Review

Microbiological Spoilage and Contamination of Vacuum-Packaged Cooked Sausages

HANNU J. KORKEALA* and K. JOHANNA BJÖRKROTH

Department of Food and Environmental Hygiene, University of Helsinki, P.O. Box 57; FIN-00014 Helsinki University, Finland

(MS# 96-121: Received 17 May 1996/Accepted 20 September 1996)

ABSTRACT

Lactic acid bacteria are considered a major component of the microbial population found on various types of vacuum-packaged cooked sausages. *Lactobacillus sake* and *Lactobacillus curvatus* have been shown to be common species in these products. *L. sake* seems to form the predominant part of the spoilage population. Lactic acid bacterial growth on the surface of the sausages produces undesirable sensory attributes, such as sour aroma and taste. A specific spoilage phenomenon of commercial significance, characterized by long, stretchy, polysaccharide ropes between sausages or sausage slices, has also been found. *L. sake* strains play a major role in this spoilage phenomenon as well. Cooking of sausages during manufacturing destroys lactic acid bacteria on the surface of the sausages. Sausages are recontaminated with spoilage lactic acid bacteria mainly during the processing stages after cooking. During the chilling process, product contamination apparently results from exposure to airborne microorganisms. Workers and equipment are among the most likely sources of contamination during packaging and slicing. Spoilage strains originating from raw material may spread to other areas in the production facility (i.e., chill, slicing, and packaging rooms) via the air, workers and equipment. Decontamination methods can be used to prevent the growth of spoilage microorganisms and to extend the shelf life of vacuum-packaged sausages after packaging.

Key words: Lactic acid bacteria, *Lactobacillus sake*, shelf life, sensory changes, decontamination, vacuum packaging, sausage

Sausages are categorized according to the temperature treatment received during processing (81). Cooked sausages belong to a group characterized by heat treatment after formulation. Textures and flavors achieved in processing contribute to the popularity of cooked sausages in many countries. Sausages are consumed in many ways; as main dishes, as snacks, and in combination with other foods such as bread slices. Sausages are produced in small family-operated plants as well as large-scale manufacturing facilities. The finished product is usually vacuum packaged and is expected to maintain good quality for 2 to 4 weeks. Spoilage of vacuum-packaged cooked sausages prior to the sell-by date can limit distribution options for the product and inflict considerable economic hardship on manufacturers (46, 89).

Beef and pork are the main ingredients in cooked sausage. Other ingredients used include adipose tissue, pork skin, organs, water, spices, and extenders such as starches and flours. Additives such as salt, phosphates, citrates, ascorbates, nitrite, glutamate, lactates, and glucono-delta-lactone are also used. Raw materials and additives usage varies from country to country according to their respective legislation.

The preparation of cooked sausages entails many different phases (68, 81). Raw materials are chopped and mixed, creating an emulsion. The emulsion is stuffed into either artificial or natural casings. The casings are stuffed with an emulsion containing meat, water, and spices. The emulsion is then cooked to an internal temperature of 68 to 73°C. Sausages are chilled, and some types are peeled and/or sliced before packaging. Vacuum-packaging of sausages has become very popular. Advantages of vacuum packages are hygienic handling of sausages, increased shelf life, good labelling possibilities and better decontamination possibilities. Disadvantages include equipment- and materials-related costs, drip formation, poor separation of slices, and packaging waste.

This paper reviews the main bacterial population which causes spoilage and the typical changes observed in vacuum-packaged cooked sausages. Contamination sites of various processing stages and approaches to improve shelf life are also discussed.

POPULATION OF SPOILAGE BACTERIA

Lactic acid bacteria form the major component of the microbial population on various types of vacuum-packaged cooked sausages (2, 3, 10, 33, 44, 56, 72, 88). A great diversity of lactic acid bacteria can be found in different types of spoiled cooked sausages (12, 22, 24, 44).

Reuter (71, 74) has characterized lactobacilli isolated from meat products. He divided lactobacilli into different...
groups, calling some groups formed, atypical streptobacteria. These bacterial cells tend to be coccoid in shape and to possess both a lower acid tolerance and growth temperature minimum than typical streptobacteria. Minimum growth temperatures of 4 to 2°C have been observed by Reuter (75). Atypical streptobacteria belonging to the species Lactobacillus sake and Lactobacillus curvatus (32) have often been shown to form the most important spoilage population of vacuum-packaged cooked meat products (11, 19, 30, 44, 56, 57, 71, 73, 74, 88). In addition to biochemical tests, chemotaxonomical and molecular biological methods have been used for the characterization of spoilage lactobacilli in recent years (7, 8, 9, 20, 23, 24, 25, 29, 32, 35, 55, 63, 69, 76, 77). DNA-DNA hybridization experiments have revealed that L. sake and L. curvatus are well-defined species (35).

Lactobacillus sake forms the largest group in radurised meat (62). Strains of L. sake have often been found to form the predominant part of the spoilage population in vacuum-packaged cooked sausages (19, 22, 30, 44, 88). L. sake is also the main cause of a highly offensive and commercially important specific spoilage phenomenon and it seems to be the most important spoilage strain in vacuum-packaged sausages (46, 55).

In addition to atypical streptobacteria, obligate heterofermentative lactobacilli and leuconostocs have been found in vacuum-packaged cooked sausages (11, 12, 13, 24, 44, 72, 73, 88). Recently, the taxonomic status of these species has been clarified (15, 28). Lactobacillus alimentarius and Weissella viridescens (former Lactobacillus viridescens) have occasionally been observed to form the main spoilage populations in Swedish ring sausages (12, 13). DNA-DNA hybridization has shown Leuconostoc mesenteroides subsp. mesenteroides, Leuconostoc paramesenteroides and Leuconostoc gelidum (former Leuconostoc amelobium) constitute the spoilage strains (22, 55). Absence of Carnobacterium spp. from spoiled vacuum-packed vienna sausages was found by von Holy et al. (88).

Species of Enterobacteriaceae, Brochothrix thermosphacta, yeast and mold counts have generally been found to be very low in whole sausages (10, 12, 13, 40, 59, 88). However, high counts of species of Enterobacteriaceae and especially Brochothrix thermosphacta were found in sliced vacuum-packaged bologna-type sausages (61). In addition to lactic acid bacteria the growth of B. thermosphacta was found to adversely affect the shelf life of vacuum-packaged vienna sausages (58). It has been shown that the growth of lactic acid bacteria can limit the growth of B. thermosphacta (16, 58).

**SPOILAGE OF SAUSAGES**

It is generally known that lactic acid bacteria can produce sensory changes as well as changes in physical appearance in spoiled vacuum-packaged sausages (Table 1). Korkeala et al. (37) have studied the mechanism of sensory spoilage in vacuum-packaged cooked ring sausages. Sensory changes are produced by lactic acid bacterial growth on the surface of the sausages (37, 40, 41, 42, 89). In addition to the sensory changes in the sausages, changes in the drip formed inside of packages are observed during storage as well. Special forms of spoilage which adversely affect the appearance of the sausages are slime or ropy slime formation on the sausage surfaces.

Sensory changes produced by lactic acid bacteria appear much later than the time when the bacteria reach the stationary growth phase (36, 37, 72). The length of time before spoilage changes become detectable increases as the storage temperature decreases (37). We can still see interpretations in which sensory changes in vacuum-packaged cooked sausages are not linked with bacterial numbers of the product (82). These instances of confusion may occur if the spoilage delay is not considered, and sensory changes are attributed to bacterial growth inside the sausages, rather than on the sausage surfaces.

**Sourness**

Spoilage lactic acid bacteria produce mostly lactic and acetic acid during logarithmic growth and especially at the stationary phase of growth (33, 74). As the counts of lactobacilli reach $5 	imes 10^8$ CFU/g of the surface layer, lactic acid concentration increases sharply (38). Sour aroma and taste are the main undesirable sensory qualities produced as a result of spoilage of vacuum-packaged cooked sausages (37, 42, 72, 88). Deterioration of desirable sensory qualities can be detected more easily by evaluating the skin of the warm sausages (39). Korkeala et al. (37) studied sensory changes as a function of lactobacilli counts in vacuum-packaged cooked ring sausages and found that taste and aroma scores decreased sharply from a constant level when the lactobacilli counts reached $1.4 	imes 10^7$ CFU/g. The taste panel considered the samples unfit for human consumption when the number of lactobacilli was between $10^7$ and $10^8$ CFU/g. Most samples with a level of $10^8$ CFU/g were deemed unfit.

The pH of cooked sausages ranges between 6.0 and 6.5. In cooked ring sausages, the pH was initially found to be ca. 6.3. Once the lactic acid bacteria reached a population of $6 	imes 10^7$ CFU/g, the pH decreased sharply (38, 41). Samples were deemed spoiled when the pH fell below 5.8 to 5.9 (38). Low pH values from 4.6 to 5.5 are found only when sausages are found to be especially spoiled. In vacuum-packaged vienna sausages, the mean pH values decreased from 6.1 (unspoiled samples) to 4.8 to 4.6 (spoiled samples) (88). In frankfurter sausages, only slight decreases in pH

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Spillage type</th>
<th>Detection</th>
<th>Cause</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Acidity</td>
<td>Sensory analysis</td>
<td>Various lactic acid bacteria</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White liquid, slime</td>
<td>Visual inspection</td>
<td>Various lactic acid bacteria</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gas formation</td>
<td>Visual inspection</td>
<td>Heterofermentative lactobacilli, leuconostocs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ropiness</td>
<td>Visual inspection</td>
<td>Lactobacillus sake, Leuconostoc gelidum</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**TABLE 1. Types of spoilage of vacuum-packaged cooked sausages**
values were observed when transverse slices of sausages after storage in vacuum packages were studied (10).

At 2°C spoilage did not always seem to be microbiological, and sausages were deemed spoiled without any marked increase in microbial counts (37). In such cases, the samples developed a musty aroma and taste, rather than sourness. No pH changes were observed. The lactic acid bacteria population on the sausage after packaging can be so low that the contaminating population may not include strains which are able to grow at 2°C.

**Gas formation**

The increase in CO₂ concentration found in packages during storage can be attributed to metabolic by-products of the heterofermentative lactobacilli and leuconostocs (1, 40, 41, 88). The aged packages become loose due to the gas formation. Blickstad and Molin (10) found a CO₂ concentration up to 21% in vacuum-stored frankfurter sausages. Gas composition, especially CO₂, increased sharply, to 40 to 60%, as lactobacilli exceed 6.4 × 10⁶ CFU/g (41).

**Slime and gray liquid**

Accumulation of slime and milky fluid in the packages of the sausages during vacuum storage has been observed (33). In some cases the slime formation has been very copious and the product was judged to be unacceptable (12). The amount of drip in the packages increased with storage time (1). Lactic acid formed in the packages changed the appearance of drip from transparent to white or gray (1). The mean exudate volume per kg of sausage was determined to be 35 ml (88).

**Ropy slime formation**

A high incidence of formation of ropy slime on vacuum-packaged cooked sausages was observed in Finland during the 1980s (43, 46). The problem still occurs sporadically. Ropy slime often forms prior to the sell-by date when the bacteria are still in the logarithmic growth phase and before the pH of the product decreases. The stretchy ropy slime forms long undesirable polysaccharide ropes between sausages and/or sausage slices making the appearance clearly different from a slimy bacterial mass (Fig. 1).

Five groups of lactic acid bacteria have been shown to cause the formation of ropy slime (8, 46, 53, 55). On the basis of DNA-DNA homology, four of these groups contain *Lactobacillus sake* strains, while only one strain of *Leuconostoc gelidum* (former *Leuconostoc amelitobium*) formed the fifth group (55). *L. sake* strains belonging to group 1 are the most important contributors to the ropy slime formation (8, 49).

Ropy slime-producing strains do not survive the cooking of the sausages to an internal temperature of 68°C (52). Contamination of sausages by ropy slime-producing lactic acid bacteria occurs after cooking, during chilling, handling, slicing, and packaging (48, 49, 55). Quaternary ammonium compounds and acid sanitizers with hydrogen peroxide were effective against these strains and can be used for their control (54).

**MICROBIOLOGICAL CONTAMINATION OF THE PRODUCTS**

**Survival of spoilage bacteria during heat treatment**

The number of lactic acid bacteria on the surface of the sausages is generally very low immediately after processing. Mäkelä and Korkeala (50) found the skins of cooked ring sausages to be relatively free of lactobacilli after cooking, with only 2 out of 30 samples showing the presence of 1 organism per 10 g of skin. As cooking destroys lactobacilli on the skin of the sausages, spoilage mainly results due to contamination after cooking (21, 50). Borch et al. (13) reported that *Weissella viridescens* was able to survive the sausage cooking process and thus its ability to spoil the heated products was not due to postheating recontamination. The heat-tolerant *W. viridescens* population was considered a major hygienic problem (13).

Korkeala and Lindroth (40) and Mäkelä et al. (52) found that bacteria surviving the heat-treatment process at the center of the sausages were unable to reach high counts during storage for 28 days at 8°C. Low bacterial counts at the center of the sausage compared to high counts on surface are apparently attributable to differences in microenvironments, especially aₜ.

**Recontamination**

Contamination of vacuum-packaged cooked sausages during postheating treatment preparation is presented in Fig. 2. Sausages are recontaminated with lactobacilli during various processing steps after cooking. Contamination studies of various cooked sausages have implicated cold-storage rooms, slicing, and packaging rooms as critical points of bacterial recontamination (50, 56, 59).

Lactic acid bacteria have been found in the air and on the structural and working surfaces of chill rooms and
Origin of contaminating bacteria

Mäkelä et al. (51) found that raw materials used in cooked ring sausages can act as a source of spoilage lactic acid bacteria. The highest lactic acid bacterial counts were found in pork skin emulsions and meat trimmings. These raw materials contained isolates which were shown to be associated with spoilage (40, 44). Spoilage strains originating from raw materials may spread to chill rooms, slicing, and packaging rooms by the air, workers, and equipment. However, the exact routes of contamination are not clear. The future challenge will be the detection of the origin of lactic acid bacterial strains associated with spoilage. Molecular typing methods can be used for recognition of spoilage strains from cooked meat products. By showing the clonal association between strains isolated from different production stages with spoilage strains, information concerning recontamination can be obtained.

ESTIMATION OF SHELF LIFE

Long shelf lives of processed meat products are expected for economic reasons. Vacuum packaging increases the shelf life of sausages when low-oxygen-permeability films are used. By using gas-impermeable packaging materials, the growth of aerobic spoilage microorganisms is inhibited, so that shelf-life sell-by dates of products can be extended (2, 26, 60, 86). Many film types can be used for packaging of meat products. A popular material is a laminate, which contains a gas-tight polyamide and a sealable polyethylene layer. Oxygen-barrier properties can be improved through the selection of various packaging materials currently available. However, a significantly longer shelf life may not be achieved by using high-barrier films instead of traditional laminates (4).

The shelf life of various sausages, based on sensory evaluation, are presented in Table 2. Depending on storage temperature, sensory changes were usually detected in vacuum-packaged cooked sausages in 2 to 7 weeks. Blickstad and Molin (10), however, did not find any off odors even after 98 days of storage of vacuum-packaged Frankfurter sausages at 4°C.

The extent of Lactobacillus contamination of cooked sausages can vary considerably from plant to plant. This variability creates an inconsistent shelf life for the same product(s) produced in different plants (50). However, the storage temperature has been found to be the most critical factor affecting shelf life. When the initial bacterial contamination level is the same for products, the shelf life has been found to depend only on temperature. The mathematical formula given by Sinell (84) predicts the shelf life as a function of temperature only, making it possible to calculate the shelf life of a product (D) at a certain temperature (t), providing the shelf life of the product is known for some other

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sausage</th>
<th>Shelf life (days)</th>
<th>Storage temperature (°C)</th>
<th>Reference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Wiener</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>(3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bologna</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vienna</td>
<td>10–30</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frankfurter</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bologna</td>
<td>27–29</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emulsion type (ring sausage)</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ring sausage</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vienna</td>
<td>20–32</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
temperature. The formula is as follows: \[ D = D_0 \times 10^{(t-t_0)/10} \]
where \( D_0 \) is the shelf life at a known temperature, \( t_0 \).

Using both sensory and microbiological criteria for evaluation, Sinell’s (84) formula accurately estimated the shelf life of vacuum-packaged cooked ring sausages (36). Korkeala et al. (37) formulated the dependence of the shelf life of vacuum-packaged cooked ring sausages on storage temperature \( t \) as follows: Shelf life = \( 10^{1.835 - 0.048t} \). The maximal shelf life of this product is estimated to be about 10 to 11 weeks.

**FACTORS AFFECTING SHELF LIFE**

To extend the shelf life of vacuum-packaged processed meat products, three approaches can be used: (i) reduction of microbial contamination during production, (ii) growth prevention of spoilage bacteria, and (iii) application of decontamination procedures to products after packaging. The methods currently available are presented in Table 3.

**Prevention of microbiological contamination**

To prevent microbiological contamination, production hygiene must be improved. Factors to consider include design of the production environment, such as air conditioning, material flow, equipment, cleaning procedures, and personal hygiene of the food handlers.

Cooked-sausage surfaces can be considered essentially sterile after cooking. Cold-storage areas and slicing and packaging areas are the most significant sites for microbiological contamination (Fig. 2). Bacteria from raw materials must be prevented from being transferred to other rooms where the products are handled after cooking (51, 53). To avoid contamination by potential spoilage bacteria, processing rooms for cooked products should be separated from rooms where raw meat is handled. The slicing and packaging of cooked sausages should be separated from the rooms where fermented sausages are handled, as well. Fermented products can be potential sources of spoilage lactic acid bacteria (48).

Closed lines, where ovens separate clean areas from unclean areas, are recommended. Ovens are loaded with the raw product in unclean areas and cooked products are unloaded in the clean area of the processing line. The material flow and staff travel should be designed to prevent the spread of contamination from the unclean areas to clean areas. Positive pressure should be used in clean areas, controlling the air flow from unclean to clean areas. Personal hygiene and hygienic working methods are very important in slicing and packaging departments. Products should be physically handled as little as possible to reduce the risk of contamination.

To extend shelf life and to ensure safety of meat products, effective production methods such as clean-room technology should be maintained during packaging to control airborne contaminants (47, 87). The following stages are required to create a clean room: air treatment, special buildings and equipment, personnel training, and special clothing and cleaning procedure(s) (87). To control the concentration of airborne particles, Lehtimäki (47) presents the following procedures: filtration of the supply air with high-efficiency particulate air filters (HEPA), high air change rates, controlled air flows, control of indoor contaminant sources, and prevention of leaking air currents from surroundings into clean rooms.

Van Zuijlen (87) considered clean-room packaging the most difficult aspect of production due to requirements for the absence of recontamination when meat products are packaged by hand. The number of bacteria on product surfaces were found to be lower on products produced in high-care departments when compared to old packaging departments (87). Information concerning shelf life of products packed in clean rooms is not yet available. Since clean-room technology lowers the amount of competitive bacteria, these products may also provide better growth conditions for pathogenic bacteria in a production-failure situation.

**Inhibition of bacterial growth**

Low storage temperatures effectively decrease the growth of the spoilage lactic acid bacteria. However, the minimum growth temperatures of these bacteria are very low. Korkeala et al. (45) found that all ropy slime-producing \( L. \) \( \text{sake} \) strains were able to multiply on MRS agar at temperatures below \( 0^\circ \)C. Hence, the growth of spoilage lactic acid bacteria cannot be inhibited completely by the use of low temperatures only.

Concentrations of salt and nitrite used in the manufacturing of cooked sausages are not effective in inhibiting the growth of spoilage lactic acid bacteria (2, 39, 56). Nevertheless, significant negative correlations have been found between concentrations of nitrite and bacterial counts after 2 weeks of storage. These correlations were not found between initial nitrite concentrations and counts after 2 weeks (83). Sodium chloride combined with nitrite in low concentrations has produced inhibitory effects on the growth of a spoilage population. Leuconostocs are more sensitive to NaCl and NaNO\(_2\) than homofermentative lacticbacteria. \( \text{Lactobacillus curvatus} \) strains are more sensitive to NaCl and NaNO\(_2\) than \( \text{Lactobacillus sake} \) strains (39). Two percent sodium lactate was shown to inhibit the growth of lactic acid bacteria and thus to increase the shelf life of vacuum-packaged coarse liver pâté and beef bologna (14, 17).

The concept of a competitive bacterial population has gained popularity and is being employed (63, 64, 66). Biopreservation (protective cultures) employs the applica-

---

**TABLE 3. Processes which affect the shelf life of vacuum-packaged meat products**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Phase of the process</th>
<th>Treatment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The formula</td>
<td>The use of food additives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cooking</td>
<td>Adequate cooking temperatures</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slicing and packaging</td>
<td>Production hygiene</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Clean room technology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Biopreservation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>After packaging</td>
<td>Irradiation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pasteurization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Microwave treatment</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
tion of living bacteria on products to inhibit the growth of pathogenic and spoilage bacteria without changing the sensory properties of the products (5). Certain strains of lactic acid bacteria excrete substances called bacteriocins, which can inhibit the growth of other lactic acid bacteria (67, 79, 80). As knowledge concerning bacteriocins increases, protective cultures or pure bacteriocins could be employed to inhibit the growth of spoilage lactic acid bacteria in vacuum-packaged meat products. Because of their specificity, bacteriocins do not inhibit all spoilage organisms. They may also be inactivated by food constituents, making their use very product-category specific.

Decontamination

An effective technique to increase shelf life of sausages consists of destruction of bacteria on product surfaces after packaging. These methods are listed in Table 3.

Vacuum-packaged vienna sausages heat treated by immersion of retail packs into water at 80°C for 20 min realized a fourfold increase in shelf life compared to control products kept at 7°C (89, 90). When cooked grill sausages were vacuum packaged and then heated at a temperature of 95°C for 5 min, in a steam cabinet the shelf life of the sausages was improved (52). The same heating broke down the emulsion structure of a sliced sausage product. Sliced sausages present greater challenges with respect to suitable heat treatments than do sausages packed in casings. For vienna sausages, in-package pasteurization increased shelf life but did not eliminate bacterial spoilage (27, 89). However, in-package pasteurization may increase clostridial prevalence so that product safety is jeopardized (27). Cooked sausages autoclaved in aluminum packages were found to have a shelf life of 6 to 12 months (34).

Irradiated vacuum-packed bologna samples exposed to a total dose of 0.3 Mrads showed an absence of growth of lactic acid bacteria during a 4-week storage period at 5°C, whereas lactic acid bacteria counts reached 8 × 10⁶ CFU/g after 2 weeks in nonirradiated control samples (16). Irradiation with a dose of 2 kGy increased shelf life of sliced cooked sausages, but also produced off flavors described as sunlight-like light which can be applied to the product surfaces before or after packaging, when UV-permeable films are used. The development and application of these new techniques will be an important challenge for future research.

REFERENCES


