational perspective, these students have micro-politically integrated into the Academy, and, through their mutual engagement, constitute their own community of practice.

### Learning the Shared Repertoire

Demonstrating micro-political integration begins with mastering organizational norms. Students in an organization or a community of practice must learn the “shared repertoire”—in Wenger’s words, “[r]outines, words, tools, ways of doing things, actions or concepts that the community has produced or adopted in the course of its existence, and which have become part of its practice.”\(^\text{24}\) As more students become aware of this “collective knowledge,” the meaning of these shared habits or behaviors grows.\(^\text{25}\) Students learn the repertoire of norms from their instructors and peers. Trainers emphasize being punctual, following rules, acting professionally, showing respect for trainers and classmates, and being disciplined. Students who master these social norms become acolytes of what they have learned. They then spread shared ethics to their classmates or students, thereby demonstrating allegiance to the community and organization as well as an interest in improving it.

### Participant Views of the Organization

When examining an organization’s operations, one must grasp its structure, function and goals. Political theorist Christina Boswell explains that political “interests” and “performance goals” drive organizational behavior. An institution benefits if members feel they belong. Thus, organizations often respond favorably

\(^{23}\) Ibid.; Peter 2013. Course totals and analysis of Academy offerings reflect programming as of February–August 2014.  
\(^{24}\) Wenger 1998, 83.  
\(^{25}\) Willner 2011, 166.
to demonstrations of “loyalty” or “commitment.” To guide youths’ actions, organizations like the Academy must develop an easily comprehensible “set of norms and beliefs,” provide a “shared cognitive frame,” and assist students in figuring out the institutional environment. Furthermore, “organizations also develop rituals, roles, and practices to help reduce uncertainty and stabilize social relations among members.” These processes may be taken to describe the development of shared repertoire within a community of practice. To ensure student loyalty and attempts towards advancement, Academy trainers should transmit organizational practices that lead to micro-political integration into the Academy. Generally speaking, one might presume that the more advanced a student is at the Academy, the more aware she would be of Academy goals. The greater her awareness of goals, the more she could contribute to goal-setting, the organization’s focus, and productions.

Due to the hierarchical structure at the Academy, views on micro-political integration change significantly according to one’s place in the hierarchy. For beginners, micro-political integration begins with feeling comfortable and welcome in a neighborhood-based Level 1 course regardless of one’s background; here social bonds and sometimes bridges begin to form in the neighborhood. An intermediate Level 2/3 student might desire belonging or acceptance in the Billstedt-based Academy community and bridge with students from other neighborhoods. For a micro-politically integrated Ensemble member who tours internationally, micro-political integration asks for mastered social norms and professionalism and the ability to bridge with global artistic partners in intercultural exchanges abroad. Thus, one’s social and geographical positioning—whether in one’s neighborhood, at the Billstedt headquarters or touring abroad—alters a participant’s level of micro-political integration and ability to form bonding and/or bridging social capital. In this section, Academy participants share their experiences in becoming part of the organization.

Among beginners Anneliese (19) and Pamela (16), with whom I danced in Level 1, awareness of Academy goals differed, suggesting our trainer’s transmission of Academy aims was not precise. Anneliese, a high school student from an upscale neighborhood, cited the Academy’s purpose was to give youths from “problem neighborhoods” a chance to dance. She did not think most beginners knew the Academy was a social integration project; rather, kids came to dance and have fun. Anneliese found hip-hop to be an effective medium for social integration because it “unites” all youths, a sentiment with which Pamela agreed. Pamela did not hold

26 Boswell 2009, 11.
27 Ibid.
29 Anneliese 2013. Due to the candid nature of student interviews on this article’s theme, I have given interviewees pseudonyms from multiple languages. Pseudonyms do not necessarily match interviewees’ ethnicities, but do reflect gender. In the case of the Academy co-founders, I use actual first names. Interviewees’ ages reflect their approximate ages at the time of interview.
German citizenship yet and fit more of the image policymakers envision when funding social integration programs. She knew integration was an Academy goal and found it to be a good method because: “Dancing and music often bring people together and at the HipHop Academy, there are a lot of foreigners and through the music, one often has fun dancing and it mutually helps people.”30 These young women’s statements demonstrate that the Academy’s potential for social integration varies depending on each student’s background. Although our course took place in a neighborhood with a 35% migrant population, about half of our classmates were similar to Anneliese, being relatively financially well-off—hardly policy-makers’ target group. That said, for social bridges to form between youths with migration and working class backgrounds like Pamela and “ethnic Germans,” students like Anneliese must be present and, in my view, a 50/50 distribution of ethnic German students and students with migration backgrounds would be ideal for bridging.

Maria (15) is a Level 2/3 dancer and Intensiv/Showgruppe participant. She started NewStyle at the Academy when she was thirteen years old. Although Maria is unsure of the Academy’s official goals, she finds Academy administrators’ focus largely to be procuring and producing paid engagements. Still, she claims micro-political integration is embedded into the Academy system. Anyone can enter the institution, feel “at home” and progress within the hierarchy.31

Former Level 2 student Yağmur (24) also called the Academy a community and characterized it as a family. She felt every person was welcome, regardless of his or her origins or German fluency.32 Yağmur made some friends at the Academy, but she knew most people previously. Students with pre-existing bonds, such as friends from class or a former teacher from dance school, tend to do better in the Academy system.

Among “integrated” Ensemble members, views on the Academy’s goals and the ability to micro-politically integrate differ significantly. One might assume that Academy aims would be clearest to micro-politically integrated students who have ascended the organization’s ranks and helped structure institutional offerings by taking part in the goal-setting process—having contributed their opinions as to what classes, levels, and artistic productions the Academy should offer and what content and output these offerings should display. Nevertheless, goal recognition and perceptions of the Academy differed significantly depending on an Ensemble member’s hip-hop expertise (e.g. NewStyle, graffiti, etc.).

Ensemble member Jeff’s (24) view on the Academy’s purpose was tied closely to professional development. Although he believed that hip-hop in itself was an integrative force that could build community, his specific formulation of the Academy’s purpose did not include bridging diverse groups of people, which was part of the Academy’s initial scheme and is specified clearly in its fundraising materials. He

30 Pamela 2013.
31 Maria 2013.
32 Yağmur 2012.
attributed its integration impact to be tied largely to language development among migrant youths, as he considered the majority of his students already to be socially integrated but mentioned that some lacked flawless language skills. Jeff’s personal teaching focus thus centered less directly on social bridging. He valued different organizational goals like building professional artists, but to achieve continual growth (and funding), the Academy must ensure clear transmission and reproduction of its social integration “bridging” goals as well. As a trainer, Jeff was a key person to perform these actions and perhaps with Germany’s refugee influx, this goal will become more prominent in his courses as well.

Ensemble member Joachim (25) is a long-term Academy member and witnessed the evolution of Academy goals since the institution’s beginning. Initially, he felt Academy participants shared something akin to what Wenger terms a “joint enterprise”—a “stated goal” that “creates among participants relations of mutual accountability”—which could reinforce students feeling like they belong to a community of practice. As a student, Joachim established contact with diverse types of people. But six years after the Academy’s founding, he primarily interacted with Academy colleagues who had similar social backgrounds to him, i.e. having strong educational prospects and coming from economically stable families. Joachim attributed the Academy’s shifting demographics to its structural change towards being an agency or Agentur for high culture artists. Specifically, the creation of the Ensemble helped to fulfill the Kulturbehörde (Hamburg city culture agency’s) intercultural-exchange funding guidelines of bridging sub- and mainstream cultures through bringing hip-hop to mainstream stages (or to high culture). The Ensemble even paired with the chamber music orchestra Ensemble Resonanz for the Tanztheaterproduktion called Sampled Identity in 2013. In other words, although the Academy initially achieved social integration almost exclusively through its local courses, as its artistic exchanges and Tanztheaterproduktionen have increased, the Academy’s focus has expanded to include bridging international artists and genres. That said, Joachim’s impression also could have changed due to his upward progression within the system—meaning if he were to participate in Level 1 today, he might find perceptions of the Academy to be more heterogeneous, which is the finding of my research.

33 Boswell 2009, 11.
36 Joachim 2013.
Professionalization at the Academy

The Academy has grown to become a training school where burgeoning artists can professionalize their skills. Trainers and students regard the professionalization aspect of the Academy both negatively and positively. As the Academy continues to develop its professionalization focus, I believe it is crucial that students feel comfortable with their instructors so they can form bridging mentorships, which can catalyze a student’s integration into the Academy. In my own course, I saw how Pamela benefitted from connecting with our instructor. Although he did not share information about how to advance within the institution during class time, he imparted this knowledge to Pamela one-on-one so that she had the opportunity to go further.

One critic of the professionalization was Sophia: a bubbly, nineteen-year-old, former intermediate Academy dancer. She exuded energy and busted out b-girl moves for a mini photo shoot at the end of her interview. She felt the Academy’s shift towards professionalism and being an agency restricted artistic expression. When students first entered the Academy, she felt many wanted to train as a group rather than compete against one another. As they became aware of numbered Levels 1–3, Sophia found students considered themselves to be more talented or professional based on these divisions. She disliked having to dance with particular people, through choreographed routines, rather than choosing her partners as she would at a hip-hop battle. She claimed the need to present an onstage product trumped the emotional attachment students had for one another. What is missing then from Sophia’s experience? Essentially, due to the Academy’s power dynamics, professionalism focus and hierarchical structure, Sophia did not feel she bonded or bridged well with other participants in her level. By contrast, she feels emotionally connected to other dancers during underground battles and community jams outside the Academy.

Overall, participants’ views on the processes of becoming part of the Academy’s community of practice differ depending on their perceptions of and social relationships within the Academy. Dropouts viewed the Academy less favorably [Sophia]; Ensemble members who made a living from the institution were more positive if the organization was moving in their preferred direction [Jeff, Peter]. In the next section, I highlight how academic theories about organizations can inform a clearer understanding of the Academy and the “political behavior” of students, trainers and administrators.

38 Pamela 2013.
39 Sophia 2013.
41 Sophia 2013.
The Organization and its Politics

To micro-politically integrate into the Academy, a student must learn the values, norms and behaviors of the organization, a task that is inherently political. Sociologist Andrew Pettigrew believes “political behavior” is “behavior by individuals, or, in collective terms, by sub-units, within an organization that makes a claim against the resource-sharing system of the organization.”42 Within organizations, members share duties and form “sub-units,” which bond together around specific tasks. At the Academy, these sub-units form naturally through the division of classes and levels. Pettigrew explains that tension can arise in organizations because each sub-unit has its own special interests. Disagreement occurs at the Academy among trainers and students regarding the structure and focus of the institution and consequently, political behavior plays out. According to Pettigrew, within organizations, sub-units (interpreted here as Academy levels) attempt to procure limited “resources” (e.g., money, rehearsal space, instruction). The sub-units, like the Ensemble members, that succeed are those that convince power-players of the worthiness of their cause.43 The most successful integrated sub-units are negotiators who know when to put in a request and correspondingly receive more engagements, money and exposure, sometimes at the expense of Level 1 students, the Academy majority.44

Sociologist Tom Burns’ explanation of corporate organization resonates with the Academy’s operations:

Corporations are co-operative systems assembled out of the usable attributes of people. They are also social systems within which people compete for advancement; in so doing they make use of others … The hierarchic order of rank and power that prevails in them is at the same time a single control system and a career ladder.45

One sees a corporate-like structure at the Academy through its entrenched hierarchy with the top echelon receiving increased benefits and responsibility. Within an organization, “power is, then, a property of social relationships, not an attribute of the actor,” and can take many forms.46 Administrators retain power over Ensemble members because they give them the opportunities and resources they desire, whether Ensemble income, class offerings or international exchanges. Still, trainers do not have the same hold over Level 2 and 3 students because they offer classes that youths could take through other integration projects or if economically able, at private dance schools.47 For resource holders—here

42 Pettigrew 1973, 17.
43 Ibid.
44 Ibid.
47 Additional Hamburg non-profit organizations with a hip-hop focus include ElbCoast Unity, DeluxeKidz e.V., and Crossover e.V.
Academy administrators—to hold power, they must make students “dependent” on and “obligated” towards them—consistently giving students the programs they desire yet could not afford or find through other organizations.\(^4^8\) For Ensemble members and trainers, the Academy offers a significantly larger amount of work opportunities for hip-hop instruction than other integration projects, which puts instructors in a weaker position to negotiate pay or other benefits.\(^4^9\)

Such political behavior at the Academy reinforces the importance of integrating into the Academy system. Pettigrew shares, “as long as organizations continue as resource-sharing systems where there is an inevitable scarcity of those resources, political behaviour will occur.”\(^5^0\) Many organizations prize and positively recognize “upward” progress (e.g., at the Academy, reaching the Ensemble).\(^5^1\) When this occurs, participants might “attempt to influence procedures for upward mobility.”\(^5^2\) Pettigrew makes observations about “resource-sharing” that also apply to the Academy. He suggests that when a sub-unit (i.e., an Academy level) receives “new resources” (e.g., at the Academy—a grant, city funding, or international exchange), it could try to contribute more to the organization’s decision-making. This could be viewed as positive, but could also incite jealousy or defensive behavior in other levels accustomed to having greater clout. This change in the allocation of resources can result in “new political action” and upset “the existing distribution of power.”\(^5^3\)

### Academy Authority

A key aspect of mastering micro-political integration is the ability to respect leaders and connect with them because authority figures generally possess the most power within organizations. Pettigrew describes sociologist Talcott Parsons’ position that “authority refers to the legitimate position of an individual or group.”\(^5^4\) Political scientist Joseph Nye also emphasizes the need for institutions and their leaders to have established “legitimacy” before their power is effective.\(^5^5\) Pettigrew overviews the debate between Parsons and sociologist Anthony Giddens about where power truly lies. To Parsons, power belongs to “the achievement of collective


\(^4^9\) Although instructors can work with other integration projects for specific events, the Academy provides regular, weekly work. Dance instructors also can and do work for private dance schools.

\(^5^0\) Pettigrew 1973, 20.

\(^5^1\) Ibid.

\(^5^2\) Ibid.

\(^5^3\) Ibid., 20–21.

\(^5^4\) Pettigrew 1973, 24 referring to Parsons 1967, 319.

\(^5^5\) Nye 2011, 82–84, 91.
goals."\textsuperscript{56} The Academy’s structure is shifting, however, and there is little agreement regarding the direction of the organization. Student goal-recognition also varies, as some students like Anneliese were aware of the project’s integration focus and others like Maria were not. Giddens argues against Parsons, claiming he assumes power is “legitimate” and that power-holders and organizational members agree on organizational aims. Instead, Giddens emphasizes the “necessarily hierarchical character of power, and the divisions of interest which are frequently consequent upon it.”\textsuperscript{57} In Parsons’ estimation, power lies in the function of the institution to act as a group and to have a cohesive identity. Power holders, however, are individuals who might or might not act in the interest of the collective and can operate without consensus.\textsuperscript{58}

Therefore, it may be difficult for students to determine which Academy power players they should petition to get the classes, programs, or other resources they desire. The Academy’s Managing Director holds the most authority and directs the future of the institution; several trainers expressed that she wants to present hip-hop as Hochkultur. Besides her, other administrators’ decision-making power is ambiguous. Administrators aside, trainers hold the most authority and power because they determine which students progress through Levels 1–3. Because several trainers are also Ensemble members, these individuals shape the Academy significantly. Each trainer has individual strengths and although the Academy Artistic Director suggests what material a course should cover, instructors ultimately choose what to teach. The Artistic Director said it is difficult to dictate what students should learn because “hip-hop is not an institute,” rather a “street culture.”\textsuperscript{59} Although this fits into the realm of what hip-hop means to underground adherents, because the Academy is an institute where the focus is to excel and ascend, having limited guidelines for what beginner courses should teach could be detrimental to Level 1 students who do not learn material that will help them progress.

\textbf{Discipline: Trained Bodies and Scripted Voices}

One of the foremost-shared values at the Academy is discipline. I observed that at the Academy, being disciplined meant not only demonstrating “proper” behavior but also applying the appropriate rigor and concentration to training. Trainer Max insisted Academy regulars are not necessarily more talented but are more trained and disciplined. They consequently are more likely to micro-politically integrate into the institution.\textsuperscript{60} Through its discipline-related efforts, the Academy finds certain

\textsuperscript{56} Parsons 1967, 504, via Pettigrew 1973, 24.
\textsuperscript{58} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{59} Artistic Director 2013.
\textsuperscript{60} Max, pers. comm., 2011.
success: its student totals and offerings are growing while shows are more polished and professional.

Disciplining of the mind, body and voice happens within dance courses or at summer camps, where rappers learn what messages are “appropriate” and dancers complete exercises that tone and condition their bodies. The 2011 Level 2 Summer camp was a four-week-long intensive training camp during which students took hip-hop classes for three hours a day, with the remaining five hours consisting of eating and social education. Trainers choreographed students’ movements and prized precision. Though hip-hop dance generally is improvisatory, the NewStyle instructor expected that students execute “clean” movements, without extraneous motions, matching their movements to his. Achieving this accuracy is difficult for students because of the closeness of the movements to the body. Instead of arms making movements at specific angles, they moved fluidly and close to the torso. One must “hit” the exact angle in relation to one’s body or face. Bodily discipline now defines the summer camp’s title; administrators renamed the camp Bootcamp.

Discipline is not limited to dance. The Academy guides students’ creation of rap lyrics. In efforts to promote conscious, positive rap, trainer Theo encouraged students to “keep it positive” and reduce profanity. Although students wanted to rap about their neighborhoods, he asked them to expand their rhymes and see alternative perspectives. He acknowledged that every city has “bad” neighborhoods, but why dwell on this situation? Instead, students should seek change and be different from “gangsta” rappers who rap about drugs, sex, violence or “bling-bling.” Such Academy “guidance” about lyric content can be interpreted as curtailing migrant youths’ self-expression.

Theo disciplined youths to adhere to what he thought were ideal standards of expression and behavior. By restricting youths’ outputs, however, he inadvertently limited lyrics along with their meanings. As linguist Jannis Androutsopoulos explains, “cultural referencing” in hip-hop lyrics has been the norm since hip-hop’s beginnings. References to popular commercial items, people or places “construct a fragmented panorama of local knowledge that includes history and traditions, high art and mass culture, places and institutions.” It “indexes a hybrid cultural horizon, in which global media culture, European cultural heritage, and specifically local traditions merge.” Through lyrics, youths fuse diverse elements of their lives together into a musical message. By impeding youths’ narratives and disciplining their expressions to be “appropriate,” their pasts and presents do not come through their art. Although the Academy suggests that hip-hop serves as a “homeland” for youths with diverse ethnic backgrounds, this particular trainer discouraged youths from making lyrical references to their actual homes and neighborhoods.

61 Theo, pers. comm., 2011.
62 Androutsopoulos 2009, 49.
If instructors limit youths’ lyrics, the youths’ “identities of participation” within the Academy may be interpreted as becoming diluted. Wenger explains that “identities of participation” (and belonging) within communities of practice increase when members’ knowledge, former and current identities, and past actions or practices become part of the community’s “history” and “the constitution of its practice.”

If students do not feel that institutional leaders or other participants value their ideas, they, like Sophia, could form “identities of non-participation” that increasingly “marginalize” them because their experiences become extraneous. These youths often drop out and interestingly, the Academy’s rap division has one of the lowest amounts of participants, especially in upper levels.

**Gender Roles & Dynamics**

Trainers not only share values, but through their repertoire of actions, words, and physical movements, impart gender roles that begin to define the community. As Wenger explains, a shared repertoire consists of “the discourse by which members [of a community of practice] create meaningful statements about the world, as well as the styles by which they express their forms of membership and their identities as members.”

Gender narratives offer one view into an organization's dynamics and point towards behaviors considered “normal.” Boys tend to rap and beatbox while girls dance. We hear men’s voices and see women’s bodies. If, like at the Academy, primarily boys occupy the highest ranks (eleven of twelve Ensemble members were men), a girl’s successful micro-political integration into the Academy could consist of her remaining at the bottom. Maria shared stories of trainers not taking girls seriously in Academy courses. Two male Ensemble members and trainers claimed that apart from the Ensemble’s sole female member, there were no additional girls ready or talented enough who would fit into the Ensemble’s (male) culture. Their comments, however, do not match the fact that girls occupy significantly more spots than boys in Level 2 and Level 3 for NewStyle, the largest contributor to the Ensemble.

Being aware of gender dynamics is important because directors, trainers and choreographers often score entire shows without student input. This happens most in lower levels. The lack of artistic license and participatory democratic principle is complicated because the institution is partially state-funded, participates in international exchanges, and thus needs to deliver guaranteed products. Nevertheless, shows lacked the “musical say” that music educator Sharon Davis

---

65 Ibid., 203.
67 Maria 2013.
theorizes as “[o]pportunities to contribute in ensemble settings and the development of musical voice through ownership, agency, relevance, and personal expression—and the investment of these dynamic and fluid meanings in the ensemble process.”

Davis’ description reinforces the joint-enterprise aspect of a community of practice, in that participants work together towards a collectively chosen, common goal. By collaborating to design a show (i.e., tackling a joint enterprise), Academy students could develop “mutual accountability.” Yet due in part to funding constraints and the need to remain relevant, the Academy has prescribed curriculums that often encourage students not to be themselves but to be what the trainers, the administrators and bureaucrats need them to be. While this keeps the project funded, thriving and able to serve neighborhoods across Hamburg, it minimizes individual contributions of students to the Academy’s enterprise, which could generate further senses of student belonging.

Creating Relationships with Power Holders and Peers

A key point for mastering micro-political integration and feeling like one belongs in the Academy’s community of practice is the building of bridges and other relationships with one’s instructors and fellow students. Classmates have insight into the organization and may share rules and norms with newcomers, although only if these are clear. Creating bridging relationships with “different” power and resource holders, namely administrators and trainers, improves one’s chances of advancement. If trainers have established a mentoring relationship with a talented, hard-working student, such as in the case of Jeff and Pamela, they are more likely to notice and encourage their promotion.

Ensemble member Peter (24) highlighted his and Jeff’s essential roles in the Academy’s decision to offer more courses and levels and how close relationships to administrators aided their success. The students mastered not only the Academy’s organizational norms, but also the art of when to make a request to administrators. Initially, administrators planned to have battles, a summer camp and a yearlong Level 1 class. Jeff and Peter productively negotiated with administrators and together they decided to do Tanztheaterproduktionen. The Ensemble also emerged from the pair’s successful, well-timed advocacy. Other students’ negotiations centered around receiving trainer positions and Ensemble placements, or participating in exchanges.

At the Academy, formation of close peer relationships depends largely on one’s level of participation and division (e.g., dance, rap, etc.). When feelings of community

68 Davis 2011, 266.
70 Peter 2013.
71 Ibid.
arise within the Academy, they commonly occur through joint enterprises like the upper levels’ international exchanges in which students like Maria participated and/or during moments of intense emotion like the culmination of the 2011 summer camp. After four weeks of hard training and socializing together, friendships had formed and the pure joy of completion and team spirit was evident through the students’ group bows. During many curtain calls following Academy shows (particularly in the upper levels), students exhibited a performer’s afterglow. They successfully represented the Academy and constituted a community of practice, having just achieved a “joint enterprise” through “mutual engagement.” This trend aligns with Thomas Turino’s “politics of participation” theory, which suggests one connects a musical experience to an “emotion” and further to an organization.72

**Conclusion: A New Era for German Social Integration**

Heretofore, migrant youths’ micro-political integration into the Academy has guaranteed the production of players for artistic exchanges, international tours and Tanztheaterproduktionen. There are examples of micro-politically integrated Academy participants who feel they belong to the institution as well as a noteworthy amount of dropouts. In the end, for students trying to advance within the Academy, understanding the organization’s “structure,” and who to approach when and for what one wants are key.73 Although according to Pettigrew, power holders “can change or maintain structures as well as the norms and expectations upon which these structures rest,” participants trying to figure out a changing structure can feel at a loss because the organization’s structure and goals guide their behavior.74

Because organizations like the Academy have multiple goals (i.e., social integration, professional development, intercultural and international exchanges, and hip-hop instruction), it is natural that confusion, disagreement and a certain amount of displeasure would be present.75 Although some students knew they were participating in a social integration project, some trainers did not identify social integration as an Academy aim. To encourage greater feelings of belonging to the Academy among students of all levels, the institution should develop methods and mediums (e.g., community meetings, peer mentorship programs, workshops with other trainers) for goal transmission, and should engage more students (especially marginalized girls) in goal-setting and decision-making processes.

As the organization grew, its offerings developed in response to self-advocates like Peter and Jeff. Despite Ensemble members’ varying levels of friendship and occasional disagreements about the Academy’s future direction (i.e., whether it

73 Pettigrew 1973, 30.
74 Ibid., 30–31.
is moving more towards Hochkultur), the Ensemble constituted a community of practice. Members had a “shared repertoire” of styles and worldviews (i.e., opinions & beliefs about popular culture & society); mutual engagements through training and private socialization; and the joint enterprises of Tanztheaterproduktionen and international exchanges. In many ways, the Ensemble was an example of an integrated group.

That being said, the middle levels within the Academy’s course hierarchy epitomized the challenges the Academy faces long-term in regards to meeting individual demands and defining its structure. Level 2 & 3 students like Maria were at a crossroads in their Academy engagement. That involved deciding whether to commit to the institution and micro-politically integrate. When things Maria thought she would receive (like the Master Class) dissolved or changed in nature, she felt the disappointment of discontinued opportunity.76

To progress “upwards” at the Academy, one must garner enough power to impact the organization’s structure in a way that benefits one’s aspirations—as Peter and Jeff did. Those people not achieving this, such as Sophia, can become frustrated, feel excluded, and abandon the organization. Several students and trainers particularly could not embrace the organization’s joint enterprise of choreographed and scripted Tanztheaterproduktionen involving restrictions to students’ artistic expression. Their departures highlight the challenge of the Academy to incorporate such less dominant voices into their decision-making processes.

Pettigrew explains that money and time limit what power-holders (e.g., administrators) can offer, and those members who negotiate and receive what they want “win” in the political sense.77 Nonetheless, for the organization to succeed and specifically for the Ensemble to regenerate itself and attract students like Maria, it must expand its current “internally focused core membership” to include youths with different styles, repertoires and goals.78 This expansion might mean meeting different demands and seeking out other voices.

Incorporating those voices has benefits for social integration as well. Political scientist Francis Fukuyama explains that, “social capital within a particular group or network can produce positive externalities by teaching people social virtues such as honesty, reciprocity and the keeping of commitments.”79 This reflects the foundation that the Academy lays: bonding social capital flourishes yet people “have a tendency to build group solidarity at the expense of heterogeneous individuals [e.g., Academy dropouts], or those who exist outside the main group.”80 If communities have more “tightly bonded” rather than bridged groups, in-fighting can occur and break up the community spirit and prevent individuals’ learning

76 Maria 2013.
78 Wenger 1998, 252.
79 Fukuyama 2004, 40.
80 Ibid.
from each other. In other words, when Academy students attempt to progress in the institution, they often bond with like-minded or like-goaled students. This creates competition rather than collaboration throughout the entire organization. For the organization to prosper long-term, it is essential that bridging continues and resources are as evenly distributed as possible.

Ideally, institutions that serve youths would allow each youth to also tell his or her story through a unique form of expression. Realistically, though, funding constraints and thematic shows limit room for creativity and as youths progress through the system, they participate in more professional shows with more-defined themes. While trainers might try to have the students direct the writing process as much as possible, in the end, they are hired to help them achieve their best and “lyric guidance” is bound to happen.

How then can students feel invested in a community of practice at every level? How can the Academy empower Level 1 students who might never advance within the Academy hierarchy? And is it possible to provide mediums through which youths can express themselves fully while still achieving integration goals? The Academy offers a HipHop Open Day that brings Level 1 students to Billstedt for a show, but an additional solution would be to offer shows where Level 1 classes take place. This way, students could invite school friends and neighbors, and correspondingly bolster their local communities by contributing to artistic life. Neighborhood shows would also be a venue where students could express themselves more fully without needing to follow a script or show theme.

Whichever direction the Academy moves in the future, it would be beneficial to include as many students as possible and their local communities in integrative processes. The Academy is an integration project for youths in which youths like Peter and Jeff have made a large impact in its goal-setting and focus. Now it is time for youths with less dominant voices like Sophia, Maria or Pamela to have their chance to contribute—alongside youths whose arrival in Hamburg is much more recent. Through the Academy, Hamburg has worked to integrate and empower the children and grandchildren of its 20th-century immigrants. Today's questions include how to assist the new population of 21st-century refugees who will need to believe that they too belong to Germany. These youths have completely different migration histories from the Academy’s target group heretofore. It is unlikely that they will be ready to jump on stage and rap in perfected German soon, but perhaps a refugee teen from Eritrea or Syria will find his way to Billstedt and rap in his native language or spray images from his “homeland” in graffiti class. In these moments, integration through the performing arts consists of unlocking the door to self-expression and dialogue. A great testament to the Academy's integration success would be to see Germany's welcoming culture living on through youths just like Peter, Jeff, Maria, Sophia and Pamela—building bridges through hip-hop.

81 Ibid.
References

Interviews


Secondary Sources


“Being on Both Sides”:
The Ethnomusicologist between Official Institutions and Musicians

Marie-Christine Parent

Université de Montréal, Canada and Université de Nice-Sophia-Antipolis, France

Based on empirical research in the Seychelles islands (Indian Ocean), performed at the request of the Seychelles Ministry of culture, this article explores how the triangular relationship between the researcher, “interlocutors” (musicians and others), and government results in a particular form of knowledge production, one with restrictions, but also involving access otherwise unavailable to a foreign researcher. The author addresses the political economy of social science research in Seychelles and presents two case studies: (1) a course taught at the National Conservatoire of Performing Arts; and (2) the author’s involvement in an Intangible Cultural Heritage/UNESCO project. She discusses authorities and forces from the perspectives of values, and claims to an ethical stance taken in research, concluding that a comprehensive understanding of the actors, stakeholders and forces that influence the sustainability of music is imperative for (applied) ethnomusicologists working with the aim of assisting endangered music forms and traditions. A better grasp of the roles of ideas, beliefs and values inherent to musical practices and policy-making processes also contributes to a better understanding of music and culture, as well as the formulation of public policies.

During the fall of 2010, I started my PhD in ethnomusicology with a project born out of an explicit request, initially addressed to my co-supervisor in Montreal, Canada, from the Seychellois’ authorities via the Montreal Seychelles’ Consul. It is my understanding that Seychelles’ Ministry of culture was expecting an “expert” to document local traditional music and to stimulate the interest of the local population.

---

1 Culture has never been the main object of a single Ministry in the Seychelles. Since independence in 1976, culture has been associated with a number of different ministries. I started to work with the Ministry of Social Development and Culture in 2011 until culture came under the Ministry of Tourism and Culture following a 2012 cabinet reshuffle. I refer to a “Ministry of culture” merely in order to simplify discussion.

2 Although the Ministry requested an “expert”, everything done in the Seychelles during my fieldwork was voluntary. I am very grateful to organizations and funds that supported my research and fieldwork in the Seychelles, especially a Vanier Canada Graduate Scholarship.
and musicians in its preservation. I spent a total of twelve months doing fieldwork between January 2011 and February 2014, mostly on Mahé, the main island of the archipelago, where 90% of the Seychellois live, but also on Praslin and La Digue islands. This project gave me the opportunity to fill gaps in academic knowledge through systemic research of Seychellois’ musical practices, and also to respond to some local requests and needs, bringing together applied and academic research. However, the conditions and the values underpinned by this research in collaboration with the Ministry of culture also required consideration.

The Seychelles’ Ministry of culture played an important role both in providing my research with official authorization and in “guiding” it, while Seychellois musicians and other individuals furnished a diversity of data on music, musical practices and their everyday life. As a result, I often assumed the role of mediator between musicians and officials at the Ministry. I consider this kind of ethnomusicology inherently applied research: it represents the music and the voice of ignored or oppressed people while it looks at the cultural policies and initiatives of the state and the reciprocal interferences and influences between these two contexts. This position contributes to a better understanding of local issues and social dynamics in a post-colonial society that impact musical expression and production. My stance towards the ambiguous, historically shifting representations and power relations was to “be on both sides,” recognizing the aesthetic values and interests of musicians as well as formal institutions.

The different groups and individuals that I encountered had their own expectations regarding my presence, and their own interests, in both cultural and music development in the country. They had their own visions and stories of the problem of the “decline” of traditional local music, but admitted in all cases that musical life in Seychelles could and should be more dynamic and valued. It is important here to consider the meaning of “giving value” to music and musical life for the different parties at stake, including myself, as this enables a better understanding of the problem. To this end, being engaged with, and working alongside, different interlocutors and institutions opens the door to a different kind of understanding of local issues and values.

My partnership with the Ministry of culture came in the wake of a series of cultural policy interventions. I consider the concept of partnership an active association between different actors—individuals or institutions—who, while maintaining their autonomy, agree to pool their efforts to address a problem or a question in which they have an interest, a motivation, a responsibility or an obligation. This is a focused “epistemic community” as proposed by Harrison;

---

3 According to anthropologist Sandra J. T. M. Evers (2010), no foreign anthropologists were allowed to conduct independent research in the Seychelles for three decades, from the Seychellois’ Revolution (1977) up until her arrival in 2004. The American ethnomusicologist Michael Naylor, although married to a Seychellois and visiting the Seychelles fairly often for holidays, conducted his PhD research between 1984 and 1994. He defended his PhD dissertation, focusing on the creolization in the musical genres of the Seychelles, at the University of Michigan in 1997.

4 Harrison 2015.
there may be a political and economic dimension to collaboration, and the partners share specific epistemic ideas, but do not need to share all of the same values and ethical systems. Consequently, when the partners agree on an end and work in that direction, supporting each other to attain their goal (at least officially), it does not mean they will use the same tools and methods. They work together because each party has something different to offer: knowledge, experience, contacts, a different role or position in the local music (eco)system and also in the global society, etc. In some cases, collaboration may also be a way to maintain control of the research and the diffusion of the results, as suggested in documents produced by the Ministry of culture governing research about culture.

The main common goal in this partnership was to document moutya—a local musical practice generally described as the musical legacy of slaves expressed by drumming, singing and dancing—to contribute to the project of getting it recognized as an Intangible Cultural Heritage (ICH) by UNESCO. Another more global goal was to better understanding of issues regarding threatened traditional local music, including the lack of appreciation of the expertise of musicians, in order to solve “concrete problems affecting people and communities.” Beyond these research goals, the Minister wished to see me getting involved in other musical activities in order to ensure that more Seychellois benefited from my presence as a “music specialist.” I thought it was the least I could do in terms of reciprocity. In this context, my various skills were solicited in many ways and I experienced a “practical side of musical being” which resulted in teaching, playing, dancing, and taking on the role of consultant or even confidant, but all within the freedom and the constraints of Seychellois' reality. Personal qualities such as diplomacy and empathy, along with a good sense of observation, self-criticism and ethics, are essential to conducting research and being active in different cultural spheres at the same time. My research was guided by the ethical principles of social responsibility, human rights, and cultural and musical equity—values advocated in applied ethnomusicology.

My approach here analyzes the triangular relation I encountered between policy, empirical work and theory in order to explain the practical challenges of conducting applied and academic ethnomusicological research in Seychelles, and their theoretical implications.

To move in that direction, I will present two significant case studies from my fieldwork: a teaching experience at the National Conservatoire of Performing Arts, and my involvement and observations in the moutya nomination process for a UNESCO list of ICH. In doing so, I want to demonstrate: (1) how “being on both sides” and understanding the relations between, and with, different authorities and ethical systems is necessary in order to grasp the complexity of musical

5 Harrison 2012.
6 Harrison 2014, 18.
7 Titon 1992, 320.
8 Titon 2015b, 4.
practices and their environments when working as an applied ethnomusicologist with government; and (2) the importance of taking an ethical stance in research in which the different stakeholders’ values and benefits interact. Before getting into that, some background on my research and the political economy in which it is embedded is required.

The Political Economy of Social Sciences Research in the Seychelles

Uninhabited until 1770, Seychelles society was born in the context of slavery as first a French, then a British colony. The country’s independence, in 1976, was followed by the coup d’État of 5 June 1977 that led to the government currently in power. Led by France Albert René—a Grand Blanc— the Seychelles Peoples’ Progressive Front (SPPF) was clearly defending an anti-colonialist nationalism and opted for a socialist-Marxist one-party state government. The following years, described by Seychellois as the “Revolution,” brought many social, cultural, economical, and political changes to Seychellois’ everyday life. Access to social and health programs was put in place ensuring a relatively high standard of living (compared to other African countries), although violations of freedom of expression and human rights were frequent and constraints imposed by the government were the norm. As my research has revealed, most cultural practices have been documented by researchers from the “Research Section” of the then Ministry of Education and Information, creating an official national (creole and/or Seychellois’) culture that was institutionalized and folklorized. A musician explained that cultural troupes had been organized in each district and that the creative content of their performances had to be approved by an official committee representing the government before they were permitted onstage. I noticed in communications with Seychellois, that, although there was a certain control, cultural expression did not take state-imposed cultural forms, but, as observed by Ana Hofman in socialist Yugoslavia, “offered an excellent opportunity for various people to be engaged in cultural activities.” In 1981, the National Youth Service (NYS), at first mandatory and then optional, was created, which included a traditional education curriculum (in which “Seychellois creole culture” was taught), political education and paramilitary training. A highly criticized program, it ceased to exist in 1998. A whole generation of Seychellois is impacted by this experience, including several musicians, now aged between 40

9 The Grands Blancs constitute a category of European settlers and/or plantation owners in the Indian Ocean islands.
10 Evers 2010.
11 The Republic of Seychelles is composed of 25 administrative districts, each containing a community center. During the autocratic period, the centers were associated with political activities. Today, districts are responsible for the development of social and cultural activities.
and 55, who told me that they learned to play “Seychellois” music during their years in NYS. The study of this important period in Seychelles history is reminiscent of ethnomusicological research conducted in other state socialist countries, where folk music research was similarly connected to the promotion of a national culture; the aim of creating a new folk culture was to “implement the state’s agenda on education and to assist in the propagandisation of ‘positive norms and values’.” The 1970s also saw the development of luxury tourism, on which the Seychelles’ economy remains highly dependent. Tourism activities provide the main music venues and sources of income for musicians. What I term the “tourism context and argument” push all Seychellois—who know very well how necessary tourism is to their economical survival as a country and as individuals—to preserve an image of paradise and political stability across their islands.

Despite the official return to democracy in 1993, not much has changed for Seychellois, who must still deal with the reality of their geographical isolation and the ambiguous policies of their government. It seemed to me—and many Seychellois have substantiated this—that a general climate of fear, distrust, and oppression is still perceptible. Drastic economic changes after the economic crisis of 2008 led the IMF to step in with a two-year rescue package, with conditions. The post-colonial Seychelles’ dependence on tourism and concurrent spread of a neoliberal economy, globalization and, more recently, the influence of the “discourse of commodification” in the UNESCO 2005 Convention on the Protection and Promotion of the Diversity of Cultural Expressions, combined with the population’s high cost of living, explain a tendency there to objectify culture and treat it like personal property. When culture or music is regarded as private property, social relations arising from exchanges are likely to be framed or defined and influenced by contracts or intellectual property law.

The conditions of my research were negotiated with a research supervision committee from the Ministry of culture and resulted in a “research protocol” that would give me official authorization to conduct research at locations in Seychellois’ territory. My research process can be described as *negotiation* because we—committee members from the Ministry and I—needed to determine the contributions from “each side” during my fieldtrips, so that exchanges appeared fair to both parties, and also because of the legal, economical and political elements embedded in local “folklore,” including music. As anthropologists Les Field and Richard G.

14 Hofman ibid.
15 This argument was used in the last presidential elections in December 2015 to frighten Seychellois with the specter that a change of government would threaten partnerships with Persian Gulf airlines, which now have a monopoly on flights to Seychelles, and resultantly, that Seychellois’ economics and quality of life would suffer.
16 A well-known local artist summarized comments that I heard more generally in my fieldwork: “Here in Seychelles, you can’t trust anyone. You and I have to be careful about everything we say and do, because everybody is watching us.”
Fox note, “the term negotiation evokes the manner in which anthropological work […] become[s] so embedded in complex relationships that the anthropologist can no longer impose [her] research priorities.”

I had to defend my project before a committee comprising eight workers from the Ministry of culture. They particularly insisted on the necessity to “return” to the committee all eventual writings or material resulting from my research. I understood, from different comments that were made, that in being a foreign PhD researcher I was “taking” something from them for my own purposes. My research in itself did not seem to guarantee them sufficient benefit. In order to balance the situation and make it “more equitable” in the workers’ eyes, I agreed to get involved in specific training and consulting activities. One must understand that, in a small country like the Seychelles, there are very few cultural workers, and the existing ones do not have a strong educational background in culture or arts management.

I think, as Hofman writes, that “there are contexts, places, time in which applied ethnomusicology, or at least research addressing local concerns, are needed or even mandatory to justify itself and the presence of the researcher.”

The conditions under which cultural researchers can conduct their projects in the Seychelles are in part set out in the document “Standards and Protocols for Managing Cultural Research in Seychelles.” We can read in this document that these “formal procedures” respond to “a necessity to develop and enforce mechanisms to ensure better management of […] cultural resources so that the Cultural Institutions derive more benefits from them as well as to exercise greater control over their usage and management in general.” As some members of the committee told me, it is noted in the same document that “some past incidents [with foreign researchers] which occurred in some cultural institutions” provide “additional justifications for formally instituting standards and protocol to manage cultural research.”

My entry into the country, supported from the beginning by the Seychellois’ authorities as it was, oriented and influenced the process of my research. Many musicians knew who I was before I met them in the course of my research because they had seen me in the capital, Victoria, going on a regular basis to the National Library, where the main offices of the Ministry of culture situate. Their first question was generally: “Who do you work for?” I would explain the whole context of my research project. I first thought that some musicians would distrust me because of my position with the authorities but, instead, they considered that, with that

18 Field & Fox 2007, 10.
19 To date there are no existing education programs in these or a similar field in the country.
21 Ministry of Community Development, Youth, Sports and Culture, Culture Division 2008.
22 Ibid., 3.
23 Ibid., 32.
experience, I could better understand their reality and what they have to face in
everyday life as Seychellois.

The following section presents two case studies based on my intervention within
the Seychellois community, where fieldwork is “a way of knowing and doing.”

Sharing and Producing Knowledge: Teaching at the National Conservatoire of Performing Arts (NCPA)

My teaching activities at the NCPA in Mont-Fleuri, Mahé provided an opportunity
to develop what one could call “participatory action research,” leading to musical
and social benefits for the local population. The NCPA includes a School of Music,
School of Dance and School of Theater. I started to teach in the School of Music
during my second week in the Seychelles. I had prepared classes and readings for
the participants (about fifteen students from different backgrounds: music students,
musicians, music teachers, and an anthropologist from the Ministry of culture); my
plan was to introduce theory and methodology, and to foster projects “creating
voice and knowledge opportunities for self-representation,” thus exposing a
diversity of experiences in relation to music. Each participant had to work on a
semester-based project, documenting a musical practice or style (local or not) from
the paradigms presented and discussed in class. At the end of the semester we
shared and discussed our findings.

My first surprise when reading the papers was that most of the young participants
knew very little about their traditional music because they do not have much
opportunity to hear and practice it. Moreover, instead of asking for information
from people around them, or talking about their own experience, many participants
copied texts from the Internet, demonstrating that, in the Seychelles, authority
seems to lie in writing or, at least, not in subaltern individuals. Some students
faced challenges when trying to consult archives. Doing research on traditional
music implies investigating the past for most Seychellois, who see their traditional
music as folklore or, as a musician once told me, as “music for tourists.” A few
young people said that they were too shy to discuss the topic with their parents or
grandparents. In another context, an informant in his fifties told me that he never
discussed musical life in the past with elderly persons in his family because it was
impolite to question an older person about Seychellois’ culture. Talking about the
past in general is not easy in the Seychelles, due to a long history of oppression.
Evers notes that the Seychelles Copyright Act underpins many restrictions on
freedom of speech and that folklore’s copyright “vests in the Republic.”

26 Hofman 2010, 26.
27 Evers 2010.
By the end of the semester, however, students were starting fully to appreciate our work and I could feel that “something was happening.”²⁸ A manager of the School of Music thanked me, but explained that some people were worried about students trying to access the archives and that the current infrastructure would not allow us to continue our work. I then realized that my approach—making participants more aware of their environment in order to start developing a critical point of view—bothered the authorities.

While at the NCPA, I questioned the quasi-absence of traditional and local music in the institution. On the one hand, the director of the NCPA was trying to convince professional musicians to come and share their musical heritage, knowledge and expertise inside the school, but without success. On the other, none of the professional musicians I met had studied music at the NCPA²⁹ and they all criticized the institution for different reasons. In the few interactions I saw between professional musicians and music students, the musicians even tried to discourage the students from a musical career, saying that nobody (referring mostly to the country’s authorities) cared about music. I could feel the bitterness in their talk. One day, I asked some musicians whether they felt they had a responsibility to transmit their musical heritage—being among the rare musicians and tradition-bearers still alive—and whether they would take part in some workshops we could organize, for instance in the NCPA. One of them answered:

“The Ministry of culture wants to use us to show the good work they do for culture. But it is false. It has been like this for years… We go to meetings that the Ministry and the NAC [National Arts Council] organize, and it’s always the same. Nothing is changing. We musicians don’t get more recognition for our knowledge, talent and work, and our life and work conditions are not getting better. We’re tired of that.”³⁰

I noticed this state of despondency in many interviews I made with musicians. Many of them were thinking they would give up their musical activities, “if it were not for the love of music...” some said. But is this “love of music” strong enough to perpetuate a musical heritage under adverse conditions? Very few young musicians are motivated to practice an instrument, and new trends, including computerized music, now dominate the national music scene. I see these decisions not to transmit, perpetuate or take part in a musical heritage, particularly in the framework of a revitalization program, as performative actions (or non-actions) and a way to define an identity in opposition to the dominant.³¹

---

²⁸ In French, quelque chose se passe means both “something is happening” and “something is transmitted.”
²⁹ The NCPA is currently the only school of music, theater, and dance in the country.
³⁰ Anonymous musician, pers. comm., Dec. 2011. All translations from Creole or French into English are mine.
³¹ Butler 1990.
At one point, I was invited by the leader of NCPA jazz band to participate as a saxophone player, in order to “stimulate local players by bringing new competences to the band and also present a model for young woman musicians.” I also took part in the School of Dance's end of year rehearsals and show as a dancer. An anthropologist from the Ministry of culture told me that he believes that if young Seychellois see a “foreign white woman” dancing moutya or sega, it would certainly contribute to enhancing interest in it. Although I did not choose to dance for this purpose, I could hardly avoid the situation. The comment reveals an inferiority complex—a common situation in post-colonial societies that experienced the slave trade. This interest in the foreign performer raises broader questions about the global politics of representation when it comes to the local display of cultural heritage.

Being involved in programs of the NCPA created situations that gave me access to alternative, otherwise inaccessible points of view, and that helped me to accumulate identities beyond that of researcher and develop other types of relationship with my interlocutors. This position allowed me access to another level of knowledge and experience in relation to my own research, although the moutya was virtually absent from the NCPA during my fieldwork period. At my request, a meeting called Memwar lanmizik Sesel (Memories of Seychellois Music) was organized in February 2012, in collaboration with the Director of the NCPA, with the purpose of discussing how moutya could become part of NCPA programs. Workers from the Ministry of culture, including the General Director for Culture, participated as well as experts from the broader community. The discussion was very informative, especially highlighting how Seychellois under forty years of age had typically never experienced “a real moutya” and that, even if it were taught at the NCPA, students would not have opportunity to participate in such an event because it does not happen anymore. “A real moutya” was a construction historically and currently being promoted by the Ministry of culture and some individuals.

In Search of Moutya:
A Call for “Salvage Ethnomusicology”

I was interested in documenting moutya, which suited the political agenda of the Ministry of culture because one of the reasons the research committee wanted to ensure research results were returned was the intention to submit moutya as Intangible Culture Heritage (ICH) recognized by UNESCO.

32 This expression must be understood here as rhetoric of endangerment, loss, threat and eventual “death” of musical heritage used by some Seychellois concerned with the “almost certain disappearance” of some local traditional music and arguing that urgent solutions that aim to “protect, promote or safeguard” musical heritage need to be found and applied. This attitude corresponds to a specific vision of the problem, as explained by Catherine Grant (2014, 635).
In its musical and choreographed form, moutya is similar to *sega ravanne* from Mauritius and to *maloya* from La Réunion. The “authentic” moutya, to use the words of Seychellois repeating government rhetoric and expressing a desire for moutya revival, consists of drumming on 2 or 3 moutya drums—cylindrical skin drums—a man singing and women singing in response, and men and women dancing. In twelve months of fieldwork, I did not encounter “authentic” moutya. A diachronic approach to musical practices in Seychelles made me realize that it had been the object of a political revitalization and recovery, which resulted in a folklorization, during the Revolution. Moutya is rarely performed today, apart from touristic performances and at big cultural events generally organized by the Ministry of culture and/or the Seychelles Tourism Board, which are promoted abroad to attract tourists to the Seychelles. Some moutya nights are also set up in hotels or by tourists’ agencies, but it is basically impossible for the actors and organizers to meet the criteria of “authentic” moutya. My research revealed no evidence of “authentic” moutya being practiced in the communities. There was, however, evidence of elements of moutya in different Seychellois’ music and cultural expressions and manifestations. For example, some aspects of moutya’s musical expression, such as the characteristic rhythmic formula or sound of the moutya drum, are now included in different local musics. It is also clear to me, as noted by Naylor, that moutya “simultaneously reflects creole identity while serving as a primary influence to the current popular *sega*.”

As I started my interviews and began to meet different individuals (tradition bearers, musicians, dancers, policymakers, etc.), I understood that while a number of persons had something to say about moutya, only a very few had an extensive knowledge or in-depth expertise about it, some of whom did not want to participate actively in a “top-down” revitalization project led by the Ministry. Other musicians, however, conscious of the cultural and economic value and potential of the moutya as musical heritage, and as a tourist attraction, want to take part in the movement. One problem is that some artists lack resources, and then there is the difficulty in accessing the material traces related to this heritage. In practice, only a few of the most popular moutya songs circulate.

Forming a larger sample, and because the Ministry had paper copies of typed moutya lyrics that were almost unreadable or not usable in other contexts, I transcribed into a Word document a collection of lyrics of moutya songs from documents archived mostly in the Creole Institute at Anse-aux-Pins and National Archives La Bastille (Mahé). The research committee members asked me not to divulge my compilation to anyone, though, due to intellectual property issues, even though I had carefully noted all relevant information in the document (context of collections, and names of researchers and informants). I found myself in a difficult situation when artists asked for access to the collection in order to get inspiration

---

33 Naylor 1997, 163.
34 Some musicians hope this scenario could lead to world music networks.
and create new musical arrangements using the lyrics. I discussed the dilemma with some committee members. The problem for them was not only the copyrights of music lyrics, but also the intellectual property of the researchers, the authors of the initial documents (non-published), and, finally, the persons who sang the songs for them. This shows how concepts of copyright and intellectual property can, in some cases, produce over-protection that casts heritage in stone and prevents its circulation. Nevertheless, I link this situation to folklore ownership issues contained in the Seychelles Copyright Act as pointed out by Evers (see above) in order to draw attention to a larger issue of institutional control over intellectual property, one which is distinctly at odds with individual human rights, for example, freedom of expression.

During conversations, many musicians and individuals alluded to laws that prohibit playing drums and public gatherings. In (mostly local) research documents, it is said that moutya was banned by British law until 1976 and, thereafter, tolerated only during public holidays from sunset until 9 pm. The current Seychelles Penal Code, dated 1935, still includes such “Drums Regulations” section and prohibits playing drums at night and in residential areas. According to the Public Order Act, holders of proposed public meetings or gatherings—meaning the concourse of ten or more persons in any public place—must present a written notice of intention, not less than six working days before the date of the public meeting, to request authorization by the Commissioner of Police. The reality is that there is a greater chance of getting such authorization with good contacts, and many people still fear the authorities. Organizers of non-official and sporadic events dedicated to moutya also faced these restrictions around 2006-2007, when the police were discouraging these very popular events on the pretext that they undermined public order. In July 2013, the musicians’ association Seymas organized the first Dimans moutya (Sunday moutya). One year later, Dimans moutya became an official festival supported by the Ministry of Tourism and Culture.

Apart from that, I observed very few concrete initiatives to promote moutya, despite different Ministry representatives’ expressing the will to see it declared an ICH by UNESCO. Although it was not clear to me whether the desire was directed at the Urgent Safeguarding List or the Representative List, my interlocutors at the Ministry of culture presented moutya to me as being still practiced by Seychellois, but also as an “endangered musical heritage” that might “die” if nothing is done because most of those who knew and had mastered the codes and know-how of the practice have disappeared.

36 On many occasions in 2015, the Minister of Tourism and Culture, St. Ange, confirmed that a process to remove this law will start soon. See, for instance, Nation 2015. References to online sources are accurate as of 16 February 2016.
37 According to a newspaper article (Uranie 2015), by 2015, the Constitutional Court of the Seychelles had declared Acts 22 and 23 of the Public Order Act 2013 “unconstitutional.”
38 For more information on the emergence of the festival Dimans moutya, see Parent in press.
The problem of “music endangerment” has been conceptualized by ethnomusicologists in terms of sustainability, “both from the perspective of creating viable futures for genres under pressure in the fast-changing contemporary world (e.g. Schippers 2010), and rather more expansively in reference too to the links between music and other sustainability concerns, such as economic and environmental ones (e.g. Titon 2008–2014, 2009).” My position concurs with the view adopted by the majority of ethnomusicologists today, acknowledging that “the vitality and very existence of music genres naturally ebb and flow over time.” Boundaries between musical genres in Seychelles are not clear. Moutya can be seen as constantly changing and adapting to new contexts. Nonetheless, although the creolization process can be observed in everyday life in Seychelles, the official representation of musical heritage is still based on distinctive (fixed) characteristics, inherited from specific cultural groups (mostly Africans or Europeans), and the whole heritage is considered and labeled “creole.” This shortcut background suggests that the local stakeholders and I had “different stories about the problem.”

Moutya’s “fluidity” makes it difficult to define and to present as an ICH according to UNESCO’s criteria. As the Mauritian anthropologist Rosabelle Boswell writes, “cultural heritage managers and researchers will find it difficult to identify pristine cultural practices and heritages or even a master narrative of heritage in the Indian Ocean,” and “the emphasis on preservation is at odds with the reality of super-diversity and ongoing creolisation.” Seychellois’ cultural authorities must face considerable pressure to meet international dominant ideas about culture. My study revealed the strong influence of international policies and concepts of culture, like those of UNESCO, in the making of national heritage. The local formulations of cultural policies were based on international models, often to the detriment of local specificities.

The initial plan did not include my participation in the preparation of the nomination of moutya as an ICH to UNESCO, but my research was to establish a scientific basis for it. Some people in the Ministry were hoping that my presence and intervention could have an impact on the dynamism of local music. Documentation of musical practices, which comes under ethnological research and inventory work, can be an end in itself—namely preservation—but it does not comprise revitalization and rehabilitation of the practices, though it might coincidentally contribute to them, as has been the case during my study. When I met with the General Director for Culture in January 2012, he asked me to focus my documentation on the elderly bearers of the tradition in order to furnish information to “rehabilitate” the moutya. He also suggested that I visit persons in charge of district management in order to gather

39 Grant 2015, 630.
40 Ibid.
41 Grant 2015.
42 Boswell 2008, 22.
43 Ibid., 36.
information about individuals or groups practicing the moutya, and to encourage them to organize cultural activities with traditional music and dance. During my third stay in Seychelles, an employee of the Heritage section of the Ministry told me that, in his opinion, I was the best person to complete the nomination form because of my knowledge of the field and related issues, convincing me to have a discussion with the Principal Research Officer. I did not want to take charge of the project because I think Seychellois, the “community” to use UNESCO’s terms, must lead the project themselves according to their own values and choices. However, I agreed to lead meetings and writing. During the discussion with the Principal Research Officer, I learned that by contributing concretely to the UNESCO nomination, I would get access to other (the oldest) moutya recordings and material, but we would then need to complete another protocol for this specific action. As requested, I prepared a one-year plan for the preparation of the nomination. I knew the Ministry wanted to move quickly, arguing that maloya from La Réunion (France) and sega from Mauritius—both deriving from the regional and original sega, like moutya—were declared ICH on the Representative List in 2009 and 2014 respectively.

This evokes the questions of who should represent the community and who “owns” the heritage management process.\(^{45}\) It also indicates that, in the Seychelles, declaring ICH is primarily the pursuit of national authorities. Comparison with neighboring nation-states confirms the latter, and exhibits the competition between groups so often deplored vis-à-vis UNESCO heritage lists.\(^{46}\)

The involvement of ethnomusicologists upstream from official recognition is likely to become increasingly common in the current social and cultural environment of post-industrial societies. Some ethnomusicologists have published on their experiences and observations while involved in the recognition process and on the consequences of UNESCO recognition of musical practices.\(^{47}\) As Guillaume Samson puts it, the role of the ethnomusicologist may be, in this context, to “put in perspective all the cultural, political and sociological contemporary issues in which music is part ... in order to consider the risk of drift, instrumentalization and misinterpretation.”\(^{48}\) At the same time, applied ethnomusicology should avoid adopting a holistic view that misunderstands communities as homogeneous in order to achieve certain political goals. Samson reminds us of the importance of maintaining “a critical vigilance regarding the relationship we and ‘our expertise’ have with the institutional and political environment in which we conduct our research.”\(^{49}\)

\(^{44}\) Sega is a polysemic term apparently first used in colonial discourses in the nineteenth century to describe the music of the African and Malagasy slaves and workers in the Mascarene and the Seychelles (Samson 2013, 223).

\(^{45}\) Blake 2009.

\(^{46}\) Samson & Sandroni 2013; Titon 2015a.

\(^{47}\) See Samson 2011; Samson & Sandroni 2013; Sandroni 2010.

\(^{48}\) Samson 2011, 170.

\(^{49}\) Ibid.
Research, Ethics and Authorities

In this vein, it seems essential to me that the researcher takes responsibility for respecting moral and ethical principles. In an intercultural context with different interlocutors, ethics might vary from one person to another, since it refers to values rather than bonds.\(^{50}\) The sociocultural dimensions of ethics are plural and complex; different ethical systems are at work in my research.

During the negotiation process with the supervision committee in Seychelles, I presented the consent form that I would introduce to all participants in my research. Such a form, mandatory for all research projects conducted with human participants at many universities globally (see Swijghuisen Reibersberg, this issue), aimed to inform participants of their rights during the research process and to authorize the researcher to use interviews and music recordings for educational purposes.

The problem is that my consent form, derived from requirements of the Canadian university at which I was doing my PhD, was at odds with the ethical values of the Ministry and the desire of committee members that I leave with them a copy of all recordings made, including musical performances and interviews. During each stay in the Seychelles, I had to meet the committee members to inform them of issues and developments in my research. While I did not need a visa to enter the country as a Canadian, I systematically had to go to immigration before the end of the first month of each stay and gain a letter of approval from the Ministry of culture in order to have my authorization to stay in the territory renewed. In a meeting with the committee, I explained clearly that I would supply most interviews except for interviews or parts thereof that I was asked not to share for personal reasons. The committee then asked me to provide a list of all my interviewees, insisting that I should include the names of all individuals. At that point, my research methodology was moving increasingly towards non-formal discussions, a format in which everybody seemed much more comfortable discussing different issues related to my research and musical practices. Being aware of the need and desire to see musical practices documented and remaining available in the Seychelles after I had left the country, I tried to record as many musicians and musical events as I could, especially moutya. The absence of a clear archives policy and a contract between collectors and the National Archives remains a concern.

One might question the validity to another country of a risks assessment conducted by an occidental or North American university ethics committee.\(^{51}\) In the Seychelles, instead of building trust with my interlocutors, the consent form was generally perceived as a formality imposed by my university to obtain official permission to use the material collected from individuals and, by signing it, collaborators had freely agreed to participate in the research. Although the purpose of this form is to ensure that a “university must respect the dignity of participants

\(^{50}\) Desroches 2010, 81.

\(^{51}\) Léotar 2011, 32.
and ensure respect for their rights” in the research process, I do not think that participants understood it as protecting them, even though I insisted on available remedies. There were concerns as to how “my university” in Canada would protect “them” from my potential harmful actions or writings, and what did “my university” know about Seychellois’ reality. The forms mandated by ethics committees hardly consider some of the local conditions that can alter individual choices and interests. As ethnomusicologist Frédéric Léotar puts it, “in countries shaped by a vision of society where culture represents political issues inherited from a totalitarian regime, signing an agreement on which appear personal data may not be the best option to build confidence with an interlocutor.” In a hierarchical society, in which subaltern voices are too often silenced, it is generally not individual interests and desires that count, but those of the community. In this sense, prior approval of my research project by the Ministry of culture certainly reassured some research participants who, without the approval of their superiors in hierarchy—social or professional—would perhaps not dare to participate in such a project. On the other hand, while knowing that local authorities are part of the research project makes it easier for some individuals to agree to participate, some topics become more difficult to elaborate, especially in front of a camera.

As researchers looking for more equity in the research process, we should welcome such initiatives from our interlocutors to “proclaim their right to consultation” because they counterbalance the authority often imposed by Western researchers and institutions, and contribute to establishing a dialogue with community authorities we work with. This dialogue eventually proved to be necessary for me to better understand the global issues inherent to local musical practices. Being an (outsider) translator or mediator between collaborators in the Seychelles and academia, I was hoping to “balance” the eventual power and knowledge relationship, inherited from a colonial legacy. As requested by the Ministry’s committee, I try to highlight the work of local researchers, but I normally do not have access to what they might have written. In a protocol, the committee insisted on “working in collaboration with local researchers,” but it was not clear—at least for me—what “working in collaboration” meant in this context.

Overall, I observed an institutionalization of my research that could have adversely affected the outcome of the research findings and complicated my researcher position. It also limited the exploration of some potential issues or revealing situations, restricting the spontaneous aspect of research in our discipline. Agreed-upon government protocol was a formal condition to conduct research in Seychelles. It is relevant to question power relationships implicated in the negotiation that eventually gave me the right to conduct research in the Seychellois’ territory. A researcher’s position of “scientific authority” often has to be negotiated with authorities when in the field.

52 Ibid., 31.
53 Aubert 2007, 12.
The research protocol can be seen as “a sign of the uneasiness felt by some of the ‘observed’ facing their observers.” As ethnomusicologist Laurent Aubert writes, “it remains to be seen if such a protocol would be likely to cause a greater objectivity in the relation of facts, or if it would risk paralysing the relation dynamics of the exchange.” In my experience, the protocol seems to have established a tension, more than collaboration, at least in the beginning. It reveals not only issues about heritage management and hegemony in Seychelles—reminding me I do not have authority there and that research results should be approved by the committee—but also a tendency towards “policy-oriented research.” It finally evokes authority issues regarding the (applied) work of the ethnomusicologist, as pointed out by many researchers. Music ownership issues can also affect relationships and research when musicians have the “perception that ‘someone is getting rich on [their] music’.” In the Seychelles’ case, it is not even clear who that “someone” could be: it seems that the committee wanted to “protect” folklore and control research and production from improper appropriation by me—the researcher. Yet the musicians I consulted were worrying more the power of government institutions, and the global music industry, about which they often feel aggrieved. Their worries concerned relations between communities and states (between heritage and governmentality), and between communities and industries (of heritage and the market); questions that are essential in theorizing heritage and cultural policies. I ask, with Valdimar Tr. Hafstein, “[W]hen is protection not a means of dispossession”?

This raises issues of ownership and control over culture and recorded material, which become increasingly important when money is to be made. As with the research protocol, the consent form, and with issues related to intellectual property and copyright, the risk is that over-regulation will not only impede research, but also discourage researchers from collecting and publishing, for fear of not respecting the prerogatives of people they work with.

54 Aubert 2007, 12.
55 Ibid.
56 Weiss 1995.
58 Seeger 1992, 356.
59 Hafstein 2014, 30.
60 Kapchan 2014, 5; Titon 2015b, 8.
62 Titon 2015b, 8.
Facing the Plurality of Stakeholders’ Values

Ethnomusicologists may work with music and heritage that are now seen as “cultural assets” protected by intellectual property and having an economic value that may be conflated with cultural values. Many issues we face are "influenced by economic resources and ownership systems, often and currently within the pressures of neoliberalism, but also within pressures or graces of nationalisms, especially in historical terms," as is the case in Seychelles. The Seychelles socialist-progressive government recently adopted a Creative Industry Policy, "guided by the UNESCO Convention on the protection and promotion of the diversity of cultural expressions adopted in 2005." This reflects somehow "its preference for culture that is profitable without public subsidy, is complicit in current modes of neo-liberal government and expansion of corporate capital." I am not going to present the paradoxes behind this policy here, but it clearly suggests a commercialization of heritage, as observed in the tourist industry. Discourses of commodification and governmentalization are interrelated and support one another, but the humanitarian and democratic aspects of creative industry policy might be neglected. In considering governmentalization of cultural heritage in the Seychelles, one should be reminded that the community is the nation as a whole and not the individuals who are part of that community. Authorities’ representing cultural practices becomes depersonalized.

Seychellois artists want to be “professional,” that is to say, earn money, be publicly recognized for their art, and create in order to produce an aesthetic and commercial product. In most cases, the artists refuse to see musical heritage as “national.” They defend their singularity, meanwhile admitting the convening power of music like moutya.

As an (applied) ethnomusicologist, my values tend more towards democracy and social justice in arts, culture and also in the research process. My experience in this case was that my independence was compromised or threatened. I often had the impression my research was not meeting the committee’s expectations in terms of methodology, length and eventually results, or “useful knowledge.” This could be explained by the Ministry’s affinity with the trend towards “policy-based evidence-making,” where research “is created by institutions that have clear research as well as policy agendas.” As cultural policy researchers Eleonore Belfiore & Oliver Bennett further note, “[i]t is, indeed, challenging (though not necessarily impossible)
to guarantee the freedom required to ask the types of complex, exploratory and genuinely open questions required for knowledge production in the context of policy-oriented commissioned research.” Academia is not immune to the forces and influences of politics and the market: research funders tend to privilege application of knowledge that has market value and/or concrete community impact.

**Conclusions**

“Being on both sides” was necessary to understand concerns and issues with musical life in Seychelles. It was also probably the only way to hope that my research would have a potential impact locally, even though I cannot be sure that my ideas will be applied in practice in the ways that I intend. My argument in this article is consistent with the idea that “[f]or an applied ethnomusicologist working with the aim of assisting endangered music, a comprehensive understanding of actors, stakeholders and forces that influence sustainability is imperative.” The temps long is necessary in the process of observation and understanding of cultural practices, and also to build up confidence and successful communication. In some cases, our partners have expectations and we need to adjust our methods and goals to meet the criteria and agendas of local authorities, which corresponds more to the consultative approach than humanities-based research. However, the latter is better at grasping the role of ideas, beliefs and values inherent in musical practices and the policy-making process in particular cases. This can contribute to a better understanding of music and culture, but also to the formulation of public policies at local, national and international levels.

Being an applied ethnomusicologist means being concerned, or “caring,” to use Jeff T. Titon’s words, with people making music and this goes beyond of the musical act of playing or listening. The position implies substantial professional and ethical dedication to the production and use of knowledge in a way that can impact positively on individuals, communities and musical traditions.

---

70 Ibid.
71 Harrison 2012, 512.
72 Hofman 2010, 28.
73 Harrison & Pettan 2010, 6.
75 Titon 2015a.
References


Nation. 2015. A “Cultural Revolution” Taking Seychelles by Storm. <seychellesweekly.com/ August%208,%202015/cult2_a%20cultural_revolution.html> (visited 17 June 2016)


Parent, M. C. In press. Le festival “Dimans moutya” aux Seychelles: (re)construction et “sauvegarde” d’un patrimoine musical au travers de sa mise en tourisme [“Dimans moutya” Festival in Seychelles: (Re)construction and “safeguarding” of a musical heritage through tourism]. *MUSICultures*.


Uranie, S. 2015. Seychelles Constitutional Court Ruling Declares Sections of the Public Order Act Are Unconstitutional. <seychellesnewagency.com/articles/3284/Seychelles+Constitutional+Court+ruling+declares+sections+of+the+Public+Order+Act+are+unconstitutional> (visited 17 June 2016)

Institutions I
ORGANIZATIONS

Universities, Music Conservatories and Learned Societies
Policy Formation, Ethics Statements and Ethics in Ethnomusicology: The Need for Increased and Sustained Engagement

Muriel E. Swijghuisen Reigersberg
Goldsmiths, University of London

This article explores the relationship between policy formation in higher education, ethics statements and ethical frameworks of professional conduct, within the discipline of ethnomusicology, from a UK and USA-based perspective. It will argue for an increased and sustained engagement with the formation of ethics statements on subjects of ethical concern and that this needs to be done through learned societies and critical mass. This, so I argue, will help inform UK and USA higher education institutions, funding bodies and sponsors on how best to approach the assessment of ethical rigour in ethnomusicological research activities.

The article’s introduction will explain the 2015–16 context in which it was written, because the paper is designed to offer an historical snapshot of ethnomusicology’s engagement with ethical policy and is therefore time-sensitive. It will then explore ethnomusicological engagement with higher education’s ethical assessment processes and compare this to similar engagement by anthropologists. I examine the role of learned societies in promoting ethical conduct and policy formation by looking at ethical statements from both anthropological and ethnomusicological learned societies. Here I will show why it is important that ethnomusicological learned societies such as the British Forum for Ethnomusicology (BFE), Society for Ethnomusicology (SEM) and the International Council for Traditional Music (ICTM) provide sustained engagement with the ethical concerns of their discipline, using concepts of meta, normative and applied ethics. I conclude by providing examples of common ethical concerns that are not well-understood by medically-oriented ethics committees and offer suggestions as to how ethnomusicologists might engage with these.

---

1 The conference paper version of this article (Swijghuisen Reigersberg 2015) was originally presented at a forum of the Society for Ethnomusicology (SEM) and International Council for Traditional Music (ICTM) held September 13–16, 2015 Limerick, Ireland, in collaboration with the European Seminar for Ethnomusicology (ESEM). The theme and title of this conference was Transforming Ethnomusicological Praxis through Activism and Community Engagement.
Introduction

In this article, I seek to explore how recent developments in the UK higher education sector have meant that researchers and institutions are required to become more rigorous in the ways in which they evidence ethical research conduct, and how this may or may not conflict with the ethical dilemmas faced by ethnomusicologists during their professional lives as students, teachers and researchers.

I examine this topic from two angles simultaneously: that of an applied/medical ethnomusicologist having conducted fieldwork with vulnerable populations, and that of an experienced UK administrative university research development and policy manager and member of Goldsmiths, University of London's ethics committee. I seek to highlight some of the common points of contention that I have identified in my routine work with academics, senior management and government officials, such as mandated anonymization and sometimes destruction of research data; definitions of authorship and the co-creation of ethnography; the inability of ethnographers to replicate their research outcomes as in the exact sciences; and issues of copyright, intangible cultural heritage and how these do, or do not, map on to institutional ethical approval processes. Basing my arguments on anthropological theory and the anthropology of law, I shall demonstrate that some of the legalistic aspects of research integrity and ethical clearance should be viewed as context and culture-specific, but are often not within the higher education sector, which in the UK and USA bases its compliance forms on research ethics models from the hard and behavioral sciences and Western (Anglo-centred) codes of conduct.

More importantly though, my paper advocates that learned societies such as the Society for Ethnomusicology (SEM) and the International Council for Traditional Music (ICTM) as well as the British Forum for Ethnomusicology (BFE) should consider either creating their own ethical codes of conduct as well as ethics training materials and blogs (ICTM and BFE) or should revise older ethics statements (SEM). This, I argue, would ensure that members of these learned societies have examples and statements of good practice to turn to, that are in keeping with developments within the discipline, which has come to include applied, medical, cognitive, advocacy and action-based research models, sometimes in ethically precarious or challenging fieldwork situations.

It would benefit ethnomusicologists to be able to cite and share these codes of conduct and examples of good practice when seeking ethical approval or when teaching within their institutions. Codes and examples of good ethics specific to ethnomusicology can be shown to institutional review boards (IRBs, as they are called in the USA) or research ethics committees (RECs, in the UK). These codes provide evidence of how ethnomusicologists have thought deeply about the ethical implications of their professional activities. Statements of this kind are often used
in other disciplines like sociology, psychology and anthropology to provide the critical mass needed to convince IRBs and RECs that the individual researcher applying for ethical approval is operating within a well-established disciplinary framework that has its own discipline-specific approaches to and history of ethical engagement.

Given the nature some current research undertakings and student requests for support, I argue such new or revised ethical statements and training materials cannot come soon enough. My contribution is a set of initial observations based on extensive administrative and academic work experience in the UK higher education sector, spanning 10 years. This paper offers the reader suggestions on how they might engage effectively with ethical clearance and institutional engagement issues on an individual level and through learned societies. My article will not address at any length examples of good ethical practice, which I recognize exist in abundance in ethnomusicology, and are already enshrined within the discipline, our practice and our written texts. Rather, this text focuses on my research on policy formation in relation to ethical ethnomusicological codes of conduct in the UK and USA.

Contextualization and Novel Research Methods

Before moving on, it is useful to elaborate on my methods of analysis as they are not commonly used in ethnomusicology, but stem from science and technology and higher education studies. My application of them here is therefore novel. The study of academic practice from an emic, insider, perspective was pioneered by anthropologist and sociologist Bruno Latour and Steve Woolgar. Using fieldnotes and ethnographic methods they documented and analyzed scientists at work in their laboratories. Through this process they demonstrated that the construction of scientific “fact,” is not an objective process, but influenced by external factors such as funding, technologies and modes of scientific writing. Their method introduced a reflexive approach to the study of the academic enterprise within higher education that previously had been absent.

---

4 Papers presented at the Society for Ethnomusicology (SEM) and International Council for Traditional Music (ICTM) held September 13–16, 2015 Limerick, Ireland are good examples. Presenters included Oliver Shao (Indiana University, USA), who looked at refugee camp policies in Kenya; Andrew McGraw (University of Richmond, USA), who works with detainees in Richmond City Jail; and David A. McDonald’s (Indiana University, USA), who researches how ethnomusicologists are moving towards an activist-oriented critical discipline.
5 Students conducting research with refugees using ethnographic methods came to me for support on how to work with their research subjects. Others that I spoke to in the past have conducted covert research in Scotland among violent football team factions; in Northern Ireland, student colleagues were confronted by militant IRA members and their often hostile political ethos.
6 For example: Swijghuisen Reigersberg 2010, 2011; Barney 2014.
Rather than specifically critiquing academic-intellectual outputs, Woolgar and Latour explored what it means to be a researcher in a higher education institution. I apply Woolgar and Latour’s method of critically examining academic practice to the formation of ethical policies at a meta- not micro-level, using my ethnomusicological training to do ethnographic analysis. This approach has meant that, for ethical reasons, I have opted to provide broad, non-detailed descriptions of public conversations had on the subject of ethics, to preserve the professional integrity and anonymity of research subjects.

In this way, I present research that is the result of more than 10 years of sustained work experience as a research development professional overseeing the acquisition of UK grants income and ethical approval processes. The institution in which I work as a research development and policy manager—Goldsmiths, University of London—is an institution specializing in arts, humanities and social science research. It is through my job in research development that I deal regularly with UK and USA research ethics applications and policy formation. Additionally, I conduct research in ethnomusicology, currently being affiliated with the Goldsmiths’ Music, Mind and Brain research center. This article also draws on personal experiences gained when submitting my own research projects for ethical approval: it is auto-ethnographic. I complement my auto-ethnography with observations made and discussions had during ethnomusicological conferences of the BFE, SEM and ICTM.

Ethical Awareness in Ethnomusicology, Administration and Codifying of Ethical Conduct

Ethnomusicologists have sporadically explored how they are engaging with ethics. Mark Slobin in his 1992 paper writes about the SEM committee on ethics. He observes that the SEM handbook on ethics was specifically designed to cater to the needs of “Western” scholars working in “non-Western” situations. In the 1990s it seems, ethics in US ethnomusicology was considered an ethnocentric enterprise. Slobin, disliking the state of affairs in 1992, thought that there was a lack of discussion surrounding the notion of whose ethics we abide by and that the ethical implications of contemporary research are not adequately covered. In 2012 ethnomusicologist Klisala Harrison, in her article on epistemologies in applied ethnomusicology writes:

Analyses of epistemic communities and epistemologies including ideologies involved in applications of music can serve as bases for analyses of ethics of applications of music and ethnomusicological research (Whose welfare? How is welfare defined?). The

notion also importantly puts a focus on shared approaches around which practice and discourse can cohere. Epistemic communities result in knowledge as well as action.  

In 2013, Kay Kaufman Shelemay identified many of the challenges that I discuss here. My intention on this occasion is to make an applied “intervention” into current ethics practices by ethnomusicologists and of scholarly societies for the field. Shelemay writes that during a time when collaborative research increases in ethnomusicology, ethical questions are multiplied and the complexity of these questions heightened. Many such ethical questions are also not necessarily musical in that they, for example, may make reference to the bureaucracy that accompanies doing fieldwork in and with corporate institutions and recording companies, such as permission and consent documentation. Shelemay situates ethics in ethnomusicology within a broader philosophical frame of thought and commentary, complementing these with specific examples and tracing the SEM’s history of ethnomusicology’s engagement with ethics from the 1970s onwards. A panel at the SEM’s annual meeting in 1972 led to the establishment of the Society’s Committee on Ethics. From the 1980s onwards, ethnomusicologists began to acknowledge the ethical challenges inherent in their work. To this day, there is no substantial body of literature addressing research ethics in ethnomusicology. Shelemay also draws attention to the variety of areas where ethical concerns may crop up, including archival work, and the medical, applied and activist domains. What she does not focus on is the processes by which individual researchers must and do obtain ethical approval through their own organizations and the hurdles they may face. Neither does she discuss the role that ethics statements from learned societies such as BFE, SEM and ICTM can play in supporting and validating the ethical choices made by ethnomusicologists or why codes of good practice and ethics training are crucial to promoting the health and safety of our students, fieldwork partners and collaborators. These are the subject of my contribution here.

Shelemay’s excellent paper, however, has not led to a sustained, critical review of ethnomusicology’s meta-level debates around policy formation for the benefit of our own discipline. Apart from two interesting and provocative panels at SEM’s annual conference in 2014, Pittsburgh, which explored fieldwork-specific ethical challenges and concerns in some detail, I have yet to see any recent activism and change in this area where the administration of our learned societies is concerned. In terms of the production of theory around ethics; guidelines and training materials and their engagement with higher education policy, anthropologists have a head start on sustained engagement. As early as 1971, for example, anthropologist

9 Harrison 2012, 522.
10 Shelemay 2013, 793.
11 Ibid., 794.
12 Ibid., 789–792.
13 Ibid., 790.
Joseph Jorgensen “attacks” the assertion that an ethical code for professional scientists\textsuperscript{14} should be based on scientific models and principles. Jorgensen challenges the ontological status that some of his colleagues accorded science and the imperative to “advance” it.\textsuperscript{15} His point of departure is clear: he will not approve of ethical assessment processes that enforce a system which only favors the use of scientific paradigms, the Gold Standard or, in other words, a system which insists on replicability of results, and the use of quantitative methods, when these are inappropriate methods for the enquiry at hand.

In 2005, anthropologists Ian Harper and Alberto Corsín Jiménez in their article on interactive professional ethics, acknowledged that anthropology as a discipline is entangled in “complex institutional and political structures which extend beyond the dialogical relationships of fieldwork.”\textsuperscript{16} They argued for an ethics beyond legalism that is less based on committees and paper work and more on assessing actual ethical concerns on a sustained basis without being reactive to crises. They supported an ethical approach that goes beyond legalism, which should ideally emerge from a sustained commitment to a discipline. The authors advocated for a continual updating of ethical guidance rather than sporadic engagement by committees and individuals in response to crises. Harper and Corsín Jiménez suggested that the application of any ethical guidelines should not be about taking sides, but instead must emphasize a learning and thinking-through process. Such a system, they opined, must be predicated on principles of its own self-actualization. The approach favored by the authors is not legalistic, reactionary, restrictive and adjudicative.\textsuperscript{17} Otherwise, as the authors wrote, “ethics become less a quality of relationships than an aspect of managerial processes and outcomes.”\textsuperscript{18}

As Harper and Corsín Jiménez point out, ethics approval processes have the ability to help a researcher think through her or his ethical approach, anticipating any social, practical and legal challenges. This will help a researcher to adequately prepare for fieldwork. When exploring the different codes of ethics of other learned societies, I have found “adjudicative” thinking from anthropology, which relies on the law, particularly inspiring. What is the relationship between law and institutional ethical reporting and clearance, and how are these culture-specific, varying from country to country and from institution to institution? As early as 1748, Montesquieu in his \textit{The Spirit of the Laws} wrote, “Laws should be so appropriate to the people for whom they are made that it is very unlikely that the laws of one nation can suit another.”\textsuperscript{19} I would add that this not only applies to countries, but also to academic

\textsuperscript{14} Here he uses the European definition of the word science, which includes research in all disciplines. By European definitions, ethnomusicologists and historians are also scientists.

\textsuperscript{15} Jorgensen 1971, 321–322.

\textsuperscript{16} Harper and Corsín Jiménez 2005, 10.

\textsuperscript{17} Ibid.,11.

\textsuperscript{18} Ibid.,10.

\textsuperscript{19} Montesquieu 1748 quoted in Falk Moore 2005, 13.
disciplines. Colleagues at Goldsmiths argue that ethics forms, the law and its implementation have very little to do with ethics. Based on my work on ethics, this I do not think is entirely correct. I agree that the law requires some form of consensus as to what counts as a misdemeanor in relation to a culture and a person's rights and roles within it. These decisions and what counts as appropriate behavior, under what circumstance, and by whom, is then encoded in some agreed form. Consequently, the law may, but does not always, essentialize categories, fix identities, to the detriment of one party or another.

The need for an evidence and paper-based legal system is however the problem, not necessarily the making of legal judgments. When attending seminars by barristers held at Goldsmiths for the Department of English and Contemporary Literature as part of my administrative duties for example, I learnt that very often judgments are made based on moral decisions which are formed through ethical debate and cultural preferences, not the letter of the law or concomitant paperwork. The legal framework is there to assist this moral and ethical debate, and to provide guidance. The law itself of course, is also subject to change, and does, in response to new societal developments and localized requirements. So should good ethical codes of conduct and statements or guidance.

In terms of the research administration of ethics, the need to implement legal frameworks has led to the design of forms, policies, guidelines and committees. Their role, ostensibly, is to monitor an institution's ability to evidence that it is facilitating ethical research to the best of its ability. Ethical clearance mechanisms are treated and viewed as means of achieving legal compliance, not what they should be: opportunities to improve the rigor of research methods and to reflect on the ethical implications of work-to-be-done. This led Economic and Social Research Council board member professor Linda Woodhead, at the 2015 UK Research Integrity Office conference to assert that ethics committees “strangle social science research” if not managed properly. There are reasons why Professor Woodhead feels this, perhaps unreasonably, is the case.

Historically, ethical clearance pertained more to the biomedical sciences than social sciences or the arts and humanities. It should come as no surprise, therefore, that the prevailing models of ethical scrutiny and training, for better or worse, are medicalized. Now that the social sciences, arts and humanities are being reviewed more rigorously in terms of their ethical practice, new ways of working need to be developed that marry the ethical codes of conduct prevailing in the biomedical world with those more appropriate to the social sciences. Ideally even, codes of conduct should be discipline-specific. In my administrative experience, achieving this discipline-specific approach to ethical clearance is challenging. No administrative form will ever cover all normative, day-to-day ethical challenges across all disciplines working within one institution. Similarly, no ethics policy (which is operationalized through committee systems, procedures and forms) would be able to cover all ethical debates in its wording. Such a policy would be in constant need of revision and never-ending. Yet, funding bodies and government
require ethical clearance and misconduct still occurs, so naively abolishing ethics committees, policies and assessment altogether would not be a workable solution either. What is needed is a culture change that appreciates the value of assessing ethical rigor. Simultaneously, discipline-specific solutions might be found that address appropriately disciplinary differences in ways of working, which might inform ethics policy formation. Here learned societies such as BFE, ICTM and SEM have important roles to play.

**The Importance of Learned Societies in Facilitating Discipline-Specific Administrative Change**

Learned societies can take the key role of supporting their membership when lobbying for changes in ethical assessment processes. Those in senior positions of authority within disciplines and on ethics committees can provide advice or examples for workable, acceptable alternatives for administrators and science colleagues. Like Harper and Corsín Jiménez suggested in 2005, I believe researchers should be less defensive, and engage with others outside the academic profession or their discipline to facilitate positive, ethical change. As a research development professional who has retained a career as a researcher, I work for and with other ethnomusicologists (as evidenced by this article-as-“intervention”) as well as administrative colleagues in efforts to ensure that my discipline and other arts, humanities and social science researchers receive a more balanced treatment at ethics committees that are not always well-designed to meet their needs. In order to do this though, it would help if I had at my disposal statements that demonstrated ethnomusicology’s approach to assessing ethical issues.

Currently, it is the case that the BFE, with my own input, has been developing an ethics statement over the past three years. The initial draft of the BFE statement was based on the SEM statement from 1998, with permission from the SEM ethics committee and SEM President in 2012 (Beverley Diamond). The new BFE committee, however, on receiving the SEM statement, opined that it needed modification before it could serve as a BFE statement for ethics. It has since been revised, and I am pleased to say, shared with the current SEM committee and President.

The ICTM has no statement or guidance for ethical issues. Some issues about formulating one are: Can and should there be ethics guidelines for an organization affiliated to UNESCO, which already has its own overarching ethical protocols? Or is there a more discipline-specific ethics model that might be developed in order to complement existing memoranda and guidelines? Of the UK, and contexts of the BFE, which is a national organization affiliated with ICTM, one may ask: How does the BFE-ICTM relationship influence the creation of an ethics statement for either organization? How would other national learned societies devoted to ethnomusicology need to engage with an ethics statement issued by...
ICTM? Would an ethics statement from ICTM, a body with many international sub-groups (e.g., a World Network of national and regional committees; study groups on ethnomusicological sub-topics), lend exceptional weight to ethnomusicology’s endeavors and commitment to ethics? These questions need answers that can only be arrived at through a discussion at the ICTM Executive Board level.

The SEM position statement on ethical considerations, from 1998, needs to be revised to make allowances for newer practices such as covert, applied and medical ethnomusicological research. The SEM statement addresses some concerns BFE members voiced when advocating for an ethics statement, namely that: ethical systems differ among ethnomusicologists; ethical values affirmed by an SEM statement do not necessarily represent those of all practitioners of ethnomusicology everywhere; and ethical systems and values may differ between ethnomusicologists and their field consultants.

SEM’s ethics position statement on ethical considerations is complemented by SEM’s “Position Statement on Ethnographic Research & Institutional Review Boards, January 16, 2008” (IRBs or Research Ethics Committees (RECs) in the UK). Here, the SEM joined other USA scholarly societies in calling for changes in the application of IRB guidelines for ethnographic research, asking that these be revised to include an increased sensitivity to ethnomusicology’s scholarly objectives and methodology. Authors of the statement ask that this new protocol be more consistently and appropriately applied. The SEM viewed the IRB situation in 2008 as threatening academic freedom, and as detrimental to the spirit and practice of ethnography. Authors offer useful descriptions of methods used by ethnomusicologists and recommendations for review panel make-up in order to ensure that ethnographic research is not assessed using biomedical ethical models and by non-ethnographers. The SEM also has additional statements available online.

These include statements on torture (discussed in detail below); music and fair use; copyright and sound recording; and anti-discrimination, anti-harassment and sexual discrimination.

The BFE has no equivalent of SEM’s position statement on IRBs, and none is currently being considered. If it were to be, it would necessarily differ from SEM’s in that IRBs in the USA ultimately report directly to governmental organizations. In the UK, higher education institutions have far more autonomy in how they report on ethical conduct within their own organization. Whilst research ethics and integrity are auditable functions for, for example the Research Councils UK and the European Commission, no set guidelines are mandated by government. Instead, UK institutions wishing to receive research income must sign up to the
“Concordat to Support Research Integrity,”21 a high-level policy document that sets out broad guidelines as to what type of conduct is expected of researchers and their employers. Organizations such as the UK Research Integrity Office (UKRIO) then offer guidance and impartial support when necessary for their members. This is not to say, however, that no position statement on research integrity and ethics clearance processes is needed from BFE, as ethnomusicologists still must contend, on some occasions, with ethics and integrity committees that contain no social scientists and are based only on biomedical models of ethics clearance. As a research development and policy manager specializing in ethics at a UK higher education institution, I believe that the SEM’s position statement on IRBs could easily be modified to suit UK and even EU policy frameworks. One or more lobbyists might then be able to, for example, take this type of statement to the European Commission, where the current ethics focus is on addressing the absence of appropriate discipline-specific guidance for arts, humanities and social science researchers.

Here again we might learn from our anthropological colleagues. The ethical support offered by the American Anthropological Association (AAA) to its members is comprehensive. The AAA manages an ethics statement provides blogs, gives examples for classroom exercises alongside case studies and training and maintains lists of literature and other resources.22 Anthony Seeger, in his keynote “Changing Praxis and Ethical Practice: Lessons for Ethnomusicology from Applied Anthropology” at the SEM-ICTM Forum in 2015,23 recommended that ethnomusicologists view the Society for Applied Anthropology’s “Statement of Ethics and Professional Responsibilities.”24 Like myself, in the Forum conference paper on which my article is based, Seeger argued that a well-conceived and frequently reassessed written code of ethics is essential to our changing praxes as ethnomusicologists. The Association for Social Anthropology (ASA) has even gone so far to act as an independent advisory body for members who require support in ethical disputes, where appropriate and necessary.25 I am not suggesting that

21 Universities UK 2012. It should be noted that as of October 2015, Universities UK (UUK) and the UK Research Integrity Office (UKRIO) are assessing whether the Concordat to support Research Integrity (a high-level policy document that sets out broad guidelines as to what type of conduct is expected of researchers and their employers) is in need of revision.
22 American Anthropological Association n.d.
23 Seeger 2015.
24 Society for Applied Anthropology n.d. Personally, I am less taken with this statement’s initial wording as it reads more like a mandate: “This statement is a guide to professional behavior for the members of the Society for Applied Anthropology. As members or fellows of the society, we shall act in ways consistent with the responsibilities stated below irrespective of the specific circumstances of our employment.” Although billed as a guide, it does not, in its wording, sympathetically recognise tensions that may exist between employer guidelines and employee ethical concerns and the difficulty in navigating these. It states that applied anthropologists will seek to act on the guidelines “irrespective of the specific circumstances of our employment.” The statement also emphasizes on informed consent, which in some cases is difficult to achieve. It also has no publication or ratification date, making it difficult to assess how current it is. However, the statement also emphasizes the importance of student training and ethical conduct towards other (academic) professionals.
ICTM, SEM and BFE go as far as that because doing so can compromise the neutrality of a learned society, bringing with that potential for time-consuming and costly legal wrangles for which there may not necessarily be appropriate expertise, funding or time. A decision to become this way involved must be taken carefully. The SfAA, AAA and ASA are actively engaged in lively debate and pro-active ethics training for and with their membership. I believe ethnomusicologists ought to follow suit.

Why Create (New) Ethical Statements, Guidance and Policies for Ethnomusicologists?

I believe we need new ethical statements because in ethnomusicological circles, existing ethical statements no longer cover the diversity of research activity undertaken. Kaufman Shelemay’s 2013 article supports this view. Additionally, in an excellent paper I attended at SEM 2014, Stephen Millar lamented that his covert research methodology was never problematized in ethnomusicological discussions on ethics, let alone acknowledged in ethical statements. He critiqued the emphasis on informed consent, openness and honesty, asking that his audience to consider reviewing sociologist Alan Fine’s 1993 article the “Ten lies of ethnography.” Fine questions the morality of ethnography and ethnographers extensively. He explores covert research methodologies and argues that these are taken from privileged positions of power, information and control. He reminds us that, to some extent, ethnographic research is always secret in some respects, because field collaborators can never know everything there is to know about the research enterprise.

I would add that this pertains not just to ensuring that participants are fully aware of the implications of their involvement in a research project and having research collaborators sign pieces of paper or give verbal consent where this is possible and appropriate. Here I am referring to differences that exist between the various ways of knowing and learning across cultures, such as written versus oral traditions, or doing versus reading practices. Ethnomusicologists, from Mantle Hood onwards are no strangers to the idea that people learn and embody knowledge in different ways. Explaining ethnomusicological theory to non-academics can be challenging, however. For example, one of the most difficult things I have had to do during a fieldwork period was to try and explain Western post-colonial theory to ageing Australian Aboriginal choristers. They had just come to sing in a choir I was facilitating as part of practice-based research into the construction of Aboriginal Christian identities, and were curious to know why I was asking what

---

26 Millar 2014.
28 Hood 1971.
to them seemed odd questions about topics they had never really considered. A lot of my consent-seeking discussions turned into layman's mini-lectures in post-colonial theory, which I am not entirely sure elucidated my reasons for being in the community. In the end, I remained “the choir lady” from Rockhampton (Australia) rather than the practice-based researcher from Roehampton University, London, leaving me to wonder whether they had actually consented to being part of the undertaking that is “academic research,” in its fullest sense. In my particular case, I briefly considered giving up the doctoral enterprise as a result.

Similarly, Irish colleagues (then students) worried they had not received adequate support in how to deal with difficult situations in which their musical activities became inadvertently and unintentionally intertwined with Irish political divides and violence.29 Music can be harmful and incite or accompany violence.30 In recent decades, scholars have begun criticizing (ethno)musicology’s lack of engagement with music’s role in social crises as well, alongside the assumptions “that its preoccupations as a field with music immunized it from the crises affecting other disciplines within and without the academy”31 as if music were an innocuous art form never related to, for example, attempts at manipulation for political ends and violent acts, such those described by Anna Papeati and Morag Grant32 in their thematic issue of the journal Torture on music in detention, and Susan Cusick’s work on music and torture.33 Admittedly, certain events have led SEM to respond to crises, such as its “Position Statement on Torture” from February 2, 2007.34

Discussing the impetus for this statement in relation to applied ethnomusicology, its ethics, definition and endeavours, Jeff Todd Titon writes:

Should the definition [of applied ethnomusicology] include, for example, ethnomusicological research put to use in torturing political prisoners? The United States bombards Muslim “detainees” with loud music, in their efforts to break their resistance and obtain information. … The Society for Ethnomusicology’s Executive Board, on the recommendation from the Society’s Ethics Committee, put out a statement on the SEM website publicly condemning the use of music for torture. … It so happens that I was the one who brought the matter before the Ethics Committee in the first place, and I found nothing but strong support for my position all the way through to the publication of the statement—the first time that SEM has taken such a public political stand, be it said. But can I find an ethical principle that will exclude this appalling use of ethnomusicological research (I don’t know that any ethnomusicologists were directly involved in the government’s decision to use hip-hop to torture political prisoners, of

---

29 I cannot provide the exact details for fear of the safety of individuals concerned. Suffice it to say that they inadvertently encountered factions of the Irish Republican Army (IRA) that were known for their uncompromising, sometimes violent political attitudes, towards non-IRA members.

30 See, for example, Swijghuisen Reigersberg 2011 and Cusick 2013.


32 Papeati and Grant 2013.

33 See, for example, Cusick 2013.

course; my guess is that they consulted the literature of music psychology primarily) and not exclude ideologies that embrace social justice? This is more than a technical question.\textsuperscript{35}

This SEM statement against music’s use for torture was discussed at the recent BFE one-day conference on Ethnomusicology and Policy, hosted in Newcastle, 31 October 2015, not long after the SEM-ICTM Forum. Here two excellent papers by Katia Chornik and Manuel Guerrero\textsuperscript{36} and Morag J. Grant\textsuperscript{37} explored the relationship between torture, music, legislation and policy. Definitions and understandings of the term “torture” were critiqued and examined, and music and sound’s roles in torture contexts explored. Towards the end of the presentations, an appeal was made to the BFE chair, encouraging the BFE to formulate a statement similar to SEM’s, which explicitly: a) calls for full disclosure of US government-sanctioned and funded programs that design the means of delivering music as torture; b) condemns the use of music as an instrument of torture; and c) demands that the United States government and its agencies cease using music as an instrument of physical and psychological torture. It was felt by the speakers that the BFE ought to present a statement to the UK government because British troops have also been involved in torture using music.

In subsequent discussions at the Newcastle conference, it became clear why BFE felt it would need to tread carefully, resonating with Titon’s question above as to whether he is able to find an ethical principle that might exclude music from torture contexts. Concerns were raised about the nature of such a position statement against music and torture, and whether it would reflect the opinions of all BFE members, given that BFE membership is diverse. Equally, signing up for BFE membership indicates a willingness to subscribe to the society’s codes and statements. Therefore, any statement or code of conduct should ideally reflect the views of BFE membership at large, or so it was felt. It is by no means certain whether all members might object to music being used as torture in certain circumstances (although I believe if there are any, they would be in the minority), and even whether all members might object to torture in certain critical circumstances related to national security and the safety of large numbers of people.

Such profoundly ethical questions must be considered before any such statement is crafted by a learned society. Similar arguments were put forward by BFE committee members over the past three years when it was suggested that BFE should have an ethical code of conduct or ethical statement. We were back to the “Whose ethics?” question. There were also general concerns about such statements being too prescriptive or not accounting for all of the potential ethically challenging questions members might face. However, this is somewhat missing the

\textsuperscript{35} Titon 2011.
\textsuperscript{36} Chornik and Guerrero 2015.
\textsuperscript{37} Grant 2015.
point in the case of an overreaching ethics statement or policy for a learned society. Policies and statements can be written in such a way that they acknowledge the diversity of opinion within a group’s membership. Policies, by their very nature, cannot feasibly be made as a set of instructions with every eventuality specified. Good functional policies are aspirational guiding documents crafted using broad-brush strokes. They can be successfully implemented according to local circumstance and should take into consideration the operational and procedural needs of those affected by them as best possible, in this case the membership of ethnomusicological learned societies.

Any ethical statement should be offered as a set of guiding principles, which are presented for consideration, not as a diktat with a long list of dos and don’ts. As the SEM has done, general ethics statements should acknowledge that a diversity of opinions might exist amongst the membership. A diversity of opinions on ethical matters, provided this is acknowledged and positively supported, is to be encouraged. Not having an ethics statement or taking no action because of a diversity of opinions seems to me unsound reasoning. Provided that a policy or statement is carefully worded and regularly revised in response to change, much is possible. A similar stance might be taken to writing a statement on torture or music’s application during torture, by BFE for example.

Given the above, clearly, ethnomusicologists conducting field research are deeply engaged in ethical issues, and are seeking support from their learned societies to champion ethical engagement and social justice causes. Many colleagues, particularly early-career and post-graduate researchers, need advice on ethics as well as training in how to achieve ethics clearances. The two are not the same. Here I am again in agreement with Harper and Corsín Jiménez who write that “our experience suggests that the diversity of ethical issues faced by graduate students should be a rich source of input and comments from the field.”38 I will add that student fieldwork should provide the impetus for reviewing ethical guidance and statements on a regular basis, as it is students who stand most to lose (education, career and research chances) if their research does not go well due to ethical challenges.

**Ethical Domains and Ethnomusicological Scholarship**

The absence of ethical statements and guidance from some of our learned societies, however, should not be taken as evidence of a lack of ethical awareness. Ethnomusicology’s concern with ethical issues is woven into the field’s publications and is, more often than not, context-specific and related to particular research enquiries and relationships between the researcher and his/her fieldwork partners

38 Harper and Corsín Jiménez ibid., 12.
and collaborators. This evidence is what Jorgensen and Kaufman Shelemay refer to as “normative ethics”: it adjudges day-to-day actions and decisions as being “good” or “bad” or both depending on points of view. Literature in our field abounds in such materials that we might use to compile readings lists that will help provide case studies and training texts for students or examples for meta-ethical debates.

Meta-ethical studies or questions, according to Jorgensen, are concerned with the meaning, function or nature of normative judgments and means by which they are justified, and how these may change according to context. Meta-ethics examines the broad meanings and origins of ethical principles, such as the concept that our ethical values are influenced by our religions, and philosophical and cultural backgrounds of our thinking. Ethnomusicology has not engaged much with meta-ethics. Kaufman Shelemay notes that there appear, however, to be “shared assumptions about the meta-ethics of studying world music that implicitly guide ethical philosophy in ethnomusicology.” She goes on to write that this includes notions of human and scholarly responsibility and the idea that ethical issues emerge from Western cultural values, most conspicuously cultural relativism.

A third category added by Kaufman Shelemay is applied ethics, which examines specific issues through an ethical lens. In some cases, applied, normative and meta-ethics may overlap in ethnomusicological work. Discussions on intellectual property including copyright tend to feature here, as they pertain to law-formation, modes of knowledge and music creation, and musical and intellectual ownership. The ways in which notions of moral rights and ownership of music are formed can be both a normative and meta-ethical question, especially in debates surrounding intangible cultural heritage. Seeger, in his article on the shifting ethics of intellectual property (IP) addresses this issue head-on when he writes:

There is a singular peril in making practical suggestions in a scholarly journal—they are even more obviously time and situation sensitive than most of our theoretical speculation. Some of the suggestions proposed below will probably be rendered ineffective by future laws; others will later be considered suspect through shifting ethical stances in certain areas. Yet issues of intellectual property touch at the foundations of “free” speech and song, and are at once practical, emotional, and philosophical. Like all other articles, this one should be read as a moment in an evolving discussion within the field about an important facet of music.

In order for ethnomusicologists to address some of the concerns they have with IP, copyright, and rights to culture with IRBs and RECs, they need to produce more meta-ethical theory, supported by many normative and applied ethical examples,

39 Jorgensen 1971, 322.
40 Shelemay ibid., 787.
41 Ibid., 787–788.
42 Ibid., 787.
such as those provided in case studies and discussions of musical ownership. It is this type of material that will help support requests for adjustments to ethical policy and protocol so that they become appropriate to our disciplinary needs. Meta-ethical arguments have the advantage of demonstrating why a particular system of ethical assessment may be at best unhelpful to our discipline. Normative and applied examples can too easily be swept aside with the argument that they only present a small, singular instance of system-tension, thereby not warranting an adjustment of the larger system as a whole.

Conclusion: Common Contentious Issues of Ethical Review and a Way Forward

To conclude then, the question arises: What exactly are our disciplinary needs for change, and how are they not being met by many ethical committees and IRBs? Ethnomusicologists do much good individually and in collaboration with co-researchers and collaborators, but we have yet to truly make use of our combined strength in the academy by providing external ethics committees and IRBs with good, regularly revised ethics statements that reflect the complexity and nature of our discipline and its difference from science subjects. In order to effect change, we need critical mass, which is what learned societies provide. Ethnomusicologists are very good at being reflexive about the communities in which they work as most constantly scrutinize their own ethical motivations, influenced by cultural relativistic theories. Ethnomusicologists as a group, however, have yet to address, through praxis, advocacy and engagement, ethical review processes that may challenge their productivity via their home institutions, for example. Lack of ethnomusicological activism may account, to some extent, for the inappropriate ethical policies and ethical assessment forms. Using our critical mass, I propose ethnomusicologists help to educate our own university administrations, RECs and IRBs. This, in turn, would help inform debates and ethics policy formation in the arts, humanities and social sciences more broadly.

I will therefore identify and discuss areas of ethical review that learned societies might be able to influence. A few of these are already referred to in the SEM position statement on IRBs. My list here is not intended to be definitive, but provides examples of topics that, as a university research development and policy manager, I hear colleagues comment on when preparing their ethical assessment forms in places where biomedical models prevail:

- A demand for anonymity: Many social scientists and medical researchers insist that all research data be anonymized, especially where personal data is collected from research participants, which might be included under the UK 1998 Data Protection Act, such as name, age, and gender. A lot of ethnomusicological activism...

44 See, for example, Barney 2014.
research however, requires that collaborators are identifiable in our publications, especially when they share their musical heritage. Anonymization is often not just impossible, it would even be unethical.45

- Informed consent and consent forms: Many ethics review boards insist on informed consent being practiced, and written consent forms being used where this might not be appropriate. Many review boards are very wary of covert research, and find it difficult to grasp that field collaborators might be illiterate or averse to official documentation, making obtaining informed consent difficult or impossible.

- Data destruction: Many hard scientists refer to their data being “dead” after it has been analyzed and the necessary articles have been written. In the UK, new legislation demands that personal data is destroyed after 7 years and research data after 10, unless research data is regularly accessed. For many social scientists and ethnomusicologists their “data,” that is fieldwork notes, film footage and photographs, for example, remain valuable and their destruction often not desirable. Equally, laws like this vary between countries. Researchers should remain abreast of these differences.

- “Lack” of replicability of research methods and outcomes: Many ethnomusicologists and qualitative researchers are critiqued at ethics review for the lack of replicability of their methods or subsequent verification of results by medically oriented researchers. In our field it is well-known that musical learning and experience are valuable ways of gaining new insights, but these methods and their outcomes are so context and person-specific that replication is not possible. Performative methods however, have demonstrated they are capable of producing new insights of value such as how identities can be shaped and wellbeing promoted through choral facilitation and education by the researcher.46 Replicability is not an appropriate criterion when assessing the merits of performative methods.

- Authorship and co-creation of ethnography: Biomedical researchers have clearer definitions of what authors are and why. In scientific journals, “authors” may not have written texts, but instead might have contributed to experimental design or other aspects of the research. By this definition, sometimes ethnomusicologists are questioned about who exactly has generated the ideas and data in applied research? In other words, who counts as “an author” of a text, if the text has been shaped by the thoughts and actions of others during the research process? Due to the arts, humanities and social sciences’ emphasis on monographs and edited volumes, relatively few articles are ever co-authored and no clear definitions exist as to what counts as an author. This can confuse scientific colleagues.

45 See, for example, Keegan-Phipps 2014.
46 See, for example, Swijghuisen Reigersberg 2010.
• IP, copyright and rights to culture: With the implementation of open access mandates in the UK for publications as well as research data, this forms one of the most pressing ethical issues for researchers in the UK and beyond. If institutions and funding bodies demand that researchers make their field data openly available via the internet or institutional repositories, this could lead to serious ethical concerns on a variety of levels related to appropriate archiving locations, levels of access, and rights to musical ownership. Many institutions retain some IP rights over research data created by researchers, and therefore musical data that belongs to research collaborators. This is not yet a well-understood area as it is relatively new, but already causing much concern among ethics committees and national funders.

So how might we engage with such issues and dilemmas as a group of researchers via our learned societies? Here I provide 5 possible ways in which researchers could involve themselves:

1. Generate more theory on meta-ethics and compile reading lists of good examples of normative ethics.
2. Prioritize the creation and maintenance of ethics statements, training materials and dialogues. Update these regularly. Share these internationally.
3. Create a critical mass of sustained and sustainable activity to help get the message across, to those outside ethnomusicology, that their ethical assessment processes need tweaking: national funding bodies, governments, etc.
4. Train students in how to deal with discipline-specific ethical challenges, including newer trends in medical ethnomusicology, covert research, etc.
5. Actively and positively engage with professionals outside the academy plus other social scientists in order to effect change

It heartens me to say that leading figures within SEM and ICTM were in attendance when I gave my paper at the SEM-ICTM Forum in September 2015 and subsequently encouraged me to facilitate the sharing of the BFE draft ethical statement with them. The BFE chair approved this suggestion and the draft statement went to the SEM Board of Directors in October 2015, which immediately decided that a revision of the older SEM statement was needed. The BFE chair and committee were also not opposed to the idea of sharing their statement with the ICTM at a later stage, once it has been finalized. It is therefore not impossible that, in the future, three learned ethnomusicological societies may be able to provide the critical mass and support needed for their membership in what are increasingly bureaucratic, data-driven times. Much remains to be done though, on an ongoing basis by all ethnomusicologists. I hope to herewith to have provided some reasons why this is necessary and how it might be done.
References


Grant, M. J. 2015. Preventing the music to torture: From research to policy. Conference paper, British Forum for Ethnomusicology (BFE), 31 October, Newcastle-upon-Tyne, UK.


Titon, J. T. 2011. The Curry Lecture: Applied Ethnomusicology. <sustainablémusic.blogspot.co.uk/search?updated-min=2011-01-01T00:00:00-05:00&updated-max=2012-01-01T00:00:00-05:00&max-results=20> (visited 16 June 2016)

Industrialized Music Education in China: A Discussion of the “Standard Grade Examinations in Music” (SGEM) Organized by the Central Conservatory of Music, Beijing

Zhang Boyu
Central Conservatory of Music and Nanjing Normal University, China

Following the UK-based model of The Associated Board of the Royal Schools of Music (ABRSM), in 1993 the Central Conservatory of Music (CCOM) in Beijing initiated a similar system called the Standard Grade Examinations in Music (SGEM). Since then, throughout China, all conservatories as well as the Chinese Musicians Association, the Chinese National Orchestration Society and some local music organizations have launched similar examinations, establishing a significant trend in music education. A Grade Exams Center (GEC), which houses the SGEM, is not confined to exams, but also runs related courses in music instrument performance, and organizes relevant publications. This article focuses on the commercial aspects of the SGEM. It classifies four business categories that form a music-industrial chain, and discusses the chain’s benefits and issues for CCOM and Chinese society.

Background

Despite its highly favorable position, the Chinese Central Conservatory of Music (CCOM) nevertheless faced serious financial problems some twenty years ago due to the country’s economic situation, with China listed (and still listing) as a third-world country. For a long time, its facilities were unsatisfactory, and the incomes of its staff low, hardly sufficient either to invite foreign professors to teach at the Conservatory, or allow its staff and students to travel abroad. Following economic reforms in China in the 1980s, Chinese universities began to use their knowledge as a source of wealth, something allowed and promoted by the government. Since the number of salaried university posts funded by the State was quite small, universities needed to supplement these from their own resources. Although the
State doubled the amount received from student tuition fees; this was still a relatively small amount. If Beijing university staff relied solely on their state salaries, their standards of living would have been of the lowest. Therefore universities needed to ensure channels of self-funding so that their staff might continue their university teaching. Under these circumstances, CCOM needed continually to explore ways of funding increased expenditures both on salaries and facilities, notwithstanding significant academic achievements of CCOM.

The Associated Board of the Royal Schools of Music (ABRSM), the UK’s largest music education body, arguably with the world’s most influential music exams, began operations in 1890 and is now one of the “largest music publishers and the world’s leading provider of music exams, offering assessments to more than 630,000 candidates in 93 countries every year.”\(^1\) In a recent publication, Wright\(^2\) illustrates the history and the social values of the ABRSM, noting its significance in music life since it opened Western music education to millions of people from many parts of the world.

Having learnt from the ABRSM, in 1993 the CCOM initiated a similar system in China, called the Standard Grade Examinations in Music (SGEM). Actually, this had been anticipated several years earlier, since in 1989 CCOM had already set up examinations in Malaysia and Singapore. Instruments included in the exams at that time were erhu (two-stringed fiddle), pipa (four-stringed lute), guzheng (movable-bridged zither), yangqin (dulcimer) and dizi (bamboo flute). Chinese examiners were not confident about offering exams in Western instruments, given that these were represented in those offered by ABRSM. The instruments selected to be included in the SGEM basically accord with the kinds of instruments most students were willing to learn. In 1992, CCOM established an administrative section called Kaoji Zhongxin (Grade Exams Center [GEC]) with more than 15 employees managing the SGEM program. The president of the conservatory CCOM appoints the director of the section. In the following year (1993), the GEC organized the first exams in China, which included the piano, violin, flute and cello, although these were confined to Beijing. However, starting from 1994, exams in these instruments were extended to all of China’s provinces, and to 42 examination centers. In 1998, the exams were introduced in Taiwan, and then in Hong Kong in 2003, Canada in 2006, and the USA in 2007.

After the advent of the SGEM, other conservatories, such as the China Conservatory of Music, the Shanghai Conservatory of Music, and conservatories in Wuhan, Sichuan, Guangzhou (called Xinghai Conservatory of Music), Tianjin, Shenyang and Xi’an, as well as the Chinese Musicians Association, Chinese National Orchestration Society and some other local music organizations, launched similar examinations throughout the country. At present, there are more than 100 institutions offering similar grade examinations, creating a significant trend in

\(^1\) ABRSM 2016.

\(^2\) Wright 2013.
music-learning and music commerce. However, those at CCOM are arguably the most popular, presently attracting more than 150,000 candidates each year. They are also recognized by the Chinese Ministry of Education as mechanisms of music education: those who pass a certain level can also receive certification from the Ministry. The GEC organizes not only the SGEM, but also cooperates with CCOM’s Continuing Music Education College through running various courses to teach related Chinese and Western instruments, while collaborating with the People’s Publishing House and Central Conservatory of Music Press to publish booklets and sheet music specifically designed for the SGEM. This then has become a business enterprise beyond the teaching and learning of music.

Scope

This article focuses on the commercial aspects of the SGEM, identifying four categories that together form an inter-related music-industrial chain. Such a chain, while presenting various problems, provides benefits both to CCOM and society in general. Because this article is intended to serve as applied ethnomusicology, I would first of all like to explain why the study is “applied.”

In various respects, applied ethnomusicology is still vaguely defined, especially in China. Indeed, looking at the ethnomusicological literature in China, it is difficult to find any serious discussion in this field. From conversations with various Chinese ethnomusicologists, it seems to me that the meaning of “applied ethnomusicology” among many Chinese scholars is “ethnomusicological practice in society, beyond the academy and beyond professional musicianship.” In one definition, what is “applied” is practical rather than theoretical. Yang Mingkang, a famous Chinese ethnomusicologist, thinks that ethnomusicology is divided into the theoretical and applied. For example, an ethnomusicologist organizing a music festival or establishing a music database is not theoretical per se, but more practical and thus considered “applied ethnomusicology.” If a music museum informs academic research, resulting work can be considered “theoretical.” However, if an ethnomusicologist curates a museum exhibit for public viewing, then the work is “applied.”

In the Study Group on Applied Ethnomusicology of the International Council for Traditional Music, applied ethnomusicology is not seen as opposed to academic, theoretical, and even ethnographic and scientific thinking. It therefore seems clear to me that there is some divergence in thinking between Chinese and non-Chinese scholars.

This article on the SGEM may be seen an example of what Svanibor Pettan calls action ethnomusicology. This is defined as “any use of ethnomusicological

3 M. Yang 2015.
4 Harrison and Pettan 2010, 16.
knowledge for planned change by the members of a local cultural group”⁵—in this case the administration of an exams system. As I am a CCOM employee not directly organizing the SGEM and I analyze music education and exams happening outside CCOM, the article exemplifies “administrative ethnomusicology.” Administrative ethnomusicology, according to Pettan, refers to “any use of ethnomusicological knowledge for planned change by those who are external to a local cultural group.”⁶ Exploring the SGEM system nonetheless within a scholarly study will illustrate Klisala Harrison and Svanibor Pettan’s claim that “applied ethnomusicology is not an opposition to the theoretical (philosophical, intellectual) domain, but … its extension and complement. Applied ethnomusicology is about how musical practice can inform relevant theory, and about how theory can inform musical practice.”⁷ To also evoke Yang Mingkang, I will undertake practice-based research about music that is “non-theoretical” in its focus on general society, yet theoretical in that it seeks to contribute to the theorization of actions of academics and higher-education students.

This paper is not intended as research into what is applied ethnomusicology in China but, rather, a means of raising the profile of Chinese music scholarship in international circles and contributing to ethnomusicological research on music in China’s public sphere. International readership may consider this paper is “applied” because it discusses social practice in music education, which is generally recognized as one of the key issues in applied ethnomusicology. The Oxford Handbook of Applied Ethnomusicology, for example, includes a music education section.⁸ However, music education per se is not the sole interest of this paper; also discussed here is its industrial aspect. Cultural industries, including the music industry, currently form a hot topic in China but, as business success is largely based on capital rather than academic research, publications on the music industry are less than comprehensive. Most useful information is found in commercial publications. However, a Master’s thesis by Liu Gang (China’s Geosciences University) entitled “Study of the Chinese Musical Industry Value Chain”⁹ offers a general overview of how the music industry works in China. Liu proposes three industrial chains in music practice:

- Recording companies—singers—composers—copyrights—media—consumers.
- Recording companies—singers—agents—concerts/advertisements—consumers.
- Recording companies—CD products—markets—consumers.¹⁰

---

5  Ibid.
6  Ibid.
7  Ibid.
8  Pettan and Titon 2015, 553–670.
9  Liu 2006.
10  Ibid.
In the academic literature in English, Simon Frith “provides an overview of the current research situation in Britain.”\(^{11}\) Topics in his article include the political economy of rights, the culture of the firm, the music industry research and government policy, and research on the music industry, among other subjects, but nowhere does he focus on music education. John Williamson and Martin Cloonan\(^{12}\) summarize the current situations and achievements in the music industry generally, finding that the word “industry” has gradually become pluralized into “industries.” However, it is clear from the article that most areas related to the music industry arise from popular music, with a scope that includes recording, publishing and live performance. Noriko Manabe\(^{13}\) presents an example of music industry research from Japan, discussing music in relation to broadcast media, the Internet, iPods, mobile phones, cell phones, ringtones, downloads, CD sales and the record industry.

In further writing on the music industry, Burt Feintuch in “The Conditions for Cape Breton Fiddle Music: The Social and Economic Setting of a Regional Soundscape”\(^{14}\) discusses how Canadian folk musicians use music for making money and boosting tourism. Reebee Garofalo\(^{15}\) proposes that the music industry involves three key areas: (1) music publishers, who occupied the power centre of the industry when sheet music was the primary vehicle for disseminating popular music; (2) record companies, which rose to power as recorded music became predominant; and (3) transnational entertainment corporations that promote music as an ever-expanding series of “revenue-streams”—record sales, advertising revenues, movie tie-ins, streamed audio on the Internet, and so on—no longer tied to any particular sound provider. Jeffrey Kallberg\(^{16}\) explains how Chopin was responsible for selling his works whereas Irving Wolther\(^{17}\) discusses how national language recordings sell in Germany and other European countries.

Although the references mentioned above are selective, we can see that, as far as they are concerned, the music industry is mainly concerned with popular music and its social contexts, such as CD products, concerts and recording company businesses (although we know differently—there are traditional and art music markets, as well). None of the publications above conceived of music education as an industry. Can music education also be industrialized? This paper will present a discussion of this question and argue “yes.”

\(^{11}\) Frith 2000, 387.
\(^{12}\) Williamson, John and Martin Cloonan 2007.
\(^{13}\) Manabe 2008.
\(^{14}\) Feintuch 2004.
\(^{15}\) Garofalo 1999, 319.
\(^{16}\) Kallberg 1983.
\(^{17}\) Wolther 2008.
Structure

Graded music exams provide a structured framework for progression from beginner to advanced amateurs. The SGEM graded examinations are divided into two types: (1) instrumental performance on both Western and Han Chinese musical instruments; and (2) music theory. Western instruments include the accordion, piano, electronic keyboard, violin, viola, cello, double bass, flute, trumpet, clarinet, saxophone, French horn, trombone, bassoon, guitar and snare drum; Chinese instruments include erhu, pipa, guzheng, yangqin, dizi, sheng (mouth organ), ruan (four-stringed, round lute), konghou (harp), and jinghu (a two-stringed fiddle used specifically in Beijing opera). Other instruments such as the Chinese suona (shawm) are under consideration. This article only investigates Chinese instruments. For any grade of performance, whether instrumental and vocal, the examination repertoire is fixed. It is QCA-accredited at ten levels: Grades 1–3 comprise the basic level; Grades 4–6, “ordinary”; and 7–9, advanced. The tenth grade is considered professional-level, even though it requires considerably lower skills than those of first-year CCOM regular degree students. As yet, the GEC has not made a clear relationship between the tenth-level examination and the professional standard required of CCOM graduates (who in 2016, study for an additional four years, minimum).\(^\text{18}\)

The second category, theoretical examinations, consists of three grades. Grade 1 corresponds to instrumental performance grades 3–6 exams;\(^\text{19}\) grade 2, to grades 7–9 exams in performance; and grade 3 to grade 10 in performance. Only grades 1–2 in theory are taking place at present; grade 3 is in the planning stages. Candidates cannot enter any practical or theoretical exam grade unless they have already passed the lower grades. The contents of the theory exam are basically divided into two branches: basic knowledge of Chinese music theory, and basic knowledge of Chinese music culture. The former refers to theories of scale, mode and meter as well as the reading and analysis of staff notation. So, it is a mixture of Chinese and Western music theory. Besides theoretical knowledge, aural training and sight-singing are required. The latter branch requires a very basic knowledge of Chinese music culture including identifying the names of Chinese instruments from pictures, listening to Chinese traditional music such as part of a song for which a pupil must give the title. At its higher level (grade 2), the exam covers basic knowledge of localized Chinese traditional instrumental genres, a very basic knowledge of Western instrumental music, popular music and world musics, such as instruments of India, folk songs of Brazil or drums of Africa. Due to the students' diverse backgrounds, the content of the theory exam is different inside China than

\(^{18}\) For more detailed information, please see the GEC textbooks for a particular instrument. Additional, relevant information can be found at http://kjwyh.ccom.edu.cn/ (Standard Grade Examination Committee of the Central Conservatory of Music 2016).

\(^{19}\) A theoretical examination is not required for the performance grades 1–2 exams.
abroad and in Hong Kong, where it is much simpler. This does not mean that students in Hong Kong are regarded as less knowledgeable about world musics, but rather that they are less immersed in Chinese traditional culture than their counterparts in Mainland China, where the tests focus more on Chinese music and culture. In 2015, the GEC plans to offer exams in voice performance. As many Chinese of all ages are lovers of vocal music, both adult and teenage-level exams are proposed. It is likely that this will attract a great number of applicants.

The organizers of the SGEM are also active internationally. At present, exams are held in Hong Kong, Malaysia, Singapore, Canada, USA and Taiwan, mainly focusing on Chinese instruments because the Associated Board of the Royal Schools of Music (ABRSM) is already established in these countries. In these places, though, the SGEM is still in the process of being developed further and the number of candidates is quite small (relative to China). However, their presence is considered a means of promoting Chinese music abroad. There are two further reasons for developing the SGEM in these countries. First, they have large Chinese populations and it is therefore perfectly natural to hold exams in these regions. As some students do not understand Chinese, the theory exam is held in both Chinese and English. A textbook in English has been published in order to help students acquire basic information about Chinese music theory, in preparation for the exams.

Apart from catering to ethnic Chinese in these countries, cultural transmission is also seen as another goal. To generalize, Chinese not only love Western music, but are also re-fashioning Chinese music along Western lines. This is no less true of the SGEM. China’s political leaders have been planning how best to promote this influence, resulting in the establishment of Confucius Institutes all over the world, which teach Chinese language and culture including music. A music-centered Confucius Institute has also been established in Denmark. 20 CCOM’s Confucius Institute has been very active. Each year it organizes music activities such as performances, training programs and conferences, meanwhile organizing Chinese music concerts abroad. Besides the Confucius Institutes, the SGEM may be considered another way in which Chinese music is being promoted abroad, offering a way for overseas Chinese to learn Chinese instruments and music culture. There may not be many taking part in the exams at present, but the number is gradually increasing.

**An Industrial Chain**

The Standard Grade Examinations in Music are not only concerned with music education, but also comprise a significant commercial chain, as is evident in the

---

20 The Central Conservatory of Music and the Denmark Royal Academy of Music jointly established a music-centered Confucius institute in Denmark in 2002.
following four perspectives: The first link of the chain is the SGEM itself. The GEC organizes two grade examination sessions per year in Beijing, and at least one in each of the 42 centers across the country. The costs are as follows. Every first-grade performance student must pay 200 RMB for each exam, followed by 260 RMB for the second, 320 RMB for the third, 370 RMB for the fourth, 420 RMB for the fifth, 460 RMB for the sixth, 500 RMB for the seventh, 530 RMB for the eighth, 560 RMB for the ninth, and finally 780 RMB for the professional level. The entrance fee for the first grade theory exam is 100 RMB, and 200 RMB for the second. As yet, no one has applied to take the third level of the theory exam. As mentioned above, only those students who have already passed the previous level can go on to take the next level exam. Since more than 150,000 students per year take such an exam on the CCOM campus alone, about 40 percent of which play Chinese instruments, this generates considerable income.

The second link in the chain is the teaching centers. As of 2014, there are 42 local Standard Grade Exam offices affiliated to the GEC, and each office organizes its own learning programs. Apart from these 42 offices, there are many other independent regional classrooms offering the same kind of programs, especially in big cities. Because these classrooms, large or small, are not contracted to the GEC, they cannot themselves organize the SGEM, but instead offer similar training programs. Their students then attend the exams in any one of the 42 affiliated offices.

21 These fees are not fixed-rate. As well, the rates may be increased in the future. The rates are not decided by the SGEM, but by the Price Evaluation Bureau of Beijing.
The Middle School of Music (MSM) affiliated with CCOM is the closest office to the GEC—MSM is part of CCOM although administrated independently of CCOM. The MSM employs a few people to work specifically on the SGEM, but the MSM’s activities are confined to courses in music theory rather than instrumental performance. The theory program is divided into three levels of examinations, but presently only two are offered since there has been no student intake for the third level so far. At each level, a center may accept up to 200 students per semester, divided into ten groups of about 20 students. Each level requires 16 one-hour teaching units. The training program includes musical skills like reading and analyzing staff notation; identifying single pitches, two-pitched melodic and harmonic intervals and chords; recognizing tonal scales; as well as other rudiments of music and basic knowledge of Chinese music gained through identifying Chinese instruments, listening to Chinese folk songs, and other ways of learning about folk and traditional music. Each student will pay 1,000 RMB for 16 lessons, totaling 20,000 RMB for each group. If 20,000 RMB is multiplied by 10 groups, the center makes 200,000 RMB in tuition fees each semester. The income is shared between the center and the teachers approximately evenly. While not large, this is nevertheless useful extra income especially for young teachers and postgraduate students, given that they teach only three one-hour classes per week. Some teachers, however, are encouraged to increase their teaching to as much as six one-hour classes per day.

Another example is the Music School of the Tanggu District in Tianjin, a city with a population of 12 million, 140 kilometers south of Beijing. High-speed trains from Beijing to Tanggu take about 40 minutes. A private arts school that teaches not only music, but also subjects such as dancing and painting, it organizes all kinds of instrumental lessons, both Western and Chinese, many of which are taught by students from the Central Conservatory of Music. Since most classes take place on weekends, employees from CCOM travel to the school by high-speed train in early morning, and back in the evening. Instrumental classes lasting 45-minutes are one-to-one, so each teacher may see six to eight students a day. The cost of each lesson is based on the teacher’s qualification. For example, those already employed by the conservatories as academic staff may receive 200 RMB per lesson, whereas for those who are still students, the price may be 150 RMB. Fees may be shared between teacher and school, with 70 percent going to the teacher and 30 percent, to the school. Although piano is the most popular instrument, some Chinese instruments such as erhu, pipa and guzheng can have many students.

The above two examples represent thousands of similar schools everywhere in China whose owners become entrepreneurs provide music education for society while creating opportunities for musicians, music students and young teachers to earn extra money. Since the number of people wishing to learn Chinese instruments is large, catering to this demand are three types of teachers: Chinese music professionals including orchestral players; teachers at music institutions; and mixed-ability amateurs who, no matter what kind of job they do, will get students.
An additional group of teachers rely solely on private teaching, but are still able to earn enough money to live in a city as expensive as Beijing. They find students either by themselves, or through being employed by any of the 42 GEC centers or by centers outside the 42. Conservatory students are, consequently, more affluent than those from students in other types of university programs because they derive income from such employment.

The third link in the chain is the publishing houses. The GEC committee enlists professional instrumentalists to create an independent editorial board that is responsible for compiling the contents of the textbooks. These textbooks are also divided into ten levels, from the basic to the professional. All textbooks for any Chinese instrument are in three volumes, the first for levels 1–6 and the second for levels 7–9. The textbook for the professional level has yet to be devised as so far no one has reached that level in the GEC system since at this level students are likely to be following the curriculum of an institution such as CCOM. Since many students participate at the lower levels, the need for textbooks is considerable. The SGEM textbooks appear in print, not digital, form. There are two volumes covering levels 1–9, for each instrument. Each learner must at least purchase two volumes; required musical pieces for the basic and advanced levels are divided between the two.

The UK-based Associated Board of the Royal Schools of Music (ABRSM) has its own publishing business. However, the GEC has not yet achieved that level. At present, two firms cooperate with GEC to publish all textbooks: the People’s Publishing House and the Central Conservatory of Music Press. The People’s Music Publishing House publishes all textbooks for Western instrument, theory and vocal exams whereas CCOM Press publishes all textbooks for Chinese instrument exams. Since a large number of students play piano and violin, all of whom must take the theory exam, it is easy to appreciate why SGEM textbooks have become the backbone of the publishing business. Chinese instrumental textbooks also provide a foundation of the CCOM Press’s income, although only for the nine most popular instruments mentioned above—erhu, guzheng, pipa, dizi, sheng, yangqin, ruan, jinghu and konghou—leaving a large body of Chinese instruments yet to be addressed. Of the SGEM textbooks published so far, guzheng is the most popular, followed by erhu, dizi, pipa and yangqin. Sheng and konghou were listed by CCOM Press in 2012, but have little popular demand and textbook sales are small. The following statistics demonstrate the financial scale of the textbooks. From 2004 to 2014, the textbooks for guzheng (two volumes) sold 79,262 copies at 45 RMB a copy, producing an income of 3,566,796 RMB. Over the same period, the two textbooks for erhu sold 54,687 copies. At 47 RMB per copy, this totals 2,570,289 RMB; sales of dizi textbooks are lower than the above. During the last ten years, the number of copies sold of the two volumes covering Levels 1–9 was 46,524 at 29 RMB each, totaling 1,349,196 RMB (134,920 RMB annually). Evidently, not all

22 ABRSM ibid.
books have the same market share. Nonetheless, the GEC must still arrange for textbooks for less popular instruments in the SGEM. Between its listing in 2012 and 2014, only 878 copies of sheng textbooks sold—440 copies each year.

We may consider the fourth link in the chain to be all of the other sectors connected with the exams including, for example, instrument-makers, music shops and printing companies. With the establishment of the People's Republic of China in 1949, all private businesses were banned. Several government-owned musical instruments factories were established, the most important being the Beijing, Shanghai and Suzhou National Musical Instruments Factories. Following economic reforms of the 1980s, government-owned companies started to face competition from new, more flexible private companies, resulting in the bankruptcy of many of the former. However, the musical instrument factories have been following another path. Three companies remain, but rather than employing workers, they act as agents for independent instrument makers, some of whom have signed contracts with the companies.

Musical instruments shops are all owned privately. In Beijing alone, there are estimated to be more than twenty, some of which sell both Chinese and Western instruments. Others sell only Chinese instruments. Whatever their business situation might be, we find that most of these stores also offer training programs. In this regard, musical instrument shops can be considered to be part of both the second and fourth chains.

The book market presents another context. In China, there are state-owned bookshops everywhere. These bear the name Xinhua Shudian (New China Book Store) and can be found in any city, big or small. Each large city has at least one in its center. In Beijing, for example, such bookshops may be found in Xidan, Wangfujing and Zhongguancun, three shopping areas of the city, and each store has four or five floors. Chinese publishers call this kind of bookshop “the first channel” because they must comply with methods of state-owned business. So-called “second channel” bookshops are private and small, but often very active. The CCOM Press has a network of more than 400 private bookshops throughout the country and through which its books are distributed. Nowadays, Internet booksellers such as Amazon, Dangdang, Jingdong and Taobao are also very active, taking more than 50 percent of total sales. Printing companies are another factor in this business chain. Printing machines, mostly imported from Western countries, are now highly sophisticated, although a company normally requires a minimum print run of 3,000 as the more copies printed, the lower the cost per unit.

This whole picture demonstrates the commercial nature of a music industry sector that extends far beyond the mere learning of music. All the branches described here, while ostensibly focusing on the pupils, have the target of extracting money from their parents. We cannot, therefore, classify this composite picture as pure music education, but rather as a commercial operation.
Reassessment

2015 marked more than twenty years of operation by the SGEM. During that time, SGEM has achieved significant success, not only in the promotion of Chinese music in China and abroad, but also in the formation of an industrial chain. On the positive side, it is apparent that through the SGEM’s promotion, more students learn music, and there are obvious economic benefits. However, two further questions arise: (1) Why do so many Chinese children wish to learn to play music; and (2) What are the disadvantages of the SGEM?

These questions will be addressed from the starting-point of current academic literature in China on the SGEM. Looking at the China National Knowledge Infrastructure, the database for all academic articles published in China, we find that discussion of the SGEM is relatively large, but the publications in which such discussion appears are not first-rank academic journals. Most influential ethnomusicologists who author first-rank publications are still focusing on widely accepted theoretical topics. Most articles published on the SGEM are short, only presenting the idea that it benefits both music education and the economy, although various scholars have also drawn attention to disadvantages. Wang Lufan, for example, says that the utilitarianism behind any kind of SGEM leads parents to have unrealistic expectations of their children, subjecting them to unnecessary pressure. Zhou Shibin, Professor and Deputy Dean of the Music College at the Beijing Normal University, a famous musicologist specializing in music education and music psychology, argues that there are two imbalances demonstrated by the music standard exams. First is an imbalance of technical training and artistic quality or standard. Exams of this kind concentrate more on technique than on artistic and aesthetic achievement. The result is that Chinese students have high levels of technical showmanship, but put little emphasis on artistic expression—therefore the level of musicality is often low. Secondly, the child’s enjoyment is subordinated to the parents’ wishes. A child learns music at the wish of his/her parents. If successful, he/she wins parental approval, but the child may not share the same feelings as the parents. Li Lulu lists three positive aspects of the exam system: it promotes and broadens music education; it creates new possibilities for musical people; and it trains music teachers to a higher level of responsibility. However, the author also lists five disadvantages: (1) there is presently no quality control of the organizers offering the exams; (2) management of the examiners is likewise unsatisfactory; (3) some students who reach a certain level are not really qualified to do so; (4) children often learn to play pipa at the bidding of their parents rather than self-motivation; and (5) parents often think that musical ability

23 China National Knowledge Infrastructure 2016.
26 Li 2003.
is a precise indicator of individual and general human ability when in fact they are not the same. Ling Jinyu, an examiner for erhu, found that many faults in student performances are due to inadequate teaching in the preliminary stages.

Other articles review similar exams abroad. Huang Qiongyao compares the Chinese exams to those in Canada, and listed five ways in which the latter differ: (1) at least one examiner at each Canadian venue is appointed by the appropriate institution such as Canada’s Royal Conservatory of Music; (2) in the case study, students who reach level six or above may convert this to one high school level music course; (3) every level from one to ten contains ear-training and sight-reading; (4) there are two further certificates offered beyond the ordinary tests—one for performance and one for music teachers, so that students do not need to attend college or university to obtain professional qualifications in music instrument performance or instruction; (5) for the highest level certificate in performance, students must give at least one concert.

Based on the discussions above, I find two reasons, historical and social, for the popularity of the exams and the development of the chain. I consider three disadvantages.

1. Advantages from the learners’ perspective:
During China’s long history as a dynastic feudal society, social justice pursuits relied on political power and personal wealth. Thus, access to a good life depended to a great extent on one’s father whereas family background determined the quality of life of family members. Such a social system breeds corruption. The ruling class naturally worked to perpetuate itself yet, at the same time, it also promoted the most able people to positions of social leadership. Developing from the latter, the Keju system, which selected officers by examination, was established during the Sui dynasty and, though varying slightly in different periods, remained basically the same for twelve centuries. The Keju system allowed anyone, irrespective of social class, to become a member of ruling class by examination. Thus, people from poor families could change their social status. The system came to an end in 1905, but the idea that one’s social position might be changed through education is still widespread in China. Concomitantly, music is regarded as a basic requirement of a good education.

Confucius himself believed that the type of music people played was a fair indication of the state of a society. He said, “to change the social trend, the best method is music.” For much of China’s history, to be a scholar, four activities needed to be cultivated: playing qin zither, playing chess, calligraphy and painting. To play qin zither, training of the mind through the discipline of performance is much more important than the enjoyment of sound: music is not merely amusement, but

27 Ling 2000.
28 Huang 2007.
29 Zeng 2008.
also a means of education, including for developing facilities of aesthetic evaluation. Even today, many people learn music, especially playing an instrument, since they still believe that this is an indication of general ability and educational background.

In addition, Chinese parents want their children to enjoy a good life in the future, and this goal relies heavily on education. Parents seek ways to send their children to good schools and, while this depends to large extent on location, one factor that makes school acceptance more likely is an accumulation of exam passes such as those possible via SGEM. Although music is highly valued as a way to elevate human capabilities, presently grade schools do not offer comprehensive music classes because of an emphasis on mathematics, Chinese, English and so on; music and arts are secondary to these, and are not included in entrance exams to universities and colleges. Grade schools are very much judged by the number of their students who successfully enter universities, but not by how many good musicians they produce. For such kinds of reasons, parents push their children to learn music and the other arts, which are not part of the regular curriculum, outside of school hours, which is why parents are so busy during the weekends.

Another reason for both the popularity of the SGEM and its resulting chain, is its connections with the “One Child Policy” and a “Parent’s Dream.” Since the 1980s, the one child policy has been responsible for the targeting of children by the education industry. Many simplistically think that, under the policy, the family unit consists of two parents and one child. In an economic perspective, what results are three families per child: the mother’s parents and the child, the father’s parents and the child, and the mother, father and child. In the Chinese mind, a family is three generations. Thus, the one child policy results in six working people being responsible for one child, and there is little problem in finding the necessary financial resources.

The popularity of the SGEM is also related to a further, perhaps unexpected element: a parent’s dream, which is closely linked to the one child policy. The school age of contemporary parents of young people coincided with the Cultural Revolution. With the closing of the schools, many school-aged children, including the present writer, stayed at home with nothing to do and so began to learn musical instruments. Since it was hard to find anything Western, Chinese musical instruments were the commonest choice. Many present-day musicians were trained during that period. Many had no opportunity to become professional musicians, but rather transferred their ambitions to their children, encouraging them to learn what they themselves would have liked to play.

2. Disadvantages, from this author’s perspective:

The first is a low degree of responsibility. The ABRSM has been criticized for using music education as a way of doing business. This is also true of the SGEM. Since

30 J. Yang 2015.
the CCOM established the GEC and began the SGEM program, its financial benefits have become obvious. Nowadays, many schools, institutions and organizations around China have followed this example, not only in music, but also in dance and other fine arts. Anything arranged for children will have its \textit{Kaqji}, a popular Chinese term for these kinds of grade exams. Yet who should take responsibility for licensing them? In 2004, the Chinese Ministry of Culture issued the Regulation of the Social Standard Exams in the Arts.\textsuperscript{31} According to this Regulation, if an institution plans to offer inter-provincial exams, the program must be approved by the Ministry of Culture. If the program is limited to a province, it must be approved by the Cultural Bureau of that province; and if limited to a particular region, the program is to be approved by the regional cultural bureau. Despite this regulation, over 100 institutions have been granted various levels of licenses. Given the huge financial benefits, everyone wants a share of the cake, but this is only available to licensed institutions. The licenses to hold exams are in high demand because it is widely felt that if students join the program of an unqualified institution, the education received may not be commensurate with their expenditure. The Ministry of Culture and the Culture Bureaus are expected to make regularly inspections, but in reality this has not happened.

A second disadvantage involves certificate “flying” and what certificates actually “certify.” After China restarted the academic certification that had been stopped for a while during the Cultural Revolution, certificates became very important. People like to have them because they are treated as evidence of the abilities of the holders and, in China, this is taken to extremes. For example, a student may gain entry to a good university if he has a certificate testifying to a certain level in CCOM’s SGEM, despite deficiencies in other areas of his school study records. Furthermore, different universities have different requirements regarding the instruments that students should play. Some require only the piano, some only Western music instruments, and some, also Chinese instruments. Such decisions, although made at university, have a bearing on the social status of a SGEM certificate and will influence a student’s attitude to learning music.

The Chinese say, “certificates fly everywhere in the sky”; in other words, a multiplicity of certificates offered by innumerable schools and institutions are offered for various purposes even though they may have little relationship to a student’s actual ability. A famous pianist, Liu Shikun, said: “The certificate of the SGEM, like a piece of waste paper, means nothing. The Standard Grade Examinations in Music target the art, but in fact depreciate it. The exam is for the certificate not for the art.”\textsuperscript{32} Any kind of training program may have merit in that it fills the educational needs of today’s China, but the quality of teaching must never be sacrificed to financial gain. Yet market forces ensure that, whatever their teaching quality, private schools will flourish if there are sufficient numbers of students wishing to take their

\textsuperscript{31} Ministry of Culture 2004.

\textsuperscript{32} Gao 2002.
programs. Given China's huge population, the need for such programs is subject to the law of supply and demand. However, among all music-training programs available in China, the SGEM is generally regarded as the best.

A third disadvantage is linked to what is called the “united music repertoire.” Chinese instrumental repertoires are not as large as that of the piano, but extensive enough to allow students to have some degree of repertoire choice from the prescribed works for each level, especially for instruments like dizi and guzheng, for which local styles are a chief characteristic of the music. As in the past, a person may specialize in one local style, but use pieces in another styles to supplement it. In the examinations, not only are certain pieces required, but all exam textbooks include pieces in various local styles. The idea behind this is that teachers like students to play in all styles but, on the other hand, this results in the gradual decline of a sense of local style, sustained and practiced at the local level. The student should decide for him or herself which style to adopt rather than being governed by the decisions of an organization in order to pass a specific grade exam.

**Conclusion**

My approach here has involved researching how traditional music can be newly embedded, used and above-all administrated in contemporary society, rather than used for purposes with which it was traditionally endowed. The performance of music might be identical, but the societal functions of the performance are different. Music is put to practical use in society for economic-industrial purposes, which formed the focus of this ethnomusicological study. Administration of the SGEM was a particular case considered within the frame of applied ethnomusicology and, particularly, administrative ethnomusicology research.

By examining the operation of the SGEM, we can appreciate that learning music is not only about how much people love music, but also involves many social behaviors related to family life, the relationship between parents and children, the education system, and commercial aspects of music, resulting in an industrial chain based around these practices. Even though China began this kind of program much later than the UK-based ABRSM, its commercial aspect is much stronger and it has exploited traditional Chinese thinking about music when developing new ways of making money. Still today, many Chinese regard music as a means of calming the mind, of encountering feeling and spirit, and of escaping materialism. The one child policy has undoubtedly served to intensify parents' interest in the education of their single offspring. Children's education has become a central focus in most families. Although Chinese income is still low compared to the first world, parents are nonetheless willing to spend money on their children's education because they believe that it will improve their intellectual ability and enhance their life opportunities. Most young parents select at least one musical
instrument for their child to learn, a trend which also provides opportunities for music teachers and students to earn their livings. Many private music schools have emerged, and most of them wish to cooperate with the GEC centers to operate the SGEM; that way, the schools can attract more students. This has two kinds of social consequences. One is the dissemination of music among children in China, especially those living in cities. It is clear that the standard of music education is raised by the exams. This is especially noticeable among the numerous students sitting a highly intensive university entrance examination organized by the Ministry of Education each year. A large number of students fail and must begin to explore other possibilities. Music as a university major has the advantage of requiring a lower entrance level than more academic disciplines and if a student has already learned music, this may become an accessible option. Because so many students want to study music, many universities have opened music programs, including technical and engineering universities where music departments can also now be found. As a result, in 2014 the Ministry of Education listed music as one of 15 non-vocational subjects, which in effect means no employment for the students after graduation. This is not to say that a music degree is a fallback qualification, but that difficulties arise for music students in a surprisingly large number of ways, particularly as not all who attain a music degree will necessarily find employment in their major.

The Standard Grade Exams promote musical education, and encourage students to progress to the next level. On the other hand, they also turn music into a money-making venture and if this becomes the dominant goal, it may be considered mercenary. Having emerged from a pure art form and spiritual object, music then becomes a commodity. I hope this presents a view of applied ethnomusicology that will stimulate thought and bring about an improvement in the functioning of the SGEM in the future!

References

ABRSM 2016 <gb.abrsm.org/en/courses-and-events/> (visited 8 March 2016)
China National Knowledge Infrastructure 2016 <www.cnki.net> (visited 20 March 2016)


Ling, J. 2000. Teaching beginners to learn erhu and the most important things on the basic level—The ideas coming from the erhu standard exam (In Chinese). *Journal of Shaoxing College of Arts and Sciences* September, 112–114.


Standard Grade Examination Committee of the Central Conservatory of Music 2016. <kjwyh.ccom.edu.cn/> (visited 8 March 2016)


Collaboration and Community-Engaged Practice in Indigenous Tertiary Music Education: A Case Study and Model from South Australia

Jennifer K. Newsome
University of Adelaide, Australia

This article provides a case study from the Centre for Aboriginal Studies in Music (CASM), a specialist education provider and unique Australian Indigenous cultural institution for applied research, working in support of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander musicians and music at the University of Adelaide. The case study describes the founding philosophy, theoretical underpinning, policy framework, guiding principles and practical methodology of the work of CASM, with insights into inherent challenges in maintaining an Indigenous “cultural space” within a mainstream institutional setting, and the central importance, in such a setting, of collaborative and community-engaged policies and practices in working effectively for and with Indigenous musicians and stakeholder communities.

Introduction

This article provides a case study from the Centre for Aboriginal Studies in Music (CASM), a specialist education provider and unique Australian Indigenous cultural institution for applied research, working in support of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander musicians at the University of Adelaide. Founded in the early 1970s, CASM has been a leading South Australian cultural institution at the centre of a thriving Indigenous music scene, driving outcomes across key cultural, educational and social justice domains through community-engaged music education, performance and production as well as event curation, advocacy and research, plus strategic partnerships, and professional and industry collaborations.¹

¹ This form of engaged ethnomusicology critically reconfigures academic praxis orientation “from being about people, to happening with people and with the goal of higher education taking proactive roles in addressing what are commonly understood as issues and causes of social injustice” (Usner 2010, 77).
In this article, I give an overview of the historical and institutional contexts, founding philosophy, developmental history, theoretical underpinning, policy, guiding principles, and practical methodology of the work of CASM, and offer insights into some of the challenges and benefits in developing and maintaining an educationally and culturally differentiated space within a mainstream Australian institutional context. CASM’s 40-year history of operating in the context of diverse educational, cultural and social realities, in overlapping cultural “worlds” and contexts within and between multiple interrelated and interacting domains, has highlighted the effectiveness of integrative intercultural-intracultural responses and collaboratively based community-engaged processes in working effectively with and for Indigenous musicians and stakeholder communities in higher education contexts.

The insights and perspectives I bring to this discussion arise from a 30-year engagement with the CASM Program as a non-Indigenous musician and educator, including from 1996 as the Head of CASM Programs.

The work of CASM as a cultural institution may usefully be understood as a collaboratively based long-term intercultural-intracultural applied research project developed and maintained through a participatory action research model. The broad aims of CASM are to bring about positive social change, in particular for Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander people as a historically disenfranchised and disempowered group of the Australian population.

Policies and methodologies adopted within CASM were developed through participatory dialogic and dialectic processes rather than the usual institutional “top-to-bottom neo-colonial systems of validation.” This approach employed consensual “horizontal participative strategies” to devise “forms of community’s self-empowerment and counter-hegemonic forms of organization” in collaborative research conducted from within the institutional setting. Cooperative modes of discourse and decision-making in collaborative knowledge-building through the

---

2 This collaborative engagement between non-Indigenous and multiple Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander peoples and communities encompasses a plurality of diverse intellectual and expressive traditions.
3 This is consistent with the definition of the Study Group on Applied Ethnomusicology (ICTM) (International Council for Traditional Music 2010–2016) and the definition of applied ethnomusicology as a “philosophical approach to the study of music in culture, with social responsibility and social justice as guiding principles” (Loughran 2008, 52).
4 Here, “the means is the end, and the conduct of research is embedded in the process of introducing or generating change” and is “intended to further local goals with local partners” (Trotter and Schensul 1998 quoted in Swijghuisen Reigersberg 2010, 60).
5 Ethnomusicologist Svanibor Pettan’s suggested subcategories (1 & 4) of the applied domain are also relevant: “action ethnomusicology: any use of ethnomusicological knowledge for planned change by the members of a local cultural group, and advocate ethnomusicology: any use of ethnomusicological knowledge by the ethnomusicologist to increase the power of self-determination for a particular cultural group” (Pettan 2008, 90, adapted from Spradley and McCurdy 2000).
7 Ibid., 18.
8 Ibid., 14.
participation of staff, students and community members, together with innovative leadership models,\(^9\) ensured that the work of CASM was developed with the mutual endorsement and support of key stakeholders.\(^{10}\) CASM exemplifies the principles outlined by ethnomusicologist Katelyn Barney and sociologist Monique Proud that highlight the importance of not only ethically framed forms of mutuality and reciprocal processes of “give and take,” but also of “solid and genuine social relationships between all stakeholders: participants, researchers, community and universities,” which may be seen as being at the heart of the collaborative process.\(^{11}\) Given inherent and overlapping power disparities and dynamics, long term effective engagements between institutions and Indigenous peoples therefore rely upon productive partnerships of mutual trust and commitment built up and (re) affirmed over time.

With the official establishment of CASM in 1975 a new wave of Aboriginal music making in South Australia had begun, reflecting the changing political and social status of Aboriginal people, and an increasing popularity of new styles of imported music. Although contentious at the time, this saw the introduction of new styles and genres of music-making within the developing CASM Program,\(^{12}\) including bands with electric guitar, bass and drum kit, and songwriting and performances of original material across a range of styles. These innovations were pivotal in the emergence of award-winning Australian Indigenous singer-songwriter musicians and seminal break-through bands from CASM, including No Fixed Address and Us Mob, the first contemporary Aboriginal rock bands to gain commercial radio airplay in Australia. These bands were developing a new and distinctive repertoire reflective of the contemporary Aboriginal experience and the political climate of the time, including now anthemic songs such as “We Have Survived” (No Fixed Address), “Black Boy” and “Dancin’ in the Moonlight” (Coloured Stone) and “Genocide” (Us Mob). The success of these early bands and musicians helped to establish the national profile of CASM as an effective, culturally responsive, community-engaged institution providing strong proactive support for Indigenous musicians and music.

Through a sustained policy commitment to a community-engaged methodology for over 40 years, CASM has helped to develop a highly productive network of Indigenous musicians, and has worked together with Indigenous organizations, event organizers, curators and education and community service providers to open

\(^9\) This provided both Indigenous and non-Indigenous leadership in the overlapping cultural domains of the work of CASM.

\(^{10}\) The importance of dialogic and dialectic approaches in the development of collaborative research partnerships with Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander people is confirmed also in the work of other prominent Australian researchers. See Barney (ed.) 2014 and Barney 2014, 2–3.

\(^{11}\) Barney & Proud 2014, 94–95. Ethnomusicologist Aaron Corn and cross-cultural theorist Payi Linda Ford also posit that the coming together of “diverse intellectual traditions and expressive modalities” in research collaborations can provide a “generative, consensus-driven model...that is informed by classical ceremonial mechanisms for expressing Australian Indigenous polities” and through which “new knowledge and understandings” may be generated (Corn & Ford 2014, 115, 127). See also Treloyn & Charles 2014, 190.

up opportunities for Indigenous musicians through collaborative efforts, thereby supporting a thriving local Indigenous music scene. These have included event curation and the referral and coordination of musicians for festivals, community events and cross-over spaces in a wide variety of performance and production contexts, in celebration and promotion of Indigenous living cultures and affirmation of discrete cultural identities resistant to cultural assimilation. This approach has produced both immediate and long term benefits for Indigenous musicians and the Indigenous community, demonstrating the efficacy of a “collective impact” methodology whereby organizations and programs from different sectors come together in a mutual commitment to solving complex systemic social problems, recognizing that “no single individual or organization can create large-scale, lasting social change in isolation.”

**Founding Philosophy and Methodology**

CASM had its beginnings in 1971 during a period of social activism and rapid and profound change in Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander political affairs that ushered in a new wave of vigorous assertion by Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander people for recognition of social, cultural, legal and political rights; as well as self-determination, self-representation, political control over Indigenous affairs, sovereignty and land rights. In the early 1970s, University of Adelaide ethnomusicologist Catherine Ellis and her musician husband Max Ellis came together with key members of the Council of Aboriginal Women of South Australia and other influential members of the Adelaide-based Aboriginal community, senior song owners and culture bearers living in the Anangu Pitjantjatjara Yankunytjatjara Lands (APY Lands) in the remote north-west region of South Australia, and Sudanese refugee and musician Ben Yengi, in order to create what was at that time a highly progressive Program of Training in Music for South Australian Aboriginal People, building on innovative social initiatives of the Port Adelaide Central Mission.

Ellis’ pioneering research into “traditional music” and in particular into Aboriginal music from the perspective of the performer, constituted her greatest contribution to an understanding of Aboriginal music traditions and to ethnomusicological theory, with significant long-lasting impacts on the educational philosophy, aims and teaching methodology of the CASM program. Her understanding that there

---

13 These included applied research projects, education and music workshops as well as sound recordings and film, radio and media productions.
14 *Social Justice and Native Title Report 2014*, 111.
15 Catherine J. Ellis (1935–1996) is widely recognized as one of the earliest, and most prolific and influential researchers to study Australian Aboriginal music (Barwick & Marett 1995, 1).
16 See Lindemann 2009.
17 See Dickey & Martin 1999.
18 Newsome & Turner 2006, 77–85. See also Ellis 1985.
was equal validity in the cultural experience of any person and inherent dangers in an ethnocentric belief led her to the understanding that, in multicultural education, success lay in “learning to see everything from a broader base of reference than that accepted within one’s own culture.” She also saw that music offered a mode of expression that could correspond with the real, rather than the imagined experience of oppressed members of “cultures of silence,” and that an emphasis not only on excellence in music itself but on “education through music” had the potential to afford holistic benefits in the development of the whole person that went beyond the simple provision of a standard music education. In this, she drew also on Freirean emancipatory and critical pedagogy, recognizing that music and music education offered an ideal means for “conscientization” and development of “authenticity of expression,” and for resolution of the dilemma of alienation not only from one’s own culture, but also from one’s own thinking about it.

The loss of this traditional education system, using music as its central form of communication, has been a severe blow to non-tribal Aboriginal people who now find themselves caught between two worlds, each of which claims a sophisticated system of learning and each of which, by means of many exclusions, denies them the right to be part of its system. It is toward this destructive educational problem that CASM has been directed.

The early commitment to the integral involvement and formal appointment of Aboriginal and later on Torres Strait Islander lecturers proved to be of central importance in the sustained success of CASM, through contribution of specialist expertise that was not only at the core of the intercultural-intracultural model, but also essential in maintaining productive collaborative relationships between CASM and Indigenous communities.

CASM was officially established within the Faculty of Music in 1975, envisaged as a program of “training in music for Aboriginal people,” which through the establishment of a permanent home within the University would “bring prestige to the University in the eyes of both the Aboriginal people and those of European descent” and provide an enclave within the University to reduce feelings of isolation.

---

19 Ellis 1985, 187.
20 Ibid., 151.
21 Ellis 1985, 162.
22 Ibid., 150, 187.
23 Ibid., 133.
24 CASM subsequently also oversaw the appointment of the first two tenured Indigenous academics at the University of Adelaide, believed to be the first two Indigenous musicians appointed to such positions within the Australian higher education system. See also Newsome 2008.
25 It was also known as the Elder Conservatorium of Music.
26 CASM was founded “as a teaching program rather than as a research project” (Lumen 1975, 3).
27 CASM 1984, 1.
and alienation. This innovative program also aimed to create an opportunity for university students to “experience first-hand the music of another culture,” bringing together “tribal aborigines, urban aborigines and Elder Conservatorium students engaged in the activities of musical study and preservation and transmission of tribal aboriginal musical traditions through tribal and western teaching techniques.”

The establishment of CASM represented an unprecedented landmark innovation in Australian higher education, and was also acknowledged as “an important milestone in the progress of Aboriginal music in South Australia” of far-reaching importance for Indigenous musicians and in Australian Indigenous music. In applying her research knowledge and institutional power to bring the university together with the Aboriginal community in the creation of a cultural institution that was to prove of longstanding benefit for Aboriginal people, Ellis had effectively applied Daniel Sheehy’s fourth strategy of applied research, “developing broad, structural solutions to broad problems.” It was recognized from the beginning however that this innovative model would be “seen and valued in different ways by the many different people involved with it,” and that the maintenance of an equitable balance between the dual functions of CASM as a specialist music training program for Indigenous students and as an academic program for non-Indigenous ethnomusicology students enrolled in “mainstream” programs “was never going to be easy.”

Of particular importance in the developing methodology was a focus on public performance that aimed to “encourage and promote Aboriginal musicians as entertainers, especially within their own community, and to give special encouragement and support to original composition” whilst also providing a necessary stimulus to learning. This integration of experiential learning through performance in Aboriginal community and broader public contexts went on to become central to the collaborative community-engaged methodology.

CASM was understood in the early days as a particular synthesis of academic and extra-university interests that could successfully deal with the complex,

29 See also Amery 1991.
30 Lindemann 2009, 58.
31 CASM 1984, 1. This was reflected in the name of the CASM in-house journal Tjungaringanyi published from 1975–1992, from the Pitjantjatjara verb tjunguringanyi meaning “joining together” or “coming together as one.” See also Ellis 1985, 167.
32 CASM was also the progenitor of Indigenous education at the University of Adelaide.
33 Lindemann 2009, 51. See also Newsome & Turner 2006.
34 Newsome 2008, 40–41.
35 Sheehy 1992, 330–331. See also Newsome 2008, 37, 40; and Newsome & Turner 2006, 80–85.
36 Lindemann 2009, 58.
37 CASM 1979, 2.
38 CASM 1979, 1.
cross-cultural and multicultural issues arising out of its work.\textsuperscript{39} The educational program was seen as providing a dual model for both traditional and urban music, exemplifying “the phenomenon of a musical culture in transition,” promoting “the musical and artistic expression of a contemporary urban Aboriginal consciousness”\textsuperscript{40} and using music as “one of the pillars of cultural identity and as a means of bridging the gap between the black and white communities.”\textsuperscript{41} The overarching purpose was “to meet the need on the part of the urban Aboriginals for training in a particular field,” and to help overcome, at least in part, some of the educational deficiencies that had been experienced by members of the urban Aboriginal community.\textsuperscript{42} An outstanding aim of the Centre was to “assist urban Aboriginals in establishing firm physical and psychological contact with their traditional roots through music” as well as to increase their understanding and appreciation of European music and its instruments.\textsuperscript{43} This approach it was thought would better enable “urban” Aboriginal people “to integrate that which is best from both cultures (white and black) in order to develop both as individuals and as participating members of the whole society.”\textsuperscript{44}

With the introduction of the officially accredited curriculum in 1989,\textsuperscript{45} CASM became eligible for ongoing government education funding, alleviating some of the financial uncertainties that had plagued the Centre since the beginning. By this time, CASM was seen as a “meeting place for three cultures,” traditional Aboriginal, urban Aboriginal and European Australian,\textsuperscript{46} and described as a “music school and research centre for Aboriginal people based on Aboriginal music and Aboriginal-style music teaching,”\textsuperscript{47} with the broad aim of promoting Aboriginal music “in all its varieties as a living tradition” and fostering “fruitful interaction between Aboriginal musicians and the representatives of other musical traditions in Australia.”\textsuperscript{48} Teaching of \textit{inma}\textsuperscript{49} by authorized senior \textit{Anangu} song owners remained a core curriculum component and annual field trips were also introduced in which the whole CASM program relocated to the remote APY Lands for intensive experiential \textit{in situ} learning of \textit{inma}, and presentation of performances and youth workshops by CASM students and staff, in an innovative and creative exchange of music

\textsuperscript{39} CASM 1984, 1.
\textsuperscript{40} CASM 1979, 1.
\textsuperscript{41} CASM 1981, 3.
\textsuperscript{42} CASM 1981, 2.
\textsuperscript{43} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{44} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{45} Associate Diploma in Aboriginal Studies in Music
\textsuperscript{46} CASM 1992.
\textsuperscript{47} Tunstill 1988, 1.
\textsuperscript{48} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{49} \textit{Inma} is the Pitjantjatjara word for song or ceremony used by \textit{Anangu} (people) living in the APY Lands.
and educational cultures that reinforced the reciprocal basis of the collaborative community – institution relationship. \(^{50}\)

In 1991, CASM became a full department within the newly formed Faculty of Performing Arts, increasingly institutionally integrated and drawn into an emergent Indigenous access and equity policy framework, a situation that highlighted CASM’s ambiguous positioning as simultaneously a product and vehicle of “the system,” and as an agency for the expression of Indigenous cultural and educational rights. The main challenge for the curriculum was the need to balance Aboriginal demands for accredited music courses with the equally important demand for flexibility and cultural relevance. \(^{51}\) Within this complex field of increasing “entanglement,” the key objectives of the work of CASM were reformulated and articulated as promoting Aboriginal music as a “living and developing tradition in the spheres of education, performance and research, and to do so from the vantage point of higher education.” \(^{52}\)

Throughout this period, the work of cultural theorist Edward Said had been influential in the educational thinking within CASM, as was the work of researchers and educators Verna Kirkness and Ray Barnhardt who argued that “higher education [was] not a neutral enterprise,” \(^{53}\) and that perhaps it was not Indigenous peoples who needed to adapt to the world of the academy, but rather, the other way around. \(^{54}\) This held a special resonance for the work of CASM, affirming reciprocal and two-way learning approaches in the provision of accessible, empowering and culturally relevant music education for Indigenous students in institutional contexts. \(^{55}\) It also upheld the view that Indigenous-centered education within institutions provided an effective structural means for Indigenous peoples to participate on an equitable basis within the broader institutional context by providing readily accessible culturally responsive curricula and an emancipatory pedagogy evolved through critical deconstruction and transformation of power relations. \(^{56}\) The work of critical theorist Homi Bhabha also presented a useful theoretical frame in articulating the complex nature of the work of CASM, and in particular his concept of “the

---

50 The roles of “performative intercultural dialogues” are also relevant in engaging with and responding to the epistemological bases of Indigenous community partners, and their values, needs and concerns (Corn & Ford 2014, 122); and ways in which “creative collaborations within any mode of expression borrow from the synchronicity of ceremony in which all forms of expression come together in a particular place and each element can evoke the whole” (Somerville 2014, 24).
51 Tunstill 1991, 2.
52 Tunstill 1993, 1–2: my emphasis.
54 Ibid.
55 This incorporated an Indigenous-centered intercultural-intracultural curriculum encompassing Indigenous and Western values, world views, perspectives, cultural knowledges and practices; and the teaching of Indigenous knowledges by Indigenous lecturers and collaborative teaching between Indigenous and non-Indigenous lecturers.
56 Ibid., 6–8.
third space”\textsuperscript{57} which resonated with the overlapping, ambiguous and marginalized positioning of CASM within the broader institution, and the unfolding intercultural dynamic, which could be understood as a process of “intervention” in the “third space” in which minority groups drew nearer to a so-called “canonical center.”\textsuperscript{58}

The increasingly embedded institutional context saw tensions emerging in CASM’s relationship within the Faculty\textsuperscript{59} based in a perceived lack of institutional support for the specialist work of CASM and the need for more mutually engaged consensual decision-making processes in the overlapping institutional space. In 1996, following a year of unrest,\textsuperscript{60} CASM was structurally relocated to the Indigenous Support Unit of the University. Although this provided a more Indigenous-centric cultural, educational and support environment for students and staff, the episode had seen a serious breakdown in communication (and cooperation), disrupting the historic relationship between CASM and the Elder Conservatorium of Music and inhibiting future collaborative initiatives for a considerable period to come. Most significantly, it resulted in Conservatorium students no longer being able to undertake studies through CASM.\textsuperscript{61}

Following this period, renewed efforts were made to (re)assert Indigenous student and community priorities through aims, goals and outcomes in teaching, learning and research.\textsuperscript{62} This saw introduction of a revised curriculum that included innovative Community and Culture and Research Studies courses and an intensified focus on Indigenous music production as knowledge creation,\textsuperscript{63} challenging a research paradigm in which Indigenous musicians and music were cast primarily as informants and research subjects and where benefits tended to flow disproportionately to researchers rather than to cultural creators and exponents.

At CASM, where Indigenous students comprise the entire undergraduate music cohort,\textsuperscript{64} there are unique opportunities for the implementation of empowering Indigenous-centered educational strategies that place highest priority on the learning requirements and aspirations of Indigenous students specifically. Within

\textsuperscript{57} See Bhabha 1990.

\textsuperscript{58} Bhabha 1994, xi. See Newsome 1998; and also the potential of the third space for “inclusion of a plurality of approaches and voices in research,” as an arena of “multiple possible belongings” and for “sparking musical creativity” (Ryan & Patten 2014, 113, 99).

\textsuperscript{59} Other Australian researchers also refer to inherent tensions in the “contact zone.” See Barney 2014, 4–5; Barney & Proud 2014, 94, 96; Treloyn & Charles 2014, 85–86; and Somerville 2014, 16–17.

\textsuperscript{60} This saw rejection of an institutional intervention that had disrupted the consensual decision making process, and effective educational and working methodologies.

\textsuperscript{61} The Indigenous Support Unit offered programs only for Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander students.


\textsuperscript{63} This included songwriting, composition/arranging, recording, performing, cultural production and event curation.

\textsuperscript{64} This constitutes a unique situation in Australian university based music education.
the new Community and Culture and Research Studies courses, a more explicit critical pedagogy was introduced. This incorporated enquiry-based learning; critical, reflective and reflexive thinking; dialogic interrogation; and discourse deconstruction and analysis based in the “logical and ethical position that Indigenous priorities and perspectives should provide the primary context and starting point for all discussion and discourse, course topics, and selection and use of study materials.” This approach recognized the transformative power of an explicitly deconstructive pedagogy in supporting Indigenous students as a peer group to explore, locate, affirm, reconstruct and build on individual and collective experiences and knowledge as strengths in the learning context of a “shared diverse embodied experience of colonization” and as a potent means for the emergence and elucidation of Indigenous epistemologies and ontologies arising through Indigenous lived experiences. This framework established a learning environment in which open free-flowing discourse was possible, which often expanded into everyday life; where it was safe to engage with multiple dissonant voices, including “colonizer culture” voices, paradigms and perspectives encountered in text, film and in everyday life interactions; and which many students had previously experienced as “dominating, impenetrable, hostile and disempowering.”

Over time, an Indigenous research paradigm emerged in CASM through the agency of students, staff and collaborating Indigenous communities—one that affirmed cultural processes, practices, expressions, products and identity work as key ways of “contributing to cultural maintenance efforts (include building Indigenous community strength and resilience), and to forms of cultural production that “feed back” and respond to the immediate priorities and needs of a marginalized part of Australian society, to be heard, existentially affirmed, firstly among themselves, and in and from their own terms, spaces and places of strength.”

Methodological Principles

The CASM Program developed through a commitment to core principles evolved through and grounded in a long-term collaborative participatory action research methodology aimed at bringing about effective responses to identified priorities and needs of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander musicians and communities within a complex and changing intercultural-intracultural context. These principles recognize:

65 These were developed by CASM lecturer, researcher and musician Ashley Turner, and grew out of an ethnomusicological frame.
67 Ibid.
68 Ibid.
69 Ibid. See also Mackinlay & Barney 2012, 1.
• the potential of music and music making in overcoming educational exclusion and in bridging cultural differences;
• the productive potential of institutional support for Indigenous music and music making through education in service to the Indigenous community;
• the central importance of Indigenous participation and Indigenous community collaboration in music education for Aboriginal and Torres Strait islander peoples;
• the importance of ethical partnerships and negotiated dialogic processes in the development of shared policy and practice frameworks between institutions and Indigenous stakeholders in music education;
• the important role of collaborative participatory action research methodologies in the development of institutionally based Indigenous music education;
• the importance of engaged negotiation between Indigenous and non-Indigenous peoples, cultures and knowledges in the development of institutionally based Indigenous music education;
• the central role of Indigenous histories, knowledges, philosophies, perspectives, ways of knowing, and expressive cultures in Indigenous music education;
• the empowering role of emancipatory and critical pedagogy in Indigenous music education;
• the need for integrative rather than assimilative educational processes in institutionally based Indigenous music education;
• the role of Indigenous-centered music education in supporting Indigenous cultural identity, cultural strength and community well-being;
• the importance of performance and the perspective of the performer in Indigenous music education;
• recognition of the diverse “lived experiences” of Indigenous peoples in Indigenous music education;
• the potential of “education through music” in the meaningful education of the whole person;
• the importance of holistic approaches to the empowerment, health and well-being of Indigenous students;
• Indigenous expressive cultures as Indigenous knowledges and the creation and production of Indigenous music as research; and
• the importance of Indigenous collaborative community-engaged applied research in supporting Indigenous musicians, music and music making.

For Australian universities, the national 2008 Bradley Review of Higher Education and in particular the 2012 Behrendt Review of Higher Education Access and Outcomes for Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander People proved to be “game changers” in Indigenous tertiary education, recommending the need for proactive, collaborative and “whole of institution” approaches to enhancing outcomes in Indigenous education. The period following the Behrendt Review saw debate and a polarizing of views in Australian tertiary education with respect to the
roles of Indigenous units and enclaves. One view held that these were essential to improving outcomes, arguing that they performed a special role in providing environments of “cultural safety” for Indigenous students,\textsuperscript{70} where the privileging of Indigenous knowledges and perspectives could provide support for Indigenous cultural maintenance and identity, and assist students in engaging with dominant discourse without being dominated by it.\textsuperscript{71} The other represented Indigenous specific enclaves as “segregationist” and as potentially isolating and inhibiting of the broader take-up of institutional responsibility. For CASM, these debates were seen in a context where Indigenous music, musicians and music cultures, apart from as a focus for traditional ethnomusicological research and study, had been historically underrepresented within the core business of Australian tertiary music education, highlighting the ongoing need for targeted institutional support for Indigenous-centered music education in addressing issues of cultural exclusion and social justice.

In 2010, CASM was relocated back to the \textit{Elder Conservatorium of Music} where today it remains the only Indigenous music organization operating from within any Australian university. Although co-location and proximity may create fertile ground for the sharing of cultural knowledges and practices and for creative innovation and transformative reconstruction within overlapping fields of interrelationship, they can also highlight differences in core values and priorities, as reflected in policy and practice, including those arising from an entrenched mono-cultural standpoint in conflict with Indigenous cultural priorities and goals.

Four decades of participatory action research at CASM point to the importance of culturally responsive, community-engaged methodologies in meeting the diverse learning needs and aspirations of Indigenous music students.\textsuperscript{72} The intercultural-intracultural methodology, informed through ongoing participatory action research processes of curriculum development and renewal, is necessarily inclusive of a wide range of music style-and genre-preferences, positioned centrally within an integrated curriculum of cultural, theoretical, historical, research, industry, technical and practical music studies. Effective innovations tested through the work of CASM include: enhanced access to tertiary education through recognition of prior and informal learning and stylistic diversity; integrated foundation and bridging programs; a nested suite of programs with multiple entry and exit points; culturally inclusive curriculum and pedagogy;\textsuperscript{73} flexible teaching methodologies based in intensive individual and small group work; enquiry-based learning and critical pedagogy; side-by-side professional mentoring with a focus on creative outcomes; and experiential learning in community-engaged performance and production contexts.

\textsuperscript{70} This included need for “cultural support—a space on campus that felt “safe” and where students could create a peer environment” (Behrendt 2015).

\textsuperscript{71} Oldfield 2012, 2.

\textsuperscript{72} See also Newsome 1998, 1999, and 2008.

\textsuperscript{73} The University of Adelaide 2016.
Multiple entry and exit points and support for whole-of-program completions also constitute important equity provisions consistent with a student-centered focus that ensures that “partial success does not equate to failure” with accompanying negative connotations for both students and programs around institutional norms related to retention and completion.74

Australian universities apply quantitatively based criteria in assessing student outcomes of academic programs: enrolment numbers, retention rates, success rates and completion rates.75 The University of Adelaide also measures Indigenous outcomes against preset numeric targets through the university’s Tarrkarri Tirrka Indigenous education strategy.76 However, these criteria do not capture the full range and extent of successes and outcomes, including those identified as important by Indigenous students and the Indigenous community that may be rated more highly than simply “receiving a piece of paper.”77 These include the many public and media successes of CASM students and alumni (as musicians/dancers, playwrights/actors, composers/arrangers, recording artists and directors/producers); employment and professional achievements in a range of fields;78 and other harder-to-measure,79 but nonetheless significant outcomes.80 One student recently posted on Facebook, “[Y]ou revived my sense of purpose, ability and self worth…my potential, thank you for letting me be me. Another wrote, “[T]his institution and music have saved mine and many others’ lives.”

Collaborative and Community-Engaged Practice in Indigenous Music Education

CASM operates within a multi-layered, multi-dimensional space across overlapping, fluid, cultural, educational and social fields encompassing the University as the host institution, CASM as an Indigenous cultural organization, Indigenous and non-Indigenous students and staff within the institution, and the broader Indigenous and non-Indigenous communities outside the University. Operating with, within and for these multiple and diverse communities has brought these worlds together in a mutually beneficial and productive way, and brought CASM and the host institution

---

74 See Harvey 2013.
75 CASM achieves outcomes at least on par with or above National Performance Indicators for Indigenous Higher Education.
76 The University of Adelaide 2013.
77 This expression refers to official graduation from the university.
78 This includes for CASM students, social/youth/community work, teaching/education, psychology, event curation/management, sound engineering/production and media/broadcasting.
79 In 2011, I and colleague Ashley Turner developed a “Student Cohort Performance Tracking and Analysis” tool capable of capturing a broader set of outcomes.
80 Outcomes of particular significance for CASM students include personal efficacy, individual and group empowerment, cultural identity and strength, community development, broader community cultural awareness, and important personal, social and individual well-being factors.
more closely together with the Indigenous community, and within a responsive, reciprocal, collaboratively based dynamic. This has meant recognizing community participants and practitioners as inherent within a mutually engaged “epistemic community,” as integral to the success of the project, and as able to proactively collaborate in creative interventions and responses to those issues and elements of culture that are important to communities, addressing these with the understanding that combined collective effort can produce more substantial impacts. 

CASM may be usefully conceptualized as a “creative learning community” operating within the context of this larger “epistemic community” at the operational Indigenous interface between the academy and the broader community. Proactive support for Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander music and musicians through composition, performance and production as applied research has proven to be an effective model in addressing issues of cultural, educational and social diversity within the curriculum. Students are presented with multiple and varied opportunities for creative engagement, drawing on prior knowledges and individual and group interests and strengths, in the production of new knowledge through composition/songwriting, cultural projects, recording and public performance in a wide range of Indigenous and broader community contexts. These modes of engagement provide students with “real world” opportunities for the rapid uptake of professional knowledge and competencies, development and expression of artistic identity and autonomy, and establishment of artist profiles and industry connections as an integral part of their studies. These integrated approaches to educational, cultural and professional engagement bring the academy and the Indigenous and wider communities together within a reciprocal dynamic that meets identified Indigenous student learning needs whilst, at the same time, providing long-term cultural, educational and social justice outcomes of benefit to the Indigenous and broader communities. The long-term success and survival of CASM within the institutional context has been sustained through this commitment to supporting Indigenous musicians and music utilizing curriculum-integrated Indigenous and broader community collaboration and engagement strategies. The linking of an Indigenous-centered educational methodology with identified Indigenous priorities as research, translatable into outcomes acceptable within the institutional framework, may be regarded as the most significant application of ethnomusicological principles in the work of CASM.

---

82 Loughran 2008, 62–63. This approach is concerned with “shifting the emphasis away from an interface between separately conceived domains towards relational social forms that occupy a single socio-cultural field” (in Ryan & Patten 2014, 105–106 after Hinkson and Smith 2005).
84 These are reportable to the Australian Research Council.
CASM has facilitated the coming-together of Indigenous music students from around Australia, creating over time a virtual powerhouse and intergenerational “seeding ground” in Indigenous music within and associated with the University that has made a significant contribution to Australian Indigenous music. It has also created, within the academy, a site of Indigenous cultural strength, affirmation and identity resistant to cultural assimilation, raising thorny questions in the university about who should be adapting to whom, on whose terms, and for what purposes? This dynamic presents an ideological challenge to an existing cultural status quo, pointing to blind spots and gaps between rhetoric and reality in institutional claims around equity, inclusivity and reconciliation, and highlighting issues arising from underrepresentation and competing values and priorities.

For over 40 years, CASM has been a prompter and promoter of change, and a protagonist in an ongoing dialectic concerned with purposes and outcomes in Indigenous education. This has seen polarized views about the role and aims of CASM including a questioning of Indigenous-centered music education for Indigenous students as a legitimate goal, and resistance to accommodation of Indigenous agendas and inhibition of developmental strategy, contrary to the inclusive intent of institutional missions and goals. There have also been debates around the validity of the Indigenous preferred research focus, the cultural focus of curricula and pedagogy, structural positioning within the institution, competing constructions of “success” and “excellence,” and resourcing relative to perceived need.

These debates have arisen in the context of institutional policies that purport to support cultural inclusivity, on the one hand, but fail to recognize the reality of competing priorities and a “dynamic mismatch” of values and forms of practice, on the other. Here, Indigenous priorities may be subsumed within the broader institutional imperative premised on a normative one-size-fits-all standardizing and homogenizing paradigm that tends to marginalize the cultural and educational rights of Indigenous students whilst at the same time instrumentalizing Indigenous cultures and knowledges in service to the broader “mainstream” agenda. These paradigms rest in dichotomous constructs that would rather problematize “difference”

85 This logic saw CASM as little more than a bridging program to the “real thing” (mainstream), contrasted with an alternative view that saw CASM as the “real thing” (Indigenous mainstream), and the Other as a coercive and assimilative hegemonic force reflective of a neocolonial power overtly rejecting Indigenous priorities and needs.
86 This included demands for an Indigenous-centered music degree by Indigenous students.
87 These are reflective of and express cultural norms and values.
89 See also Corn & Patrick 2014, 167–168; and Mackinlay & Barney 2014, 59, 67–68.
90 This includes Indigenous Studies courses designed for “mainstream” delivery at the expense of Indigenous-centered programs that give priority to Indigenous student and community interests.
than interrogate cultural assumptions underpinning assimilationist drivers within the “mainstreaming” ideology, and dismiss dissenting “voices” that do not accord.\(^{91}\) Institutions can alleviate such tensions through increased Indigenous participation in transparent consensual decision-making processes and implementation of a “distributive leadership” model,\(^ {92}\) providing the means for increasing the overall cultural competency of the institution and enhanced “cultural safety” for Indigenous peoples within universities, and the application of “real world” understandings and Indigenous priorities within the institutional setting.

Although the university gains in many tangible and intangible ways from the presence of a unique Indigenous cultural program in its midst, in a dynamic reflective of a neo-colonial normative impulse that regards difference as anomalous,\(^ {93}\) there has been more “give” on the part of CASM than on the part of the institution in ensuring the survival and success of CASM. The onus has been on CASM to “find a way” to adapt, in accommodation of a rigid and unyielding “mainstream” that at times has also been ambivalent in its support. Much additional staff effort has been directed therefore as a matter of internal policy towards responding proactively and effectively to Indigenous student and community priorities and needs.

Strategic solutions offered by CASM included: enhanced tertiary education access measures; an intercultural curriculum that enabled Indigenous students to go on to further training and study after CASM, and encouragement and support for students to do so;\(^ {94}\) preparation of and support for students to create and take up employment opportunities; advocating for students and arguing for greater cultural inclusivity within existing Australian “mainstream” music programs;\(^ {95}\) development of an innovative Indigenous-centered music degree;\(^ {96}\) and enrichment options within “mainstream” music programs at the University of Adelaide. These efforts aimed to go beyond the standard deficit-based Eurocentric model in meeting identified Indigenous student learning needs, recognizing that Indigenous student preferences and priorities may also include study options embedded, located and situated within Indigenous knowledges and social and cultural contexts.

---

91 This can be a particular problem in the neo-liberal, corporate market-driven university environment.

92 This has been identified as a preferred approach (Miller 2011).

93 See also Mackinlay & Barney 2014.

94 A substantial number do go on to further study, but not necessarily straightaway or at the University of Adelaide.

95 Students often saw “mainstream” programs as uninteresting and irrelevant, and unaccommodating of Indigenous cultural interests and learning priorities. See also Newsome 1999.

96 The framework for the degree included components that could also be taken by non-Indigenous students, however, this program has not been implemented by the university.
Concluding Comments

CASM, together with other peak South-Australian educational, cultural, community, industry and government institutions, has played a pivotal role in achieving sustained support for Indigenous music in South Australia with far-reaching impacts in Australian music. This case study highlights the important educational, curatorial, logistical and advocacy roles that public institutions can play, and the central importance of collaboratively based, community-engaged policy and practice in the development of successful long-term models of social inclusion and cultural empowerment for Indigenous musicians and stakeholder communities. Building on a long-standing commitment to community-engaged practice, CASM has acted as an Indigenous resource across multiple sectors and spaces, providing educational and cultural services within and for the institution and broader communities. In doing so, CASM has provided the institution with a successful working model of respectful, responsive and responsible community engagement and collaboration in education and research, and a practical example of how to work ethically and effectively with, within and for an Indigenous stakeholder community through a proactive service orientation. CASM has also made an important contribution to overall institutional culture, to the public profile of the University of Adelaide, and to stakeholder interest and confidence, especially within the Indigenous stakeholder community.

The Indigenous cultural organization located within the broader institution is uniquely positioned to shine a bright light on historically excluded Indigenous music traditions, and new and emerging forms of Indigenous expressive cultures, bringing these deep inside the institution and proactively promoting their significance and value in performance, teaching and research. Here the specialist cultural organization within can actively promote innovation in teaching and research, and advocate for institutions to cede ground and transform mainstream practice through the repositioning of Indigenous-centered music curricula and research as integral within multiple overlapping shared learning contexts. However, these potentials can only be realized where there is reciprocal engagement, sustained investment, and an ongoing commitment by the host institution. This points to the need for a more sophisticated paradigm of tertiary education than often exists, and that in part has been illustrated by the methodology described in this article. Such a methodology properly recognizes inclusive representation, dialogic decision-making processes, and true partnerships in the development of shared policy and practice frameworks between institutions and Indigenous stakeholders, with the broader aim of negotiating mutually beneficial, sustainable, long-term outcomes that are inclusive of Indigenous interests and priorities.

97 This would see a mutual field of engagement within the Indigenous-centered music “space” for all music students.
Representation of both internal and external Indigenous stakeholders in priority setting and decision-making has a key role to play in holding institutions to their stated commitments and obligations. This may mean speaking up, resisting and even “rattling the cage” in advocating for and maintaining pressure around the need for ongoing systemic change within institutions. This is especially so where broader assimilative and economic forces threaten to overwhelm Indigenous interests and programs within institutions. For a small but effective Indigenous cultural organization such as CASM, the combined strength of multiple internal and external Indigenous-stakeholder voices, built through a longstanding commitment to an Indigenous-centric educational methodology based in community-engaged collaborative practice, will prove essential in ensuring that the current focus of the organization continues to survive and thrive. The quality of the host institution’s relationship with the Indigenous cultural organization within, and the extent to which Indigenous stakeholder interests continue to be served through it, offer a true “litmus test” of the ongoing commitment of the institution to identified Indigenous priorities and needs.

References


98 This is the subject of a forthcoming paper.
CASM. 1979. Supplement to CASM Position Paper 4/10/79 by the CASM Committee Chairman. Adelaide: CASM.


Tunstill, G. 1993. *Submission by the Director of the Centre for the Purposes of the 1993 Review of the Centre Conducted by the University of Adelaide*. Adelaide: The University of Adelaide.


Initiatives, Reorientations and Strategic Plans in the Music Department, University of Fort Hare, South Africa: A Summary and a Visionary Reflection

Bernhard Bleibinger
University of Fort Hare, South Africa

The emphasis of the Fort Hare music programs of the 1970s and 1980s was on Western music. It was only in 1998 that Dave Dargie introduced an innovative African syllabus – one that reflected the cultural background of the students and their specific, practical way of learning – by integrating traditional African music which was collected in the field and added to course content. At that time most of the students came from rural schools and hardly had any formal music training before registering at the university. The new BMus degree program, which was introduced in 2012 in East London, still follows Dave Dargie’s most fundamental ideas, namely: practical approaches and compulsory components of African music. Yet the needs, the demographic composition, and the schooling background of the student body at the department have changed since then, bringing new expectations and challenges with reference to the entrance level and career wishes of students, but also new opportunities for a young society.

Introduction

Talking about the challenges and opportunities of Applied Ethnomusicology at the Music Department of the previously disadvantaged black University of Fort Hare in the Eastern Cape Province in South Africa is a complex endeavor, for one has to take into consideration the institution’s historical and political backgrounds, its staff and students, and its past and current agendas. Furthermore, one has to deal with questions concerning the rejection and appropriation of knowledge and—in this context—the complexity of identities, whether imposed by others, self-constructed, or chosen after a process of self-referencing that uses imagined or existing ideal-types as reference points. Academics may even take on roles on the basis of expectations and prejudices stemming from the institution and, at the same time,
they should pay attention to the local needs of communities. In the following article I will not be able to deal with this in detail, but, rather, I restrict discussion to some institutional and personal challenges, while examining opportunities, initiatives and reorientations at the Fort Hare Music Department.

The Wolf in the Pack – Personal Challenges and Applied Ethnomusicology

I started working at the University of Fort Hare in 2007, and according to what I was told during the job interview, my task was basically to stabilize a Music Department, which was at risk of being closed, and to prepare it for an upcoming institutional audit.¹ Coming from Barcelona, where I had worked as “professor” at the musicological department of the Escola Superior de Música de Catalunya since 2005, I was curious about the working environment at a South African tertiary institution—and later surprised by the disastrous infrastructural condition of the department, and the challenges I had to face from the beginning. Applied ethnomusicology was a necessity in this situation² and the Music Department became the focus of my applied work. But unlike many other applied ethnomusicologists, I did not come to South Africa with a research project or NGO that would bring me into contact with communities and their needs. I was primarily appointed at Fort Hare to do repair work. As Head of Department (HoD) I was a member of a partly international academic body; my outsider status at the Music Department very soon changed. I was a part of the “pack” when appointed. The comparison is suitable because wolves or dogs, as was explained to me by one of my colleagues, are often bitten when newly joining a pack, but after a while they become part of it and its struggle for survival. The roles³ I played or was given at that time can be summarized in the following way:

• The academic and head who serves the department in achieving structural changes (students and staff used to call me “Doc”).
• The foreigner and outsider who, on the one hand, enjoys the advantage of being out of political and tribal disputes, and who therefore sometimes receives more

¹ I want to thank my colleagues who helped to save and develop the Music Department: Henry Botha; Jonathan Ncozana, Gwyneth Lloyd, Mkhululi Milisi and Lotta Matambo; Germaine Gamiet and David Manchip; Prof. Dave Dargie, Prof. Rudolph Botha and Dr. Pamela Johnson.

² Teaching material was either outdated or non-existent, and the building was in a dangerous condition. So I did some of the glazery, carpentry and electrical work on the building myself, and tried to organize books for the students.

³ Being given multiple roles is not uncommon. People who consider themselves as insiders may even be labeled as outsiders and outsiders may become insiders. Roles may shift and be redefined. An interesting case is that of Washington Onyango-Ouma who, although doing “anthropology at home,” found himself given different identities that, as he writes, “simply stripped me of my local status and lumped me instead in the category ‘other’ at different times” (Onyango-Ouma 2006, 260). Among the identities attributed to him were in-law identity, urban/elite identity, educated identity and adult identity.
information than an insider, thereby enabling an abstract perspective of the department. Yet, on the other hand, outsiders are more sensitive or vulnerable to a latent xenophobic climate.

- The organizer and administrator who can make things happen.
- The musical performer who, through practical skills, can connect with people.

As an academic I had doubts as to whether applied work in a strange cultural context could be justified, but as HoD I was responsible for the development and design of a new Music Department. Gregory Barz’s book *Singing for Life*\(^4\) gave me peace of mind and provided me with some guiding principles at that time, for it spoke in favor of engagement with communities, the ethnomusicologists’ responsibility, the relevance of scholarship, and an ethnomusicology that should serve people. The first symposium of the International Council of Traditional Music’s Study Group on Applied Ethnomusicology in 2008 in Ljubljana, Slovenia finally helped me to justify and to think over my practical work in this field. Since other contributors to this volume will elaborate on the methods and approaches of applied ethnomusicology in detail, I will only outline a few basic ideas relevant to discussion.

Sheehy, like Barz, talks about the purpose of applied ethnomusicology, which should respond to the needs of people. Four qualities of applied ethnomusicology, as mentioned in his article from 1992, explain how ethnomusicologists may assist people:

1. developing new “frames” for musical performances,
2. “feeding back” musical models to the communities that created them,
3. providing community members access to strategic models and conservation techniques,
4. developing broad, structural solutions to broad problems.\(^5\)

According to Sheehy’s model, applied ethnomusicologists advise, develop, feedback knowledge, and provide skills. Therefore they can be seen as interlocutors and coordinators. Feedback, sometimes also called “inreach,” is a reminder that some ethnomusicologists bring knowledge back to the people from whom it originally came. Bess Lomax Hawes mentions inreach in connection with the Folk Arts in the Annual Report 1980 of the National Endowment for the Arts:

> Our second strategy has been *feedback*. This is framing turned around, so that the arts of the people are presented back to the people who created them. A.B. Spellman calls it ‘inreach’ as opposed to “outreach.”\(^6\)

---

4 Barz 2006.
6 Lomax Hawes 1980, 89.
Svanibor Pettan proposes sub-categories, which were borrowed from applied anthropology,\(^7\) to describe four directions and objectives of applied ethnomusicology.

1. Action ethnomusicology: any use of ethnomusicological knowledge for planned change by members of a local group.
2. Adjustment ethnomusicology: makes social interaction between persons who operate with different cultural codes more predictable.
3. Administrative ethnomusicology: for planned change by those who are external to a local group.
4. Advocate ethnomusicology: by the ethnomusicologist to increase the power of self-determination for a particular cultural group.\(^8\)

According to Pettan, applied ethnomusicologists are scholars who assist in empowering people of local cultural groups by providing knowledge and skills. They render their services towards the goals of achieving planned change; improving social interaction; and increasing self-determination, in all of which they may be directly involved. The target groups he mentions in this context are minorities, diasporas, ethnic groups, immigrants and refugees,\(^9\) while stating the ICTM Study Group on Applied Ethnomusicology’s formal definition of ethnomusicology:

> [a]pplied ethnomusicology is the approach guided by principles of social responsibility, which extends the usual academic goal of broadening and deepening knowledge and understanding toward solving concrete problems and toward working both inside and beyond typical academic contexts.\(^{10}\)

A misperception of applied ethnomusicology, criticized by Usner,\(^{11}\) as extra-academic work that later may be discussed within academia has thus changed. One of the most prominent examples of engaged applied ethnomusicology in South Africa is Angela Impey’s work with the Dukuduku in Northern KwaZulu Natal.\(^{12}\) Drawing on Robert Chamber’s Participatory Research and Action Model from the field of international development studies, Impey assisted the Dukuduku to recover and conserve indigenous knowledge. The project also improved their self-determination and contributed positively to a tourist industry in the village and to the generation of income. Today applied ethnomusicologists seem—due to the outcome of what might be called empowerment work—more emancipated

---

7 Pettan’s model, which is partly based on applied anthropology, is comparatively open regarding project partners or target groups. Target populations are important to applied work. Onyango-Ouma, for instance, writes about applied anthropology in Kenya: “Applied anthropologists, both local and expatriate, work with development organisations where they apply anthropological knowledge to ensure that development programmes are appropriate to target populations” (Onyango-Ouma ibid.).

8 Pettan 2008, 91.

9 Ibid., 95–96.

10 Ibid., 87.

11 Usner 2010, 88.

12 Impey 2002.
in that they talk openly about their participation in musical performances including their doubts, as in the case of Kathleen van Buren, or about transdisciplinary approaches (e.g., Swijghuisen Reigersberg). The common tenor of both van Buren and Swijghuisen Reigersberg, could be summarized in the following way: get in touch, be engaged, talk and explore new methods. I found both useful in my case. On the basis of my experience—which I will explain later—I also suggest that we should minimize the “gap” between music and (ethno)musicology.

In order to make the following explanations concerning the history and development of the Fort Hare Music Department more understandable, I dare to add another thought: applied ethnomusicologists deal with the future of people. In the classical sense, applied ethnomusicologists may be said to empower local people in and for a local or regional context or setting. Yet in special cases, for instance in that of applied work at a developmental university, it might mean that the applied ethnomusicologist is tasked with empowering local people to become global players, so that, if they wish, they can also leave their local setting and work with other music cultures (whether as a researcher, through a post abroad or in new multicultural environments, through foreign exchange programs, for example). For that reason—and in line with existing frameworks—an applied ethnomusicologist may make provision for his/her students to get acquainted with modern trends (e.g., by introducing curriculum specializations in new, music-related technologies). Our aim should be to pave the way for future, fruitful dialogues globally.

**Historical Background – Challenges at Fort Hare**

The main campus of the University of Fort Hare is situated at the edge of the small town of Alice, approximately 120 km west of East London in the Eastern Cape Province of South Africa. Two additional campuses are in East London and in Bisho (60 km west of East London). The University of Fort Hare is one of the so-called historically disadvantaged institutions and is known as the alma mater of famous African political leaders, such as Nelson Mandela, Julius Nyerere and Robert Mugabe. During recent years, it has made the headlines of South African newspapers several times because of its student riots and severe corruption.

---

13 Van Buren 2010.
14 Swijghuisen Reigersberg 2010.
15 This expression is occasionally used in the Senate at the University of Fort Hare. It means that the university is still to be developed in order to reach an international standard.
16 The former president of Tanzania.
17 The current president of Zimbabwe.
18 On May 14, 2015 the Daily Dispatch reported on the suspension of two Fort Hare top officials due to corruption in building tender processes (Hartle 2015) and regarding a National Student Financial Aid Scheme. As a consequence the University of Fort Hare lost the Student Representative Council (normally ANC) to the DA (Joubert 2015). The African National Congress (ANC) is currently the ruling party in South Africa and the Democratic Alliance (DA) is in the opposition.
Fort Hare started in 1916 as “South African Native College.” It was the first South African institution that did not restrict its admission to “Europeans.”\(^{19}\) The premedical program was so successful that, between 1920 and 1925, 84 graduates completed their studies in Scotland, England and Germany. This is an impressive number keeping in mind that the student body in general was comparatively small. In 1942, for instance, Fort Hare had 220 students. A speciality of the institution was that it incorporated

a deliberate emphasis on African languages and culture, without excluding any aspect of the Western liberal arts and sciences. It also included social sciences and politics to provide a more critical approach to the study of history, for example.\(^{20}\)

Thus, Fort Hare could be said to be an open-minded and liberal place. Yet in 1951 the National Party in South Africa tried to bring all education under the control of the Department of Bantu Administration and Development and later, in the 1960s, nationalized Fort Hare despite the protest coming from Alexander Kerr, the first principal at Lovedale College, and Zachariah Keodirelang Matthews, the head of African Studies at Fort Hare and political activist.\(^{21}\) In 1951, the institution also changed its name to “University College of Fort Hare” and was affiliated with Rhodes University. In connection with the Bantustan politics of the 1970s – early 1980s, Fort Hare, which belonged to the homeland of Ciskei,\(^{22}\) was given the status of a university. In this context, several new departments and degree programs were developed and implemented. The Music Department was one of them. It was founded by the former Rhodes Professor Georg Gruber in the 1970s, an Austrian who specialized in choral music, occasionally composed music, and wrote a book on tonic solfa and staff notation for teachers, composers and choir-masters.\(^{23}\)

South Africa’s democratization in 1994\(^{24}\) did not return Fort Hare to its former state. Mismanagement led to severe financial constraints;\(^ {25}\) meanwhile, the

\(^{19}\) Lilford 2012, 195.

\(^{20}\) Lilford ibid., 196.

\(^{21}\) Lilford ibid., 199.

\(^{22}\) The development of homelands was promoted from 1950–1958, when Hendrik Vorwoerd was Minister for Native Affairs. The Bantu Self-Government Act of 1959 led to the creation of “quasi-independent Bantustans” or “ethno-national states.” Ten Bantustans were established, four of which were later declared independent by the South African government. Among these were two homelands in the Eastern Cape, i.e., the Transkei (year of independence: 1976) and the Ciskei (year of independence: 1981). Homelands were meant to concentrate ethnic groups in designated areas. People from homelands could work in South Africa, but did not have the same status as South African citizens. Homelands were not economically independent from South Africa (Welsh 2000, 448–451; South African History Online 2014).

\(^{23}\) Gruber 1974.

\(^{24}\) Democratization was already being gradually prepared before 1994, the year of the first free election. Yet frequently 1994 is referred to as the beginning of the democratization, when Nelson Mandela became the first black South African president.

\(^{25}\) My predecessor Dave Dargie told me several times about the riots in 1997 when the university, due to the financial situation, was about to be closed.
movement of black students from formerly disadvantaged universities to previously advantaged—that is, white—universities led to a decrease in the total student number—from 6,000 in 1992 to 4,000 in 1999. With the appointment of a new Vice Chancellor, however, the number increased again to almost 9,000 by 2007. Furthermore, like many other black universities, Fort Hare had to educate less-prepared students in large classes. Between 1991 and 2004, only 12% of the Fine Arts students completed their studies on time whereas 37% needed two and 42% needed three additional years. With the incorporation of the former Rhodes University Campus in East London, in 2004, a significant number of white, mixed-race and Indian students came to Fort Hare. Yet that number dropped after the incorporation. The number of white students, for instance, dropped 14% between 2006 and 2007. The student body itself was very different, with better-prepared students from former model C schools in East London and less-prepared students from village schools in Alice. The socio-economic background of the Alice students was severe— they came from a region with an estimated unemployment rate of 37% – 53.5% in 2006. It was also estimated that 65.2% of the households lived on incomes of less than R 1,500 per month. Further obstacles for students included the comparatively high HIV infection rate in the Eastern Cape—around 29% in 2007—and a disastrous schooling situation. According to some newspaper reports, in 2010, 80% of the schools were dysfunctional and 80% of the teachers either under-qualified or not qualified at all. Consequently rural and historically disadvantaged tertiary institutions in particular were, and still are, confronted with a student intake that—due to socio-economic and educational disadvantage—had insufficient preparation for studying at a university.

26 University of Fort Hare 2008, 16.
27 Lilford ibid., 200.
28 Since 1970, the year when Fort Hare obtained its university status, it hasn’t been affiliated with Rhodes University any longer. In 2004, it incorporated a campus in East London, which until then, had belonged to Rhodes University.
29 University of Fort Hare ibid., 22.
30 During apartheid, different school models were in place for each ethnic group. Model C Schools are basically previously white schools with either English or Afrikaans as the major language, which later decided to admit black students as well. The C refers to the funding model. As Jane Hofmeyr (2000, 6) explains: “In the early 1990s, during the dying days of apartheid education, the then Minister of Education, Piet Clase, under pressure to open half-empty white schools to black pupils and needing to reduce state expenditure on white education, allowed white state schools to choose one of three Models on the basis of parent vote. If a school chose Model A, it was allowed to become private with no state subsidy. A Model C school would receive state funding only for its staff and was allowed to determine its own admission policies. Most voted to admit black pupils.” Even today, the quality and standard at these schools is very high.
31 R 1500 is equivalent to $213 US in 2007 or $99 US in 2016.
Development and Challenges at the Music Department

The historical development of the Music Department at Fort Hare can roughly be divided into four different phases.

First phase – building and implementation phase (1970s):

In this phase, the department was built up and modules were implemented. The degree offered was a BPed (Bachelor of Pedagogics). Gruber, who was responsible for the development and implementation of music modules for the BPed degree programme, was, as mentioned above, interested in African music; he built up a choir and wrote a manual, *From Tonic-solfa to Staff Notation*, which aimed at teaching staff notation to students training to become teachers. The focus was on Western music.


This phase is, according to the University Calendars and the syllabus of the Music Department of that time, characterized by an emphasis on Western classical music. Choral music—as I was told by my predecessor Dave Dargie—was seen as inappropriate. African music was not considered “music” at all.


In the year of the first free democratic elections, Professor Dargie was appointed HoD. The challenges he faced were financial constraints and resulting staff retrenchment, fewer educated students and lack of appropriate teaching material in African music. 100% of the students were black Africans. In the years after 1994, a new curriculum in the political spirit of the time took great importance, because it could contribute to a reconciliation process after colonialism. The end of apartheid offered opportunities for new initiatives. Dargie was the right person for this task, for he could teach Xhosa music in class using knowledge and skills obtained during his research in Lumko in the 1970s and 1980s. Since the majority of the students came from villages of the Eastern Cape, indigenous music knowledge was being brought back to the ethnic groups who had created it. Therefore one can call this inreach. Students learned about Xhosa music and how to make and play indigenous instruments. Dargie made himself teaching

---

33 Gruber ibid.

34 According to the University of Fort Hare Calendar 1982 (Edu42 – Edu45), the music syllabus concentrated on Western music theory and history, with preference given to German and Italian composers.

materials on Xhosa music; such materials did not exist. In 1998, he introduced a new syllabus for the new BA degree program, which took African music and the indigenous way of teaching (i.e., learning through practical participation) into consideration. Ethnomusicologist Andrew Tracey called Dargie’s the most “African” syllabus in South Africa. Even today, all Music Theory and Music History modules consist of both African and Western components, and music theory is taught in a hands-on way, by playing music. The syllabus and Dargie’s teaching approach can also be seen as a contribution to the reconciliation process after the first free elections. Music of previously oppressed groups was, as in the case of advocacy ethnomusicology, finally being acknowledged, while people’s political demands and cultural backgrounds were also taken into consideration.

Fourth Phase: Re-consolidation, extension and internationalization (2007–)

The challenges in 2007 were, to a certain extent, similar to those that Professor Dargie faced, one difference being that departments were additionally expected to raise their academic standard and to internationalize.

The university’s mission from 2009, for instance, reads:

The mission of the University is to provide high quality education of international standards contributing to the advancement of knowledge that is socially and ethically relevant, and applying that knowledge to the scientific, technological and socio-economic development of our nation and the wider world.

Fort Hare’s mission corresponds to national requirements, as outlined in the Higher Education Qualifications Sub-Framework, HEQSF.

In order to achieve the goal of raising the academic standards and internationalizing, lecturers at Fort Hare were encouraged to attend courses offered by the university’s Teaching and Learning Centre (TLC), intended to familiarize

---

36 In addition to publishing a comprehensive book on Xhosa music, Dargie published articles, CDs, booklets, and manuals on indigenous instruments and music, Ntsikana the Xhosa prophet, and indigenous church music, to mention just a few outputs (Dargie 1982, 1983, 1988 and 1998).

37 See also Bleibinger ibid., 43–44.

38 University of Fort Hare 2009, 2.

them with principles of quality assurance and international trends in teaching and learning. Yet, at the same time, the specific background and learning attitude of our students had to be taken into consideration.40

In addition, the music student intake was constantly controlled and reduced by faculty administrators, which led to there being more staff than students. In 2009, for instance, we had an intake limit of 5 students. Four of them were sent to us by the faculty office and none had any musical experience. The only way to survive in this situation of numerous challenges was to learn to achieve more with less and to move forward. Part-time staff members were appointed to guarantee appropriate lectures. Contact with the communities was used to make us known to people and to bring our students into touch with Xhosa music. A new BMus degree was discussed and designed for East London in order to increase student numbers again.41

The challenging situation in Alice invited community engagement, which consisted basically of lectures, workshops, performances and research.42 In order to give our students first-hand information about indigenous music we also invited groups, like the famous Ngqoko group, into the classroom. This allowed our students to engage directly with culture-bearers. Indigenous knowledge from the villages was communicated to the younger generation—most of them from villages—at the Music Department. It was on the occasion of a concert given by the Ngqoko group that I became aware of my own—maybe challenging—position and roles. As mentioned before, I was appointed by the university to conserve and develop the department. I had the roles of an academic, a teacher-provider of skills and knowledge, and, as HoD, an administrator. Looking back on that time, I would describe my work as administrative ethnomusicology, because my duty as culturally external person was to plan and bring change to a local group. As an outsider with a cultural and educational background different from that of the majority in the department, I was given multiple identities, which were mostly seen in a positive way. The following incident reminded me of my status as foreigner and it taught me about the strong authority held by local South African culture-bearers. Although my practical drum making workshops were appreciated by South African senior

40 Approaches concerning peer learning, assessment methods and quality assurance, as outlined by Boud (2003), Cohen and Sampson (1999), Luckett and Sutherland (2000), Nicol and Macfarlane-Dick (2006) and SAQA (2001), to mention just a few, were applied in class since 2011. At the same time, staff discussed about and based teaching on experiences with students in Alice, e.g., that some students who came from a choir tradition preferred learning in groups or that African music theory needed to be taught via performing.

41 First discussions on this matter took place in September 2007.

42 Jonathan Ncozana trained marimba bands in Alice and Hogsback, and we both taught for a while in a high school in Alice. At the university, Mr. Ncozana taught bow-making; I introduced drum-making in our Music honours program. At that time, we were conducting field research in the region north of Queenstown. Like David Dargie, Mr. Ncozana later used the research findings in class. Although our community engagement often took place in the institutional setting of schools, it was not restricted to those. In 2009 and 2010, I was invited by Dr. Norma Van Niekerk to hold drum making workshops in an NGO, the HIV Hope project in Hogsback, in order to teach skills to participants that would help them to generate income. Although the project no longer exists, the group of participants, as I was told in July 2014, still produces and sells drums to individuals and traditional healers in surrounding communities as well as churches and schools.
students and students from South Africa’s neighboring countries, on one occasion an instrument was defined as an alien intruder by a colleague in front of younger students from the Eastern Cape. Yet any negative perception of the instrument in the university group changed a few days later when the Ngqoko group performed a concert at Fort Hare and, seeing the ngoma, requested to use this “beautiful igubu” during the performance. The authority of the Ngqoko group as culture-bearers, which was higher than that of the staff member who had made the comment, led to an immediate appropriation of the East African drum, renamed igubu. From that moment the drum was accepted by everybody. Additionally, the appropriation of the instrument by a local cultural authority also had a positive impact on students’ perceptions of me as a teacher, and positively affected my relationship with the younger students.

Yet the main challenges of that time were the instability of the department in Alice caused by the faculty; infrastructural problems; and the educational and socio-cultural backgrounds of our students. The development of a new BMus degree program seemed to be a chance to stabilize the department and to offer our students more career possibilities as performers and researchers. After comparison with curricula of other institutions and discussions with students a general BMus with specializations in performance and musicology/ethnomusicology was developed and finally implemented in 2012. Due to the staffing situation⁴³ at the Music Department, the new degree program was still limited in terms of the specializations offered, but since it was a general BMus, future amendments were possible.

The new BMus degree program allowed us to extend the department to East London. It brought more stability, but also new challenges and opportunities. Until 2012, 100% of our students were black Africans. In 2013, we had one white student for the first time. In 2014, the new student intake in East London consisted of 12 black students, one mixed-race student and three white students. Almost half of the students in East London come from former model C schools. This means that we have to deal with extreme gaps with reference to the music knowledge and standards among our students. Students from better schools, for instance, enter the university with grade-8 music theory⁴⁴ knowledge whereas students from rural schools have mostly no knowledge at all and need special attention. For that reason, we introduced a Basic Music Literacy Course (BML) for first year students, which is also open to outsiders who want to improve their knowledge in music theory (e.g., schoolteachers). Generally the culturally mixed setting is seen by staff and students—keeping in mind that Fort Hare started as an academically universal and non-racial institution—as an opportunity.

⁴³ For some time, we had to run two departments with two different degree programs, but with the same staff.

⁴⁴ There are 8 different grades in the music exams in the United Kingdom. Grade 1 is beginner’s level and Grade 8 equals the standard requirements for entry to a music college. At Grade 8-level music theory, students must be familiar with modes, scales, chord progressions, four-part writing in Bach style, music analysis, jazz theory and orchestral arranging.
The Way Forward: Recent and Current Activities and Initiatives at the Music Department

The Music Department is repositioning itself at the moment. We try to conserve our roots, be open to local needs, and at the same time be aware of global developments. In this situation, music can be a useful tool for historical reflection, and function as a mind-opener and bridge-builder.

In the spirit of Fort Hare and Dargie’s syllabus, the music theory and music history modules in our BMus program still consist of African and Western components. Xhosa music is taught in class and our students learn to play musical bows. One could describe this as *adjustment ethnomusicology*, because our students still learn about indigenous music of the region, but at the same time they also get exposed to other cultures. Keeping in mind our new poly-cultural student body and xenophobic attacks in the country in 2008 and 2015, building cultural bridges via music and promoting transcultural thinking appears to be more necessary than ever.

Bridge-building at the Music Department is mostly done through performances and international events: Jonathan Ncozana, for instance, teaches also songs from South Africa’s neighboring countries in the department’s marimba band and David Manchip incorporates traditional South African music in arrangements he writes for the department’s Jazz Ensemble. An evaluation after Ncozana’s pan-African music experiment showed that students became, on the one hand, more interested in original Xhosa music and, on the other, in music from other African countries. Recognizing musical similarities between different music cultures made students more open-minded. At the same time, they could experience their own individuality by learning and performing improvisation techniques.

In 2013, students and staff participated in an indigenous opera, composed by Mkhululi Milisi, about the Xhosa prophet Ntsikana. In the same year, our African marimba band was invited to give workshops on African indigenous music and concerts in Germany. The recognition that our students received for their performances of indigenous music, from international audiences, boosted their self-esteem and appreciation of their indigenous heritage.

---

45 Xenophobic attacks in May 2008, with 62 people killed and several hundred injured, and again in 2015 prompted some other African countries to take initiative to repatriate their nationals. The victims were mostly foreigners from other African countries, but also Pakistanis. The attacks in 2015 led to several protest marches against xenophobia, for example, the University of Fort Hare organized a march against xenophobia.

46 As stated by Gabriel Tati, xenophobia at South African tertiary institutions is still one of the main reasons for foreigners to study in another country (Tati 2012, 140–141, 145–146).

47 Bridging ethnic divides in Norway is the focal point of an article by Kjell Skjelstad (2008), who argues for the use of music as a tool to prevent conflicts. He describes listening as a transformative experience and ensemble playing as key to social learning. Both aim at a bettering transcultural understanding. There are similarities between our approaches. With reference to South Africa, Anne-Marie Gray (2008) recommends the use of music in the reconciliation process of a previously polarized society because music may improve understanding and empathy among different groups.

48 Most interesting was the case of the Xhosa indigenous song “Uyolingena,” for which Jonathan Ncozana arranged a version with marimbas, drums and brass. The new version incorporates traditional and modern elements and was preferred by the students (Bleibinger 2014).
traditional musics. In October 2014, soloists from the Fort Hare Music Department and the Academic Orchestra of the University of Stuttgart performed together arias and choruses from Strauss’ “Die Fledermaus” in a concert in East London. All of the above-mentioned events aim at building bridges for international co-operation. They encourage appreciation of different musical cultures. Performances based on a variety of musics and musical elements from different cultures also enhance social interaction of people across different ethnic and cultural backgrounds.

The Music Department still tries to transmit and keep indigenous music alive. This is an essential feature of the curriculum. But there are other local needs that must be taken into consideration too. Fort Hare students, as Leslie Bank from the Fort Hare Institute for Social and Economic Research recently stated in the *Daily Dispatch*, can no longer automatically expect to find a job in the government. Many of students are unemployed after their studies. Therefore they need programs that make them more competitive in job markets.

In response to the current situation and in order to improve the employability of students in the music industry, two specializations, namely New Technologies and Arts Administration, were developed by David Manchip and Germaine Gamiet, then implemented in our BMus program in 2015. The two specializations provide students with knowledge and practical skills. They include excursions and practical components that bring them into contact with companies (potential institutions of employment). Thus, the programs respond to government expectations as outlined in the HEQSF, the Higher Education Qualifications Sub-Framework (available through the websites of SAQA, the South African Qualifications Authority, and CHE, the Council on Higher Education):

36. The HEQSF is designed to:
36.1 Be sufficiently flexible to accommodate different types of higher education institutions and enable institutions to pursue their own curriculum goals with creativity and innovation;
36.2 Facilitate the education of graduates who will contribute to the social cultural and economic development of South Africa and participate successfully in the global economy and knowledge society;
36.3 Enhance the development of a vibrant, high quality research system;
36.4 Be compatible with international qualifications frameworks in order to ensure international recognition and comparability of standards...

Through practical components and excursions, the new BMus also incorporates WIL (Work Integrated Learning) as requested by the above-mentioned sub-framework.

---

49 For a long time, many Fort Hare students found jobs in government (Banks 2014, 15).
50 SAQA 2013, 51; The Council on Higher Education 2015, 17.
51 SAQA ibid., 51; The Council on Higher Education ibid., 16.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level (Year)</th>
<th>Module combination</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>400</td>
<td>Performance, Musicology/Ethnomusicology, Music and Arts Administration, Music Technology and Production. Selection of 5 courses from MUS 401-408, MUC 401 and 402, MUA 401-403 and MTP 401-404. Three of them must be relevant for the specialization, one of them must have a strong research component, and one is an elective. MPI 401E Primary Instrument (52) MUS 401E African Philosophy of Music (26) MUS 402E Advanced Theory of African Music and Jazz (26) MUS 403E History of African or Western Music (26) MUS 404E History of Jazz and Popular Music (26) MUS 405E General History of Music (26) MUS 406E Field Work and Research Techniques (26) MUS 407E Creative Studies (26) MUS 408E Music Technologies (26) MUC 401E Advanced Choral Music (repertoire, management skills, conducting; 26 credits) MUC 402E Advanced Practical Music (Choral and Singing Techniques; 26 credits) MUA 401E Music and Arts Organisation Management (26) MUA 402E Event and Festival Management in Music and the Arts (26) MUA 403E Music Business Practice (26) MTP 401 Recording (26) MTP 402 Mixing (26) MTP 403 Multimedia (26) MTP 404 Advanced Digital Audio (26)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>300</td>
<td>MUH 311/321E Music History, Western and African (16/16) MUT 311/321E Music Theory, Western and African (16/16) MPI 311/321E Primary Instrument (to be split up in the future in vocal/instrumental technique and repertoire, credits: 32/32) MUA 311E Introduction to Music and Arts Administration (16) MUA 312E Music and Performing Arts Management (16) MUA 321E Music and Arts Marketing (16) MUA 322E Community Music and Arts Partnerships and Learning (16) MTP 311E Physics and Acoustics (16) MTP 312E Contemporary Arrangement (16) MTP 321E Synthesis (16) MTP 322E Introduction to Recording and Mixing (16) 64 credits required in specializations, i.e., Performance, Musicology/Ethnomusicology (MUH + MUT), Music and Arts Administration, Music Technology and Production; 64 credits in electives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>200</td>
<td>MUH 211/221E Music History, Western and African (16/16) MUT 211/221E Music Theory, Western and African (16/16) MPI 211/221E Primary Instrument (16/16) MSI 211/221E Secondary Instrument (16/16) All compulsory (total credits: 128)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>100</td>
<td>MUH 111/121E Music History, Western and African (16/16) MUT 111/121E Music Theory, Western and African (16/16) MPI 111/121E Primary Instrument (16/16) MSI 111/121E Secondary Instrument (16/16) All compulsory (total credits: 128 whereby each module, for instance MUH 111E, is 16 credits) BML 111/121E Basic Music Literacy (not credit-bearing, but compulsory for students who do not pass the music theory entrance test. After passing BML, students can proceed to MUT 111/121E. BML is designed as a short course and can also be attended by people who do not study music.)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1. Introduced in 2016.
2. Existing courses whose credits were reduced to accommodate MUA and MTP.
A Summary and Afterthought

As outlined above, the educational and socio-economic backgrounds of our students were among the main challenges in 2007. Additionally we had to prepare for an institutional audit and to deal with a reduced student intake. The latter reflected badly on the viability of the department. Yet the situation evoked fresh thinking about broader contexts and new opportunities. Following Dave Dargie’s model of a syllabus that makes provision for local needs and cultural backgrounds, a new BMus program was developed that familiarizes students with African, Western and World Music and, at the same time, is open for amendments catering to global trends. The specializations introduced in 2015 (Music Technologies and Production, and Music and Arts Administration) responded to such trends as well as students' employability, and government policies and frameworks like the HEQSF. Whilst new challenges, such as the extreme gap that divides the musical education of new students, may require a strategic response in the form of a bridging course (e.g., BML), the now poly-cultural student body will hopefully stimulate competitiveness. At the moment, the new Music Department in East London is a nexus between rural and urban, and local and global. Students and staff perform with international guests and abroad, plus some global networks are being established. Yet we are only at the beginning.

Recently, I have been asked why or how the Music Department has developed in such a way. The question, in fact, invites reflection. I have already touched on most of the historical, socio-economic, and structural influences. Yet one of the most important aspects has so far been left out: the type of communication on-the-ground, through which the new department was imagined for the first time and finally designed, which led to an environment conducive to creative thinking.

We all have to act on different levels, for example on political and interpersonal levels. In terms of the political level (conflict- or interest-) parties have to negotiate—and to a certain extent defend—standpoints and the conditions on which bases they want to work, cooperate or develop something. These parties tolerate, that is, accept, the others, but at the same time they draw lines or boundaries, which in the course of negotiations or afterwards may become inflexible. Negotiation has its value in political contexts and in management. More important for the development of the Music Department was the interpersonal level, where the groundwork for the new program was done. Negotiation would be an insufficient or even inappropriate word to describe the type of communication that we had on this level. According to my experience of the last eight years, I would define it as playful dialogue, in which all participants are contributors (like in an orchestra or soccer team). In a playful dialogue, otherness is not only tolerated, but appreciated and embraced, boundaries are rather fluid and the discussions are highly dynamic. Each participant is aware of his/her own strengths and those of the others and uses them to achieve a group goal or to find solutions for problems that affect the group. The strength of the group lies partly in the otherness of its members which, in the course of playful dialogue,
unleashes or releases a creativity that, in turn, leads to something new—in our case a newly oriented Music Department. Prerequisites for the success of playful dialogue are the openness, willingness and curiosity to cross cultural boundaries and to recognize transcultural features in oneself. This was mostly the case among the staff of the Music Department. Another common aspect was that they were all experienced in solo and ensemble performance in different genres, and this practical background eased our discussions across cultural boundaries. Playful dialogue is thus a useful approach to enhancing transcultural social cohesion. Yet it may have an impact on the role of the applied ethnomusicologist, for it reduces cultural distances. The applied ethnomusicologist might even—as in my case as HoD of the department—lose his/her status as an outsider and become part of the team.

As I observed, it is sometimes unconventional strategies, skills, but also seemingly unimportant details of daily interaction (with staff and students), which can make a difference:

- Reducing cultural boundaries by recognizing common features and similarities: This happened or was achieved through musical performances and partly through comparison and discussion of similarities of musical elements in class: by comparing the medieval trope and the vocal commenting practice among the Xhosa called *ukucabela*, for example; or the Lydian mode with the Xhosa scale to explain composition / improvisation techniques and modes; or by comparing the music of different African countries. Working with concepts that are known and accessible in one’s own culture may help one to understand similar concepts in other musical cultures. Seeing similarities and affinities may help one to overcome cultural boundaries in discussions (for it also demystifies the supposedly superior “other” and/or own culture).
- Old music in new contexts: Musical transcriptions from field research were used in order to create new or modern versions of old or indigenous songs. Those new versions often increased the interest in the original song and thus contributed to its conservation.

---

52 The staff members of the Fort Hare Music Department, who were effectively involved in the design and implementation of the new BMus degree program, consisted of: one Xhosa male with solo and ensemble experience (voice, piano, choirs), trained in Western music and familiar with African indigenous music; one Chewa male trained in and familiar with African indigenous music and Western music and with experience in solo and ensemble performance (African instruments, piano); two white South African males with experience in solo and ensemble performance (piano, electric guitar, indigenous instruments) in different genres (including Jazz); one white South African female with experience in solo and ensemble performance (voice); one mixed-race South African male with experience in solo and ensemble performance (piano, choirs); one white female from Finland with experience in solo and ensemble performance (piano, voice); and one German white male with experience in solo and ensemble performance (brass and woodwinds). Our experiences in solo and ensemble performance not only fostered mutual respect for each other, but had positive impact on discussions concerning the curriculum design or practical solutions for problems because we spoke the same musical “language” and, equipped with similar experiences as lecturers and performers, we knew what we needed in terms of teaching approaches, learning material, venues or equipment. We had the same goal.
• Playful uses of new genres and foreign elements (e.g. instruments, rhythms) or musical pieces: When done in our African music theory modules or in joint concerts/workshops with students from abroad this helps to enhance open-mindedness and to build bridges.

• Practical skills of lecturers: In an environment in which practical music skills are vital, lecturers should be able to perform music. It is useful for teaching and learning and necessary for the relationship between students and staff.

• Positive humor: Humor at the right time can reduce stress and tension, and generate energy in discussions and work situations.

After all, a department is only as strong as the knowledge, skills, motivation and team spirit of its staff—and students.

Having worked in a poly-cultural setting, having experienced the application of the monolithic 19th-century concepts of untouchable and static culture, Early anthropologists used the concept of culture in this way and some of my colleagues in South Africa. The term is problematic. In South Africa the word “culture” may even be used as substitute for “race” (see Wilson 2002, 212–213).

53 Welsch 1994/95.
54 Takeda 2010.
55 The College Music Society 2014.

54 Transculturality as proposed by the philosopher Wolfgang Welsch and the linguist and cultural scientist Arata Takeda might be an adequate model at this stage in South Africa, because in this model, cultures are seen as hybrid, heterogeneous, open, and in constant development and endless exchange. Cultures shouldn’t be seen as markers of difference, but rather they invite cross-cultural participation. This idea promotes an atmosphere of openness, which might lead to real freedom of the mind, and responsibility-driven and sustainable change. This is—I think—what applied ethnomusicology should try to consider and to achieve. Another advance in this direction is the report of The College Music Society which—based on the three pillars of creativity, diversity, and integration—proposes work on new improviser, composer and performer-oriented curricula that takes diverse musics of the world into account in order to offer musicians skills they need in the 21st century, with its global cultural influences, and also achieve greater transcultural understanding.

56 The College Music Society 2014.
References


South African History Online 2014. The Homelands. <sahistory.org.za/special-features/homelands> (visited 7 March 2016)


Institutions I
ORGANIZATIONS

The Christian Church

Dave Dargie
University of Fort Hare, South Africa

The Constitution on the Liturgy of the Second Vatican Council opened the way for the use of folk music in Catholic worship. The author’s work in African church music grew out of this. Lack of official policy for the conservation of Southern Africa’s musical heritage led the author to use opportunities arising from church music work to record and document traditional music. Later he was given the opportunity to bring traditional music into the syllabuses of the Fort Hare University music department. Although not a stated policy this clearly suited the post-apartheid university leadership. The article traces the work of the author in these fields.

Introduction

Here are some definitions that have been offered for applied ethnomusicology:

“Applied ethnomusicology is any use of ethnomusicological knowledge to influence social interaction, to maintain or change social conditions, or to direct the course of cultural change.”¹

“Applied ethnomusicology is the approach guided by principles of social responsibility, which extends the usual academic goal of broadening and deepening knowledge and understanding toward solving concrete problems and toward working both inside and beyond typical academic contexts.”²

“Applied ethnomusicology is a philosophical approach to the study of music in culture, with social responsibility and social justice as guiding principals.”³

¹ Pettan 2008, 90.
³ Loughran 2008, 92.
“Applied ethnomusicology puts ethnomusicological scholarship, knowledge and understanding to practical use. … More specifically, … applied ethnomusicology is best regarded a music centered intervention in a particular community, whose purpose is to benefit that community – for example, a social improvement, a musical benefit, a cultural good, an economic advantage, or a combination of these and other benefits.”

4 Pettan and Titon 2015, 4.
Daniel Sheehy has the following to say:

(Applied ethnomusicology) has been praised as an avenue to benefit humanity in ways that the academy has not…. If ethnomusicology is an approach to the study of the music of the world’s peoples, then applied ethnomusicology is an approach to the study of the music of the world’s peoples. It is … something more fundamental that informs all one’s actions as an ethnomusicologist.\(^5\)

The above definitions of Applied Ethnomusicology all agree that it is the use of ethnomusicological knowledge for the benefit of people. Underlying it at base are social responsibility and social justice, both of which suffered profoundly under the system of apartheid in South Africa. Some particular aspects referred to in the definitions include: to maintain or change social conditions, or to direct the course of cultural change;\(^6\) to benefit that community – for example, a social improvement, a musical benefit, a cultural good, an economic advantage;\(^7\) in terms of an ethical responsibility to “pay back” those whose music and lives we study.\(^8\)

In the light of these definitions and descriptions, I believe that I was working as an applied ethnomusicologist before I had any claim to be an ethnomusicologist. I had to learn as I went on with the work. Once the work had begun, it could not be stopped. I had jumped into deep water, and I had no option but to keep on swimming.

The article covers two main time periods, each associated with an institution and its policies. In the first period, from 1976 to 1989, the institution was the Catholic Church, the policy involved an important change regarding the music of the Church. In the second period, from 1995 to the present, the institution was a South African university; the policy change was the need to make the previously almost-ignored study of African music the most important focus in the music department. During the whole of the time period, from 1976 to the present, run two themes. The first of these is heritage: discovering, preserving and promoting the musical heritage of indigenous peoples of Southern Africa. The second theme is creativity: building on the traditional music heritage in attempt to creatively answer new needs.

In addition to the definitions quoted above, certain ideals are expressed in suggested definitions for applied ethnomusicology taken from the sub-section headed “Defining Applied Ethnomusicology” on the Internet page of the Applied Ethnomusicology Section of the Society for Ethnomusicology,\(^9\) as follows:

“We are … ethnomusicologists with a strong desire to make the world a better place through our work.”

---

5 Sheehy 1992, 323.
6 Pettan 2008, 90.
7 Titon 2015, 4.
8 Sheehy 1992, 323.
9 Society for Ethnomusicology 2016.
“We strive to empower individuals and communities.”
“For me, what distinguishes applied work is the advocacy and social justice aspect of it.”

The ideals expressed in the above declarations by applied ethnomusicologists inspire one to believe that the study of the music of the peoples of the world is something most worthwhile, that music is something way above mere entertainment or a way to make money. When I began my work to promote the production of new African church music, I was 38 years of age and still very idealistic in outlook. But at that moment, the thoughts in my mind were focused on two questions: Would the people I would be working with actually compose new church songs? And would any of their songs make use of the African techniques of melody, scale, harmony, form and rhythm?

A Change of Policy regarding Church Music in the Catholic Church

In 1970, with degrees in theology and in music I was working as a Catholic priest in East London in the diocese of Port Elizabeth in South Africa, Archbishop Denis Hurley of Durban, the noted anti-apartheid activist, asked me whether I would be willing to work for the promotion of new music for the Catholic Church in African styles. The possibility of developing Catholic liturgical music in the styles of non-Western cultures had been considered more than once in the past. New impetus was given to this by the Constitution on the Liturgy of the Second Vatican Council, *Sacrosanctum Concilium*. The way was opened to bring the use of folk music into the Catholic Liturgy, and also for my involvement in this field.

New Catholic Church Music for South Africa

In Zimbabwe, the drive for liberation expressed in the freedom struggle there led to a revival of traditional music, including among the Shona people a revival in the use of the *mbira dzavadzimu*.[11] This had the natural spin-off that church members in Zimbabwe desired to bring their own music into their worship. The Protestant Churches were ahead of the Catholics, but the Catholics were striving to catch up.[12]

10 Paul VI 1963.
11 See Dargie 1984, 10.
12 For example, this was so regarding production of church songs (including church freedom songs) in African style through the work of Protestant musicians and musicologists, including Patrick Matsikenyiri, Olof Axelsson, Robert Kauffman, former Zimbabwean President Rev. Canaan Banana and others. See Hawn 2003, 148–188.
Fritz Lobinger and Oswald Hirmer, two German Catholic missionaries working in the Eastern Cape Province of South Africa, had already begun working for the development of new church music in traditional style for use in Xhosa congregations in South Africa. Catholic church music in Xhosa had been limited to the use of Xhosa texts set to western hymn tunes. Lobinger and Hirmer took the step of commissioning the noted Xhosa choral composer, B. K. Tyamzashe (a Presbyterian) to compose music in Xhosa style for the Catholic Church.

Tyamzashe composed a number of songs, which later found their way into the Xhosa Catholic hymnal. Some have proved lastingly popular, especially his Missa I. This Mass was published through the Catholic Lumko Pastoral Institute at a conference called by Lobinger and Hirmer at Lumko in 1965. I was at that conference and returned with a copy of the Missa I. In 1966 I began work at the Catholic Church in the township of Zwelitsha near King Williams Town. The choir leader there, Lambert Mpotulo, taught the Missa I with great enthusiasm to the choir and congregation. One result of Mpotulo’s work was that we soon had to have more church benches made, as the singing drew in more and more worshippers.

The Gloria of Missa I used a striking chord pattern, alternating F major and G major chords, as shown in the excerpt in Figure 2.

![Figure 2. An excerpt from Tyamzashe's Gloria of his Missa I.](image)

This type of chord usage, a method of tonality shift based on the method of playing the most important Xhosa traditional musical instrument, the uhadi musical bow, was something new to me. I asked Hirmer how Tyamzashe got the idea for his Gloria. Hirmer told me he had asked Tyamzashe, who said he was inspired by the Great Hymn of the Prophet Ntsikana. Ntsikana (d. 1821) was the first Xhosa Christian who not only preached to his own people, but also composed hymns in

13 This hymnal, *Bongan’ iNkosi*, is included in the section of references as PCXR n.d. Oswald Hirmer was the editor, and the hymnal appeared in 1979, but these facts are not stated in the hymnal itself.

14 Lumko Institute was based (until 1985) at the old Lumko Mission about 60 kilometres east of the town of Queenstown, in the Eastern Cape Province of South Africa (see Figure 1). In 1985, Lumko moved to Germiston.

15 Figure 2 is taken from Dargie 1988, 131.

16 See Dargie 1988, 76 & 78.
traditional style for his followers. Figure 3 shows an excerpt from Ntsikana’s Great Hymn as it has been handed down in Church use.\(^{17}\)

![Figure 3](image)

Figure 3. The beginning of Ntsikana’s Great Hymn as it is often sung in churches.\(^{18}\)

The “inner melody” of Figure 2 is the melody for the tenor solo which begins Tyamzashe’s Gloria (sung to the text “Uzuko kuThixo enyangweni” – “Glory to God in the Highest”). This “inner melody” is closely related to the opening melody of Ntsikana's Great hymn, which is begun by the tenor and continued by the soprano in Figure 3. However, the “upper melody” (soprano part) of Figure 2 may have been based on another Xhosa traditional song, “Umungqel’ indawo,” shown in Figure 4 below.\(^{19}\)

![Figure 4](image)

Figure 4. A vocal canon from the song Umungqel’ indawo.

Tyamzashe’s Gloria marked the first usage of traditional Xhosa harmony in Catholic church music. In addition, the “upper melody” in Figure 2 uses an additive rhythm pattern, 3+2+3=8 beats. This additive rhythm is used in the song “Umungqel’ indawo,” and forms a polyrhythmic pattern with the tenor “inner melody.” Such a usage of rhythm was also a first in Xhosa Catholic church music.

---

17 On the music of Ntsikana, see Dargie 1988, 194–205, and Dargie 1982. For information on Ntsikana’s life and work, see Hodgson 1980 and 1985.

18 Figure 3 is taken from Dargie 1988, 199. It is based on a performance recorded by Hugh Tracey: Tracey 1957.

19 Dargie 1988, 131.
The Author’s Involvement in the Project

After working in English-language parishes, in 1974 I began in Grahamstown as a chaplain at Rhodes University. I registered for a doctorate in composition of church music in English, and from mid-1977 to the end of 1978 I taught music theory in the music department. In 1976, when nearly 38 years old, I was approached by Hirmer and Lobinger with a view to promoting the production of new songs for the proposed new Catholic Xhosa hymnal mentioned above, of which Hirmer had been appointed editor. Hirmer wished to have psalms and psalm responses included in the hymnal. Such short responses gave excellent opportunities for the use of African style, with call-and-response form and the use of response form and the involvement of body movement in the rhythm.20 As a preparatory step, Hirmer and Lobinger sent me to attend a composition workshop for church music in Ndebele, the second main language of Zimbabwe, to be conducted by Olof Axelsson at the Kwanongoma College of Music in Bulawayo, of which Axelsson was the director. The workshop took place over the last week of 1976 and the first week of 1977. I arranged that three other South Africans should also attend the workshop. They included Stephen Cuthbert Molefe, a prolific composer of choral music in Sotho, Zulu and other African languages. Molefe’s music was often very lively and often used call-and-response structure.

The workshop at Kwanongoma was attended by 29 people who composed 28 new songs during the workshop. I came back, full of enthusiasm, to report to Hirmer and Lobinger. I suggested that we hold a workshop for the composition of new songs for the hymnal, and Hirmer at once went about setting up the workshop. It would be held at Zwelitsha, at the church where I had once worked with composer Lambert Mpotulo. Hirmer prepared placards with psalm response texts to be set to music, and also distributed texts in advance to known composers, including Molefe and Mpotulo. Hirmer had Molefe, who was at Vosloorus near Germiston east of Johannesburg, and 12 of his choir flown down to the Eastern Cape. The workshop, held over the Easter weekend of 1977, produced 53 new songs, including Molefe’s Great Amen, which appeared in the new hymnbook as “Masithi – Amen” (“Let us say – Amen”). This song has since spread over the world, and is now in many hymnals in Europe, America, the Far East and elsewhere.

I soon found opportunities to conduct further workshops in other languages. The first of these was at Redacres near Pietermaritzburg in KwaZulu-Natal in June 1977. The main organizer was Archbishop Hurley. By the end of 1978 I had 8 further workshops, one in Xhosa (at Lumko at the end of 1977), one in Zulu (at Mariannhill monastery near Durban), three in Tswana and two in Sotho. The songs from these workshops were later published, in both staff and sol-fa notation, by Lumko.21

20 It is useful to consider the use of rhythm in western music rather as passive compared to its more active use in Xhosa (and other African) music. See Dargie 1988, 82.

21 Dargie 1979.
Ways of Building New Songs:  
Methods of Group Composition

In the Zwelitsha workshop I imitated the Kwanongoma workshop, simply inviting the gathered musicians to compose new songs. However, as early as the Redacres workshop, it sometimes became clear that the participants needed to find a way into creative composing. I had been thinking over something I had learned from Oswald Hirmer.

Xhosa, like the very great majority of African languages, is tonal. European melodies do not fit the tone patterns of African texts, and the accents in the melodies very rarely fit the accents of African speech. Changing the speech tones can change the meaning of the words. The most famous example of this happening in African church singing is recounted by Lazarus N. Ekwueme, who tells how pairing an English hymn tune with a translation of its lyrics in the Igbo language of Nigeria changed the meaning of the words from “there is no sorrow in heaven” to “there is no egg on the bicycle.” The least obnoxious result of misuse of speech tones in singing is simply to render the words meaningless. Hugh Tracey described the result as “sacred gibberish.”

Hirmer told me how he got Xhosa youngsters to create songs by having one go some distance from the group and shout a text to those in the group. When shouting over a distance, Xhosa people will strongly emphasize the speech tones, so that even if their words are not clearly audible over the distance, the tone pattern will enable the hearer to distinguish the words. As a boy visiting farms of my relatives, I heard this myself several times when people on a mountainside shouted to others in the valley below. Hirmer would then urge the group of hearers to sing what they had heard, and so new melodies could be developed that suited the tones of the text.

At Redacres, I put the same system to work in a different manner. I asked the workshop participants to recite a text together, urging them to emphasize the tones, and then go from speaking to singing. In this way, four new songs were created. From that time on I frequently began composition workshops with a group composition going from speech to singing. Drummers were asked to accompany the spoken texts, beating on the accents of speech, so that a new song could develop that correctly reflected the tones and accents of the text. Such a group composition was not only useful for creating a new song, it also taught new composers a way of putting a song together. In time, highly refined methods of group composition were developed, including using a speaker selected by the group as tone exemplar, and also methods of working with traditional musicians. When a bow player was present, the player was asked how her/his bow would sing

22 Ekwueme 1972/4, 15.  
23 Tracey 1959.  
the words of the text. Musical bows are considered as singers taking part in a song, as is clear from the way musicians speak about the bows. Bows “speak” texts by reproducing the tone patterns, as do the talking drums of West Africa.

Various methods of group composition used in my workshops are described in Dargie 1983. The handbook and 2-CD set Dargie 2012 was designed to demonstrate group composition work in practice, using recordings of group composition taking place and then the finished compositions from a workshop I conducted in Bunya, Kavango, Namibia, in 1979. The following examples, Figures 5, 6 and 7 are from the Bunya workshop. Figure 5 shows the pronunciation of the text **Tanga nokufumadeka Hompa**, which means “Praise and glorify the Lord” in the Kavango Rukwangali language.

![Figure 5. Tone patterns of a text.](image)

Figure 6 shows how the spoken text became a melody, as realized by a schoolgirl during the speaking of the text. (The process lasted well over half-an-hour; the full composition took one-and-a-half hours.) The sung melody clearly has the same tone pattern as the spoken text, except that at the end of the second phrase the melody rises (a usage common in neo-African music). The melody uses a pentatonic scale, with use of Afro-diatonic harmony.

![Figure 6. Realization of a melody for the text.](image)

Figure 7 is drawn from the performance of the finished composition, with use of drums including a cross-rhythm of 4 beats of the *mundindi* drum to 3 beats of the other drums. The harmony is typical of Kavango usage of Afro-diatonic techniques.

25 See Dargie 1988, 51–52, 64.

26 “Neo-African” as used here, also called “neo-traditional,” refers to African musical styles combining traditional and exogenous elements. “Afro-diatonic” is a term I use for African ways of using western diatonic scales and harmonies, which are combined with African techniques like blues notes and the use of parallel harmonies.
After this first composition, which took the complete first session on the first morning of the workshop, in the rest of that day and until the following midday, when the workshop ended, the participants composed a further twelve songs, including a complete new sung mass, building on the techniques used in the opening group composition. More than half of the thirteen songs use traditional tetratonic Kavango scales and harmony whereas some others use pentatonic scales (e.g., “Tanga nokufumadeka Hompa”).

One great virtue of the group composition method I used was that it was quite unnecessary for me to know anything about the musical style of the workshop participants. I guided them, certainly, but the creativity came directly from them. A melody would be created, sometimes by the whole group but sometimes just by some participant grasping the melodies implied in the spoken words. Then, without any encouragement usually being necessary, the group would take over the melody and at once use with it the methods of harmony typical to the musical style. When different singers sing the same text at different (consonant) pitch levels, then they necessarily follow the same (speech) tone patterns and so create systems

27 See also Dargie 2013.
of parallel harmony. Use of parallel harmony is common in musics of Southern Africa. Minimal encouragement might be necessary for the participants to create leader parts, either short lead-ins to the melody or sometimes by having the whole melody sung first by the leaders, and then by the followers. The participants always had clear ideas how to use drums and rhythmic instruments in the new songs. I called myself the “catalyst,” making things happen while somehow not being involved directly in the process.

In the period between Easter 1977 and mid-1989, when I left Lumko, I conducted some 70 composition workshops. These ranged from a day to two weeks in length. Workshops produced from perhaps 10 or 12 new songs to sometimes over 70. Altogether nearly two thousand new songs were composed. The songs were published by Lumko on audio tapes and with texts. I was quite unable to cope with transcribing everything although I transcribed as much as I could.

**Ways into a Technical Understanding of African Music**

In 1979 I was taken onto the full-time staff of the Catholic Lumko Pastoral Institute to open a department of church music. Lumko Institute was situated near the town of Lady Frere: see no. 4 on the Map, Figure 1. I decided that the best way to learn about African music was to research the music around Lumko. My colleagues feared that, with missionaries having been active in the area for a long time, traditional music would have suffered, but this was gloriously incorrect. Around Lumko was a most marvelous area of musical preservation. A possible reason for this is that in the period about 1835 to 1850 the Thembu people, who were coming into the area, lived side-by-side with San people. Intermarriages took place. The strong musical culture of the San people clearly passed on to the Thembu people in that area today (see Dargie 1988, 24–28). The people around Lumko simply continued to practise their traditional culture (including music) without telling the missionaries about it.

Soon after I took up residence at Lumko, I began looking for the *uhadi*, the calabash-resonated percussion musical bow that Hugh Tracey had recorded and Andrew Tracey had told me had provided the basis of Xhosa scale and harmony, and other traditional instruments.

---

29 This is a guesstimate: I have not made any exact calculation.
30 These people are called San and also Bushman. Both names are unsatisfactory, but nowadays the people themselves—those still surviving—tend to use the name San.
31 Xhosa scale and harmony derive from the overtone patterns of the musical bows. Uhadi is the oldest Xhosa bow. The others, using the mouth or an oil tin as resonator, use the same harmonic system as uhadi. See Dargie 1988, 46–55.
There is not space in this article to write in depth about Xhosa music theory. It must suffice to say that I found players of various kinds of bows, notably the uhadi master Nofinishi Dywili. The Xhosa use of rhythm is extraordinary. Musicologists had written what they did not understand about it rather than what they did. It took me years, but finally I broke the Xhosa rhythm “codes,” and began to learn the extraordinary cross-rhythms in Xhosa singing. As an example of typical rhythm usage from the Lumko area, see Figure 8.

![Figure 8. An example of Xhosa rhythm usage in the Lumko area.](image)

In Figure 8, each score line shows a different rhythm. What is not shown is that clap delay technique may also be used. In this particular song, as many as four different rhythmic systems operate simultaneously.

I found things in Xhosa music that were until then unknown or only partially known. These included, in addition to the use of rhythm, a rich multiplicity of polyphonic parts in some songs, the playing of imirhubhe (singular: umrhubhe) mouth-bows in duet, a number of versions of the historic song of Ntsikana, including

---

32 Three important writings predate my study of Xhosa music. Rycroft (Rycroft 1971) wrote about the difficulty of analysing Xhosa rhythm, noting how voice beats and body rhythm beats did not coincide. However, he could not explain this. Hansen (1981) wrote a huge thesis covering the music of the entire Xhosa-speaking peoples. His thesis contains a great deal of information. Perhaps Hansen’s main theoretical achievement was to point out the stylistic difference between the early Xhosa inhabitants of the Eastern Cape and later, intrusive groups who mostly came into the area as a result of the Mfecane, a pattern of wars that afflicted a vast area of South Africa as a result of the wars of Zulu King Shaka. However, Hansen also did not offer a satisfactory explanation for the Xhosa use of rhythm. Unfortunately, when producing my own dissertation (Dargie 1987), I did not find much theoretical material in Hansen on which I could build. My dissertation and my book (Dargie 1988) both concentrate strongly on the techniques of Xhosa music as exemplified in a small area, the Thembu Xhosa of the Lumko district. Xhosa rhythm in particular is extremely complex. I offered a solution in my thesis and my book, but I believe I have come closer to full understanding in an article presently awaiting publication, mentioned in footnote 22 below. Bigalke (1982) also wrote a thesis on Xhosa music, but his study is particularly concentrated on social and sociological aspects of the music of the Xhosa Ndlambe people. He hardly touches at all on the techniques of the music.

33 See Dargie 2010/11.

34 Dargie 1988, 82–87.
two versions using the uhadi bow. My most exciting “discovery” was the use of overtone singing, the first overtone singing documented in any African traditional music. This was the Xhosa umngqokolo singing, and especially the variety called umngqokolo ngomqangi. Figure 9 shows an example of umngqokolo ngomqangi.

From the beginning of my attempt to study Xhosa music, I was convinced that unless I could somehow perform at least some manifestations of that music, a purely “academic” attempt to understand Xhosa music could never bring significant insights. Quite early in my research around Lumko I learned to make and to play the uhadi – not anywhere near the level of skill employed by Nofinishi Dywili, but I could still render some of her songs, and also an uhadi version of the “Great Hymn” of Ntsikana, which I recorded at Mackay’s Nek near Lumko in 1981. The example of Ntsikana encouraged me to bring the uhadi into the church. I went so far as to compose some uhadi psalm settings (using response and verses to the same melody), which we sang sometimes at worship at Lumko.

I had to get moving on the creative composition workshops early in 1979, long before I was able to do any study of ethnomusicology or African music, or get in-depth into the study of Xhosa music. That is why I stated earlier that I was working in applied ethnomusicology before I had any training or experience as a musicologist. The workshop methods I was using had to enable the people themselves to create their own music in their own styles, based on their own knowledge of their music without any input from me, at least regarding proper use of call-and-response form.

35 These “discoveries” are discussed in Dargie 1988. In 1993, I presented a paper on umngqokolo at the ICTM World Conference in Berlin, Germany: Dargie 1993.
melody, scale, harmony or rhythm, which the workshop participants knew from their own music traditions. In many cases, I needed to provide texts to be set to music: parts of the mass, new songs required for hymnbook use and so on. Sometimes, when it seemed opportune, I would suggest the composing of freedom prayer songs. Often it was necessary for me to suggest ways of setting long texts such as Glorias or Credos. Here I encouraged the composers to imitate methods used in Zimbabwe, in which the congregation would sing a constant response and the song leaders could build up the full text by singing verses. Much new church music in traditional styles was composed in this way. However, sometimes I had to work in other ways, giving input myself and even, on some occasions, composing new songs, mainly for singing with accompanying musical bow or marimbas.

Creating Church Songs as Part of Cultural Liberation

In addition, I soon realized that creating their own church music for worship was a form of cultural and religious liberation for those people. In Zimbabwe, the movement for new liturgical music went hand-in-hand with a national freedom struggle. So far as possible, I tried to point things that way in my own workshops. I not only tried to show people that by going to the roots of their own culture they were working for their liberation, I was also sometimes able to persuade them to create freedom prayer songs. Unfortunately, it was also clear that people felt afraid at times, as for example on one occasion when people composed a number of such freedom prayer songs at a workshop in 1984, planned to use the songs at the community mass on the Sunday, and then did not sing a single freedom prayer song at the mass. I did not ask why—the reason was clear.

The Heritage of Traditional Music: A “Personal Policy” Decision

At the beginning of my work with African church music Andrew Tracey, son of Hugh Tracey who founded the International Library of Traditional Music (ILAM), had just brought ILAM to Rhodes University in Grahamstown. This gave me the opportunity for many discussions with Tracey. He told me of the damage often done to Africa’s music heritage by missionaries. He was clearly anxious that I would act in the

36 See the conference paper Dargie 1984.
37 Examples of such songs abound in the recordings and song collections of the “Dargie Collection” (Dargie 2000 to Present). See, for example, the CD and handbook set called “How Long,” which is a compilation of freedom songs.
38 At the funeral of a police victim in Grahamstown in 1986, a group of women of the anti-apartheid Black Sash movement stood outside the township entrance singing “Nkosi sikelel’ iAfrika” (Lord, bless Africa). A policeman came to them and warned that if they did not stop, they risked being shot.
same way. However, what I learned from Tracey made me determined that my work should contribute to the preservation of the cultural heritage of the people for whom I was working.39

**Bringing Traditional Music Styles into the Church**

The first step was to bring the heritage of traditional music into the new church music. In workshops, my efforts at encouraging participants to use their traditional musical styles in their compositions often lacked tact, nevertheless some took these messages to heart. More and more compositions using traditional techniques resulted. In addition, some remarkable composers had already worked at producing new church songs in traditional styles. These included Zulu Benedictine Brother Clement Sithole. Another most talented Zulu composer came to light in workshops that I conducted at the Catholic Seminary in Pretoria. This was Paul Thembayona Manci, who to my delight has just been made rector of that seminary. Sadly my efforts to get Clement's and Manci's compositions into the new Zulu Catholic hymnal were dismissed by the missionary editor. Clement's songs, he told me, were “pagan” (despite being settings of the mass texts, and psalms sung with the umakhweyane musical bow). Manci, I was told, “could not even write his own music.” Nevertheless the “Dave Dargie Collection”40 includes CDs by Clement and Manci, as well as CDs containing selections of new church songs in the traditional styles of Xhosa, Zulu, Northern and Southern Sotho, Tsonga, Venda and other musics of South Africa, and of a number of peoples of Namibia, Swaziland, Lesotho and Botswana.

Traditional techniques and instruments feature in these collections, as well as an instrument type successfully introduced to Lumko. These were marimbas that were being used in Zimbabwe and elsewhere for church music. For the very great majority of people in Southern Africa, marimbas were not traditional instruments. By bringing marimbas to these peoples we were crossing a line, and at first I had doubts about it. However, it was at the request of Lambert Mpotulo, the long-time choirmaster and composer of the Zwelitsha parish, that Lumko colleagues Hirmer and Lobinger brought in marimbas. I too had to play my part in this.

---

39 My efforts at heritage preservation did not prevent me from assisting in the development of neo-traditional music, such as promoting the marimbas introduced by Lumko into South Africa, especially when such changes were clearly beneficial to people or actually requested by local musicians. There was no contradiction or conflict. The same students who learned marimba playing from me at Fort Hare I also taught to play and make traditional musical bows.

40 Dargie 2000 to Present. There is further discussion on the “Collection” and how it may be accessed later in this article.
Introducing Marimba Xylophones into South Africa

In 1977, Lumko imported three sets of marimbas from Kwanongoma College in Bulawayo. Until then, the only South African xylophones were the very few made and used by Venda traditional musicians. In 1979, Lumko set up a small factory for making marimbas in Umtata. I helped by designing the tuning system (based on Xhosa music). It became my task first to learn and then to teach people to play the marimbas. I worked out ways to adapt the use of Xhosa scale and harmony to marimba playing, and also ways to bring in the use of Xhosa rhythm. Traditionally the Xhosa did not use drums, until they learned the use of bass drums by observing the British military bands in the 19th century. The extremely complex and sophisticated use of cross-rhythm in Xhosa traditional music exists in the patterns created between movement of voice parts and body movement. It was necessary to find ways of expressing such rhythms in marimba playing. This often meant amplifying cross-rhythms into additive rhythms, for example. Figure 10 shows the marimba performance patterns of the song “Ungumpriste ngonaphakade” (“You are a priest for ever of the order of Melchisedek”) composed by the author for singing with the uhadi musical bow. A recording of the song may be heard on the CD *African Sunday Marimba Mass*, of the Dargie Collection. Similar marimba techniques were brought into the performance of numerous songs composed by a variety of composers.

I travelled far and wide in South Africa, Namibia, Botswana and Swaziland teaching marimba playing and adapting church songs to use with marimbas. Today, marimbas are used in churches and schools in many places in South Africa, and many popular music groups are using “Lumko” marimbas, now produced by Tracey’s African Musical Instruments factory in Grahamstown and by other local makers. The first such group was Amampondo, whose CDs are now on sale in many countries around the world. Three of the six original Amampondo members were among the first church marimba groups that I taught, at Langa, Cape Town, in 1979.

This article deals to a large extent with the activities of the author. However, it is important to acknowledge the contribution others made to my work. For example, it was a young marimba player in Kwazakhele, Port Elizabeth, who in 1983 developed a new playing method using additive rhythms, which he was using to accompanying the Sanctus (*Ungcwele*) in Xhosa composed by Joseph Mziwamadoda Singiswa. He and his colleagues proudly performed this for me. This new playing method spread like wildfire throughout the Xhosa church marimba

---

41 Kirby 1968, 44–46.
42 In my time with Lumko, I conducted around 24 marimba workshops, recording masses performed on marimbas as part of many of the workshops.
43 This song with marimba accompaniment may be heard as track 13 on the CD *African Sunday Marimba Mass*, one of the CDs of the collection Dargie 2000 to Present.
Figure 10. A marimba realisation of a song using 3-vs-2 cross-rhythm patterns. The players play by ear with much improvisation, not from score. The transcription in Figure 9 shows how the different marimba players may interpret their parts. Note how the soprano marimba player places melody tones with pulse delay, on the clap beats.
area, wonderfully transforming the music. Credit for developing exciting ways of playing the marimbas is due also to Amampondo and others of the new marimba groups. It was exciting for me to learn from people I had taught.

The downfall of apartheid undoubtedly allowed people to express their freedom in many new ways, including in their church music. When I presented the paper on “African Church Music and Liberation" at one of the ethnomusicology symposiums organized by Andrew Tracey, at the question time Tracey asked: “To what extent do some of the church people feel they need liberating from you? Your approach is to get them to do things for themselves, but there’s quite a resistance among a large number of church members. They’re really happy with the stuff they know.” My response included these words: “The way I see and justify my work is that it is part of liberating people from an oppressed mentality. Sometimes we don't like to be liberated, so if I am knocked on the head I won't be at all surprised.” I have not yet been knocked on the head, though on at least two occasions priests who had brought me in to teach some of the new songs were threatened by choir or congregation members that if that happened again, the church would be burned down.

**Working Directly for Heritage Preservation: Recording Traditional Music**

The key tool in conducting composition workshops is the tape (or other) recorder. It is essential not only to record the compositions themselves, but with group composition it is also necessary to record all the stages of the work of composing. Composers are able to build up their work by listening to the recordings of spoken texts. In the beginning, I had only the simplest of tape recorders, with a built-in microphone, but as the work progressed I was able, through Lumko, to get excellent audio recording equipment. However, I had only very limited opportunities to make video recordings.

My Lumko work took me all over Southern Africa, south of the Angola, Zimbabwe and Mozambique borders. Wherever I went for church-music work, I also tried to make opportunities to record traditional music. Sometimes I had excellent results with this. Many missionaries were most supportive of my work, and helped me to

---

44 Dargie 1984.

45 This question is included with the printed version of the paper, Dargie 1984, 12.

46 There were two main reasons for this: missionaries had taught their converts that African music was heathen, and that drums and other rhythm instruments were for use only by witch-doctors and indigenous churches – people incorrectly regarded as socially way beneath mainline church members. The second reason was that bringing in a change in the music used in church was a threat to the members of the choirs. Now the choirs could lose their glory as the emphasis passed to the music leaders in the congregation.

47 My Lumko budget was not large; my earnings were minimal. But it must be said that so far as possible I always made it a point to remunerate the traditional musicians I recorded.
make contact with traditional musicians. Brother Clement, for example, helped me to meet elderly traditional bow players, so that I could make unique recordings of Zulu music, including the last recordings made (as far as I know) of the most important traditional Zulu musical instrument, the *ugubhu* musical bow. The latest news from Brother Clement is that *ugubhu* is now sadly extinct in traditional Zulu music.

In 1979, looking for the uhadi musical bow, the Xhosa equivalent of *ugubhu*, in the Lumko district with the help of my colleague Fritz Lobinger, we found a woman in a nearby village who told us that she used to play uhadi, but she did not have to play it any more. Now we have the FM, she said – the radio. The radio, tape recordings and CDs have taken over places that used to be occupied by village musicians. This bow was once used by many South African peoples, but now only the Xhosa uhadi and possibly the Sotho version, *thomo*, are still extant. This trend was strongly in place before I began my work and before the “Lumko” marimbas were introduced. My “discovery” of the noted uhadi player Nofinishi Dywill undoubtedly sparked a revival of interest in uhadi and other musical bows in universities and with some popular music groups in the Xhosa area. Revived use of uhadi has moved parallel to the new interest in marimbas.

In my travels, I have been able to make recordings of rare instruments and even instruments not recorded before, but sadly many of these recordings may be the last-made as so many instruments and songs fall into disuse. The latest to come under severe threat are the Xhosa overtone singing techniques called “ordinary” umngqokolo and umngqokolo ngomqangi, which I had been the first outsider to document from 1980–1983. Only five performers of the amazing ngomqangi version are still known, and some of them have been ill.

I was able to record quite a lot of traditional music, just as so much of it began to fall into disuse. My documentation includes fairly large numbers of Xhosa and Zulu recordings in South Africa, with significant collections also in Tsonga and Northern Sotho. Other areas included are Southern Sotho, Tswana and Venda. I was the first musicologist to record Kavango music. I made a number of recordings of musical bows and mbira types, and also a great deal of sung music with drumming in traditional styles in the many Kavango workshop compositions I recorded on a number of workshop tours in Namibia. Other Namibian music in traditional styles I recorded among the Ovambo, Damara and Herero peoples. In addition, I made many recordings of music of the African Initiated Churches, mostly in Xhosa.

In 1996, after I had returned to South Africa, Franciscan Father Laurence Anselm Prior, then director of Lumko Institute, returned all my original recordings to me with the wish that I would be able to make good use of them. All my recordings,

---

48 As-yet undocumented instruments included the Kavango musical bow *lipuruboro* and the Jew’s Harp *ruwenge* (see Dargie 2013).

49 Dargie 2013.

50 A major reason for the emergence of these Churches was the desire to use their own culturally suitable music in worship (see Dargie 2010).
from the Lumko time and later, are now kept at the ILAM. All have been digitized by ILAM and are accessible through the Internet. Since 2000, I have been myself working on digitizing a selection of my audio recordings and all my Xhosa video recordings. The 47 audio CDs, one CD-ROM with photos and 9 DVDs compiled by me, together with 23 (so far) accompanying handbooks are now published by ILAM as the “Dave Dargie Collection.” Now all my recorded heritage material is accessible to students and musicologists world wide, as well as to the musicians themselves and their peoples.

The “Ngqoko Group”

As a result of my Xhosa music research, musicians of the Lumko area became publicly known and were invited to perform, first at musicology conferences in Grahamstown, and then further afield. This led musicians of Ngqoko51 village next to Lumko establishing the renowned Ngqoko Traditional Xhosa Music Ensemble, which has performed many times in America and Europe.

A Statement of Policy at the University of Fort Hare Music Department

In 1984, at a culture festival at the University of Fort Hare in Alice, I met a former Rhodes University student of mine who was then working at the Fort Hare music department. He told me that the professor of music maintained that African music and jazz have no place in a university. I resolved that if ever I got the chance to put the matter right, I would take the opportunity. The opportunity came in 1994 when a friend of mine working at Fort Hare sent me a message that Fort Hare was looking for a professor and head for the music department.

In 1988, I visited Munich in Germany to do some church music work for a Catholic organization there. In 1989, I left Lumko, and feeling that I could no longer live with apartheid, went to Germany where in 1991 I married a lady I had met in 1988.52 From 1989 to 1994 I lived in Munich, one of nearly forty ethnomusicologists in Germany without a full-time job. I began to prepare teaching materials, using my Lumko recordings and preparing written materials on the music. Then in 1994, with great joy, I stood in line at the South African consulate to vote at last for a democratically elected president of South Africa. Then came the opportunity I had hoped for, to change the music-teaching situation at Fort Hare. I applied for the

51 Members of the Ngqoko Group have been able to earn money by their performing tours. Some tours have enabled them to build houses for themselves in the village. The Group may be heard and seen in the recordings of the “Dargie Collection.”

52 In time the Catholic Church recognised our marriage, so that I can still do music work for the church.
vacant position there, was invited to an interview at Alice, and flew out with an uhadi bow that I had made in Germany. In the interview I was asked what aims I might have for the music department. I stated my firm intention of bringing Xhosa and other African musics into Fort Hare, and as an example took up my uhadi, and sang an uhadi version of the ancient “Song of Ntsikana the Prophet” that I had recorded in 1981.\textsuperscript{53} Fortunately a number of the interviewing committee were Xhosa people, and therefore knew about Ntsikana. I was not dismissed as crazy, but was offered the job.

\section*{Changing the Direction of the Fort Hare Music Department}

When I arrived at Fort Hare in January 1995, the department had been without a professor for some years. There were three lecturers, one of whom left very soon and another, somewhat later. The department offered a Bachelor of Pedagogy degree, a teaching qualification. One major subject could be music, the other either music education or a non-music subject. Graduates were far more likely to get teaching positions in non-music subjects – music teaching posts in schools were rare indeed. Fortunately, the process had already been started to move the music department from the faculty of education to the faculty of humanities. When this happened, we were able to convert our degree to a BA in music with two music major courses, “Music” and “Choral Music.” Subsidiary courses for the degree included other humanities courses up to second year; a third (non-music) major course was also allowed. After graduating, students could then do a diploma in teaching, but even with that the students’ hopes for teaching positions lay with their minor non-music subjects.

By 1997, Fort Hare had developed severe financial problems. The university narrowly escaped being closed by the government. A new vice-chancellor was appointed who in time brought the financial situation under control, but the pressure on small, “non-viable” departments such as music was great.

Fortunately, a set of “Lumko” marimbas had been obtained by the department some time before 1995. They had stood unused until in 1995 I began teaching students to play them, using mostly the Lumko marimba church songs. The students, perhaps all members of Christian churches, had no problem with this. We concentrated especially on the church versions of two of Ntsikana’s songs (the “Bell” and the “Great Hymn”).\textsuperscript{54} I managed to persuade the university choir, which at that time had no connection with the music department, to let us accompany them at university occasions, especially graduations, singing Ntsikana’s songs and other religious songs. The high point came at the first graduation at which Prof. Derek

\textsuperscript{53} Dargie 1988, 203–204.
\textsuperscript{54} Dargie 1988, 199.
Swartz, the new vice-chancellor, presided. In his speech, he told about the effort that was being made to rescue Fort Hare, and said that when he heard Ntsikana's Song with the marimbas, it sounded so fine that he knew that the university would be saved. And also the Music Department, I said to myself.

At times, there were only two of us teaching in the department. The syllabus focused mainly on Western music, the only subject of particular African interest being choral music. The students' efforts at performance of Western music fell very short, with minor success only in singing. In music theory the highest achieved in recent times (by only one student) was at Grade 6 level – below school matriculation level. Yet the students showed great talent in singing and harmonizing and even teaching African songs, and were doing very well with marimba playing. It was clearly time to re-orient the teaching focus.

In 1998, I introduced the first changes in the official music syllabus, and completed the process in 1999. Andrew Tracey, who served as adjudicator for the new syllabus, commented that it was the "most Africa-orientated in any South African university." That was a very positive step forward from the situation in 1984.

At Lumko, I had begun to try to teach music in a way based on tradition. The first marimba group I taught at Lumko was composed of four boys about fourteen

---

55 The quotation is from Tracey’s adjudicator’s report on the proposed new Fort Hare music syllabi.
years of age. They had had no experience at all of keyboard instruments, or any instruments that had a visual link between order of pitches and ways of producing those pitches. I worked with them as I would have worked (orally) with a group of European youngsters: this note is C, the chord is C-E-G, and so on. It went painfully slowly. After more than half-a-year at last they could accompany an entire marimba mass. Then a mission close to Lumko obtained a set of marimbas. Instead of teaching that group myself, I arranged that our young group should go there and teach, allowing the new players to experience the songs as full performances. After two weekends, the new group could accompany the whole marimba mass. It was based on this and other experiences that I developed ideas on an African theory of music education. As much as I could, I put these ideas into practice at Fort Hare.

In 2000, my wife had to return to Germany. At the beginning of 2001, I went onto part-time contract with Fort Hare so that I could live most of the time with my wife, and arranged that another full-time head of department be brought in. The third of these (in 2007) was Bernhard Bleibinger. The situation now is that, under Bleibinger, the department has gone from strength to strength. A former student of mine from the 1990s, Jonathan Ncozana, is on the staff teaching African music, with students continuing to learn traditional Xhosa instruments and marimbas by observation and imitation.

In Conclusion

Angela Impey has this to say about applied ethnomusicology in South Africa:

Applied or advocacy ethnomusicology has yet to be developed as a formal sub-field in South Africa, yet researchers of music have the advantage of being at the forefront of a social reconstruction impetus that provides opportunities for relevant social engagement, the modelling of research foci, the expansion of multidisciplinary applications and the utilisation of participatory methodologies that have yet to be explored in research or performance.

I believe that my work, described in this article, falls within the parameters outlined by Impey. I was a bit ahead of the time referred to by Impey: the early years of a democratic South Africa. Nevertheless, when I was working for Lumko the Freedom Struggle was preparing the way for the “New South Africa,” and the

56 Dargie 1996.
57 Bleibinger has been able to broaden the aims and achievements of the music department, with music now taught in Alice and in East London, and a B.Mus. degree now offered in East London. It is most uplifting to see a number of lecturers teaching a variety of courses, way beyond the possibilities of my time as head of department.
58 Sadly, at the time of revising this article (March 2016), Fort Hare has again been experiencing major financial difficulties and things have not been going as well as hoped in the music department.
1994 South African election was a springboard for my work at Fort Hare. I believe my work played its part, at least in a small way, in social reconstruction, that what I did was an expression of social engagement. I believe also that my work fits into the pattern of ideals and objectives mentioned in the definitions for applied ethnomusicology offered in the introduction. Through my church music work, ordinary church members were enabled to create their own music for worship. Traditional and other musicians found ways to earn money through their music. The heritage left by many traditional musicians will not be lost. Today, many seem to think that marimbas are a normal part of the South African music scene. I am deeply grateful that I had opportunities to do the musical work I did. I did not create the opportunities, and I can claim little credit for what happened when I was turned to follow new musicological paths. But I do not regret having to put my own creative music aspirations aside. This is my ethnomusicological apologia.

References


Dargie, D. 2000 to Present. The “Dave Dargie Collection” series of CDs, DVDs and handbooks. Grahamstown: ILAM.


PCXR (Prayerbook Commission of the Pastoral Conference of the Xhosa Region) n.d. *Bongan’ iNkosi, iNcwadi yeMithandazo namaCulo yeBandla lamaKatolike aseRoma* [Bongan’ iNkosi, Book of Prayers and Hymns of the Roman Catholic Church]. Queenstown: Pastoral Conference of the Xhosa Region.


Society for Ethnomusicology 2016. Applied Ethnomusicology Section. <ethnomusicology.org/?Groups_SectionsAE> (visited 8 February 2016)


Institutions II
SELF-ORGANIZED INSTITUTIONS
Uploading Matepe: Online Learning, Sustainability and Repatriation in Northeastern Zimbabwe

Jocelyn Moon
University of Washington, USA

This article investigates the growth of a small online learning community interested in matepe music, an mbira type traditionally played in Northeastern Zimbabwe and adjacent areas in Mozambique. I demonstrate how informal online learning has led to the development of participatory online spaces where new media and archival resources are shared and discussed. I put these activities in conversation with national arts policy and recent national and multinational online sustainability initiatives in order to highlight some of the advantages and insights that come from operating outside of a top-down framework. I aim to show the necessity of online and offline continuity by touching upon the ways in which online collaborative networks that are based on learning impact on-the-ground efforts of sustainability and repatriation.

In a 2013 report on the status of the Zimbabwean arts and culture industry, arts activist Paul Brickhill asserts that over 90% of the creative sector economy is made up of “arts practitioners,” or those who operate independently from the government in order to avoid excessive taxes and regulations. In the absence of coordinated state efforts, available resources or an appropriate infrastructure to support the growth of local creative industries, musicians and other artists have learned to cultivate “thousands of small, direct social ‘connections’ into Europe, USA, Canada, Australia, Japan, South Africa and elsewhere, bringing all manner of opportunities for sales, touring, help, loans, gifts, exposure, marketing; through

1 Paul Roger Brickhill (b.1958 d. 2014) was a much-beloved promoter of arts and culture in Zimbabwe. He was the founder of the world-renowned Book Cafe venue as well as parent NGO Pamberi Trust. Since the 1990s, these organizations have hosted over 10,000 shows and events in the capital city of Harare, and have had a lasting impact on the growth of local music scenes and the careers of numerous musicians.
2 In Eveleigh 2013, 64.
Jocelyn Moon

diaspora connections or well-wishers.”

Brickhill emphasizes the agency of the artists when he states that Zimbabwean and African arts practitioners in general are “exceptionally gifted at networking in this way.” This strategy has been key to the livelihood of musicians, from afrojazz players to spoken word poets to mbira ensembles, especially in areas of Zimbabwe beyond the capital city of Harare, where there is very little access to state resources as well as coordinated top-down foreign investments through NGOs.

In this article, I focus on how the translocal social connections that Brickhill describes contribute to the sustainability of marginalized music traditions in Zimbabwe that are disconnected from top-down support, primarily functioning outside of national arts and culture policies. I am specifically interested in how social networking raises the awareness and status of particular music traditions of rural Northeastern Zimbabwe that are associated with matepe, an instrument that has strong associations to traditional religious practices of ancestral spirit veneration. Since 2008, matepe’s emerging presence online has contributed to the formation of networks that engage a small contingent of Zimbabweans, Zimbabweans in diaspora, and other scholars and musicians, myself included, who are specifically interested in learning how to play matepe music. Online interest and activity do lead to some economic opportunities for Zimbabwean musicians via the global market, but they also function as a means to learn traditional repertoire, build community through dialogue and resource-sharing, increase the visibility of marginalized cultural groups, and address religious and social stigma associated not just with matepe, but with Zimbabwean mbira traditions more generally.

Extending beyond Zimbabwean contexts, this case study provides a valuable contribution to dialogue about evolving approaches to sustaining music cultures and safeguarding cultural heritage that are influenced by UNESCO guidelines. In the foreword to the 2010 volume on Heritage and Globalisation, heritage studies specialists William Logan and Laurajane Smith highlight the importance of recognizing more fully that “heritage protection does not depend alone on top-down interventions by governments or the expert actions of heritage industry professionals, but must involve local communities and communities of interest.” These considerations have led to new and evolving strategies of incorporating local communities in safeguarding processes, with an emphasis on the DIY creation of “born digital” media. The 2003 UNESCO Convention for the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage has increasingly manifest in the form of nationally driven

3 Eveleigh ibid., 69.
4 Eveleigh ibid., 69.
5 To the best of my knowledge, any financial opportunities for Zimbabwean matepe players that result from online activity seem to occur “indirectly,” not through online exchanges themselves. For example, matepe players may benefit from online visibility and consequently have more requests to purchase instruments, or they may have an increase in students seeking in-person instruction.
6 Logan and Smith 2010, xi–xii.
7 UNESCO 2003a.
digital heritage projects that utilize participatory methodologies to produce online community-generated archives. Although the collaborative approaches of these projects offer promising new directions, the implementation of top-down policy and application of external value systems associated with UNESCO continue to be problematized. An analysis of activities surrounding matepe online therefore offers a much-needed example of related methodologies that operate independently from national agendas and in the absence of safeguarding discourse.

A key element in the "production, consumption and engagement with heritage" related to matepe music is a consistent emphasis on learning how to play. I argue that utilizing digital resources for the purpose of learning uses a mode of engagement that is more participatory than presentational because it requires repeated and attentive listening to recordings and careful study of related text and transcriptions. Ultimately, I hope to show that learning from digital resources is less focused on the digital products themselves, but rather leads to music-making in various contexts outside of the online environment. To demonstrate this, I begin with the growth of matepe online and the ways in which learning from new media has enabled a renewed interest in archival recordings from the International Library of African Music (ILAM) as well as an increase in their accessibility via processes of convergence and narrative connection. I then relate matepe online to emerging born digital heritage projects that are influenced by UNESCO policy in order to offer insight on the implications of not operating as a centralized, policy-based initiative.

In the last section, I stress the importance of making connections between online and offline contexts. I explore how online learning leads to the creation of "collaborative networks" between academic archives, culture-bearers and online learners in order to address overarching issues of access and agency. I am particularly interested in how online learners are able to bridge the gap between online and on-the-ground activities by connecting with culture-bearers in rural areas who have essentially no means of directly participating in the online environment themselves. These connections provide a measure of continuity between various offline contexts as well, by prompting face-to-face conversations that consider the diverse perspectives of culture-bearers and their strategies of addressing barriers of religious and social stigmas.

My approach to digital ethnography in this case study engages major streams and ideas about matepe music that take place across multiple social media platforms, websites and offline contexts. I do this in part to respond to what heritage studies expert Elisa Giaccardi identifies as a need to understand the broader impact of emerging communications technologies on heritage construction by investigating how individual’s engage with cultural heritage “in the context of their own lives and in association with the unique character of the places and communities in which

---

8 e.g., Hennessy 2012, Marschall 2014.
9 Logan and Smith ibid., xii.
10 Seeger 2002a.
heritage comes to matter.”11 I draw from research in cultural heritage, archiving and ethnomusicology to understand the “complex online-offline dynamics”12 of strategies pertaining to the sustainability of matepe music. This case study may furthermore provide some ideas on how to investigate the impact of online cultural sustainability and safeguarding initiatives in terms of how they translate to contexts beyond the constructed environment of project webpages and/or platforms.

A critical point in this study is the need to address the roles of culture-bearers who are influenced by a persistent digital divide. Whereas cultural studies specialist Piia Varis suggests that “the lives of people with little or no digital engagement are influenced by the very absence of [Internet or device access] for communication,”13 I show here that online-offline dynamics must also consider the agency of those individuals with little-to-no Internet access and the ways in which they negotiate their online presence. As online safeguarding and sustainability projects continue to encourage “user-generated” audiovisual recordings to be uploaded and shared online without traditional archival safeguarding mechanisms in place, it becomes increasingly important to consider the intentions of culture-bearers without online access, especially if they are featured in these recordings. My own role and perspective as an applied ethnomusicologist is informed by a decade of playing, performing and teaching marimba and mbira music among the Zimbabwean-music community in the Pacific Northwest United States. The research would not be possible without the community music experiences and connections that initially inspired my interest in ethnomusicology and introduced me to matepe music. This study is based on four years of research surrounding matepe online and a preliminary trip to Zimbabwe in 2014; it will serve as the foundation of my doctoral dissertation research in Zimbabwe during 2016–2017.

Online Learning

In their 2012 article, “We’re All Archivists Now,” Carolyn Landau and Janet Topp Fargion assert that the digital revolution has shifted archival policies concerning access and dissemination to the point where “archives are no longer for the ‘-ologists’ but for all learners, including the people whose cultures are represented in them wherever they are in the world.”14 The authors speak to the ways in which digital media and the Internet have increased the relevance of archival materials while also creating new challenges and responsibilities as archives attempt to reach out and respond to diverse global audiences. In this section, I focus on the activities of the “learners” of matepe music, which include community musicians, culture-bearers

11 Giaccardi 2012, 2.
12 Varis 2016.
13 Varis ibid., 61.
14 Landau and Fargion 2012, 128.
and ethnomusicologists, and how they utilize and reference archival materials in online spaces such as YouTube, Facebook and discussion forums. I demonstrate how online learners transform the social relevance of archival recordings by putting them in conversation with present-day music practices via online dialogue and the creation of newly recorded materials.

Matepe, also known as madhebe and/or hera, is a mbira type historically played by the Sena-Tonga, Buja and Korekore peoples of Northeastern Zimbabwe and adjacent areas across the Zimbabwe-Mozambique border. Although the family of instruments called mbira have come to symbolize the musical cultures of Zimbabwe at a national level, marginalized mbira types such as mbira dzavaNdau and matepe are relatively unknown around Zimbabwe in comparison to more popular instruments such as mbira nhare (also called mbira dzavadzimu) and nyunga nyunga mbira. The rise in popularity of mbira nhare is discussed at length by Turino, who identifies a bias towards music cultures that were proximal to the capital city of Harare during the development of the nationalist movement, especially those music and dance traditions associated with the Shona-Zezuru ethnicity. Matepe music cultures are associated with Shona ethnic groups based in the rural Northeastern outskirts of the country, including the Korekore and Buja. Matepe is also practiced among ethnic groups such as the Sena-Tonga and Marembe that fall under the fringes of the Shona “supertribal” national umbrella but also have strong ties across the Zimbabwe/Mozambique border. Based on the relative geographic and ethnic marginalization of matepe music, it remains largely outside of the Zimbabwean national imagination and outside of school, church and festival contexts.

From the 1970s to the 1990s, matepe became known to a growing international audience that was interested in Zimbabwean music by way of several brief references in Paul Berliner’s seminal ethnography, *The Soul of Mbira*, which features a matepe song titled, “Kuyadya Hove Kune Mazowe” in the book’s accompanying set of field recordings. Corresponding to music trends within Zimbabwe, both academics and community musicians abroad at this time were primarily interested in playing the increasingly popular mbira nhare, with only a limited awareness of matepe music. In 1999 and again in 2002-2003, musician Chaka Chawasarira provided the first opportunities for many Americans to experience matepe music in a live setting.

---

15 Tracey 1970.
16 Although mbira dzavadzimu or mbira “of the spirits” is the more widely accepted name of the aforementioned instrument in foreign community music and academic contexts, I choose to refer to it here as mbira nhare, a label commonly used by Zimbabwean musicians and academics as well as prominent Zimbabwean NGOs such as Mbira Centre. I adopt this label primarily to emphasize that mbira nhare is not the only mbira used for ancestral spirit veneration, as matepe plays a key role in spirit possession ceremonies as well.
18 By this comment I mean to reflect the standpoint of the musicians I worked with in Nyamapanda, Zimbabwe, who identify as Marembe, which is also the name of the language they speak.
19 Msindo 2012.
20 Berliner 1978.
setting during the “Soul of Mbira: Mbira Masters of Zimbabwe” tour,\textsuperscript{21} followed by his year-long residency as Visiting Artist at the University of Washington School of Music in Seattle. It was not until about five years after Chawasarira had returned to Zimbabwe, that his student, Texas-based musician Joel Laviolette, rekindled an interest in matepe by developing an online forum\textsuperscript{22} where participants could learn from videos and transcriptions, share knowledge and resources, and discuss their personal experiences with matepe music.\textsuperscript{23}

Within this new online context, several key resources began to make their way into the hands of aspiring matepe players. Andrew Tracey’s article, “The Matepe Mbira Music of Rhodesia,” published in 1970, was posted with Tracey’s permission on Laviolette’s Rattletree forum as a free, accessible resource. The article includes information on how to build and tune a matepe and nearly ten pages of detailed transcriptions of matepe songs, accompanying shaker patterns and vocal lines. Andrew Tracey’s corresponding 1969 matepe recordings from the International Library of African Music’s (ILAM) Sound of Africa Series have become an essential sonic reference that allows online learners to interpret the article’s prescriptive notation. These field recordings fit into a larger, more diverse collection of approximately thirty-five tracks of matepe music from ILAM, recorded by Hugh and Andrew Tracey from the 1930s to the 1970s.

Fargion argues that the value of archival recordings largely depends upon the intentions of the collector in creating a resource for future use rather than simply documenting music for “their own research purposes.”\textsuperscript{24} Both Hugh and Andrew Tracey’s intentions to create resources for cultural revitalization are evident in their writing and recording process. Recent director of ILAM Diane Thram writes how “working under the ‘collect and classify’ paradigm of his time, Hugh Tracey was motivated, beyond a ‘salvage’ mission, to document and preserve African music for future generations of Africans.”\textsuperscript{25} In response to the rapid loss of cultural diversity in Southern and East Africa during an era of colonial development, forced labor and migration, Hugh Tracey’s vision for the ILAM archival collections was not only intended for later use as scholarly material for “armchair” analysis, but specifically as a means of revitalizing cultural heritage through the learning process itself.\textsuperscript{26}

Since 2008, the online environment has helped to create virtual spaces where archival materials of matepe music are used by individuals to learn how to play the instrument. For example, in order to bridge the gap between Andrew Tracey’s

\begin{flushleft}
\textsuperscript{21} The 1999 US Soul of Mbira Tour was organized by Paul Berliner to feature some of the music that was discussed in his book. The performances highlighted the work of five artists, including Beauler Dyoko, Hakurotwi Mude, Cosmas Magaya, Simon Magaya and Chaka Chawasarira.\\
\textsuperscript{22} Rattletree Marimba 2008. References to online sources are accurate as of 23 May 2016\\
\textsuperscript{23} Laviolette spearheaded this online dialogue based on his experiences learning from Chawasarira for several years while living in Zimbabwe.\\
\textsuperscript{24} Fargion 2009, 86.\\
\textsuperscript{25} Thram 2014, 317.\\
\textsuperscript{26} Thram ibid., 317.
\end{flushleft}
transcriptions and the corresponding ILAM field recordings, online learners have posted YouTube videos of themselves playing matepe with close-up views of the keys so others can, in turn, learn more easily from these audiovisual recordings. In this way, resource-sharing online has become a means to breathe new life into archival holdings and disseminate learning materials in a more accessible form.

The digitization and dissemination of archival materials has allowed online users to creatively converge song transcriptions as well as reel-to-reel recordings with born digital media content. According to media studies specialist Henry Jenkins, the process of media convergence, or when “old and new media collide,” takes place when consumers “seek out new information and make connections among dispersed media content.”27 Jenkins stresses that although “digitization set the conditions for convergence,” the process should not be viewed as primarily technological, but rather as representative of a cultural shift towards a more participatory culture that stands in contrast to “older notions of passive media spectatorship.”28 Dagny Stuedahl applies this concept to the field of heritage studies, asserting that convergence allows present-day audiences to interact with heritage content in new ways as well as publicly voice their “expectations about access and interactions” in regard to institutional collections.29

Stuedahl argues that digital media, especially in the context of online social networking sites, has allowed the formation of multiple and diverse “narrative connections” between public audiences and cultural heritage collections. Rather than maintaining a focus on the content of these collections, Stuedahl claims that heritage institutions such as museums now focus on “learning and experience as part of new communicative practices”.30 Although ILAM’s digitized collections have become increasingly accessible to online learners via their website,31 the narrative component of the matepe recordings take place within social media platforms like YouTube and Facebook, where dialogue and convergence with born digital media can occur. These sites encourage participation based on familiarity and accessibility, as links to videos and conversations can be uncovered easily with one-word Internet searches (e.g., “matepe”) and posts can be embedded and shared in other social media platforms. This online visibility and dialogue outside of the archival domain contributes to increased public awareness and interest in existing archival resources.

Archives are adapting to changing relationships between people and place, as they must respond to the growing number of culture-bearers who no longer reside in areas that neatly correspond to geographically based archive catalogues. The online learning environment has been a means to spark dialogue with culture-

27 Jenkins 2006, 3.
28 Jenkins ibid., 3–11.
29 Stuedahl 2009, 5.
30 Stuedahl ibid., 5.
bearers in the diaspora, including UK-based Rattletree user “Ndikiye,” who posted on the Rattletree forum in 2009 about his concern over the declining number of culture-bearers who have first-hand knowledge of matepe music traditions. Based on the lack of available teachers, he asserts the importance of online accessibility in revitalizing the music practices of such a challenging instrument, stating that “more players will be able to play it only if they have access to the resources,” including the ones featured on the Rattletree website.32

Ndikiye’s words add a narrative layer to the online matepe media, as he draws from his personal experiences to emphasize the necessity of accessible learning resources as a step towards the continuation of matepe music both within and beyond Zimbabwe’s borders. After four years of researching matepe, I know of less than ten master musicians in Zimbabwe who play the instrument. I would estimate that there are upwards of thirty or forty players worldwide who are utilizing online resources to learn matepe, with still more who are actively engaged in watching and discussing video postings. On Laviolette’s Rattletree forum, for example, although there are only about a dozen users who have directly contributed to the dialogue, over 22,000 views appear on some of the discussion threads about matepe. Participants continue to read these conversations even though the website is no longer open for any further postings as of 2012, when the dialogue shifted more exclusively into the form of Facebook and YouTube comments. This shift occurred primarily in response to the YouTube posts of Japanese anthropologist and musician Yuji Matsuhira, who initially uploaded two videos in December 2011 of the Zonke-Tsonga family of Nyamapanda, Zimbabwe playing matepe. Matsuhira’s posts, along with a full-length album of the musicians, provided the first published recordings of matepe in a community music setting since forty years prior. These videos have not only re-focused the content of some online materials to feature culture-bearers, but have also sparked further interest from Zimbabweans online.

**Sustainability and Safeguarding Online**

The growth of accessible and collaborative online spaces focused on matepe music parallels much broader trends in heritage studies, archiving and ethnomusicology that seek to “participate, to partner and to engender trust for mutual benefit.”33 Online platforms for digital resource sharing in particular have become popular as collaborative tools for repatriation, cultural revitalization and large-scale safeguarding and sustainability projects that involve partnerships between various government and academic organizations, community groups and NGOs. My aim is to situate the case study of matepe music within a larger context of UNESCO-influenced Intangible Cultural Heritage (ICH) management

32 Discussion thread on Rattletree Marimba 2008.
33 Landau and Fargion 2012, 137.
initiatives. The approaches I discuss are shaped by the UNESCO *Convention for the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage* as well as the UNESCO *Charter on the Preservation of the Digital Heritage* that support an increasingly practitioner-centric model of heritage management through the use of online digital technology.

The 5-year, multi-million dollar project *Sustainable Futures for Music Cultures*, for example, launched the soundfutures.org website to encourage dialogue between culture-bearers globally so they are empowered to “forge musical futures on their own terms.” A number of national policy initiatives that operate under the UNESCO safeguarding paradigm have also begun to embrace a grassroots, participatory approach towards inventorying ICH through the creation of digital heritage archives. For instance, emerging online ICH initiatives such as Korea’s ichpedia.org and the South African eNanda project found at enanda.co.za emphasize the value of user-generated media as means to prioritize the contributions of culture-bearers. Park describes the development of Korea’s Ichpedia project as a “web-based ICH encyclopedia and archive” that is part of a “new paradigm of safeguarding methods” that uses recording technology and interactive digital platforms in order to demonstrate the dynamic nature of cultural heritage. Through direct access to the online system along with technical support, Korean ICH communities are able to create and upload material that they deem significant. The Ichpedia design therefore encourages culture-bearers to become leaders and collaborators in the endeavor.

Project developers involved in national ICH initiatives report that in addition to various practical barriers such as limited user participation and ongoing needs of website maintenance, there are persistent concerns regarding the local impact of an external value system that is based on UNESCO’s conceptualization of heritage and its subsequent strategies of heritage management. Heritage studies expert Chiara Bortolotto has written at length about this issue, explaining that “while UNESCO celebrates the diversity of content (the elements of heritage to be safeguarded), it enforces common codes, categories and values because it operates through a common scheme.” Despite new developments in collaborative methodologies outlined in the 2003 convention, Bortolotto argues that “the concrete

---

34 UNESCO 2003b.
35 UNESCO 2003a.
36 Sound Futures 2014.
37 Schippers 2010, 159.
38 Ichpedia 2015.
39 eNanda Online 2016.
40 e.g., Park 2014, Marschall 2014.
41 Park ibid., 71.
42 Park ibid., 71.
43 Bortolotto 2012, 266.
empowerment of grassroots communities, as put forth by the bottom-up ICH approach” is “considerably weakened” because the UNESCO system continues to operate through top-down mechanisms of heritage recognition.\(^4^4\)

Sabine Marschall, professor in cultural and heritage tourism, builds on Bortolotto’s ideas to demonstrate how UNESCO guidelines and national policy manifest in the context of eNanda, a collaborative heritage website directed towards safeguarding ICH in Inanda, South Africa.\(^4^5\) Marschall argues that despite a number of benefits that residents gain from participating in the digital heritage project, it nevertheless “facilitates the ‘heritagisation’ of lived local culture,” in the process, which occurs when people begin to think about their own lived culture as a form of heritage that needs to be preserved.\(^4^6\) She contends that safeguarding can therefore have a potentially negative influence on ICH communities by altering local views about change and innovation in living traditions and how they relate to the past.\(^4^7\)

The Sustainable Futures for Music Cultures project departs from UNESCO’s safeguarding paradigm by applying a more holistic strategy that focuses on the sustainability of musical ecosystems.\(^4^8\) Although the initiative is informed by UNESCO guidelines, it is not limited to discussions of Intangible Cultural Heritage. Rather, Sustainable Futures diversifies the discourse on ICH by considering a number of contributing factors to the sustainability of music genres, including the impact of ethnomusicologists, media and the Internet, ways of learning, diaspora and cross-cultural connections, the role of archives, etc.\(^4^9\) This shift in ideology draws heavily from theoretical considerations in ethnomusicology that frame music cultures as adaptive living systems that are continuously changing through processes of innovation rather than rooted primarily in their “past glory.”\(^5^0\) Although I support the direction of these ideas in relationship to notions of safeguarding heritage and adopt the concept of sustainability in order to discuss the status of matepe music, it is significant to note that this essay will likely be the first online resource that describes matepe music in these terms.

In the absence of a concrete framework enforced by a centralized project, top-down policy or external funding, matepe online is largely devoid of terminology such as preservation, safeguarding or sustainability. Although dialogue and resources are scattered around the Internet rather than housed in a designated website directed towards sustainability or safeguarding, discussions about cultural loss, systems of learning and strategies for revitalization do take place. I argue that the multipurpose and familiar space of popular social networking sites facilitates the inclusion of

\(^4^4\) Bortolotto ibid., 98.
\(^4^5\) Marschall 2014.
\(^4^6\) Marschall ibid., 121.
\(^4^7\) Marschall ibid., 121.
\(^4^8\) Schippers 2015.
\(^4^9\) Schippers ibid., 141.
\(^5^0\) Titon 2010, 710.
diverse viewpoints from participants that are able to contribute in a manner of their own choosing without conforming to a predetermined framework. This has allowed a distinct theme of music learning to emerge from the conversations and videos featuring matepe music. I do not mean to say that a model of music learning works across the board for other contexts, but rather that we need to consider diverse approaches to sustainability that are not driven by top-down initiatives.

While dialogue and resource sharing on social networking sites may provide more visibility and a flexible platform for participation, an underlying issue with all of the projects I have described involves issues of access to these online spaces. Indeed the attention to learning matepe music through videos, recordings and transcriptions suggests that many online users are not situated in communities where they have in-person access to experienced musicians and teachers. Marschall problematizes online collaborative inventorying projects of ICH in rural African contexts, as she claims that these are often the places where residents have very limited access to computers and the Internet. She asserts that “digital technology and the storage and sharing of data through the Internet are often associated with inclusiveness and the democratisation of knowledge, but these technologies are also associated with exclusion and limitations of access in their own right, especially in developing world contexts.”

Whereas online safeguarding and sustainability initiatives are built on the premise that Internet access worldwide continues to increase, especially via developments in affordable cell-phone technology, it is nevertheless important to discuss present-day levels of access. YouTube analytics suggest that the majority of YouTube viewers accessing matepe videos are located in the US, Japan, the UK and South Africa, respectively, which—with the exception of Japan—are all regions that correspond to large diasporic populations of Zimbabweans. Culture-bearers who reside in urban Zimbabwean areas also emphasize the importance of these videos. For example, Harare-based musician Kuda Nyaruwabvu, who is originally from Mutoko, explained that he uses the videos to show his co-workers about the rural Northeast because “very few in the country know about the culture of this place.” In my experiences, the rural Northeastern areas where matepe music cultures are based currently have little to no access to online social networking sites. Internet browsing is only accessible in Nyamapanda using devices that can connect to 3G services. This method of access is expensive and many residents in the area do not yet own the type of phone necessary to stream YouTube videos or access Facebook online.

51 Marschall ibid.
52 Marschall ibid., 127.
53 These statistics are based primarily on a YouTube channel that was created by Google+ user Zack Moon and includes both “learning progress” videos as well as videos of the Zonke-Tsonga family. The statistics are supported by the YouTube channel analytics of users Matsuhira Yuji and Rattletree based on conversations with Yuji Matsuhira and Joel Laviolette in 2014.
54 Email, K. Nyaruwabvu, 30 April 2014.
Even though many master matepe players are not able to access the Internet directly, online learners have helped to fuel the connections between online and offline contexts, as they seek to play matepe music with others. This is despite the fact that matepe is especially well-suited for playing alone. The instrument's extremely low bass notes and prominent overtones produce such a full sound that players often report how “one matepe is enough”\textsuperscript{55}. One instrument, rather than two or more, can produce the hocketing effect that is characteristic of Zimbabwean mbira music.\textsuperscript{56} Andrew Tracey describes how “the volume and richness of sound coming out of three or four matepe,” in comparison, however, is “incomparable” to other mbira based on the range and depth of matepe's distinct sound.\textsuperscript{57}

When I asked Andrew Tracey to respond to online learning of matepe, he said, “I think it’s good, but [...] one has a responsibility to the people whose music it is and I think just making the sound of their music is not enough, you have to go there and [get] the full experience.”\textsuperscript{58} This perspective is echoed among aspiring matepe players such as American musician Jeff Brahe who expressed how learning the music online is not really learning the music to its fullest, but rather playing “out of context” and in some ways, preparing to play with musicians who have grown up with this music.\textsuperscript{59} In 2011, when Yuji Matsuhira posted videos of the Zonke-Tsonga family, he provided online learners with much more than just another learning resource, as the videos include contact information that invites the viewer to travel to a specific place, meet specific musicians and experience the music first hand. Since that time, individuals such as my husband, Zack Moon,\textsuperscript{60} and I, have travelled specifically to Nyamapanda to learn matepe from the Zonke-Tsonga family.

### Collaborative Networks On-the-ground

A four hour \textit{kombi} ride from the capital city of Harare to the rural Northeastern corner of Zimbabwe will take you as far as the Nyamapanda border region where several matepe players of the Zonke-Tsonga family reside. The rural landscape, brick huts

\textsuperscript{55} Tracey 1970, 49.  
\textsuperscript{56} Paul Berliner notes that matepe’s characteristically full sound is thought to have resulted from the desire for a single performer to play “all the different parts of a ngororombe panpipe ensemble” (1978, 23), which is a music tradition occurring in regions where matepe is played. One can hear how the matepe sounds like an “ensemble” based on the prominent overtones of the instrument as well as the three keys (typically) that comprise an additional upper left-hand register on the instrument. Consequently, players use four fingers (two thumbs and two index fingers) rather than three as is used in mbira nhare. This adds a significant level of difficulty to the playing technique.  
\textsuperscript{57} Tracey ibid., 49.  
\textsuperscript{58} Tracey 2014.  
\textsuperscript{59} Brahe 2014.  
\textsuperscript{60} Zack Moon continues to play a central role in this project, as he was the first one to introduce me to matepe music from his own perspective as an online learner. He stands as my research partner in this endeavor, offering insight based on his many years of experience participating in Zimbabwean-music communities of the Pacific Northwest of the USA as well as 10+ years of experience as an mbira nhare player.
and striking silhouettes of the baobab trees provide a feeling of remoteness relative to the high-density suburbs of the capital. Nonetheless, connections to the political, economic and cultural center of the state are inscribed prominently in the scene. These include a strong police presence in and around the shops that line the main road leading up to Zimbabwe’s second largest border post, and the road itself, which is situated on a widely traveled route between Malawi and South Africa. The sounds of the country’s latest zimdancehall, urban grooves and Christian gospel hits are also carried over the main road by kombi sound-systems and along the dirt footpaths through young residents’ personal MP3 players.

The Nyamapanda shops are configured as a truck stop rather than a tourist destination, with little indication of the rich dance, drumming and mbira traditions that characterize this region. Ethnomusicologist Jennifer Kyker argues that music and dance traditions from rural Northeastern Zimbabwe in particular are “largely invisible in recordings, archives, and scholarly and popular writings.” The music traditions of Nyamapanda, located within the greater Tsonga Village area in Mudzi district, are no exception. National media sources focus on the Nyamapanda border-crossing as a dangerous outpost that struggles with ongoing issues associated with prostitution, drug smuggling and human trafficking, with very little attention paid to the Sena-Tonga ethnic groups who live in the surrounding rural areas. The online visibility that has developed in social networking sites, however limited, therefore provides an important means of cultivating a widespread awareness of the matepe music cultures of Northeastern Zimbabwe.

While online learners outside of Northeastern Zimbabwe mainly access and utilize these resources on social networking sites, it is significant to discuss how YouTube videos and discussion forums impact the musicians who are featured in many of these videos. In this section, I specifically focus on my experiences learning from the Zonke-Tsonga family in Nyamapanda in order to demonstrate how activity in the online environment can facilitate networking, informal music making and the repatriation of archival recordings.

In 2008, ILAM undertook a massive digitization project to help preserve and distribute their collections by making them available through a searchable online catalogue. Diane Thram argues that “ILAM’s mission goes far beyond making its holdings accessible to Internet users. Getting its historically rich field recordings out of the archive and back to communities where they were originally collected and to the general public through outreach, education and repatriation initiatives is an essential endeavour as crucial to its mission as primary research and further expansion of its holdings.” In addition to the ongoing work of distributing the Sound of Africa Series and other relevant recordings to African academic institutions, Thram has dedicated much of the last several years to coordinating smaller, more direct repatriation projects to villages, families and individuals who are connected

---

61 Kyker 2011, 50–51.
62 Thram ibid., 318.
to specific recording sessions. She sees this as a vital part of the repatriation process, since repatriating field recordings to academic institutions “doesn’t get them back out into the villages where Hugh Tracey made the recordings in the first place,” unless universities facilitate opportunities for students to engage in projects within local communities.63

In the case of matepe music, the Zonke-Tsonga family was able to facilitate the repatriation of ILAM’s matepe recordings even though they have no direct connections to the institution or access to its online site. My husband Zack and I were fortunate to be able to provide the family with the field recordings primarily because it was requested of us to do so. Joel Laviolette, who made a trip to Nyamapanda in January 2014, relayed to us that the family was interested in obtaining the archival materials because Anthony Zonke and his mother, then 89-year-old Sinati Nyamande, may have been present during one of the field recording sessions. Consequently, we decided to spend a week at ILAM in Grahamstown, South Africa in order to obtain a comprehensive collection of the Hugh and Andrew Tracey matepe recordings. This process was much more involved than we had imagined, and it took a collective effort of many hours, sifting through digital records, listing and locating the individual tracks in the database, and listening for matepe’s characteristic deep sound. We were motivated to reach back into the collection and obtain even the earliest tracks from the 1930s because they were recorded within the lifespan of Ambuya Sinati Nyamande and may be of great significance to her.

On our trip to see the Zonke-Tsonga family in August 2014, Zack and I were joined by Kuda Nyaruwabvu who we first “met” online in the comments section of one of the Nyamapanda videos. He wrote: “IM FROM MUTOKO,” which is an area in Northeastern Zimbabwe on the way to Nyamapanda. He went on to say that “My Father used to play this same type of Mbira. I tried to lure him to teach me but he just doesn’t want to.”64 Nyaruwabvu’s comment alludes to deeper issues that are tied to the sustainability of matepe music, namely the barriers between the instrument’s role in traditional religious practices of ancestral spirit veneration and the predominantly Christian contexts that characterize much of Zimbabwe today. Travelling to meet the Zonke family was therefore an opportunity for Nyaruwabvu to experience matepe music in secular contexts where the religious barriers of the instrument are not as rigidly defined.

When we arrived in Nyamapanda, Anthony Zonke hooked up a solar-powered battery to a large radio that had a space for the thumbdrive we had brought. They listened to the tracks for over an hour—during the first listening session of many—with a constant stream of comments in English, Shona and their local language, Marembe, which is more closely related to languages in nearby Mozambique than to Shona. The younger members of the family were unfamiliar with some of the

63 Thram 2015.
64 YouTube video comment by Kuda Nyaru (username) on Matsuhira Yuji (username) 2012, original emphasis.
songs and language that was heard, which prompted 65-year-old Anthony Zonke to play short snippets of each song along with the recordings and explain where they came from, who the musicians were, and what they were saying. Similarly, Zack and I attempted to play the songs we had learned, via transcriptions, on the Zonke's instruments. This proved difficult due to differences in tuning, mode, size and even key arrangement of their instruments in comparison to the ones we had learned on. After several minutes of stumbling over the keys, Zack was able to overcome these barriers (as he had practiced this music for hundreds of hours back in our Seattle apartment) and Anthony Zonke recognized and joined in with every song, making Andrew Tracey’s transcriptions relevant and transferable to present-day practices. In conjunction with the sound recordings, this act of playing transcriptions can also be seen as a form of repatriation.

Over the next week-and-a-half, Zack and I spent all day playing matepe in this context. The main players consisted of Anthony Zonke, Kenneth Zonke and Boyi Nyamande on matepe, along with Sinati Nyamande’s soaring vocal lines, Chrispen Zonke’s intricate and varied hosho patterns, and a whole group of other participants who joined in with hand claps, singing and sporadic dancing. We were able to learn a song called “Washora Mambo,” but that was a difficult and time-consuming process despite many years of experience playing and learning other types of mbira. Since the scale/mode was very different than the instruments we had used in Seattle, I was unfamiliar with the way the notes corresponded to the sound and therefore had to rely more on visual rather than auditory cues when learning the patterns. There was no slowing down, break-down of phrases, or explanation of how to learn, but rather just “playing along” and trying the best I could to keep up with just two thumbs while Anthony Zonke played with all four fingers, including high lines and left hand variations at confusing speeds. Needless to say, without the chance to listen repeatedly and learn a number of songs beforehand, it would have been extremely difficult to pick up the music solely in this way, as it was much easier to make adjustments in tempo and, in some cases, beat placement for the songs we had already learned.

Nyaruwabvu, who joined us for the first two days of the trip, had not been able to fully utilize the online resources that were accessible in Harare, namely because he did not have a means to play them. Although his family had matepe instruments that were his if he desired, they were essentially off-limits from his perspective because of their close associations with ancestral spirit possession. As a Methodist, Nyaruwabvu is actively involved in searching for ways to “de-mystify” matepe so it can be appreciated and embraced as a secular music practice that is an expression of his own Buja cultural identity. He was able to begin learning a song from Kenneth Zonke, but much discussion ensued about the boundaries

65 The matepe instruments we own were made by Chaka Chawasarira. The differences described are partly explained by regional variations between Sena-Tonga matepe traditions and Korekore hera traditions, although there are certainly regional differences within those groups as well.

66 K. Nyaruwabvu, email, Aug. 2014.
between sacred and secular, and if it was even possible for a Christian to pursue learning this music, especially certain songs that have strong spiritual associations. Anthony Zonke spoke to Nyaruwabvu at length about the strong secular role of matepe music apart from traditional religious contexts. He asserted that “this is beautiful music for entertainment!” implying that it can be appreciated by people who do not support its role in spirit possession ceremonies.

Huib Schippers and Catherine Grant argue for the importance of recontextualization as an “asset rather than a weakness” that contributes to the adaptability of a music genre.67 Addressing religious stigma associated with matepe and other types of mbira therefore warrants an investigation of individual and community strategies for promoting mbira instruments in diverse secular and religious contexts. For example, Chaka Chawasarira has managed to incorporate his own 19-key karimba into Catholic Church services in Harare by composing masses for the church that feature the instrument. He claims that this strategy, which utilizes an mbira type not associated with spirit possession ceremonies, helps to pave the way for karimba players to become interested in learning other styles of mbira that are not presently accepted in church contexts.68 Social networking sites also offer secular spaces where digital media of matepe performances can be broadcast online. The contents of the videos are significant in that they feature only staged secular performances intended for uploading to social media sites. Kuda Nyaruwabvu underscores this point, as he stresses the potential impact that translocal perspectives on matepe music cultures, i.e., online videos of foreigners playing matepe, may serve as one means of contributing to a de-stigmatization of the music in Zimbabwean contexts.

The online interest in matepe has grown most significantly from posts of Zimbabweans playing matepe, rather than the ‘learning progress’ videos that feature several US players. Interestingly, only one of the videos that features culture-bearers is self-posted by the person in the recording.69 A major question in the circulation of matepe videos online is therefore the issue of agency that these players have in the online environment. Zack and I, who were able to learn directly from close-up videos of Anthony Zonke and Boyi Nyamande’s hands on YouTube, were intent on trying to understand their perspective on the matter. Ethnomusicologist Claire Jones commented, “if they are not participating in this digital world, they need to know … get an inkling of what happens as soon as something gets recorded.”70

Although we approached the topic with much skepticism, within the first day of being in Nyamapanda, questions along the lines of, “Are you recording?” turned into requests in the form of, “Why aren’t you recording?” as the musicians inquired

67 Schippers and Grant forthcoming, 453.
68 Rattletree School of Marimba (username) 2015. Chaka Chawasarira tells his personal story as a matepe musician in this YouTube video, recorded and uploaded by Joel Laviolette and Rakefet Avramovitz of Rattletree Marimba.
69 Andidenha (username) 2008.
70 Jones 2014.
about the possibilities of creating videos and photographs that others could see, while also obtaining copies of the resources for their own use. In this way, the family was not only actively invested in obtaining existing archival recordings, but they were also invested in the process of creating new ones.

Anthony Seeger asserts that “recordings are not just commodities,” but they are also “parts of networks of social relations and they can be one of the ways such networks are created and maintained.” The accessibility of the Nyamapanda YouTube videos continues to create connections between Northeastern Zimbabwe and online learners like Joel Laviolette, Yuji Matsuhira, Kuda Nyaruwabvu, and Zack and I, who are then able to engage with the Zonke-Tsonga family at a local level within a vibrant community music scene. Differing levels of accessibility between online and on-the-ground contexts have generated an ethical responsibility on the part of the online learner to share archival resources with culture-bearers in these areas; a responsibility that was made known by the requests of the culture-bearers themselves.

These repatriation activities are not singular events, but are rather fueled by the desire to find something deeper and more meaningful than learning from transcriptions and recordings online. As such, these activities represent one outcome of creating and maintaining ongoing connections between Zimbabwean culture-bearers and online learners. In his 2010 article “Music and Sustainability: An Ecological Viewpoint,” Jeff Todd Titon highlights the benefits of collaborative, community-focused approaches to cultural heritage management. He advocates for increased “local, grassroots, participatory, often amateur, music-making directly inside musical communities” as an important component of this strategy that contributes to cultural revitalization. By stressing the value of born digital and archival recordings as learning resources, online activity, at least in the case of matepe music, has directly contributed to informal music-making in community music contexts. This has allowed attention to shift away from the recordings themselves as digital objects to be preserved and towards the importance of recordings as a means to share perspectives and experiences.

Conclusion

In the age of social media and user-generated content, heritage organizations and practitioners are increasingly expected to pursue projects that enable users to play a central role in “activities of collection, preservation and interpretation” of digital and digitized heritage content. The influence of UNESCO policy in particular has led to a number of ICH safeguarding initiatives that rely on digital communication

71 Seeger 2002b, 6.
72 Titon 2010, 704.
73 Giaccardi ibid., 2.
technologies in order to implement a "practitioner-centric model" with the intentions of prioritizing the needs and aims of culture-bearers. In this article, I focused on online social networks and strategies of cultural sustainability that are not driven by top-down initiatives. I did this to illuminate some of the constraints that prevail in the practitioner-centric model and to stress the need for long-term research that investigates the everyday impact of participatory online archive projects.

Considering the growing presence of online user-generated heritage content, little attention has been paid to the ways in which the tools of social media act to blur “the boundaries between official and unofficial heritage.” Online projects that are framed by heritage, safeguarding and/or sustainability discourse may limit the flexibility needed to foster diverse “grassroots understandings and manifestations of heritage practice.” As I have shown, this inquiry requires an exploration of how individuals are currently using digital media and social networking to address issues of sustainability, even if the uses are not expressed in such terms.

I emphasize the role of the applied ethnomusicologist in these online endeavors as positioned to be ever mindful of limits to Internet access and a persistent digital divide. Cultivating long-term trusting relationships to music communities offers opportunities for ethnomusicologists to navigate the digital divide and provides a measure of continuity between online and offline access to resources and ideas. This can be accomplished by repatriating archival resources, as I have discussed, but should further include the sharing of born digital media as well as comments and conversations taking place in the online space.

References

Interviews


Secondary Sources


74 Giaccardi ibid., 4
75 Giaccardi ibid., 4


eNanda Online 2016. Community, Heritage, Tourism: An Interactive Community Website in English and isiZulu. <enanda.co.za> (visited 23 May 2016)


Ichpedia 2015. Intangible Cultural Heritage Online Encyclopedia. <ichpedia.org> (visited 23 May 2016)


Matsuhira Yuji (username) 2012. Kuyadya Hove Muna Mazowe. YouTube. <youtube.com/watch?v=k_NuYum8N4E&list=PL833CF7EDAC4F9610&index=23> (visited 23 May 2016)


Rattletree School of Marimba (username) 2015. Matepe Master Chaka Chawasarira. YouTube. <youtube.com/watch?v=Tml3CkuOYhQ> (visited 23 May 2016)


Sound Futures 2014. Sound Futures: Sustaining Music, Engaging Communities. <soundfutures.org> (visited 23 May 2016)


List of Contributors

**Bernhard Bleibinger** has studied in Munich and Los Angeles and taught at the Ludwig-Maximilians University in Munich (Germany), the Escola Superior de Música de Catalunya in Barcelona (Spain) and the University of Fort Hare in Alice and East London (South Africa). From 2007 until 2015 he has been the head of the music department at the University of Fort Hare, where he developed and implemented a new BMus degree program. He is currently also professor at the Department for Transcultural Music Studies of the Franz Liszt Music University in Weimar (Germany). Among his research interests are: music and symbols; the history of ethnomusicology; Xhosa music and applied ethnomusicology. The practical application of ethnomusicological and musicological knowledge is one of his main characteristics; e.g., through indigenous music instrument-making workshops in South Africa and Germany (since 2008) and compositions (e.g., “Die zerrissene Stadt,” 2016).

**Dave Dargie** was born in 1938 in East London, South Africa. In 1976 he began working for the promotion of new church music in African styles for the Catholic Church in Southern Africa. From 1979 to 1989 he worked for the Catholic Lumko Pastoral Institute in South Africa. In 1987 he obtained a PhD in Xhosa Music, and in 1988 his book *Xhosa Music* was published. Other publications include the “Dave Dargie Collection,” a series of CDs and DVDs, with accompanying written materials. The “Collection” is published by the International Library of African Music in South Africa. He now lives with his wife in Munich, Germany.

**Klisala Harrison** (PhD, York University, Canada) is Academy Research Scholar in the Department of Philosophy, History, Culture and Art Studies, Musicology program, at the University of Helsinki, Finland. In this capacity, she directs the five-year research project “Music for Health and Well-being in Arctic Indigenous Cultures,” supervises doctoral students, and teaches ethnomusicology. Dr Harrison’s research areas include Sámi, Inuit and Arctic settler musics, and relationships between music and issues of poverty, wellness and human rights. On applied ethnomusicology theory, method and practice, she has edited two volumes (the first is *Applied Ethnomusicology: Historical and Contemporary Approaches*, 2010) and published six international, peer-reviewed articles, for example in *Ethnomusicology, MUSICultures, The Oxford Handbook of Applied Ethnomusicology* and the *Journal of the Central Conservatory of Music*, Beijing. Dr. Harrison chairs the Study Group on Applied Ethnomusicology of the International Council for Traditional Music. Earlier research and teaching posts were held at the University of British Columbia, Vancouver Island University and Columbia University.
Jocelyn Moon is a PhD candidate in Ethnomusicology at the University of Washington, Seattle, USA. Her dissertation research is supported by a Fulbright-Hays award and focuses on *matepe* music cultures in Northeastern Zimbabwe and the role of digital media in collaborative mechanisms of sustainability. Jocelyn is founder of the University of Washington Zimbabwean Music Club ensemble and member of Seattle band, Ruzivo, which received a 2014 Zimbabwean music award for best collaborative album. Her research interests include music sustainability, technoculture and the anthropology of place.

Jennifer K. Newsome is an independent researcher with over 30 years of experience in academia, including as Head of the Centre for Aboriginal Studies in Music (CASM) at the University of Adelaide. She has been responsible for initiating and implementing numerous innovative intercultural projects, including unique community-engaged education programs for Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander tertiary music students. She has curated music and dance performances, festival and conference projects, exhibitions, international tours; commissioned compositions; and engaged in collaborative education and performance work with remote area Aboriginal communities. Her publication and conference contributions encompass: historical biography, collaboratively based community-engaged tertiary Indigenous music education, applied research in Indigenous performing arts education contexts, institutionally based Indigenous tertiary music education, historical discourse on South Australian Aboriginal music and culture, Indigenous intellectual and cultural property rights, and Indigenous cultural maintenance and development in diaspora communities. She is also a professional flautist.

Marie-Christine Parent is currently completing a PhD in ethnomusicology at the Université de Montréal (Canada) and the Université de Nice Sophia Antipolis (France). Her research concerns intangible heritage issues related to *moutya*, a musical genre and practice from the Seychelles islands (Indian Ocean). Her research focuses on postcolonial societies’ cultures, creolization processes, cultural policies, performance and artistic creativity in relation to tradition, cultural tourism and creative industries. Parent received a Vanier Canada Graduate Scholarship for her doctoral research. She serves as the French review editor of the Canadian peer-reviewed journal *MUSICultures* and is a member of the Music Committee of the Conseil des arts de Montréal.

Emily Joy Rothchild is an anthropologist of music based in Hamburg, Germany. She completed her MA and PhD (Anthropology of Music/Ethnomusicology) at the University of Pennsylvania. Research focuses include migrant youth, Islam, social integration in Germany, media representation of Muslims, gender, hip-hop and Broadway musicals. She has published on these issues, most recently in the edited volume *Transglobal Sounds: Music, Youth and Migration* (Bloomsbury Academic, 2016). She also holds a BM in Vocal Performance and is a pianist.
Muriel E. Swijghuisen Reigersberg is an applied, medical ethnomusicologist and Visiting Fellow at the Music, Mind and Brain Centre, Psychology, Goldsmiths, University of London. Here she researches the relationship between music, health and wellbeing. Her most recent work explores broadly the influence of culture on music therapy practice and pedagogy. She also has a forthcoming co-edited volume with Taylor and Francis examining global Christian congregational music-making in context. In addition, Dr Swijghuisen Reigersberg is a Research Development and Policy Manager at Goldsmiths, University of London, Research Office.

Sally Treloyn is a Senior Lecturer in Ethnomusicology and Intercultural Research and Australian Research Council Future Fellow at the University of Melbourne. Treloyn’s specialism is the public song traditions of the Kimberley and Pilbara regions of Western Australia. Her research focuses on issues of music endangerment, resilience and sustainability, repatriation as strategy for revitalisation, and collaboration and ethics.